

SENATE*Tuesday, March 11, 2003*

The Senate met at 1.30 p.m.

PRAYERS[MR. VICE-PRESIDENT *in the Chair*]**LEAVE OF ABSENCE**

Mr. Vice-President: Hon. Senators, I wish to inform you that Sen. The Hon. Dr. Linda Baboolal, President of the Senate, is acting temporarily as President of the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago and as a result, she would be absent from this sitting. I must also inform you that I have given leave to Sen. Prof. Kenneth Ramchand to be absent from this sitting.

SENATOR'S APPOINTMENT

Mr. Vice-President: Hon. Senators, I have received the following correspondence from Her Excellency, The Acting President of the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago:

“THE CONSTITUTION OF THE REPUBLIC OF TRINIDAD AND TOBAGOAppointment of a Temporary Senator

By Her Excellency DR. LINDA BABOOLAL, Acting
President and Commander-in-Chief of the
Republic of Trinidad and Tobago.

L. Baboolal
/s/ Acting President

TO: MRS. JOAN HACKSHAW-MARSLIN

WHEREAS the President of the Senate has temporarily vacated her Office of Senator to act as President of the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago:

AND WHEREAS the Vice-President of the Senate is acting as President of the Senate:

NOW, THEREFORE, I, LINDA BABOOLAL, Acting President as aforesaid, acting in accordance with the advice of the Prime Minister, in exercise of the power vested in me by section 40(2) and section 44 of the Constitution of the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago, do hereby appoint you, JOAN HACKSHAW-MARSLIN, to be temporarily a member of the Senate with immediate effect and

Senator's Appointment
[MR. VICE-PRESIDENT]

Tuesday, March 11, 2003

continuing during the period that Senator Dr. Linda Baboolal has temporarily vacated her Office as Senator.

Given under my Hand and the Seal of the President of the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago at the Office of the President, St. Ann's, this 11th day of March, 2003."

OATH OF ALLEGIANCE

Sen. Joan Hackshaw-Marslin took and subscribed the Oath of Allegiance as required by law.

FREEDOM OF INFORMATION (AMDT.) BILL

Bill to amend the Freedom of Information Act, brought from the House of Representatives [*The Minister of Public Administration and Information*]; read the first time.

INCOME TAX (AMDT.) BILL

Bill to amend the Income Tax, Act, Chap. 75:01, brought from the House of Representatives [*The Minister in the Ministry of Finance*]; read the first time.

PAPERS LAID

1. First report of the Auditor General of the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago on the financial statements of the Agricultural Development Bank of Trinidad and Tobago for the year ended December 31, 2001. [*The Minister in the Ministry of Finance (Sen. The Hon. Conrad Enill)*]
2. Report of the Auditor General of the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago on the financial statements of the Eastern Regional Health Authority for the year ended September 30, 1999. [*Sen. The Hon. C. Enill*]
3. Report of the Auditor General of the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago on the accounts and financial statements of the Project Execution Unit of the Ministry of Housing and Settlements in respect of the National Settlements Programme for the year ended September 30, 2000 as required by Loan Contract No. 584/OC-TT between the Government of the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago and the Inter-American Development Bank. [*Sen. The Hon. C. Enill*]
4. Annual audited financial statements of Taurus Services Limited for the financial year ended September 30, 2001. [*Sen. The Hon. C. Enill*]

WRITTEN ANSWER TO QUESTION
Directors on Various State Boards
(Qualifications and Experiences)

5. Sen. Wade Mark asked the Hon. Prime Minister and Minister of Finance:
 Could the hon. Minister provide this Senate with a detailed listing of the names, addresses, qualifications and experiences of the Directors on the various Board in all the:-

- (1) State Enterprises
- (2) Statutory Authorities and
- (3) Public Utilities.

Could the hon. Minister state, for how long stipends and or honoraria will be paid to each director, (inclusive of Chairman and Vice-Chairman) of the respective State Enterprises, Statutory Authorities and Public Utilities.

Vide end of sitting for written answer.

ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

Private Legal Services
(Retention by Attorney General and/or
Director of Public Prosecutions)

19. **Sen. Robin Montano** asked the hon. Attorney General:
- (a) Could the hon. Minister provide this House with the following information:
 - (i) The names of all attorneys-at-law in private practice and the private law firms that have been retained by the Office of the Attorney General and/or the Director of Public Prosecutions for the period December 25, 2001 to date?
 - (ii) The matters for which the said attorneys-at-law and/or law firms were retained?
 - (b) Could the hon. Minister inform this Senate about the number of all requisitions made to each attorney-at-law and/or law firm inclusive of any refreshers?
 - (c) Could the hon. Minister further inform this Senate about:
 - (i) The amount of money paid to each attorney-at-law or law firm to date?

- (ii) The amount of money outstanding to each attorney-at-law or law firm for each matter to date?

The Attorney General (Sen. The Hon. Glenda Morean): Mr. Vice-President, in responding to Sen. Montano's question, I wish to inform this honourable Senate that in many instances, attorneys-at-law in private practice and private law firms appeared for or acted on behalf of the Attorney General and/or the Director of Public Prosecutions (DPP) since December 25, 2001 to date in matters that commenced before that time and which have continued since then.

Accordingly, my response includes information of all attorneys-at-law in private practice and private law firms who provided advice to and/or who appeared for or acted on behalf of the Attorney General and/or the Director of Public Prosecutions and those who were paid by the Ministry of the Attorney General—I am saying the Ministry of the Attorney General because that is how it is called—though it may not be correct—since December 25, 2001 to January 24, 2003. Hon. Senators should note that the date January 24, 2003 is the date on which instructions were given within the Ministry of the Attorney General to collate the information required to answer this question.

Mr. Vice-President, the Ministry of the Attorney General does not make requisitions to any attorney-at-law and/or law firm, therefore part (b) of the question is a non-question. Further, I am advised that the records of the Ministry, as at January 24, 2003, do not show any outstanding bills on hand to any attorney-at-law or law firm. However, there are some overseas payments which have been approved by the Ministry and which are being processed by the relevant department for such overseas payment. This honourable Senate is informed that although question No. 19 has several sub-sections, my reply is an attempt to convey the information in a comprehensive and holistic manner as provided to me from the records of the Ministry. Due to the volume of information I am providing, I seek leave, Mr. Vice-President, to give to the Clerk for circulation to all Senators two appendices.

In an effort to simplify the information being provided, I would like hon. Senators to note that part (i) is a list of all attorneys-at-law in private practice and private law firms who have provided advice to and/or appeared for or acted on behalf of the Attorney General and/or the DPP in matters in which they were retained prior to December 25, 2001 but who were paid during the period under review, that is, December 25, 2001 to January 24, 2003.

During the period under review a sum of \$7,815,747.76 was paid by this Ministry for retainers that took place prior to my assumption of office. Included in

this figure are payments to the British law firm of Charles Russel Solicitors. This law firm was designated as the State's solicitors very many years ago and it has been appearing on behalf of the State in all appeals to the Judicial Committee of the Privy Council. Similar arrangements exist between several Governments in the Caribbean and this law firm. Hon. Senators should note that the requisitions from the British law firms are normally stated in pounds sterling and given the rates of exchange, the fees charged are not unreasonable.

Hon. Senators would recall that prior to the general election of 2001, the issue of corruption was high on the national agenda. In fact, my friends on the opposite side still seem to be experiencing the pain and hardships that some of their own colleagues inflicted on them when they voted against their own Government's measures and caused the UNC Government to collapse prior to the 2001 General Election, based on their stance against corruption. Corruption is an evil in society. It is a corrosive which erodes the development of the State. When corruption infiltrates public offices, authorities and enterprises, the principles of fairness, equality of treatment, professional ethics, objectivity and the like, undermine the legitimacy of public institutions.

Sen. R. Montano: Mr. Vice-President, on a point of order. I do not remember asking about corruption. I asked a simple question relating to the attorneys. I have asked nothing else. Bearing in mind that at quarter past two the questioning must stop, I ask: What is the learned Attorney General saying? I understand the politics of it; I understand why she is coming with it; and I understand that she cannot resist swiping, but what I would like, please, is an answer to my question. It was simple and direct.

Mr. Vice-President: Madam Attorney General, I would like to ask you, please, to confine your answer to the question asked by Sen. R. Montano.

Sen. The Hon. G. Morean: Mr. Vice-President, I appreciate your ruling but I am answering the question in detail. I am breaking down the figures and I am stating what each part of the figure is for. The first part of it dealt with fees to foreign attorneys. I am now dealing with the other part of the figure that dealt with the cost of the corruption matters. *[Interruption]* Mr. Vice-President, when a question is asked I am entitled to answer the question as I see fit, in accordance with what was asked.

There is a list of attorneys-at-law in private practice and private law firms who provided advice to or who appeared for or acted on behalf of the Attorney General and/or the Director of Public Prosecutions (DPP) in matters mainly relating to corruption for the period December 25, 2001 to January 24, 2003.

There is a pending criminal matter involving the State against a former politician in this country in which the services of Mr. Timothy Cassell, Q.C. were retained in November 2002 and payments are outstanding as the requisition is to be received for processing. This matter should also be included in Part (ii). A requisition is also outstanding in respect of the criminal proceedings against the former UNC Government Minister, Dhanraj Singh. Part (c) is a list of other routine matters for which payments were made by the Ministry of the Attorney General during the period December 25, 2001 to January 24, 2003. A sum of \$4,984,859.44 has been paid during the period under review.

In order to present a complete picture and in our quest for transparency and accountability in Government and in the pursuit of freedom of information, I have taken the liberty to also provide hon. Senators with a list of attorneys-at-law in private practice and private law firms who provided advice to and/or who appeared for or acted on behalf of the Attorney General and/or the DPP and those who were paid by the Ministry during the period 1996 to 2001. These matters are contained in Appendix II, which, with your approval, would also be circulated to hon. Senators.

The policy for the retention of non-State lawyers has been the subject of several Cabinet decisions, the last of which is dated January 09, 2002. In the civil area, the lawyers in the Chief State Solicitor's Department generally act as instructing attorneys, and the Solicitor General would assign attorneys from her department to act as advocates. If the Solicitor General is of the opinion that a matter is one that requires the experience and expertise of senior counsel, she would so advise the Attorney General, who would consult with her on the choice of person or persons to be engaged. Political affiliation has not been one of my considerations in the process of retaining counsel. Competence, experience and willingness to act are the only criteria. This would or should be apparent from the appendices that have been supplied. A similar procedure obtains with the Director of Public Prosecutions, where a senior counsel is generally retained in matters involving complex legal issues or in cases where the staff just cannot carry the workload at the particular time. In all matters where a senior counsel is retained from outside of the Ministry, junior attorneys on staff are assigned to work along with seniors for the added advantage of gaining the necessary experience.

I wish to make it abundantly clear that since assuming the position of Attorney General of Trinidad and Tobago, I have sought to carry out my duties and responsibilities with utmost fairness and integrity. Within the Ministry, the heads of departments such as the Solicitor General and the Director of Public Prosecutions are the key people who advise me as to whether the retention of legal services in

any given matter is necessary, and when it becomes necessary to retain legal services, the legal staff would generally advise me on what is fair and reasonable for such services. The records of the Ministry would show that on some occasions we have even had to cause adjustments to be made downwards in the fee structure.

Mr. Vice-President, at this point I would like to commend the many state counsels who are employed in the Ministry of the Attorney General. I am aware of the hardships they undergo on a daily basis. We all work long hours together and their monetary compensation is definitely not comparable to what obtains at the private Bar. The legal workload is heavy, but these officers give of their best. The problem is that there are several vacant positions to be filled especially at the middle levels. For example, State Counsel III, Senior State Counsel and Assistant Solicitor General. These positions require a greater level of experience and expertise and it has been taking some time to fill these vacancies. I have inherited these problems but I am committed to dealing with them.

I would also like to thank all attorneys-at-law who have provided legal services to the State over the years and I apologize to all members of the legal profession for any embarrassment that Sen. R. Montano's question may have brought to bear on them by these disclosures.

Thank you Mr. Vice-President. [*Crosstalk*]

Vide end of sitting for written part of answer.

Mr. Vice-President: I would like to call on all Senators to observe that this is a sitting of the Upper House and we should maintain a level of decorum, please.

Private Legal Services

(Retention by State Enterprises)

20. Sen. Robin Montano asked the hon. Attorney General:

- (a) Could the hon. Minister provide to this House the following information:
 - (i) The names of attorneys-at-law in private practice and law firms retained by any/or all state enterprises during the period December 25, 2001 to date?
 - (ii) A brief description of the legal services performed or to be performed by these attorneys and/or law firms?
- (b) The total number of requisitions, bills or agreements for fees made by each attorney-at-law and/or law firm for the said work?

- (c) The total amount paid to each attorney-at-law and/or law firm, together with the amount/s outstanding to each attorney-at-law and/or law firm?

The Attorney General (Sen. The Hon. Glenda Morean): Mr. Vice-President, I wish to inform this honourable Senate that whilst question No. 20 has several sub-sections, my response is an attempt to convey the information in a holistic manner, based on the information provided to me by the Ministry of Finance (Investments) from the records of the several state enterprises.

I am advised that state enterprises and statutory authorities retain legal services on their own. In order to give a balanced picture and in our quest to promote transparency, accountability in Government and in the interest of freedom of information, I seek your leave to provide hon. Senators with a bundle of documents showing the names of attorneys-at-law in private practice and law firms retained by the majority of state enterprises for the period 1996 to 2003. Included in this bundle is a statement from WASA which shows requisitions totalling \$5.2 million from the law firm of Montano & Company with payments totaling \$3.9 million. Hon. Senators should also note that with regard to fees paid by the state agency, Petrotrin, payments in excess of \$33 million were made to the British firm of Davies Arnold Cooper Solicitors from the year 1997 to 2002.

Sen. R. Montano: Mr. Vice-President, is the hon. Attorney General aware of the payments to the firm of Montano & Company, on behalf of a small team of attorneys, and that the matters involved in those payments, that is, WASA being put at risk to the tune of some \$485 million? [*Interruption*] I am asking if she is aware? And that the law firm of Montano & Company and the lawyers, together with the unstinting help of the then Deputy Chairman of WASA, Sen. Mary King—

Sen. Joseph: Mr. Vice-President, is the Senator asking a question? Or, is he making a statement? Or, is he defending his position?

Mr. Vice-President: Please, is the hon. Attorney General aware?

Sen. R. Montano: Mr. Vice-President, is she aware that my firm, the lawyers and Sen. Mary King saved WASA something more in the tune of \$400 million? Is she also aware that these lawsuits arose out of illegal contracts granted by the PNM regime of 1991 to 1995?

Sen. Dr. Saith: Mr. Vice-President, surely, you ruled when the hon. Senator rose and said that the Attorney General should not continue to make statements. This is an abuse of the Senate. It is not a supplementary question. The hon. Senator

would have ample opportunities on other occasions to make his statement and I would really ask, Vice-President, that we continue with the business of the Senate.

Sen. Mark: Mr. Vice-President, could I ask the hon. Attorney General whether she is satisfied with the present system as it relates to selection and distribution of briefs? And whether she believes that there is need for some kind of change in an effort to promote greater transparency, accountability and scrutiny?

Sen. The Hon. G. Morean: Mr. Vice-President, to the first question, I am satisfied. To the second question, my belief is immaterial because this is a question of policy on the part of the Government.

Sen. Mark: Mr. Vice-President, may I ask a further supplemental? Would the Attorney General not agree that the current system leaves much room for nepotism, cronyism and corruption? What attempts is she making in order to ensure that there is a certain level of transparency and accountability in the distribution of legal briefs?

Sen. The Hon. G. Morean: Mr. Vice-President, in my answer I set out the procedure in great detail whereby non-State attorneys are engaged in relation to how the Solicitor General is the head of the Civil Litigation Department and the DPP relates to the Attorney General in relation to the retention of attorneys. I cannot go any further with an answer.

Sen. R. Montano: Mr. Vice-President, the hon. Attorney General has said that these figures are good to January 24, 2003, could the hon. Attorney General say whether there had been additions to this list between January 24, 2003 to date?

Sen. The Hon. G. Morean: Mr. Vice-President, I cannot say. That means I would have to go back to the department and let them check. I would not be able to answer that one.

Hon. Senator: New question.

Sen. Seepersad-Bachan: Mr. Vice-President, can the Attorney General indicate what plans are in place to improve the terms and conditions for state attorneys to ensure that there is parity with their counterparts in the private practice?

Sen. The Hon. G. Morean: Mr. Vice-President, that is a good question but it is a new question.

Mr. Vice-President: Thank you very much.

Written part of answer lodged in Parliament Library.

**MOTOR VEHICLES AND ROAD TRAFFIC (AMDT.)
REGULATIONS**

The Minister of Works and Transport (Hon. Franklin Khan): Mr. Speaker, I beg to move the following Motion standing in my name:

WHEREAS it is provided by section 100 of the Motor Vehicles and Road Traffic Act, Chap. 48:50 (hereinafter referred to as “the Act”) that the Minister may make Regulations in respect of, inter alia, the better carrying out, generally, of the provisions of the Act and in particular for the inspection of motor and other vehicles and the times, places and manner of such inspection:

And Whereas it is also provided by section 100 of the Act that Regulations made under that section shall be subject to affirmative Resolution of Parliament:

And Whereas the Minister has on the 20th day of February, 2003, made the Motor Vehicles and Road Traffic (Amendment) Regulations, 2003 (hereinafter referred to as “the Regulations”):

And Whereas it is expedient that the Regulations be now affirmed:

Be It Resolved that the Motor Vehicles and Road Traffic (Amendment) Regulations, 2003 be now approved.

Mr. Vice-President, Cabinet, in April of 1998 in an effort at that time to effect measures for vehicle safety in Trinidad and Tobago, agreed that the Motor Vehicles and Road Traffic Regulations, made under section 100 of the Motor Vehicles and Road Traffic Act, be amended to allow, inter alia, for the inspection of private motor vehicles to be undertaken biennially by authorized private garages.

Section 100 of the Act provides that the Minister shall make regulations in respect of all or any matters listed in the Act including, at paragraph 100(g), which says:

“the inspection of motor and other vehicles and the times, places and manner of their inspection;”

Such regulations are to be made subject to the affirmative resolution of Parliament.

The salient details of the Amendment Regulations made in 1998 were:

Regulation 27 was amended in order that all motor vehicles—whether for the public or private use—are to be inspected on a biennial basis once the said vehicles are five years of age or older.

A new regulation 27A provided for the authorization of premises so designated by the Licensing Authority to carry out these inspections. It further indicated the manner in which authorization was to be sought by prospective owners of such premises or establishments.

A new regulation 27B empowered the Licensing Authority, that is the Transport Commissioner, to appoint premises as private garages, as well as suitably qualified persons to be examiners upon his being satisfied as to their qualifications and/or experience.

A new regulation 27C also set out conditions under which authorized premises and examiners were required to conduct inspections. Examiners are required to be tested by the Licensing Authority in order to meet competency standards established by the authority, and may inspect vehicles in accordance with the terms of their consent or authorization.

A new regulation 27D established the conditions under which the authorization of premises and examiners may be terminated by the Licensing Authority.

A new regulation 27E following from 27D made provisions for all the forms, records and documents required for use by the examiner and the premises that must be returned to the Licensing Authority upon termination of their authorization.

Another new regulation 27F established the procedure by which members of the public, whose vehicles have attained the statutory age limit may apply to a private garage for an inspection.

Another new regulation 27G set out those conditions under which authorized premises may refuse an application to have a motor vehicle inspected. These include, where the prescribed fee has not been paid, or where a certified hard copy, as evidence of ownership of the vehicle has not been proffered by the applicant.

Another new regulation 27H set out the conditions as to liability and responsibility for damage to vehicles as well as third parties during the course of an inspection.

A new regulation 27I outlined the procedure to be adopted by the examiner upon the completion of an inspection.

A new regulation 27J outlined the procedures to be carried out in such instances where a braking test—if not the most important elements of a motor vehicle inspection—cannot be carried out at a particular establishment or premises.

A new regulation 27K made provision for the removal of vehicles from private garages in special circumstances where an inspection cannot be completed.

A new regulation 27L sets out the procedure for an appeal to the Minister by persons who have been refused the issue of a “test certificate” at the end of an inspection. That document signifies a completed and successful inspection and shows that the vehicle is roadworthy.

A new regulation 27M followed on from regulation 27L by making provisions for the payment of fees for an examination done by the Licensing Authority for the purpose of an appeal.

A new regulation 27N sets out the prescribed fees for motor vehicles examinations.

A new regulation 27O sets out the prescribed fees for appeals.

A new regulation 27P made provisions for the proper upkeep of records at premises and the provision of periodic and regular return of same to the Licensing Authority as well as their being made available for his inspections at all times.

The Amendment Regulations also contain other consequential amendments that were not germane specifically to the private garage inspection regime, but had become necessary as a result of previous amendments to the Motor Vehicles and Road Traffic Act—the most recent being in 1996—as well as replacing outdated and superfluous provisions within the Regulations.

The Motor Vehicles and Road Traffic (Amdt.) Regulations were eventually affirmed by both Houses of Parliament in 1999. It was subsequently discovered, however, that the 1999 affirmation motion of Parliament was flawed for the following reason. In 1997, the Act was amended at section 100, giving the Minister with responsibility for motor vehicles and road traffic, the power to make regulations instead of the President who previously had that power. However, the 1999 motion of affirmation was, in fact, signed by the Secretary to Cabinet on behalf of the President, who no longer had the power to sign the regulations into law. It therefore became necessary to go back to Parliament to validate the 1999 Regulations. At the same time, based on a review of the regulations and on empirical and anecdotal evidence from examiners, proprietors and transport officers, it was also decided that further amendments were required to the regulations in order to correct errata and anomalies as well as to give further legal effectiveness to the regulations.

The first of the two new legislative measures is an Act to validate the Motor Vehicles and Road Traffic (Amdt.) Regulations which were passed in both Houses of Parliament in 2001. The effect of this Act was to validate all actions taken under

the regulations as if they had effect from the signing of the original affirmation way back in 1999. With all this legal jargon—that really means—and I think those of us would remember that when these regulations were put into effect, because of this anomaly in terms of how the affirmations were made, the private garages for the inspection of vehicles could not function because they had no basis in law. The hon. Sen. Baksh would know that much of these private garages in place—and they have been knocking on my door continuously since I became the Minister of Works and Transport, to bring back these corrections here to the Parliament because the fact of the matter is that nobody is presently inspecting their vehicles. For that reason and for subsequent reasons which I will outline shortly with regard to punitive action as to penalties for not so doing.

Mr. Vice-President, the purpose of this Motion here today is really to give effect and to make this system operate in an effective way. As you are quite aware, there are serious challenges that this country faces with regard to traffic management and how we plan to deal with the traffic population of Trinidad and Tobago. It is a very holistic approach to traffic management. I do not want to digress too much, but it has to deal with interchanges and overpasses which we dealt with quite effectively in the House of Representatives on Friday. What it is saying is that we have to get serious about the type of vehicles that are on the roads of Trinidad and Tobago today.

We all know from a cursory look that a significant number of vehicles on the roads today are not roadworthy and with the proliferation of foreign used and continually used—and all these old vehicles so to speak. We have to consider the safety of the general public and the safety and effectiveness of traffic management. It is not something intended against the poor man; the poor man continues to own an old vehicle. There are many poor people in this country who take good care of their vehicles. Those who live in the South would know that between Penal, Debe, Golconda and San Fernando there are the most 120Ys in Trinidad and Tobago. Those vehicles are all PAF, and they continue to work very well. I only sold mine recently—and that is about three months ago. That vehicle had given to me almost 21 years of good service.

Mr. Vice-President, the Motor Vehicles and Road Traffic (Amdt.) Regulations, 2003 is the subject matter of the Motion before the Senate today, which seeks to do the following, inter alia, most importantly:

With respect to punitive action, regulation 27 now makes it a criminal offence if a registered owner of a motor vehicle fails to produce his vehicle for inspection or drives a

vehicle without obtaining an inspection sticker and test certificate. An owner becomes liable on summary conviction to a fine of up to \$5,000.

The second punitive action is a further criminal offence to fraudulently use an inspection sticker or test certificate without proper authorization to do so. Persons so doing are liable upon summary conviction to imprisonment of up to one year and fines up to \$15,000.

With respect to the third punitive action, regulation 27A is amended by making further provisions for the process by which authorizations to examine vehicles may be renewed by the Licensing Authority. Examiners and owners of premises that fail to renew authorization within the specified time must return all unused documentation or face criminal sanctions. This has become necessary because even after the affirmation was sorted out, where the law came into effect, vehicle owners still refused to take their vehicles for inspection at the private garages. Basically, there was no basis for which magistrates could have charged persons who had created an offence.

Section 91 of the Act provides for a general penalty in those areas of the regulations where an offence is not specifically provided for. This penalty was a \$1,000 fine or imprisonment of up to six months. These regulations now provide for specific offences and penalties that fit the nature of the offences. I am no attorney but it is my understanding that magistrates do not like to charge persons under general offences, and they need specific clauses and regulations to charge for specific offences. Hence the reason magistrates were reluctant to charge before this new Motion is passed here, that persons continue to not inspect their vehicles and there was no level of prosecution for these offenders.

Regulation 27C is amended in order to streamline the process by which proprietors are required to notify the Licensing Authority of all examiners under their purview.

Regulation 27E is amended in order to further streamline the process by which forms and documents are to be returned to the Licensing Authority once an authorization has been terminated.

Regulation 27M is amended in order to fortify the appeal procedure. That is the proprietor of premises must now refund to the Licensing Authority, the cost expended by an applicant of successful appeal.

Regulation 27O is amended by making the Licensing Authority the proper authority to hear appeals rather than the Minister as previously stated.

The remainder of the amendments can be divided into two categories: Firstly, where terminologies are corrected and substitutions are made. For example, in regulation 27G, the words “transport officer”, “examiner” and “applicant” are inserted where it has, upon examination, been deemed to be more appropriate. In addition, spelling and syntax errors are also corrected.

Secondly, further consequential amendments as a result of more substantive amendments to the Motor Vehicle and Road Traffic Act.

Mr. Vice-President, we would all agree that these are necessary regulations to continue to effect—[*Interruption*]

Sen. R. Montano: Mr. Vice-President, on a point of clarification, if I may ask the Minister. I have been listening very carefully. The result of passing these amendments would, of course, bring everything into line, more or less, immediately. One understands what the Minister is trying to do, but almost immediately, as soon as it becomes law, and because of what has happened, there is bound to be some kind of backlog. Is the Minister contemplating any kind of—for want of a better word—amnesty period to allow the citizenry to get their house in order?

Hon. F. Khan: Mr. Vice-President, I am about to wrap up and I would deal with those issues when I respond to the debate. Suffice it to say that it is necessary. Obviously, it is an operational consideration—because we cannot go out in the morning and charge everybody in the country who does not have a sticker on his or her vehicle. Obviously, we would have to entertain that in some way. The point has to be made that as we move this country forward, citizens have to understand that there must be discipline; there must be laws; there must be regulations, and we on this side do not plan to run a free-for-all country.

There must be laws that govern behaviour, traffic and good order, and this Motion here is to so do. We are really putting the final touches on legislation that have been there for some time but they have been ineffective because of those reasons. So that once these resolutions are passed in both Houses of Parliament here today, I think we can see a significantly improved situation on our roads in terms of vehicle roadworthiness. Mr. Vice-President, I beg to move.

Question proposed.

Sen. Sadiq Baksh: Mr. Vice-President, at the outset, I would like to inform this honorable Senate that the hon. Minister presenting the Motor Vehicles and Road Traffic (Amdt.) Regulations, 2003 would find the support from this side of the

Senate, in that we understand the necessity for ensuring the proper functioning of private garages for the inspection of vehicles in Trinidad and Tobago. We understand the importance of the modernization of the Transport Division, so as to promote better safety and efficiency on the roadways of Trinidad and Tobago. We also understand that this is part of a wide range of measures intended to facilitate the development of the transport sector and promote greater mobility in our country.

However, there are certain matters that we would like to raise and as part of these putting in place the measures that would allow the smooth operation of these private garages, we also support the measures that would, in fact, ensure that members of the public do take notice of the need for having their vehicles properly inspected, and that the Minister would also, in reply, tell us about vehicles' emission. Emission control is part of the measures that we intended, as part of private garages—and I was hoping that the Minister, in his presentation here, in trying to tighten up the legislation and to add some new penalties would, in fact, look at that.

Also, we are expecting the Minister to tell us about the computerization of the Transport Division. We have over 200,000 private vehicles in Trinidad and Tobago that would need inspection, and without a proper computerization of the Transport Division, when these private operators, in fact, communicate with the Transport Division concerning the number of vehicles inspected, we would find it extremely difficult to enforce and to know—although I am aware of the stickers being there, but again—and I am glad to see the penalties in place for fraudulent display of a sticker.

In addition to that, the breathalyser is part of an important aspect that we know the Ministry continues to work on, but it is important that it comes to this honorable Senate. It is not a question of only putting in place the private garages and inspection of vehicles, but, in fact, continuing the wide range of measures necessary so we would be able to modernize the system here in Trinidad and Tobago. Mr. Vice-President, we are also hoping that the Minister would clarify some of the deletions and additions that he spoke about, going into detail, especially in terms of criminal charges and also as to the time span necessary.

I am aware that vehicle owners got in excess of three years to prepare for inspections but we must face it, that if they did not, under law, get their vehicles over five years old inspected, that the process—I am sure that we now have over 200,000 private vehicles to inspect, what is the time necessary to have those vehicles inspected? Cognizant of the fact of the 55 or so private garages and

inspection stations in Trinidad and Tobago, how long will it take to inspect all those vehicles? Mr. Vice-President, those are some of the issues that we would like to raise; those are some of the points that we would like the Minister to address in his winding up, and to tell him that we would like him to proceed apace in terms of all the other measures necessary so as to promote better safety on the roads of Trinidad and Tobago. It cannot escape the attention of the national community that the carnage on our roads continues to run almost a competition with the number of murders taking place on a daily basis. We just cannot allow it to continue. One life lost on the roads of Trinidad and Tobago continues to be too much for the Members of this honourable Senate.

We are also looking to the Minister for, in fact, bringing to the attention of the national community, all the measures that he would take in terms of improving the roads of Trinidad and Tobago. We have noticed that the maintenance seemed to be lacking on the roads and would cause many more vehicles to need repairs. We have noticed the lack of maintenance and the roadways of Trinidad and Tobago almost reverting to what they used to be before the 1995 era. We cannot allow that to continue. We must also take the necessary steps to promote better maintenance on the roads of Trinidad and Tobago; better safety; better road markings; bringing to bear in the Ministry, the type of computerization necessary to make sure that we utilize the resources of the Transport Division, to promote emission control, and also to bring to the Senate legislation for the introduction of breathalyser in Trinidad and Tobago.

Thank you very much, Mr. Vice-President.

Sen. Brother Noble S. A. Khan: Mr. Vice-President, I, too, would like to give support to what is before us and also to extend congratulations for the way in which our hon. Minister of Works and Transport has made out his case. He is an affable gentleman, and I must say that one would have a feeling of likeness for him and particularly as we carry the similar surnames.

There are two matters which I would like to remind ourselves of and they have been around for quite some time. One is as far back as when I was a young person, and that is the question of the speeding that takes place and the mechanisms for having some form of check on it. I think that as far as technology has gone we might be able, by adopting some of the techniques in other countries, to have better—for want of a better term—speed-traps or catchment areas where there could be some governance as far as when persons travel on the roads, particularly on our highways.

2.30 p.m.

I expect that there would be some work being done on this, but obviously some time has gone and there is an utter urgency for dealing with this question of speeding and devising a mechanism whereby we can have some form of control.

The other point is—I think some allusion has been made to this by my colleague, the previous speaker—the question of the use of alcohol while driving. I know too, and I am sure all of us are aware, that there are techniques available to possibly the police force or those elements in our society that are supposed to be monitoring these types of controls. I do not know if we could find that under the motor vehicles law or under other laws that deal with breaking of the law but obviously it has to deal most likely with people travelling, hence I am taking the liberty of mentioning that here.

We have heard of the breathalyser. There may be problems with that in our country. I guess if you use the breathalyser throughout the country, you know, especially not too long ago and even now, you may find that very few people might pass that test using the breathalyser and travelling on the road, but I would like to draw our attention to those two areas, speeding and the use of alcohol on the road. These are possibly two areas of which we all are aware, but there seems to be a lack in addressing them in such a way that the State would have a say or take positive action whereby there could obviously be a diminution insofar as these areas are concerned, that is, speeding and alcohol, if we were to really put proper checks in place.

Again I must thank you and I hope that there would be some response to these areas when the hon. Minister addresses us. Thank you. [*Desk thumping*]

Sen. Prof. Ramesh Deosaran: Mr. Vice-President, I take the opportunity to make three points on the Minister's presentation. One is, of course, the question of enforcing the Regulations with particular reference to road safety. This is about the fifth occasion I am taking the opportunity to make this particular point about law enforcement.

I would first say, with the pleasant demeanour of this Minister, I think he is always welcome in this Senate. I always like to hear his presentation. He is not only articulate but also very attractive and it is in—perhaps I feel compelled to respond and take part in the debate. So I full well understand his concern, I have often heard him say, Mr. Vice-President, his serious interest in modernizing the transportation sector in this country and I believe I am going to take him at his word because I am beginning to see some signs of that happening. So it is in that context of shared goodwill, I expect, that I will make my few points starting, of course, with the question of enforcement.

Whenever we have these bills or these amendments in this case, a Motion, and they concern the role of the police service so closely, I always ask the question: Where are the police representatives to listen first-hand to the concerns of its Legislature? It is in this transference of the admonishments or the concerns that we here have that would lead to effective enforcement of the Regulations. Sen. Baksh did raise the point, and so did my colleague, Sen. Brother Noble Khan, about the major objective of this Motion. I do not think, Mr. Vice-President, the intention of the Regulation is really to let garages make more money. That might be an incidental benefit. The real purpose of this Motion is to enhance road safety and save lives, as I understand from the Minister's presentation.

Could we then be assured that inspection at these garages, under the conditions that have been articulated, will ensure that objective? I am not convinced. I am not yet convinced that that will make any big dent on road safety. The reason, perhaps to my very simple mind, is that accidents are caused by many different factors, in addition, of course, to matters like defective brakes, loose steering and bad tyres. What I am implying, with respect, Mr. Vice-President—and this is to support Sen. Baksh's point—is having a database that is up to the task of providing strategic information all directed to the ultimate objective of road safety and the preservation of life. I mean, in this case, that we should have some analysis as to the causes of accidents when they do happen, as far as possible, and I say so because it is not an impossible task.

I think, when the circumstances are examined from accident to accident, there is much room for us to understand that some are caused by drunk driving, some are caused by bad tyres, some are caused by bad brakes, but some are also caused, Mr. Vice-President, by bad or inappropriate or the absence of proper road signs. I do not want to belabour this honourable Senate with numerous examples, which I know, and I am quite sure all of us know. I can point in particular, however, to the Churchill-Roosevelt intersection where the controversy about the overpass is located.

If you are travelling from the north and are heading south into that intersection, worse yet if you are a stranger to that part, it is only when you reach almost exactly at the traffic light you realize that you have to take this lane to turn right, [*Indicating by pointing hand in rightmost direction*] otherwise you end up in the lane going, presumably, to San Fernando and you will find yourself in an awkward situation—somebody either ramming you from behind or quarrelling with you—but it would not be your fault; and that is a mild example. There are other places to which I can point where road signs are totally absent. So I suggest to the Minister

in his mission to modernize the transportation sector that road signs, street signs—when you are driving looking for a street you get distracted and it happens. I am sorry, Mr. Vice-President, if these examples sound so simple in the midst of perhaps a larger debate but, this is where it counts, at the ground level where lives are at risk, and if you go around this country you would see so many streets without any signs—thousands and thousands; all corners of the country. Now Vision 2020 should certainly consider signs so the vision can be sharpened in a more life-enhancing context.

I come back to one of my major points, the question of enforcement. Some of the worst cars I have seen in this country without lights at night, with no tail lights, are driven by some police officers and sometimes the very jeeps that they use are so dented and distorted that perhaps we should have a special system to inspect those vehicles too. The point is not to single out the police for criticism. The point is much more ennobling, that is, they should show us a better example. They are on the Priority Bus Route driving—the kind of vehicles I see them driving, you speak about the appearance and the defects of vehicles?

I do not want to belabour the point because it might appear that I am singling out the police, but they should set good examples by the kind of vehicles I see them driving in different parts of the country. It does not look good, as you would say. So through you, Mr. Vice-President, Mr. Minister, I think you should impress upon the police officers, apart from that recent comment, the need to enforce the Regulations, to check on those vehicles that appear defective in the first instance and to apply the Regulations effectively in order to save lives, as I think is your objective.

Considering the other aspects that I mentioned, Sen. Baksh is right, road maintenance, because you do not have to be a rocket scientist to know that when you try to get away from a pothole you endanger other people's lives on the traffic route and that is a common experience. Many times an accident is caused through those elements to which I have alluded. I hope that a few years from now we would have the kind of analysis with regard to circumstances and particularly causes of accidents and the particular areas where these things happen with greater frequency so that your overall mission, road safety and the preservation of lives, will be properly looked after in addition to your own enthusiasm.

The Minister is quite right. We have too much of a free-for-all in this country and you see the worst example of this on our roads. I think it is well known so I would not belabour the point, except to say again that our police service must take a more active part—people in the wrong lane, people with defective vehicles, people parked badly. By way of illustration we just have to check the Curepe area

in the vicinity of the Southern Main Road and the Eastern Main Road. You have to check again the Croisee and you will see the craziness that goes on under the name of traffic in this country, but it all rests on what the police should be doing.

So Mr. Minister, you have my full support in this and other things I believe in which you will be engaged in making the road a safer place by starting with the vehicular inspection programme but I am pointing out these things for added emphasis, if only to underline the important role of the police service of Trinidad and Tobago in this overall exercise.

Thank you very much, Mr. Vice-President. [*Desk thumping*]

Sen. Dana Seetahal: Mr. Vice-President, I just wish to say one thing with respect to the actual Regulation. I am looking at an amendment, Mr. Minister, through you, Mr. Vice-President, at clause 3(vii), which is an amendment to increase, as it were, the current penalty. The current penalty for breaches of Regulations, for which there is no specific penalty provided, is a fine of \$1,000 or six months. The Minister has said that he would like to provide some specific penalty and I believe the reason he gave is that magistrates do not like to impose one of the general penalties. I have my doubts about that. In any event, there is now a provision where, if you do not produce your vehicle for inspection, et cetera, there will be a fine of \$5,000. I see there no alternative of any period of imprisonment.

Now, it may be argued that there is some general provision somewhere but you can have an alternative. However, since the Minister has said that magistrates do not like to rely on general provisions, I do not understand why he did not provide a specific alternative when, in the next subsection, he has “imprisonment for one year and a fine of \$15,000” and then later on in his own amendments he has other such alternatives. It would seem to me to be a simple matter of just saying a fine of \$5,000 or six months’ imprisonment or something of the kind.

I do not know what reason there could possibly be for omitting that. I do not think it is necessary to create in the minds of our magistrates any confusion as to whether an alternative is provided because it has been argued before the courts of this country that, if there is no alternative provided specifically, that means the intention of the Legislature is not to have a period of imprisonment. It has come up before the Court of Appeal and that issue is still pending, if I may say so.

The next point, which I propose to make, is not on the specific terms of the legislation but relates to what my colleagues have said and this has, in fact, to do with the enforcement of the legislation. Now, the point has been made that too

Motor Vehicles (Amdt.) Regulations
[SEN. SEETAHAL]

Tuesday, March 11, 2003

often we see before this Senate and the other place pieces of legislation passed with great enthusiasm and nothing comes of them. We are here talking about inspection of vehicles, we do not want to have second-hand vehicles all over the place causing accidents and whatnot and it is true that, with respect to offences such as the PH drivers about which I have talked already, Mr. Vice-President, and speeding and so on, it seems that there is little enforcement. The problem, however, is that police officers cannot be everywhere.

There are about 5,000 or 6,000 officers in this country—I stand to be corrected there. How can they be everywhere monitoring the use of vehicles, speeding, if someone drives on the left to overtake or drives on the shoulders and so on? The point, however, is that we have a ticket system that was introduced to deal with this situation—a police officer passing by gives a ticket—and people would feel that there is a real possibility they can be stopped and charged at any given time, but the ticket system has failed and it will fail in enforcing this piece of legislation that is now before us as well. Why has it failed? There are too many tickets.

The law is that you are given a ticket and, if it is not paid within 14 days, you must go before the Magistrates' Courts and there you may be tried—the matter could be tried, you could plead not guilty and you would have to come back and so on and it is hoped maybe that you will be frustrated in time and you will pay the ticket. However, in any Magistrates' Court every week you might have 200 tickets listed. I was a magistrate and I would spend time asking, "Anybody who wants to plead guilty?" and you might have 10 people coming up to plead guilty, you deal with them, you make them pay the fine and then you have 190 cases to be adjourned and, after a year, you just throw them out.

So any motorist who flagrantly and often breaks the law will know that all he has to do is not pay the ticket, do not go to court, hope that the police are so busy they will not serve him any summons and, after a year, that is the end of it. So it seems to me that we are "spinning top in mud" if we go on passing more and more pieces of legislation and we cannot enforce them. Who will be laughing at us? All those people driving wildly and causing accidents and killing people every two or three days, it seems to me, in this country.

It is my opinion and a suggestion that perhaps the Government can consider what was abolished some years ago, the use of the point system. That is a system that has been enforced in many states in the United States and it seems to me that we were in advance of our time 30, 40 years ago and then we abolished a system that can work well. It can be used to take away a driving permit if you have so many points accumulated or, better yet, to increase one's insurance. With the

growth or the development of technology, there should be no difficulty, if we are talking about all the other things we are talking about, to have this system in place. So that any driver who recurrently has a ticket, whether he pays it or not—if he does not pay it, his permit could be taken away. If he pays it, even after so many tickets, his insurance would go up.

Why can we not have that system? I mean, I am sure that there is some convoluted reason that I do not know why we have not been able to bring this in place but it would seem to me that if we can pass, week after week, all sorts of very complex legislation, and we are talking about many, many other complex systems that we can put in place, this should be an easy matter. If we do not do something like that, when all is said and done, all of this, everything to do with traffic and all the legislation, all the new offences, the inspection and the speeding and every week we are talking about the fact that every year so many—perhaps around 190 people—died and “What are we doing?” and we pray for them and we say “People, drive carefully on the road”, and the next day you pass you see somebody like a wild person overtaking you and they could not care less, we have to do something. The only way they would feel it is in their pockets when they have to pay more or if they cannot drive on the roads.

By the way, a good thing to mention is that, in some countries as well, if you do not pay your maintenance, if a man does not pay maintenance—and I use “man” here because it is more often a man than a woman—for his children, his driving permit is taken away. So it is a good analogy to bear in mind that if you do not pay your ticket fines, you do not pay your maintenance, your driving permit—and people pay up their maintenance.

Now, there is something that Sen. Prof. Deosaran mentioned about roads and a good example of what can cause people to exhibit road rage and really “disrespect” the law is what I saw happening yesterday right there on Abercromby Street at the corner of Queen Street. Thousands of people were coming to work and, without any notice—at least no notice that I heard of, Mr. Vice-President, and I was one of those coming there—traffic was backed up for about a mile coming into Port of Spain and when you reached Queen Street you had to turn off and go into Edward Street and there was a police officer telling you that you could do that. Well, of course he did not need to tell us because the road was blocked, and, in order to get back to your position you had to drive for another half an hour. That kind of situation when you experience disrespect for yourself as a user of the road could cause people to be disrespectful of the law, but it is just a thought. I was really struck by that because I was almost feeling to just drive over everybody when met

Motor Vehicles (Amdt.) Regulations
[SEN. SEETAHAL]

Tuesday, March 11, 2003

with that situation. Of course I exercise the restraint but there are many of us who may not do that.

That is all I wish to say, Mr. Vice-President. Thank you. [*Desk thumping*]

Sen. Dr. Jennifer Kernahan: Mr. Vice-President, this Motion, the Motor Vehicles and Road Traffic (Amdt.) Regulations, is coming to the Parliament at this time when the whole of Trinidad and Tobago is traumatized by the carnage on the roads and our nation needs answers. Our people need some sort of assurance that this will be halted in the very near future, that there is something that will be done, positive steps will be taken, to curb this carnage on the roads. I totally agree with the previous speakers who mentioned that it is a two-way street. The Government has its part to play in this phenomenon and so too do the people of our country.

What we see on the roads today, all this belligerence and aggression, the “don’ care” attitude and impatience, I believe that it is very symptomatic of the mood that we feel at this time of our economic concerns and conditions of poverty that exist in the society, of the way people have to hustle to make a living, because one of the major groups of people that is very much involved in what is happening on our roads is the drivers of maxi-taxis. Many times these maxi-taxis are not owner-operated and you find this hustle.

The average maxi-taxi driver has to make at least \$400 for the owner before he can make anything for himself. So he is on the road all day trying to make \$400. By three o’clock in the afternoon maybe he would just have accomplished that and then he has to make something for himself. So this question of economic survival that is so very difficult in our country, based on economic policy and the sort of traditional neglect for our country and the wastage of our economic resources that has preceded us over the last 40 years, has to do with what is happening on our roads. You have to see the interrelation between what is happening on our roads now and the economic conditions.

However, there are law-abiding citizens, people who use our roads safely, who observe the laws and so on and who would like to be protected from this element that is on the road today and causing so much destruction. I would say then that the challenge to governance, the challenge to Government in this time, is to institute the preventative measures that would help to curb these sorts of antisocial acts on our nation’s roads, to enforce the punitive measures that we would have through our legislation and so on and the process of education and socialization of our country. Even our children in schools need to be socialized into the way that we use the roads, both as pedestrians and as drivers. So there is a lot of work to do in all

areas in terms of education, in terms of socialization, in terms of legislation and in terms of enforcement of the punitive actions that we need to take.

Mr. Vice-President, I would mention at this point that we are not alone in this phenomenon. Apparently this is a worldwide trend. In fact, the statistics show that worldwide there are over 750,000 road deaths every year and this is expected to rise to over a million. The trend shows that in developing countries such as ours there is a higher trend of road deaths than in developed countries. In this context, it might be useful to look at where we stand in Trinidad and Tobago with respect to this.

Information given by the IDB in a study done by the Inter-American Development Bank, which funded a review of traffic safety in Latin America and the Caribbean region in 1998, showed that Trinidad was fourth on a list of 17 countries, most of them much larger than we are, huge countries, with respect to deaths per hundred thousand persons. Mr. Vice-President, Belize had a figure of 31.1 deaths per hundred thousand persons; Uruguay 21.6; Colombia 21; and Trinidad was right up there with the best of them—20.4. We were higher than huge countries like Guyana, Argentina, Bahamas, Brazil, Panama, Jamaica, Chile, Cuba and Venezuela, and the list goes on. So, Mr. Vice-President, clearly we have a very serious situation here in Trinidad and Tobago. Our deaths per hundred thousand people are in the top five internationally among the largest countries, highly motorized countries also, because this has to do with the level of motorization, and some of those countries are also highly motorized and something clearly has to be done. The Government has to play its part, as I said before, and we also have to take some responsibility for the way we use our roads.

With respect to this particular Motion before the Senate, Mr. Vice-President, as my colleague mentioned, we generally would support all the measures that would serve to ensure that people obey the law, that our drivers have safe vehicles on the road, that they are inspected as the law requires, that the authorized inspection points and so on are conducted with integrity and with transparency, with tight and strict controls and so on and out of that, you know, based on what I have seen in the amendments here, I was wondering to what extent you can have people beating the system, as it were—maybe I am subject to correction—if there is no cross-referencing, if the system for these checks and balances is not fully computerized and so on.

I was asking the question, is it possible for a driver to take his vehicle to one authorized checkpoint, have it fail there, then take it to another authorized checkpoint and, because of whatever else may happen there, he could get it passed?

Is there any cross-referencing and cross-checking within the system to ensure nobody engages in this sort of activity? I believe that the only way that we would ensure that sort of tightness and transparency is if the computerization of this system is fully on stream.

Mr. Vice-President, there are a couple of areas that I would submit to the Minister for clarification. There were a couple of deletions the rationale for which we would like to know on this side of the Senate. For example, on page 706, the revised regulation 27(8) is being deleted. It says that:

“If by 31st December the Motor Vehicles Inspector has not been able to examine any vehicle produced to him for examination, he shall extend the last certificate for such further period as he may consider necessary in order to enable an examination to be carried out, so that no motor vehicle or trailer shall be used on the road unless the owner thereof has obtained a new certificate or an extension of his last certificate.”

Based on these amendments, this regulation is to be deleted and I would like the Minister to give us some sort of rationale for this deletion because it seems to me that, through no fault of his own, if an owner presents his vehicle for inspection and, because of the backlog in that particular authorized station or whatever, it is not inspected on time, I do not know whose responsibility it would be to ensure that this vehicle is subsequently inspected in the shortest possible time or what is the owner's position with respect to that.

Mr. Vice-President, another regulation that perhaps we would like some clarification on, is with respect to page 713. It seems to me that the deletion of this regulation, 27E, which deals with the deletion of the whole of the—in this regulation it says that we delete the:

“...office of the traffic area in which is situated the vehicle testing station specified in the authorization...”

So we are deleting the whole concept, it seems to me, of owners and drivers reporting to specific substations of the Licensing Authority for their particular vehicle according to where they operate and I would have thought that this particular system would be one that would lend itself to more control, more transparency and it is easier to control the particular—you would know that a particular group of people have to report to particular areas for licensing and inspection and so on and therefore this sort of system would lend itself to better manageability, especially if the system is not fully computerized. So perhaps the Minister would like to elaborate a bit on the question of going back to the centralized method of operation.

Mr. Vice-President, the question of centralization is so fundamental to what is happening on our roads today because, as we can clearly see, everything happens in Port of Spain. All the major government ministries and offices are in Port of Spain. There was an attempt to decentralize subareas for the Licensing Authority under this Act and you want to go back now to the question of centralization, and part of the problem that we are having on our roads has to do with the overcentralization of our country. I believe that if we look logically at the sort of remedial action we have to take in order to at least come to grips with the problem of road safety and control for our road population, both from the point of view of the humanitarian aspect of it—because, you know, it is causing tremendous dislocation in the lives of so many of our people. It is disrupting family life. It is disrupting the ability of our people to function as an economic unit, as a family unit.

When you lose a breadwinner, family life is totally disrupted and there are serious social costs to that and there are also economic costs to the country when you have this tremendous loss of resources every year, both in terms of material and human resources. So there are economic costs and there are social costs. We have to look at the question of road traffic management and traffic management, Mr. Vice-President, very logically, and I would say that one of the first areas we have to look at is the question of how we study the economic costs, as earlier speakers had indicated. We talked about establishing a database and one of the things that we have to do when we are establishing this database is to establish what are the economic costs to our country.

Other countries have gone as far as to estimate; and a study done in 1997 by eminent economists estimate that the economic costs to most developing countries are about 1 per cent of GDP and they are saying that the trend is that it is going up and therefore each country has the responsibility to look at what is happening and to put an economic cost to it and see what it really is costing us. Therefore, when we look at what it is costing us, we know that when we are budgeting for our national economy certain areas would take priority and so on but road safety has to take priority, has to be given its rightful place in a budget because we know that we can save money. Studies have been done. You can save money if you prioritize properly, give road safety and all the systems that go with it its proper place so that you can cut down on the horrendous human cost in the first place and also the economic cost.

Mr. Vice-President, I mentioned that the question of decentralization, under some of the economic issues that will deal with the question of traffic management, has to do also with the way we structure our country, the way we put our country

Motor Vehicles (Amdt.) Regulations
[SEN. DR. KERNAHAN]

Tuesday, March 11, 2003

together, where we place people, because we have a situation where there are thousands of people moving in one direction in the morning and the same thousands of people moving in the opposite direction in the evenings and it causes these tremendous traffic jams. It causes the kind of road rage, impatience and the “don’ care” attitude that we see on the roads that is causing so much suffering and misery to our people. So when we are looking at road safety and management we have to really look as a Government at decentralization, both of the Government and of private enterprise.

In terms of when we want to look at this thing in a holistic manner also, we have to look at, as mentioned before, in terms of infrastructure, the design, layout and maintenance of our highways and roadways. This is part of the infrastructural element that will serve to minimize the tremendous cost to our society of road traffic accidents. Pedestrian crossings, as was mentioned before, proper placement of signs and traffic lights—too many times you find that there is tremendous back-up of traffic where the simple, judicious placement of traffic lights and so on would help to solve that problem. As Sen. Seetahal mentioned, there are 5,000 or 6,000 police officers. They cannot be everywhere and therefore we have to set a system whereby we could make it as automatic and as self-fulfilling as possible.

Mr. Vice-President, in terms of the social approach that we need to set in place, I am sure the Minister would agree that we have to start in the schools. In the United States, secondary school students are exposed to drivers’ education, they are exposed to the culture that is necessary and vital to be part of the system of road users and so on. So drivers’ education in school, the whole question of mandatory defensive driving, Mr. Vice-President, should be looked at. Too often you find people get their licences, sometimes they buy their licences because of the corruption in the system and they are never exposed to any sort of testing or monitoring ever again and they go out there, drive and kill people. It seems to me that people who have a car have a special licence to kill as opposed to other types of criminal activities and we should be very firm in this society that people who kill with cars are just as liable to criminal prosecution as people who do it by other means. So therefore mandatory defensive driving, Mr. Vice-President, on a regular, periodic basis is very, very important to curb this whole process.

In fact, Mr. Vice-President, in Cuba the process of obtaining a drivers’ licence takes over six months because, in addition to knowing road signs and road traffic laws, you also are exposed to very strenuous courses on car care and on the use and maintenance of cars. You must have some sort of mechanical exposure in order to get a drivers’ licence. I believe that the time has come to be maybe a little more

rigid and stringent in respect to the question of whom we give drivers' licences. It seems to me that too many young people who do not have that culture of caring, who are perhaps still at the age where they are a bit irresponsible and so on, are given drivers' licences and we do not really monitor them, we do not follow them up, we do not ensure that they are exposed to the latest technology and so on with respect to the use of the road.

The whole question of the use of alcohol, Mr. Vice-President, and our acceptance of alcohol as a socializing element wherever we gather together in two or three, is one of the major fundamental problems we have on the roads. I do not know to what extent the breathalyser is being introduced or when it would be introduced, but, Mr. Vice-President, you go to the beach and you sit or you are having a swim and you are looking at people and the central activity on beaches in our country, at parties, wherever people go, is consuming alcohol. These are the same people who are going to jump in their cars and drive on the Mayaro or the Maracas road, and we have seen the consequences of that. So this society has to take a very serious look at the tolerance we have towards alcohol consumption in public, especially alcohol consumption of drivers and so on. We have to take a serious look at that as part of the social measures we are going to take.

With respect to the preventative measures, the question of increased highway patrols must come into play because seeing a police patrol car on the highway is, in itself, a deterrent to antisocial activities. Mr. Vice-President, I pride myself on being a very safe and careful driver but the presence of a police car behind mine sort of shakes me up. Instinctively I drive with extra caution. I believe this is one of the issues that the Minister will have to deal with in taking a holistic approach to this question of road safety and traffic management in addition to the measures that were brought here today.

The UNC government had mentioned, during the last general election, the introduction of cameras at traffic lights in this country and I know for a fact that in developed countries the statistics are showing that their trend is downward with respect to road traffic accidents while ours is going up. We have seen that, where they have these systems in force and so on, these automatic cameras, they are a serious deterrent, as their experience would have shown, to people who break the light. Mr. Vice-President, to me, breaking red lights now is a game in Trinidad and Tobago. I see people break the red light at the drop of a hat. Nobody seems to care about the red light any more. It seems that red means go and green means stop. I do not know, it is a whole different code on the roads these days because the rules are more observed in the breach than in the observance. So we have to get serious

about the sort of technology we employ in this country at our traffic lights to catch the culprits.

Safety audits is another serious aspect of what we need to do. The Minister needs to look at it to bring relief to the people of this country who are suffering daily with this problem because there are situations where accidents sometimes occur over and over in the same spot or around the same area and we need to look at the statistics, look at the causes, dissect the information to give us some sort of guidelines on how we can proceed with respect to lowering the number of accidents, especially at known trouble spots.

In some countries they actually put up signs itemizing the number of deaths that have taken place at that particular spot and they keep them up-to-date so that people sort of get a chill when they pass that particular spot because they might say “Seven people have died here” and you look at that, you remember that and maybe somewhere it will trigger something in the cortex that will tell you that you need to be a little more careful. Maybe we need to look at that sort of action that will jolt people a bit on our roads, and this can only come out of safety audits, looking at our country, looking at the dangerous areas, looking at how people react in certain dangerous areas and so on and looking at ways in which we can mitigate these problems.

Mr. Vice-President, this is basically what I have to say in terms of—I needed to bring to the Senate the sort of holistic approach we must take to road traffic accidents in terms of the economic cost, in terms of the human cost and in terms of the social cost, because so many children are fatherless. We are talking about protecting our children, so many of whom are fatherless and motherless today because of people who are negligent, directly careless and “don’ care” on the roads, who want to leave home late and reach where they are going early.

Mr. Vice-President, I hope that the Minister and the Cabinet would look at some of these suggestions in terms of a holistic approach to curbing the carnage on the roads and bringing some sanity to this situation. Thank you. [*Desk thumping*]

Sen. Carolyn Seepersad-Bachan: Mr. Vice-President, I would be very brief.

Hon. Khan: “The page nearly finish.”

Sen. C. Seepersad-Bachan: You could start another page. I am sure that is not a problem. I am going to be very short, Mr. Vice-President, so the Minister does not have to worry too much.

When the Minister started his presentation, he spoke about the garages and many of them knocking on his door because they had made major investments and

have not been able to realize that investment because no one was really inspecting their vehicles as a result of the lack of enforcement of the Regulations. Mr. Vice-President, I want to take us back a bit with the garages themselves because I did make a check of some of the garages about which we are talking and in some cases I noted that many of the pieces of equipment as defined in Appendix II of the Regulations, some of them like the brake efficiency tester, the emission tester, the smoke meter, et cetera, have not been acquired and of course they were not enforced by the inspectors or the authority because there was no income stream for these garages as a result of people not bringing in their vehicles for testing. So, like Sen. Montano, the question really would be, how long would it take? Are you going to allow another 12 months to give these garages time to acquire the necessary equipment as defined in Appendix II? I do not suspect that they would be able to go out tomorrow morning and acquire such equipment immediately.

Mr. Vice-President, the other issue in terms of these very same inspection garages, is, let us try to understand what the whole procedure or concept was about, and that is, we started by licensing or authorizing private garages to execute these inspections and, as a result of that, their investment required that they provide suitable accommodation and they had to send their inspectors for training to properly certify them and so on. My point is, there may be some thought or plan in order to reduce this inspection period because right now it is biennial and it is required only for motor vehicles that are five years and older.

If we look at some of the inspections and many of the issues that were raised in this Senate today in terms of roadworthiness and safety on the roads, should we really be speaking only to vehicles that are just five years and older? If you look at some of the vehicles that are three years and older, rental vehicles in particular, or vehicles that are used by citizens of this country to go very far distances to work and so on, you would find that they may be in a worse condition than a vehicle that is more than five years old. So I wondered if there was any plan to move this from five years to less than five years and from biennial to annual testing.

I say this because if you look at the inspection list as well, at the end, I think it is in Appendix VI, and you look at some of the procedures to be carried out, especially when we are talking about tyres and the braking system and so on, after you have inspected the tyres with, I think it is the tyre tread depth tester, what you would find is that within three or four months, again depending on the use of the vehicle and the mileage that it would cover, on some vehicles these systems could be in a deteriorated condition. So I ask the question—and I do not expect that we would be able to inspect vehicles every three to four months but—what plans are in place?

Now, certainly, if there is a move towards increasing the frequency of inspection and reducing the age of the vehicle from five to three years or so, what it may mean is that we would have to look at a reduction in terms of the inspection cost itself, for example, from \$100 down to \$60, but then there must be that critical volume. I am just asking if the Minister or the members in his ministry have done any further studies, especially like a feasibility study, to determine what would be that break even cost to justify the investment cost in the garages if we increase the frequency but at the same time reduce the cost of inspection.

I say this because I am sure this is going to be an evolutionary piece of legislation as we go along in the context of continuous improvement because what you have listed here in your checklist, no doubt, within the next two years you are going to find that these are antiquated inspection measures. With the emergence of new technology and more sophisticated inspection procedures, we would probably want, at the end of the day, the garages themselves to adopt some of these procedures, but an adoption of sophisticated procedures means more cost, more training and the outlay of capital for investment in equipment and so on. However, I am sure that, if you look at some sort of economic study, you will be able to determine as we increase the frequency, et cetera, and we reduce the age and at the same time reduce the cost of inspection, the motoring public, the citizens of Trinidad and Tobago, will realize that we are not going to be taxing them in any particularly significant way.

I also wanted to ask the question: What are the plans in place with respect to rental vehicles, commercial vehicles, trailers and so on that are being inspected right now by the Licensing Authority? I mean, we are moving on in the sense that we are trying to improve our increased private sector participation because of the efficiencies that they bring to bear on the situation. I think it must have been envisaged that at some point in the future these same vehicles would also be removed from the Licensing Authority to private garages that are suitably equipped to deal with such inspection procedures. I am just wondering what sort of time frame there is for this movement. I feel that, the more you allow private sector participation, the more the motoring public will be able to benefit because, if you are able to train, you are able to invest in equipment and some of these garages can actually improve their standards, the motoring public will be able to benefit from that as well. We will in general be able to benefit from new technology, equipment and new inspection procedures, et cetera, more qualified and trained personnel for these purposes.

So I was wondering if the Minister could tell us what are the objectives or the intention or what plans are in place and the time frame with which we are dealing, with respect to the movement of these vehicles because I tell you, there are garages right now that deal with trailers and they can deal with commercial vehicles. I mean, if you look at fleet owners and so on, their vehicles are actually serviced and maintained by garages. So there is, in the private sector, some facility and some capability that we would probably want to enhance as we go along.

The other point I wanted to raise, Mr. Vice-President, is in terms of the actual procedures being used, in terms of how we move along over, let us say, the next four to five years in the adoption of new procedures. I see here where we talk about an emission tester, for example. Is that procedure required only to test for levels of carbon dioxide, CO₂, or are we, for example, especially with the use of unleaded gasoline, looking at the emission of MTB? We are all aware, when we talk about non-functioning catalytic converters, which is very frequent in this country and we do have emissions of MTB which is carcinogenic and is probably even more dangerous at times if we go through a lot—in California, for example, where they have established no MTB emissions because of the carcinogenic effect.

So those are some of the issues about which I wanted to find out. What steps are being put in place as you go along to improve this checklist and as you look for more, what we call, safety issues—the roadworthiness. What about sulphur dioxide, diesel, et cetera, et cetera? What are we doing about some of those inspection procedures or the special equipment that is required for such purposes?

Another issue with which I really wanted to deal is the issue of—and I do not know if the Minister can tell us. I know that as you go along what will happen is that newer and newer procedures will be developed and I think an issue that is bothering most people is that of collusion and corruption in this process. What steps are being taken? If tomorrow morning we pass this Motion, everyone has to have his or her vehicle tested. What procedures are you putting in place to ensure that the Licensing Authority ensures that there is no collusion or corruption in the process? For example, what happens if there is a vehicle with an inspection sticker which says that the particular vehicle passed successfully, but, when you do check the vehicle, it was not passed successfully because of some sort of collusion between an agent in the garage and the vehicle owner? So these are some of the issues to which I hope the Minister would be able to respond.

Last but not least in terms of the amendments, probably, and probably when we get to committee stage, I would just like the Minister—*[Interruption]*

Sen. R. Montano: We do not go into committee.

Sen. C. Seepersad-Bachan: Oh, it is not going to committee. Mr. Minister, through you, Mr. Vice-President, throughout there have been areas where you have changed from “transport officer” to “inspector” and “proprietor” to “examiner” and I am wondering if, by error, for example, in regulation 27G(c) where you changed it, you probably can get your technocrats to check it but just below that in (d) you actually have “proprietor” and that was not changed to “examiner” and you have “inspector”, you know, the “inspector” is okay there. I am not sure what is happening, if there is probably some valid ground, some reason why it was not changed in (d).

So I thank you, Mr. Vice-President, and I hope to hear more from the Minister.
[Desk thumping]

Sen. Robin Montano: Mr. Vice-President, I had not intended to speak in the debate because, frankly, what was raised by my colleagues on this side and from the Independent Bench is literally everything that needs to be said and the questions that need to be answered, but there is one question that has not been asked. I did ask it as a point of information and the Minister fobbed me off by saying, well, he would deal with it when he dealt with his reply. With the greatest of respect to the Minister, I was not happy because it means that he will be replying to the question and, for the record, let me say that the question was: Are you envisaging any kind of grace period? If you are not, then there is inevitably going to be confusion and hardship developing for the citizenry as a whole. If you are considering a grace period, what is the grace period being considered?

Now, the Minister replied to me, that, well, he would deal with this in his reply, which effectively has stifled debate on the issue. However, I would like to know this. I would pause in my contribution and ask the Minister—again, I do not mind if he uses my time, but I would really like an answer to this question. So I pause for a moment to give the Minister the wherewithal to reply to this specific question.

3.30 p.m.

Hon. Khan: If you are the last speaker, you just have to wait until I am speaking and I would reply to everybody.

Sen. R. Montano: Mr. Vice-President, with the greatest of respect, it is because I am the last speaker and I may or may not wish to comment on the answer, but if I pause and I sit for good, then after that the debate is over and the Minister is free to tell this honourable Senate whatever he likes, and there can be no commentary

whatsoever from the other Independents who have not spoken and there can certainly be no comment from the other Opposition Senators who have not spoken. I wonder why there is this great unwillingness to answer what, to me, is a very simple question. Therefore, I pause again and ask the Minister on this issue. I am not asking him to reply to everybody else, but it is a very simple question that will require, I would imagine, two or three sentences, four at the most. So I pause again to give the Minister the ability to reply.

Hon. Khan: Mr. Vice-President, the intent of a debate is not for the mover of a motion or the piloter of a bill to go into a tit for tat with everybody who speaks. The procedure of the Parliament, as I understand it being quite new, is that you move a motion or pilot a bill; it is debated both by Members on this side and the other side, and the Independents, and the mover of the motion at the end—well, the procedure is clear as given to me by the Clerk of the House; so it is a non-issue. [*Desk thumping*]

Sen. R. Montano: Mr. Vice-President, let me put on the record my utter dismay at the fact that there is a simple question here and the Minister's absolute refusal and his not understanding the meaning of the word "debate". How can I comment intelligently on an important issue which the Minister has up to now refused to comment on? If we pass this Motion here today and there is no grace period given, then there is going to be confusion.

There are people whose cars are over five years old, who have not gone and had them inspected, and they have not done so because of the lacuna in the law. Now, all of a sudden, there is going to be a big rush. There are people whose cars would be five years old next week or next month and they are going to be caught up in the rush, because they have been thinking, "Oh well, we don't have any problem," but all of a sudden they go down there and there would be long lines. While I agree completely with what the Minister says, that is to say, that this must be a law-abiding country; we must do things properly; we must make sure there is order in the society and we must make sure that the cars are properly inspected and everything else, nobody can disagree with that. But reality strikes, you are going to have a problem. Why is it so difficult? What is the big State secret?

It is like the big State secret about the reason to move the Red House. The Speaker is not consulted, we do not hear about that. What is the big State secret? Why can you not tell me now? What is so simple about that and why are you afraid to debate it? A debate means that you ask a question. There is nothing wrong in sitting and asking a question. My question was not being asked in an adversarial manner, or a partisan manner, but it was being asked in a manner that

Motor Vehicles (Amdt.) Regulations
[SEN. R. MONTANO]

Tuesday, March 11, 2003

was designed to help protect the citizenry, and that is what we are about; we represent the citizenry here; all of us.

We are about making life better for our people. How can we make life better for our people if we are going to create confusion tomorrow morning? How can we do that? That cannot be right and it cannot be proper. For the record, Mr. Vice-President, because the Minister has refused to answer and because I would not be able to debate it and put my two cents or three cents in for that matter, let me say here and now, that we on this side will not support this Motion now, if we do not get an answer that protects the citizenry from the inevitable confusion, because it cannot be right.

Do I think the Motion ought to be passed? Yes this Motion ought to be passed, but it ought not to be passed—[*Crosstalk*]

Mr. Vice-President: Order please!

Sen. R. Montano:—at the expense of the citizenry. And the Motion ought not to be passed if we are going to create confusion and hardship for our people. It is a simple matter and I do not understand why—It is a simple question. Why? Why is it so difficult? Of course, it seems to be a matter of great mirth for the other side; “Ha, ha, ha,” they say. “Oh, you do not need an answer to that.” “Why should we bother to answer?” I did not ask once, I did not ask twice, but I asked three times, and on each occasion I was told, “At the end of the debate, I will tell you what I am going to do.”; at the end, when the rules say that we cannot make any comment any further. Why?

For the life of me it does not make sense, and as soon as something does not make sense I say, “Hold it sheriff, she’s heading for the strawberry patch.” [*Laughter*] It does not make sense what the Minister is saying; it simply does not. Yet the Minister sits, he smiles and he laughs, and the Senators on the other side also smile and laugh. They do not understand all I was seeking to do; it is a simple point. What are you going to do? How are you going to make sure that there is not confusion, that people are not going to be prosecuted unduly and unnecessarily and that people will be given some time?

If my memory serves me correctly, when this legislation was first passed people were given not one, but several grace periods. Now what is so difficult about getting that answer from the Minister? No, Mr. Vice-President, the attitude is adversarial and it is wrong, because we are not here to throw brick bats at each other; we are here to deal with the people's business. It cannot be right that when a simple question, but a serious one, is asked of a minister of Government, in the

name of transparency and on behalf of the people of Trinidad and Tobago, the minister says, "I am not going to answer you until the debate is over." The principle is wrong, and you only have to look at it to see that it is wrong. The other side can make all the noises that they want, but it is a fact; you cannot defend that, not now, not ever, never!

Thank you.

The Minister of Works and Transport (Hon. Franklin Khan): Mr. Vice-President, sanity pervaded until about five minutes ago. I was looking at the body language of the Independent Senators, and I think if Sen. R. Montano wants to rant and rave, someone in a safe seat in the UNC should resign his position, put him to fight and let him come to the Lower House to do battle with us. As we say that, there probably is not any safe seat for the UNC anymore, so they cannot even take that chance. [*Desk thumping*]

Mr. Vice-President, let me answer his question first, [*Laughter*] just to please him, because he seems well aggrieved about it and I am kindhearted and I want to really please him. He is an attorney, and let me make it abundantly clear: the legislation was flawed during the affirmation that was badly handled in 1999. My notes here state that the 1999 Motion of Affirmation was, in fact, signed by the Secretary to Cabinet on behalf of the President who no longer had the power to sign the legislation into law. So at that point in time, the legislation was flawed, so the system collapsed.

When the very said UNC administration brought it back for affirmation in 2001, when the legislation to validate the regulation was passed in both Houses in 2001, it became legal. So to quote my hon. Prime Minister on it, the issue of a grace period does not arise. It is, effectively, the law. [*Crosstalk*]

Sen. R. Montano: That is why you did not want to answer.

Hon. F. Khan: That is why I will come to Sen. Prof. Deosaran's position. Why is it that we are in a society where the law is valid and every single car owner in this country refuses to inspect his or her car, when the law is in effect, because there was no punitive action that we could go through a Magistrates' Court to prosecute people? Therein lies the societal problem, which I would deal with shortly. Mr. Vice-President, through you, that situation does not arise. The law is in effect since 2001 and people should have been inspecting their vehicles from since then until now. The issue of a grace period, from a legislative point of view, does not arise.

We are not foolish people at the Licensing Authority; tomorrow morning the police would not go out and charge everyone who does not have a sticker. Operationally, there will be an issue, which we will manage on a day-to-day basis. [*Desk thumping*] We are not foolish people. We just have to re-inspect the garages and make sure the process continues, because a lot of them have been dormant. The population should not be too perturbed, but understand that the culture we are dealing with is if we say that there is a six-month grace period, do you know what will happen? For the first five months nobody would inspect their vehicles again, and they will be running in the last week of the inspection period to bottleneck the system. We are dealing with a cultural problem in this country as it relates to adherence to law and order. [*Desk thumping*] So we will move on from that issue, because the question is well answered. [*Desk thumping*]

I appreciate a lot of the comments that came from the Independents and the Opposition Senators. There is obviously consensus to the passing of this Motion. The debate ended up dealing with a lot of issues, the general and holistic way of traffic management and road safety. While this specific legislation is just one step in the right direction, obviously, there are other issues that the Ministry of Works and Transport and the Government of Trinidad and Tobago, by extension, will have to tackle.

Mr. Vice-President, I really want to comment on a couple issues here and to deal with Sen. Prof. Deosaran's point about enforcement. It is not an issue that is specific to this legislation, but one of enforcing legislation that is made on a week-by-week basis in the Parliament—enforcement of this, as it relates to Sen. Brother Khan, with regard to speeding, alcoholism and driving. The Ministry of Works and Transport and the Government is looking at this seriously.

We cannot legislate everything. We have to take it from the schools, as one Senator suggested. There needs to be greater public education on road safety. On Friday I am having a meeting with all the stakeholders in road safety and traffic management: the police, Licensing Authority, the Traffic Management Branch of the Ministry of Works and Transport and the insurance companies, because they are major stakeholders in this. The more accidents we have, premiums will go up. The insurance companies are major stakeholders in road and traffic management. They are now willing to come in to us and let us craft solutions, because if we reduce the accident rate on the road, the population will have a financial benefit to accrue. Their premiums will drop, insurance companies never lose; their premiums go up to suit, but they would prefer a scenario where they are part of the solution, moreso than part of the problem.

I want to go on record as saying this: people feel that traffic offences are minor offences. A policeman was telling me the other day that these days when they stop a citizen on a traffic offence, some of them ask you, “Why yuh eh go and look for criminals; I only parking here just for five minutes,” or “I only speeding five more miles per hour than the speed limit.” Mr. Vice-President, that is the culture we have to tackle. There is no small offence or no big offence. We need to breed a culture of law-abiding citizens.

My classic example is Timothy McVeigh, the Oklahoma bomber, who was listed as the most wanted man in the United States. The Federal Bureau of Investigation and the Central Intelligence Agency—they did not have Homeland Security then, but everybody was looking for him—and he had a non-functional tail light. He was pulled aside by a traffic policeman on a highway in the United States and they were able to capture the most wanted man. There is a moral to the story: if Timothy McVeigh was in Trinidad, “dey” never find him, [*Laughter*] because no policeman would see it fit to pull you aside for a park light. Even then, if he or she does, and you go to the Magistrates' Court, the same attorneys would say that the police are being draconian for pulling you aside for such a small offence.

Mr. Vice-President, road traffic accidents, road hogs and administering the law in terms of traffic laws in Trinidad and Tobago, I personally see them as very serious. There is no small or large traffic offence, because in that small offence, that speeding person can take the life of your son, mother or father.

We on this side and myself, as the Minister responsible for traffic in the country, are going to take a very serious look at road safety. Very shortly we will be launching a new initiative on road safety with all the stakeholders. We will try our best to implement the law and get more policing on the road. You cannot police everybody; Sen. Deosaran knows that; we cannot have a policeman for every citizen of this country. We have to continue to build the culture along that way.

Mr. Vice-President, the issue of road signs and markings is also very significant. The points that were made both by the Independent and Opposition Senators are presently being addressed by the Traffic Management Department of the Ministry of Works and Transport. Again, we are incorporating private sector participation. If you were to see some of the recent signs that were put up, just below them in small print you would see 3M, TIDCO or BpAmoco. We propose to continue that programme into this year and, hopefully, to next year. All roads in Trinidad and Tobago should have a sign giving its name and directions anticipated.

Motor Vehicles (Amdt.) Regulations
[HON. F. KHAN]

Tuesday, March 11, 2003

We have come a long way in the last two years or so, but there is still a lot to be done, especially among the minor roads. Some of the Senators who mentioned this are right, if a foreigner came to Trinidad, in certain parts of the country there are not enough signs and he or she could easily get lost. That is another aspect of traffic management that we plan to tackle head-on in the immediate future. [*Interruption*]

Sen. Mark: Mr. Vice-President, on a point of clarification. Could the hon. Minister tell us when he intends to implement Act No. 21 of 2000 that was passed in the Parliament to bring into being traffic wardens to deal with the very problems that he has been discussing?

Hon. F. Khan: The Attorney General has advised me that that is presently being revised because it is considered unworkable in its present form.

Sen. Mark: It seems that everything is unworkable. [*Crosstalk*]

Hon. F. Khan: On another question, Mr. Vice-President, the Attorney General has again advised me that the Law Reform Commission is currently looking at the point system and would advise her in due course. I think I need to wrap up here.

These regulations that we are attempting to amend are, obviously, a step in the right direction and they have the concurrence of this side of the Senate and the Opposition Senators, I hope, and I can almost guarantee from their body language, the Independent Senators. There are many parallel issues that have to be taken with this concurrently: signage, the breathalyzer, traffic management, more policing on the highways and a holistic approach to traffic management. As you are aware, the PNM with Vision 2020 is taking a holistic approach to most of the facets of the economy and building Trinidad and Tobago into the type of society that we want.

Traffic management is, obviously, an integral part of a modern economy. Today, we live in a very mobile society. There are certain intrinsic and inherent weaknesses in Trinidad and Tobago's spatial development, and it was well articulated by the other side: the over-accentuation of Port of Spain, the dilemma of the East/West Corridor and the development of a mass transit system in the city. How do we spread the population south and east? These are some of the challenges we face in developing Trinidad and Tobago. In the interim we have to manage a situation where every family feels that it is their right to own a motor vehicle. A motor vehicle has become, not a tool for the privileged, but a utility, just like cell phones today, so that every home has one.

We now, as a government, have to plan how we organize all these vehicles. Sometimes I feel that Trinidad has now become a landfill site for Japanese used vehicles. I have my own views on that, but it is not the subject of this debate. There

are many challenges ahead and this regulation is a step in the right direction. I hope to have the support of the Opposition and the Independent Benches.

Mr. Vice-President, I beg to move.

Question put and agreed to.

Resolved:

That the Motor Vehicles and Road Traffic (Amdt.) Regulations be now approved.

MUNICIPAL CORPORATIONS (AMDT.) BILL

Order for second reading read.

The Minister of Local Government (Hon. Jarrette Narine): Mr. Vice-President, I beg to move,

That a Bill to amend the Municipal Corporations Act, 1990 be now read a second time.

Mr. Vice-President, discussions with Sen. Seetahal pointed out to me that in clause 2(a) of the Municipal Corporations (Amdt.) Bill, there is a typographical error, in that, the second line of (4c) reads “elections” and the following line has “election”. I would like to indicate to you that I would like the letter “s” where it says “elections” to be removed.

The amendment before us in the Upper House today is simply to make way for Local Government Election 2003. The term of office for local government ended on July 12, 2002, and section 11(4) of the Municipal Corporations Act, No. 21 of 1990 specifies that the term of office of councillors and aldermen shall be three years. Additionally, section 11(a) as amended by Act No. 8 of 1992 further states that an election should be held within three months of the expiry of the term of office, which meant that by October 12, 2002 we should have had the election.

You will understand, however, Mr. Vice-President, that in the year 2002 there was an 18/18 deadlock in the Parliament of Trinidad and Tobago, and we were unable—we were not as fortunate as you were in the Upper House, we did not have a Speaker in the Lower House—to bring legislation at that time to have the tenure of the local government councillors, aldermen, mayors and chairmen extended. We, therefore, took the matter to Cabinet and as of July 13, 2002, Cabinet decided that the councillors who vacated the day before would be made advisors to the mayors and chairmen. This continues up to the present time and will continue until local government election is called. The reason for this is that there should be continuity.

The Opposition went all over the country asking to have elections immediately, even following the Crowne Plaza Accord. At that time, we did have general elections on October 07, 2002 and it is now history that they were calling for elections, but the PNM was victorious; so we now have a properly constituted Senate and Lower House.

Mr. Vice-President, the primary objective of this Bill is to ask the honourable Senate for an extension of the period to hold the election from the stipulated three months to within one year of the expiry date of the term of office for councillors and aldermen. Therefore, we are, obviously, going to have local government election before July 12, 2003. In addition to that part of the legislation, Mr. Speaker—Mr. Vice-President, I am sorry.

Sen. Mark: Take a note here; we cannot have you insulting the Vice-President.

Hon. J. Narine: Sen. Mark, it is not meant to be an insult; it is a slip of the tongue. The old people used to say, “When bachac ready to dead dey does get wings”.

Mr. Vice-President, in clause 2(b) of this Bill we are asking for the period between the date of election of the councillors and the time of swearing in to be amended from the present three-day limit to within 10 days from the date of the election, because clause 13(1) of Act No. 21 of 1990 states clearly that on the third day next following that on which the election of aldermen has been held, and save for the taking of the oath, the office by any alderman elected under section 13—which means that if an election is held on a Monday, by the Thursday following we are supposed to put in the aldermen, mayors and chairmen.

I am sure that Senators in this august House would realize that three days are insufficient for any political organization to determine that 14 regional corporations will have persons selected, even beforehand. Right now there is a tie, in that, the Opposition has seven corporations and we have seven. It will be to the benefit of both sides that we give sufficient time to have these persons placed in office. So we are suggesting, and it is for amendment, that it is done within a 10-day period.

The final clause to amend this Bill, clause 2(c), seeks to regularize the vacancy left by the former Chairman of the San Juan/Laventille Regional Corporation, who is now a Member in the other place. This occurred in 1995 when the then sitting Chairman for the Sangre Grande Regional Corporation became a Member of the Lower House. At that time legislation was brought by the then government to have the Deputy Chairman assume the role of chairman until the election. In this case,

the San Juan/Laventille Regional Corporation Chairman became the Member for St. Ann's East, so that we had to have the Deputy Chairman of the corporation act in that position.

Today, I am asking that we validate this situation that occurred last year because of the non-existence of Parliament. As I said before, with the 18/18 deadlock we could not have had the local government election, but we did have the general election before the three-month grace period, which was supposed to end at the end of July. The general election was held on August 07, 2002. So I am asking, because of these simple amendments, that this Senate give unanimous support.

I beg to move.

Question proposed.

Sen. Wade Mark: Mr. Vice-President, let me take this opportunity to welcome my colleague and friend. I just felt as a guest he should be accurate. Thank you for giving me the opportunity to contribute to this very important matter before us today, which we do not regard as very simple and/or very straightforward. We have some queries and unless we get some clarification on them we would have some grave difficulty.

This Senate is being requested to perform, as far as we are concerned, an act in illegality, which was committed by the Cabinet of Trinidad and Tobago when it illegally extended the life of the various regional corporations. I would develop as I go along what we mean by that. What we are seeing here is a regime that is crumbling at this time to get the support of the Parliament in order to justify and legalize illegal acts.

So they come to this Parliament today with this Bill and as the Explanatory Note indicates:

“This Bill seeks to amend the Municipal Corporations Act, 1990 (the Act) in order to extend the prescribed time...”

We were being told by the said Minister that Cabinet had the authority to extend the life of these corporations; we were told so. Now we are being told that the Cabinet did not have that authority, and that is why today we are being asked to legalize an illegal act that was committed by a Cabinet that has gone mad. If you examine what has been happening in this country, this is a government in full stride and has no respect nor regard for public opinion or the views of the vast majority of citizens of this country.

So the first thing that we are being asked to do, according to the Bill in the Explanatory Note, is to provide for the extension of the period for holding election

under section 11 of the Act, from three months after the expiration of the life of the councils, to one year thereafter.

This PNM Government was in power illegally and unconstitutionally, as far as we are concerned, from December 2001 right until the general election was held on October 07, 2002. If you are talking about priorities, Mr. Vice-President, then the hon. Minister ought to have given this matter top priority. Why is he coming now in the month of March? Why could he not come before in order to deal with this matter, maybe in October or November? [*Crosstalk*] He did not come, and he comes here today and says that he did not get a Speaker downstairs. How could you have got a Speaker when you did not have the majority? If you had a majority, then you would have got a Speaker; but you were illegally installed by your friend. Anyway, I would not deal with that now, we will deal with that on the hustings.

So the real question we want to raise in this debate is: Did the Cabinet at the time have the authority to extend the life of these corporations and councils? Did they have that right? I go further, does the Cabinet have the authority to appoint advisors, so-called advisory committees? But you know, Mr. Vice-President, the trick in this particular exercise is that the PNM did not want their councillors to be retrenched. [*Interruption*] We were just mere pawns in that game. That is why the hon. Minister proposed to Cabinet—whoever advised him in a misguided way—to establish advisory committees and they turned out to be totally farcical bodies, no power. The new dictator was the Minister of Local Government. I must say that you are learning well from your Prime Minister.

Mr. Vice-President, we want to query and question the legality of the measure that is now before this honourable Senate. Maybe the hon. Minister can give us some examples. Maybe he can provide us with some precedent in law; quote some authority for us, where this development took place in the past. [*Interruption*] I am talking about after the three-month period. You had the authority between July 12, 2002 to October, 2002. What happened after October 12, 2002? And even if they talk about 1995, we brought the matter to the Parliament within a week. I want the hon. Minister to tell us in this Parliament the precedent, the law; under what authority did the PNM Cabinet appoint these advisory committees? These are very grave matters, and this Senate, once we are here, will not be used. We want to get explanation; that is what we want. We should not be used by this evil regime in order to endorse and perpetuate illegal acts; it should not be. I call it a gangster regime.

Therefore, we have grave difficulty in supporting the measure in its present form. We want to get the explanations from the hon. Minister, my former colleague

in the trade union movement. He is presiding over something—I am glad that the hon. Minister of Works and Transport is still here, because I want to say something about the undermining of the trade union movement as a result of what is taking place in local government today, and I hope that he would not preside over that arrangement.

What we are witnessing here today, as far as we are concerned, is an illegal action, and we feel that what the regime is attempting to do at this time is to ride roughshod over a number of critical institutions; we have seen their behaviour. It is dangerous, but I keep saying that they are playing with fire and those who play with fire eventually will get burn. [*Desk thumping*] We are saying, “Listen, give us an explanation, an understanding, quote the relevant precedent in terms of this illegality that was concocted and manufactured by the PNM in its own selfish and narrow personal interest at the end of the day.”

It was not an attempt to deal with the extension of local government. It was to extend the life of their supporters and their people who were in charge of those councils at the time. Therefore, what we see taking place is that instead of holding election for these councils, the Minister arrogated total power unto himself and had advisory committees appointed just for convenience, so that everybody could receive their stipends and salaries. What we have been witnessing is an undermining of local government. If you look at the experience of local government since July 12 to the present time, you would see that it is not what it used to be. It does not have the power or the authority; everything has to go to the Minister; the Minister is boss. So what we have here is ministerial dictatorship.

This is what these amendments are; he is asking us to endorse all the wrongs that he did whilst he was the Minister of Local Government from July 12, 2002 to the present time. And what has happened? The councils went out of existence. That is why I will demonstrate, as I proceed when he comes here to tell us that we must deem some Deputy Chairman of the San Juan/Laventille Regional Corporation as Chairman? When? A chairman is elected by the people. [*Desk thumping*] A chairman goes up for an election in an electoral district

Hon. Senators: No, no.

Sen. W. Mark: The former Chairman was Anthony Roberts who is a Member of Parliament; he is an elected person. We are arguing on this side that the Minister has usurped the powers of the councils. [*Interruption*] If I am misleading the Senate, then you can rise on a point of order through the Vice-President.

As far as we are concerned, these measures that are being proposed here do not find favour with us unless we are able to get some real clarification. What we are being requested to do is to deem someone who, in this instance, was an elected councillor, lost that position from July 12, 2002, even though the person was a deputy chairperson of the corporation at that time; but after July 12, 2002 the only people who maintained representative status on an elected basis, were the chairmen. So the chairmen were elected by the people and they were properly elected by the council. What you had was a vice-chairman who was properly elected by the council, but after July 12, 2002 that vice-chairman became an advisor.

So hear what is the contradiction, Mr. Vice-President: a person goes to the polls in an electoral district, he is elected as a councillor, has his first meeting, elects his chairman and his deputy chairman; the council goes out of existence. The only person who remains validly, with some kind of representative kind of background is, in fact, the chairman. This chairman contested elections, as you recall, in 2002, because Sen. M. Joseph recognized that the people of St. Ann's East would have rejected him [*Laughter*] so he put in place Mr. Roberts who is the person who now represents the people of St. Ann's East. When Mr. Roberts became the representative, he had to vacate his chairmanship of the council—and that is logical—but a lady called Patricia Mejias who was the Deputy Chairman and who at that time was an advisor, lost her position. The Minister is now coming here to tell us that a person who was an advisor—[*Crosstalk*] Well, sorry, wrong corporation, but let us deal with the deputy chairman, forget the name. Let us not squabble over a name.

Hon. Minister, how can the deputy chairman, who is an advisor, be deemed by this Parliament to have been the chairman? It does not follow. The Attorney General, who, apparently, had some role to play in this Bill, should advise us. Madam, are we asking this Senate to endorse an illegal action that was taken by the then Minister? This is something that we have great difficulty in supporting. We cannot support this measure in the manner that the Minister is proposing at this time. As I understand it, and the Minister could tell me if I am wrong, when you are appointed as an advisor you do not have that kind of influence as the chairman and, in any event, these advisory bodies that the Minister referred to in his opening remarks, merely were established to ensure that the PNM, in the first instance—[*Crosstalk*]—we just happen to be accidentally a part of it. [*Laughter*] We were just pawns in a game. The main objective was to ensure that the PNM councillors were taken care of; that is what it was about.

Therefore, we feel that the measures that have been submitted here this afternoon, have not in any way contributed to the strengthening of local government. I think the Minister can admit to us here that under his reign and supervision, local government bodies have been weakened in a very measurable way. Local government as we know it is being crushed. This PNM regime, as you know, is about centralized control. I understand that Sen. Dr. Saith, the Minister of Public Administration, is the hatchet man; he is the man who piloted the Cabinet Note that says we must all be removed from this Parliament; a totally unelected person, what he is doing here, I do not know.

Hon. Senator: Are you elected? [*Crosstalk*] [*Laughter*]

Sen. W. Mark: If we had an agreement in Crowne Plaza, he would have been in jail or something, because that is the man who owes the country \$30 million. [*Crosstalk*] [*Laughter*]

Mr. Vice-President, here it is you have people who are elected by the people and they are no longer elected because the time expired. What the Minister should be doing is trying to hasten the electoral process so that these people can be properly reconstituted. Do you know what he did? He extended it from July to October, 2002. He went from October to the present time, and he is now coming here and saying, "By July 12 we go have elections." You know between July 12 of one year to July 12 of the next, is a year. Do you know what they have been able to do, Mr. Vice-President? The Minister of Local Government has been running the show.

You make recommendations as a council, as an advisory body, the Minister decides if he is going to accept them or if he is going to approve them. So what you had were puppets posing as advisors and they had no effect on the Minister. What you see taking place today and to show how the regime does not have any interest in local government, we only have to go back. Remember we dealt with some variations in the Finance (Variation of Appropriation) Bill 2002. We had a list, variation of appropriation accounts. When you look here you see, for instance, that in every corporation, be it PNM or UNC, there were reductions in capital programmes: Port of Spain, \$3 million gone; San Fernando, \$4 million; Chaguanas, \$4 million; Laventille, \$4 million; Sangre Grande, \$4 million; Mayaro—Hon. Khan's constituency—\$3 million; Princes Town—and they tell us that they care about local government. When they were supposed to give local government the kind of support, the kind of financial muscle to strengthen their operations to provide basic goods and services to the people that these corporations represent, they were starved.

I understand, and my colleague could tell me if I am wrong, that for fiscal year 2002—2003 for 14 corporations, the regime has only allocated \$24 million for the

capital programme. [*Interruption*] You put \$10 million more? So that is \$34 million. But listen, for the Community Environmental Protection and Enhancement Programme (CEPEP), \$77 million. To do what: cut grass, paint stones, paint culverts? They may even be damaging communities, putting them at risk, because there is no supervision, no engineers, no public health inspectors or no technical people. They are just there; PNM supporters.

If you could go to a commission of enquiry and say, “Ballot paper green or blue”, \$500,000, you get a big contract; that is what the PNM is doing here. I want to make the point about the hon. Minister of Works and Transport, because people who do not have a sense of history do not fully appreciate the importance of a number of matters. I want to find out: How can the hon. Minister sit and allow this statement, and I have not heard a retraction from his good self, as a former trade unionist?

Mr. Vice-President, I quote from page 5 of the *Newsday* of February 20, 2003. The headline is “Government to expand CEPEP”. I want to quote, because I want to tell you why I am talking about CEPEP. If you look at Act No. 21 of 1990 you would see under clause 232 the functions that all local government bodies have to carry out, including road maintenance and ensuring that roads are clean and drains are taken care of. These are functions of the Ministry of Local Government via their regional corporations.

Mr. Vice-President: Hon. Senator, I shall permit you to continue right at the resumption since it is 4.30 p.m. The Senate will now be suspended for tea. We shall return at 5.00 p.m.

4.30 p.m.: *Sitting suspended.*

5.03 p.m.: *Sitting resumed.*

Sen. W. Mark: Mr. Vice-President, before we took the tea break I was on the issue of a statement that appeared in the *Newsday* of Thursday, February 20, 2003, on page 5. It is written by journalist, Azard Ali and he says:

“So impressed is government with its Community Environment Protection Enhancement Programme (CEPEP), started two months before the general election in October last year, that it has decided to expand the programme across the country.

If Works Minister Franklin Khan has his way, the workers under the programme who clean roadsides and drains, will replace daily-paid workers in the Ministry of Works as well as those at Regional Corporations.”

You know my colleague and friend from Ortoire/Mayaro is a very enthusiastic chap and I suspect somebody gave him basket at the meeting and he must have made some error, because I cannot see that coming seriously from Franklin Khan. This thing about using CEPEP workers to replace daily-rated workers in the regional corporations and the Ministry of Works and Transport. I cannot see Franklin Khan, the hon. Minister supporting that. So I have to conclude it was just over enthusiasm, or over exuberance of youth, maybe, at that time to cause him to make that statement.

Mr. Vice-President, I raise this question about CEPEP because if one looks at clause 232 of Act No. 21 of 1990 one will see the functions that the regional corporations have to execute. So one understands exactly what is taking place, and I hope it is not the intention of the Government to undermine the trade union movement.

Mr. Vice-President, section 232(i) says one of the functions of the regional corporations is:

“the maintenance, control and enhancement of the physical environment...”

Now they are also responsible for road maintenance in some areas, and for cleaning the sides of the roads. That is what local government officers do but, today as we speak, we have a parallel organization doing the same work, duplicating the same work that the local government authority is supposed to be doing.

I have no problem with that, I want to make it very clear. I want every able-bodied man and woman in this Republic to be working once they are able and capable. I want productive, meaningful, rewarding jobs for workers. So I am not against workers in CEPEP, I want to make that clear. I have no problem with people earning a daily bread. What I am saying is that there is need to understand that in dealing with the taxpayers' resources—our money, what you and I and every able-bodied worker pay in this country—I do not think any government should be utilizing those resources in a one-sided way.

Mr. Vice-President, when one looks at the headline in the *Sunday Guardian* of Sunday, February 23 on page 1, “\$44 million PNM payback” and the hon. Prime Minister at a public meeting last Saturday indicated to the entire country that he is going to treble. [*Desk thumping*] So in other words, what you have now is \$44 million payment, it will be \$176 million in one year and in three years we are talking about \$0.5 billion for doing what? “Yuh capping, yuh rapping?” You know what? They want to retrench 9,000 workers from Caroni (1975) Limited, and they are prepared to do so. What skills can a young man or a young woman derive from

Municipal Corporations (Amdt.) Bill
[SEN. MARK]

Tuesday, March 11, 2003

cutting and rooting out grass every day and painting stones and putting everywhere “We love CEPEP”? What skills are you preparing these young people to inherit?

Mr. Vice-President, I honestly believe that the PNM is setting up young people.

Sen. Yuille-Williams: Mr. Vice-President, on a point of order, I think the hon. Senator is irrelevant, and I think he should confine himself to the Bill. We have listened to him for a long time. *[Interruption]* We are talking about extending the life of the corporations and I do not see how the— *[Interruption]*

Sen. W. Mark: Yes, you are talking about regional corporations. It hurts. The truth hurts, that is why “yuh” getting vex.

Mr. Vice-President: I have said before, I would really prefer if you keep within the ambit of the Bill that we are discussing.

Sen. W. Mark: Mr. Vice-President, I agree with you and I will be guided. What I was simply indicating to you and this honourable Senate is that we are dealing with the Municipal Corporations (Amdt.) Bill. The Minister comes here and says he wants us to support measures. We are saying we cannot support these measures and we are showing where they appoint advisory committees which are not functioning, they do not have any power, the Minister has all the power and the Government, whilst simultaneously undermining local government authorities, is employing persons who are going to undermine and compromise the jobs of tens of thousands of daily-rated workers and you cannot see the connection? I want you to connect the dots, you must connect the dots, Mr. Vice-President, and I am sorry that my dear friend, hon. Joan Yuille-Williams cannot connect the dots because it is clear. So what we are arguing here is how can you—and when I talk about CEPEP what has them upset is because we are talking about local councillors, people who are advisors.

Mr. Vice-President, I want to let you know that some of these advisors are now contractors, some are now CEPEP contractors. Is that what Sen. The Hon. Joan Yuille-Williams does not want to hear? She does not want to know about the councillors who are now advisors and got contract for \$600,000 in three months? She is saying that I am irrelevant. I want to tell you that there are names of people here who are advisors and the Minister is asking us to give endorsement to a measure to extend the life of the corporations where he appointed advisors, that is what he told us—advisors.

Mr. Vice-President, I am showing this honourable Senate that some of these advisors who are no longer councillors—hear their names, Roopchand Balliram; he

is an advisor now you know. He is from the Siparia Regional Corporation. A “fella” called Philip Salazar, he is also an advisor from the Siparia Regional Corporation. They formed a company called “Roopy” Roopy’s Contracting Services, Mr. Vice-President. These people who are now advisors and they are getting paid. The Minister will tell you that they receive their monthly allowance. The reason he extended the life of the corporations is because he wants to ensure that these people receive their moneys. They are getting their money from the Minister of Local Government every month and Roopy’s Contracting Services received \$545,288.66. Two councillors formed a company, they are advisors and they get almost \$0.5 million.

Mr. Vice-President, I go on further. Jennifer Marryshow is also an advisor from the San Fernando City Corporation. She formed a company and “she bold”, you know; she calls it Marryshow Maintenance Services. She puts her name and she is a councillor, now advisor. She got \$393,342.09 and I want you to note that in 12 months if you multiply that, it is \$1.2 million. That is to campaign, Mr. Vice-President. They are using taxpayers’ money in a most illegal and illegitimate way in order to fund their campaign, and you know the scandal about this thing is the discrimination.

I am a citizen of this Republic, and I am ashamed at the kind of unprecedented racial discrimination. I say PNM is practising a modern and sophisticated form of apartheid in Trinidad and Tobago because Indian people did not vote for them, or because they believe large sections are UNC, they just discriminate against them. All the CEPEP programmes they have all over the country, there is nobody from the UNC. [*Crosstalk*] Roopy is Balliram and Salazar.

Mr. Vice-President, another advisor, Darian Marcelle, was the Chairman of the Diego Martin Regional Corporation before and co-owner Wendell Stephen, ex-St. James West councillor, formed a company called DARWEN Limited and received \$551,664.47.

As I said, I have no problem with somebody earning a dollar, everybody must live. What I have a problem with, is the deliberate, calculated, wilful misallocation of taxpayers’ moneys to feed their supporters. The PNM is in a feeding frenzy and they are seeing about their people.

I take objection as a citizen of this Republic to be treated as a second-class citizen. I will revolt and rebel! Do not try to enslave me in my country! Not because I did not vote for the PNM, I am not entitled to live and my family is not entitled to live, and my children are not entitled to go to school. That is what the PNM is doing. They are breeding people in this country who will eventually revolt. They cannot take this thing for long, you know, Mr. Vice-President, they cannot be

treating people like that. I must starve, and you must eat? That must be the slogan: if I “cyar” eat, you “cyar” eat, and if I “cyar” live, you “cyar” live. That is what the slogan must be.

The PNM cannot continue to discriminate and deny people their basic, fundamental, human rights and that is what it is doing. Forty-four million dollars in three months expanded for three years, or three times, so \$0.5 billion. But you want to send home 9,000 workers at Caroni (1975) Limited. You cannot subsidize Caroni (1975) Limited you know. It is earning foreign exchange. Are CEPEP workers earning foreign exchange?

Mr. Vice-President, I raise the point of CEPEP in the context of the undermining of local government. I am seeing where the Minister is presiding over an arrangement and if he is not careful—your Prime Minister is a hater of workers, he hates workers. I just asked for a list of all the people who are members of boards because we never got it from the Government. They were not as open and transparent as the UNC. Every time we appointed people to state boards, it was on the newspaper for everybody to see. When they appoint people, it is hidden, we have to extract it from them and I got it today. They do not want workers to be on state boards you know, they say that is a conflict of interest.

Sen. Dr. Lenny Saith is another hater of workers, he is anti-worker, I know that. He does not want workers on state boards but you know what, when you go through the list, you see a “fella” who is the vice-president of Amoco, BPTT.

Sen. Dr. Saith: Mr. Vice-President, just so that in another place and another time the Senator does not say that he made a charge and it was not denied. I wish to state that I do not hate workers, Sen. Mark, I have nothing with workers. I am not the architect of any policy to keep workers off state boards. When he has time to go through the list, he will find a number of working task representatives on the state boards.

Sen. W. Mark: Mr. Vice-President, I am glad the Minister said so, but you see, words are cheap, we have no problem with that, anybody could deny it. No big thing. The reality is, they do not want to put workers on state boards, but you go to Petrotrin and you have the vice-president of BPTT as a director on the board of Petrotrin. A competitor you know, BPTT is a competitor. There is a “fella” who has a leasehold arrangement with Petrotrin Venture Capital Production on the board.

What I am saying is that the Government must have some kind of vision and I do not see it. All I am seeing is a PNM frenzy, they just care about themselves, they do not care about people.

Sen. Dr. Saith: Mr. Vice-President, on a point of order, I draw your attention to Standing Order 35(1), on relevance.

Mr. Vice-President: Hon. Senators, the speaking time of the hon. Senator has expired.

Motion made, That the hon. Senator's speaking time be extended by 15 minutes. [*Sen. S. Baksh*]

Question put and agreed to.

Sen. W. Mark: Mr. Vice-President, even silence is agreement. I always maintain that. I have 15 more minutes and I want to let you know that as I deal with the Municipal Corporations (Amdt.) Bill, one of its functions is to ensure that residents of communities, particularly the rural communities, have access to pipe-borne water and where there is no access, the responsibility of the corporation is to supply truck borne water.

The Water and Sewerage Authority (WASA) has indicated to us, and maybe Minister Dumas at the appropriate time will tell us that we have a harsh dry season. Mr. Vice-President, in Tobago, your country, your island, I understand they have begun to ration water and in Trinidad there are large areas of this country—whether it is central or south Trinidad—where people have not had water for five days.

What I want to tell you here is that the Minister of Local Government knows that truck-borne water is an essential part of the councils' functions and appropriate allocations have to be released because in many areas people do not have water for three and four days. The PNM is a nightmare and a blight you know. As soon as it came into office, water gone. Every day people used to get water in Laventille, Arima, Princes Town and as soon as the PNM came, no water. This PNM is an evil force.

Mr. Vice-President, I want to ask the hon. Minister why he is starving the UNC-controlled regional corporations as it relates to the allocation or release of funds for them to hire contractors to supply residents of those areas who are in need of water. I want him to tell us why he is doing that. I understand the moneys that are being used are very small; \$50,000, \$400,000, \$500,000, in four weeks' time that goes out the window and he knows that, he was a former local government representative.

All I am saying to my dear friend is that there is a situation where, if you look at the tendering procedures in the absence of the corporations or the councils, who are the people responsible for approving or awarding contracts? It is the Minister,

Municipal Corporations (Amdt.) Bill
[SEN. MARK]

Tuesday, March 11, 2003

the CEO, and maybe the Central Tenders Board. I understand that the Minister can handle up to \$100,000. [*Crosstalk*]

I understand there is a procedure where the councils used to have their own tender committees, which are no longer in existence because the councils do not exist and basic, elementary matters that people need to undertake in their communities within the corporation cannot be done.

I want Sen. Dr. Lenny Saith to listen to this one, I want to let this Senate and you know that contractors who did a lot of work for people of this country are owed hundreds of millions of dollars and I want to know, for instance, how soon those moneys are going to be paid to those contractors. Here it is you pay CEPEP contractors; one-man and two-man contractors get \$44 million and by the end of this year, they will have \$1.2 million, but people who have done work already, there is no money for them. I understand the State owes over \$100 million, but my information is that the only reason the State is not paying the money is because some high officials want a kickback; some want 10 per cent, some want 20 per cent. Corruption! So you have people who are legitimate contractors not being given what is considered to be their just due.

I also feel as we talk about the local government, the municipal corporation—
[*Crosstalk*]

Mr. Vice-President: Senators, please allow Sen. Mark to make his contribution undisturbed.

Sen. W. Mark: Mr. Vice-President, I am saying to the Minister that there ought to be a greater level of consultation and communication because I understand what is taking place at the municipal level with these advisory committees and CEPEP. There are jobs that are supposed to be undertaken by the councils or these advisory bodies that are being taken on by other bodies and there is no communication.

The Minister of Local Government does not communicate with the corporations as he ought to, to let them know that CEPEP is brush-cutting here today as the case may be. So what you have is that these workers, without any guidance or direction are a vote bank for the PNM. They have actually bribed these workers to work for them, and if you want to be a CEPEP worker, you have to be either a PNM, or have a PNM card and if you are not a PNM or do not have a PNM card, you have no work to get in this country. [*Interruption*]

I am not casting aspersions; I am saying that the PNM is discriminating in the distribution of state resources. I have nothing against workers, I represented them

for years so I have no problem with workers. I always say blame managers and the owners. I do not blame workers for these things unless they do something extremely wrong. If you are dishonest, I have a problem with that.

Mr. Vice-President, do you know that within the local government bodies, the councils, the corporations where they now have these advisory committees, that the Unemployment Relief Programme (URP) is located in these corporations? Are you aware of that? Further, what is happening is that the Minister of Local Government does not extend any kind of control to the UNC corporations or advisory committees to employ people. In the areas where the PNM has control, they hire and they fire and in the areas where the UNC is located the Ministry supplies the labour. Is that not discriminatory?

There is a situation where the Minister is taking charge of everything he is not supposed to be taking charge of and it is not fair. I am saying that the Minister of Local Government ought to be giving more power to these bodies. I understand also—and the Minister can tell me if I am wrong—that within the local government, the municipal corporations where we have these advisory committees are running the show. That is what the Minister claims, but he is the person who is actually running the show.

Mr. Vice-President, it has become so bad that in some areas in Nariva, Ortoire/Mayaro if they put up street lights, and after they put them up they discover that the people voted for the UNC, they take them down. [*Crosstalk*] They remove the lights; that is the extent of the wickedness of the PNM.

Mr. Vice-President, we feel that the Minister needs to give us some real explanations of the measures that are before us. We do not understand why he is trying to ask us to endorse and support illegal acts. We do not support the view that a person who was a deputy chairman should now be deemed a chairman because that person has no local standing in the context of what we are discussing today, and I want to find out if that person has already been paid.

The Minister must tell us if that vice-chairperson whom he is trying to get us to endorse as a chairperson today has already been paid, and what he is looking for is a rubber stamp arrangement here. The only time local government bodies would get some respect in this country and stop being used and abused is when we enshrine into the Constitution of our country local regional corporations. The same thing done for the Tobago House of Assembly must be done for these regional corporations and municipalities because the Government—and I do not care which government it is, I am saying that for the local government bodies to have the kind

of respect necessary they must be given constitutional status. Place them in the Constitution of our country so that no government could manipulate them.

Mr. Vice-President, you must never forget what we are debating today is something that is not strange to the PNM. It has always asked for the extension of local government. Under Eric Williams, they extended local government for seven years. No local government election was held in Trinidad and Tobago for over a period of seven years under the late Dr. Eric Williams. So it is not strange today that we have a further extension. It is the same mentality.

Our view is that we must enshrine local government authorities and bodies into our Constitution. We believe that will deal with discrimination because this Government practises discrimination, there is no doubt about it and until the Attorney General, who is always making excuses—she cannot pass the Equal Opportunity Bill because it is not ready.

Mr. Vice-President: Sen. Mark, you have just two minutes to wrap up.

Sen. W. Mark: As far as we are concerned, we need proper action on the belief that the hon. Minister owes us a proper explanation on the matters we have raised, and I want to serve notice that if we do not get that kind of explanation that will convince us, we will reserve our right.

I also want to indicate that their Prime Minister says we are now irrelevant. We will prove to this country that this UNC Opposition is extremely relevant. I keep saying that those who cannot hear will feel and there will come a time when all that bravado and “ol” talk about irrelevance of the Opposition, and that there is no need for an Opposition, I am saying at the end of the day we shall see what we shall see.

Thank you very much.

Sen. Dr. Jennifer Kernahan: Mr. Vice-President, the price of freedom is eternal vigilance and I really feel a sense of outrage and shame on behalf of all the citizens of this country today when the PNM can come into this Parliament and bring a Bill which seeks to validate the illegality imposed on this country by the Cabinet when they refused to call the local government election when it was constitutionally due.

Mr. Vice-President, elections are serious business. They are the foundation of our democracy and our traditions and the people of this country have fought for our democratic tradition, and I think it is an affront to every citizen of this country that such a Bill could be introduced to this Parliament in the manner in which it is being done.

The relationship between a government and a people is based on principle and trust and it has to work both ways. People have to be able to trust this Government and understand that it will act on principle always, regardless of the circumstances. What we are saying is that when this trust is betrayed by the Government, and when the principles are violated as they have been in this case, then it is a very sad day in this country.

The Minister has spoken about the 18/18 deadlock and the inability to come to Parliament to deal with the question of extending the date for the election, but what we are saying, and what the PNM has not heard up to this day is that the 18/18 deadlock situation was a cry for justice and equality in this country and not discrimination against half the population. That has yet to be answered by the PNM Government.

Mr. Vice-President, when you are talking about an example of the discrimination, we are talking about how the people are groaning under the weight daily. We had the misfortune to view on the national television recently where the Prime Minister of this country stood up in a political meeting, speaking to partisan PNM supporters, and said that he is going to give them a handicap in the race for economic survival because he is refusing to send out tenders for CEPEP and those contracts, and he is telling his PNM supporters that he is going to give them a handicap in the race. That is the sort of mentality and culture that we are breeding in this country.

I have no objections to giving those who are deserving in our society a handicap in order to advance themselves economically. That is what you are supposed to do as a government, but you are not supposed to give it to PNM supporters only. You have to give it to all who are deserving in the society, and that is the problem we have. [*Desk thumping*] You will not get anything from the Government if you are not a PNM supporter and that is the tragic reality of what we are facing in this country today; and this is where the PNM has betrayed the trust of this country.

The trust of the people in electing a government into office is that the government will work on behalf of all the people. So you cannot stand in broad daylight and tell people it is only PNM supporters who will get a handicap to advance themselves economically. That is betrayal of the highest order, and I say again, that the price of freedom is eternal vigilance. Who have ears to hear let them hear.

The people of this country have to sit up and take notice of what is happening because we know that many countries have gone down this road. We have had the

experience of many countries which have had no respect for constitutionally due election and we have seen Hitler and what has happened in Germany; we have seen Mussolini and what has happened in Italy; we have seen what has happened with Papa Doc in Haiti; we have seen what has happened in Uganda with Idi Amin; and we are seeing what is happening here with Patrick Manning's PNM.

Mr. Vice-President, that is the political reality of our situation. Election is not a joke, this is our democratic tradition and when election is due it is due and you are supposed to come to the people and make proper arrangements so that the people can give another mandate to whomever is in office. You just cannot stroll in here whenever you like, drop a bill on the table and say, take that. Mr. Vice-President, this is outrageous.

One of the ways this PNM Government has betrayed the people in a very fundamental way has to do with the way they deal with local government. They pay all this lip service and shed all these crocodile tears for unemployment, the social sector, and developing young people by giving employment to them. If they were serious about that and the development, training and the future of young people in this country, they would engage the constitutionally established bodies like the local government and so on to bring young people into productive work. That is what they would do.

I say to the young people of CEPEP, HYPE, URP that a job is their right. They have a right to work in this country, and where the PNM Government has betrayed these people is by politicizing the right of young people to work in this country. You have to know a Minister, you have to know Jarrette Narine, you have to know Rahael, and you have to know somebody to get a job in this country. You have to be running to the Minister's office; and this is where they have betrayed the trust of these people.

Mr. Vice-President, the local government bodies need to be functioning as established by the Constitution and if the Government is serious about development, it is going to bring all these young people—instead of side-stepping local government—[*Interruption*]

Sen. Joseph: Mr. Vice-President, on a point of order, Standing Order 35(1).

Sen. Mark: I think the PNM should go home and sleep because they are tired. [*Crosstalk*]

Mr. Vice-President: Sen. Mark, I would like to advise that we keep to the Bill that we are discussing please. We should try to be relevant and try to minimize the

waste of time. Sen. Dr. Kernahan, could you stay within the Bill we are discussing, please?

Sen. Dr. J. Kernahan: Mr. Vice-President, we are speaking about the constitutional viability and protection of local government, of these municipal corporations, and we are saying it is a fundamental part of our democratic tradition, and they need to play a crucial role in the development process. We are saying that it is necessary for the Government to recognize that these are the institutions that have been established historically, and we need to bring our people into this environment and not create unsustainable environment.

As a young person, if you need to go to the bank to get a loan to buy a house or to buy a car or whatever, you cannot tell anybody that you are working for CEPEP. It is a different story if you go to the bank with a letter saying that you are an employee with some local government corporation, and I am saying that we cannot play fast and loose with our Constitution, and the right of our people to live, work and be productive citizens. We cannot play fast and loose with constitutionally due election, and I am saying that the PNM Government is carrying us very quickly down the road to fascism in this country.

Mr. Vice-President, the question of sustainable employment and real employment and training in the environment of local government, local government is responsible—

Mr. Vice-President: The Bill we are discussing has to do with the extension of the life of the municipal corporations and I would like us to keep the debate leaning towards that please. Please be guided.

Sen. Dr. J. Kernahan: Thank you, Mr. Vice-President. Sen. Mark indicated to this Senate that we will not support the Bill as presented to this Senate in this fashion, with the illegal establishment of these so-called advisory bodies which have no basis in our Constitution and in the Local Government Act.

As we have enunciated so clearly, we view these advisory bodies, this whole scenario as being very illegal, very anti-people and we are saying it is another glaring example of the fact that this Government is governing on behalf of part of the population and not the whole population.

The passing of this Bill will be viewed by future generations as one of the most infamous acts of this Government. It is an act which this regime is going to impose on this country and it is going to put a stamp of approval, it is going to make official the policy of discrimination, arrogance and total disrespect for the rule of

Municipal Corporations (Amdt.) Bill
[SEN. DR. KERNAHAN]

Tuesday, March 11, 2003

law and order in this country. And as I said, the people have to open their eyes. People are looking at what is happening and not because it brings short-term gains to advisory bodies that are able now to take advantage of this lawlessness in the society and form themselves into a “wash-your-foot” and jump-in company.

What is the history of these companies? We know for example there are many traditional organizations in this society that are not able to get contracts, not able to make a legitimate contribution in the development of this country. So clearly, the whole scenario is about sustaining the life of the PNM under the concept of, if you are not with me you are against me, and who are with me will live, those who are not with me will die.

Mr. Vice-President, what we are saying is that the maintenance of the extension of the Municipal Corporations Act, as I said before, is one that we will not support and that any right-thinking person in this country will see how wrong it is, how arrogant, and illegal it is. We are saying that the Government had its chance; they were in a situation where they were supposed to listen to the voice of the people and carry the politics where the people directed it should go; 18/18 meant a situation where you needed a new political direction. They lost that chance and they are coming here today to railroad and impose their concept of governance on the people of Trinidad and Tobago.

Mr. Vice-President, this will not continue for long. This is a very short-term ride; they are having a good ride, they are enjoying themselves, they are laughing, they are having fun while people are starving, people are groaning, they are feeling the weight of discrimination, and the Prime Minister is saying they will openly discriminate against people who are not PNM and they are all having fun at this time, but it will not last. Every rope has an end and the end of the PNM will come very soon.

Thank you.

Sen. Carolyn Seepersad-Bachan: Mr. Vice-President, this afternoon I want to support my colleagues on this side of the Senate. Before us is this Bill that seeks to extend the life of the councillors of the municipal corporations and the mechanism to be proposed is the establishment of an advisory council, and as a result of that, the councillors being retained as advisors with the same role and functions in terms of this advisory committee.

I want to deal with Act No. 21 of 1990, which established a level of governance which, if we use an analogy to the corporate world, is one where there is some transparency and accountability. If one looks at the sections of this Act and looks at

the accountability measures established in this Act, the local government bodies and municipal corporation bodies are indeed practising some level of governance which we should commend.

I am going to point out some of the sections and then look at them in terms of these councillors acting as advisors. If one takes a look at the section of the Act that deals with the management and effectiveness, one would notice that there is the establishment of a chief executive officer. In the Act, there is also the establishment of several standing committees like finance and human resource, on issues such as infrastructure and any other committee as the corporation may deem fit to deal with the matters and the business of the corporation, and 51 per cent of the committee must be drawn from the council.

If one looks at the meetings, there are open meetings and how the Minutes are to be filed. It is very similar to what happens in the corporate world, but what we have been seeing over the last year as my colleagues have indicated, is a lack of accountability and transparency.

If one looks at the Municipal Corporations Act, there are sections which deal with disciplinary proceedings. There are sections which deal with how you coordinate with other state agencies. Why? Because you want to practise efficiency and effectiveness; how one coordinates with other state agencies such as WASA and Trinidad and Tobago Electricity Commission (T&TEC).

That is so that the people of this country can derive value for money spent and that is the purpose. We do not go digging up a road after it has been paved to put a water line and this is the reason for having such coordinating committees established.

There is also a section that deals with how the local association is formed and if we look at the intent, it ensures that there is coordination among all the municipal corporations. The one that I was very interested in was section 121(1) of this Act, which dealt with conflict of interest. It says:

“Where a member of a Council has any pecuniary interest, whether direct or indirect, in a contract or proposed contract or any other matter, he shall disclose the nature of his interest at the first meeting of the Council at which he is present after the relevant facts have come to his knowledge.”

And it goes through a whole section of what he is supposed to do when himself or herself or a spouse has any such interest in any contract or any other business matter before the council.

Mr. Vice-President, it is interesting to note that when we look at CEPEP and we see the same issues and some of the councillors, for example, Mr. Roopchand Balliram and Philip Salazar receiving \$545,000—

Sen. Dr. Saith: Mr. Vice-President, before the hon. Senator continues, I see where she is heading into improper motives. Please be advised that the councillors whom she is quoting as having done work have not been doing work for the council. If she did her work, she will know CEPEP is not a local government body.

Sen. C. Seepersad-Bachan: Mr. Vice-President, I would like to finish this point and I know that is the justification that would be used, but the ethics and principles must still be applied. So are you telling me this is why we are now trying to circumvent or subvert the processes that have been firmly established for accountability? Is that what we are trying to do? Do you recognize, had this same set of contracts been awarded before the council or the corporation, that such individuals would have had to declare a conflict of interest and abstain from such proceedings and they would have had to go through the same processes? So if these same contracts had been before the corporation and not CEPEP, I am saying the same ethics and principles should be applied. Therefore, from your own admission, are you now saying, Sen. Dr. Saith, through you, Mr. Vice-President, that is why CEPEP was set up, so at the end of the day it could avoid section 121 of this Act?

I know the Director of Public Prosecutions (DPP) is an independent office, it has always been so and I would like to know where the DPP stands on an issue like this in terms of a conflict of interest. As a result of that, I would call on the DPP to peruse and investigate this because what we are seeing is a breakdown in accountability down to the level of local government. And if we are to instill into the citizens of this country the confidence that is so desired for governance, this is what is required.

The Prime Minister openly admitted that he will continue and he will expand threefold the CEPEP. Is that because he does not want any more of such projects to go before the municipal corporations, which is where it should rightfully be? Are we at the end of the day undermining and removing the work and responsibility of the local government corporations? That is what concerns me and the terms of issues of governance, and I am a strong advocate of that because at the end of the day we want to be a country—[*Interruption*]

Let me tell you something Madam—Mr. Vice-President, through you, let me answer the Attorney General and she very well knows it. There is nothing in

National Petroleum on me. [*Desk thumping*] Every report that has been written has reiterated the integrity of the former board of directors of National Petroleum. So do not let her get away with that nonsense at all. Every report that has been written has been fully investigated and there is nothing and she knows that. That is why she could sit here and do that. She cannot go outside and do that. Anytime you try to tell the other side where this country should be going, they want to jam you back on this side by saying you are corrupt here, you are corrupt there and imputing.

For the five to six years, that is all the other side has ever done; talk about imputing improper motives and chastising and maligning people's character in this country. That is what they have done and at the end of the day, look at the culprits in this whole thing. These are the people at the end of the day who are undermining governance in this country. Do not tell me about that, Madam Attorney General!

Sen. Smith: The worst thing that ever happened in this country.

Sen. C. Seepersad-Bachan: Mr. Vice-President, what I was about to say in terms of the ethics, convention and tradition—because we must apply ethics across the board if we are to be serious. If we want our citizens to believe that at the end of the day we are ethical, then it must apply across the board whether it is at a high level or the lowest level of governance, the local/ municipal level.

6.00 p.m.

But you see, we have heard so much today why we have not had a local government election to date. I heard it is because of the tie; the 18/18; no Parliament et cetera; the Cabinet took the decision to extend the life. They took the decision. The Parliament convened here in October of last year, and do you know not for one minute—yes, we had the budget statement; what happened in November; what happened in December? What happened then? Is it because at that point in time they wanted to further other programmes that can compete with the municipal corporations? Why did we not take urgent steps to deal with the municipal corporations? After so much effort has been placed in developing this Bill, why is it today that we are seeing this amendment?

This is where we are undermining governance. We are being asked here to validate an illegal act. This is why at the end of the day the Parliament is of no value. This is why you can pick up the Parliament and move it and go anywhere. We on this side have no contribution to make at the end of the day, because it is not heeded to on the other side.

When we talk about governance, ethics and principles and the other side speaks, they must deal with these issues first. If they are serious about their local

Municipal Corporations (Amdt.) Bill
[SEN. SEEPERSAD-BACHAN]

Tuesday, March 11, 2003

government corporations, then get on with it. We should see an election sooner than later, if we want to get our standards back up. I heard no date yet for election. Probably the Leader of Government Business might be able to enlighten us on the date for the election. Let us get our councillors, aldermen and chairmen back in office. Announce the date for the election. For some time now we have been asking when is the local government election.

But you see, Mr. Vice-President, you always wonder why we take these particular courses of action. At the last Senate sitting, my dear friend across there, Pundit Maniedeo Persad, spoke about the same ethics, principles and intellectual honesty. I was referring to these same issues, that when there is no accountability or transparency people either resign—or they should resign—and he told me, “No. Well, what happened to the last administration?” You find the examples. I quoted him the examples currently before the citizens of this country that require some accountability and transparency, and as a result of that people should resign.

That is what I said in my contribution. But, you see, I do not know. I see, “Prakash Persad” here, a very good learned friend of mine. Actually, the Pundit will remember, it is Dr. Prakash Persad who took me to meet Mr. Basdeo Panday several years ago. That was my first introduction. [*Desk thumping*] But here I see this colleague of mine, a former lecturer at the University of the West Indies in Mechanical Engineering, receiving \$320,000-odd in CEPEP. I do not know how many more \$320,000 contracts are to be received. Is this the price that you are paid for your support of the PNM? As you would see, this is pay-back time, because your very same Prime Minister said—

Sen. Dr. Saith: Mr. Vice-President, on a point of order. This debate is not about CEPEP and even if it were, we are getting where repetition is becoming the norm. Sen. Mark has gone through that; Sen. Dr. Kernahan has gone through that. Please, Mr. Vice-President, relevance!

Mr. Vice-President: Madam Senator, I am forced to agree with the Leader of Government Business. We are slipping away from the Bill and what we are here about. I would like you to confine your contribution to it, please.

Sen. C. Seepersad-Bachan: Thank you, Mr. Vice-President. But you see, after we extend the term of the life of these councillors on the advisory committee from July 12, 2002, I wonder how much life they would have, because after other programmes erode the functions of the corporations, I am not sure that we will need any councillors after all is said and done. This is the point that I was trying to make, that it makes no sense—we are sitting here; we are debating an amendment to the Municipal Corporations Act to extend the life, and I am not sure what we are

extending it to do, because there are so many other programmes competing and eroding the municipal corporations.

Mr. Vice-President, this is the contribution that I wanted to make. When we want to be intellectually honest, we must be honest about intellectual honesty, my dear friend. [*Desk thumping*]

Mr. Vice-President, with that, I thank you. [*Desk thumping*]

The Minister of Local Government (Hon. Jarrette Narine): Mr. Vice-President, I heard in the other place that there are certain people who come to this Upper House every Tuesday to sing for their supper. I did not believe it. Today, I am very much in the place here, in this business, to know that.

Mr. Vice-President, I have the *Hansard* of Tuesday, December 19, 1995 when the Minister of Local Government, the hon. Dhanraj Singh came to this Senate and moved the same amendments. I would like to read parts of this contribution. It states at page 86:

“In the case of (b), this was occasioned by the fact that the Chairman of the Sangre Grande Regional Corporation...”

Sen. Mark: On a point of order. The Minister cannot quote in this Senate a statement made by a minister then in the House of Representatives.

Hon. J. Narine: This is the *Hansard* record. Mr. Vice-President, apparently the Leader of Business on the other side cannot understand. This is the *Hansard* record and this was brought to the Senate on Tuesday, December 19, 1995. It was brought by one whom their Prime Minister said was the best minister of government. So how could you say today that this is irrelevant? The same problems that we had in the labour congress are what we are having here.

The situation at that time, Mr. Vice-President, is the same that we have today, where at that time the local government election was put off for the general election. That is exactly what happened. At that time the Member for Pointe-a-Pierre, the then Minister of Local Government, came to Parliament with this very Bill asking to have it passed for an extension. I read these parts of *Hansard* because I would like Senators to understand that we have heard for the last few hours a lot of talk that meant nothing to the relevance of the Bill. I continue:

“In the case of (b)...”

And “(b)” at that time was asking that the vice-chairman of the Sangre Grande Regional Corporation take the place of the Member of Parliament elected, Mr. Roger Boynes. It is here so I am reading it into the record.

“In the case of (b), this was occasioned by the fact that the Chairman of the Sangre Grande Regional Corporation, Mr. Roger Boynes, was a successful candidate in the November 6, 1995 general elections, and had to vacate office in accordance with section 8(f) of the Municipal Corporations Act...”

No problem then, but problems now because they are on that side and they would remain on that side for a long, long time.

There are other areas I would like to read. This is page 88:

“In closing, may I state that the purposes of this Bill recently passed in the House of Representatives are as follows:

- (i) to provide for the extension of the period of holding elections under section 11...”

which I spoke of today; the same section:

“of the Municipal Corporations Act, 1990 from the stipulated three months to nine months for the next local government elections only.”

And this is only for this local government election. So do not call wolf, like they did last year. They want election; they will get election, and we are going to be successful at the polls this year in the local government election. I continue to read:

- “(a) the Councillors and Aldermen of each Corporation whose term of office expired on the 27th day of September, 1995 shall comprise an Advisory Committee of that Corporation on the same terms and conditions of service that they enjoyed as Councillors and Aldermen;”

It is no different today. It happened then and it is happening now. But they have no shame to come here and not read the *Hansard* record. [*Interruption*] We have passed that stage. You have people in Parliament today who should be behind bars.

Sen. Mark: You might end up there, you know!

Hon. J. Narine: No, “might”. Never! I am cleaner than thou. I did not take anything from you all.

Mr. Vice-President: Senators, please let us proceed with the business without the crosstalk.

Hon. J. Narine: Mr. Vice-President, we are supposed to be in a dignified House and I can understand the problems that you are having. I continue to quote:

- “(b) the person who held office of Deputy Chairman in the Sangre Grande

Regional Corporation on the 26th day of September, 1995 shall assume the office of Chairman of the Sangre Grande Regional Corporation.”

It goes on to say:

“I beg to move.”

It is nothing new. This was done in 1995. Do you apologize?

Sen. Mark: No.

Hon. J. Narine: As a matter of fact, we did not extend any life of the council. The council came to an end on July 12 last year. Sen. Mark indicated that they had nothing to do. May I say to him that all the corporations meet on a regular basis every month and they get advice from committee meetings which advise the mayors and chairmen. This is why Mr. Nagassar was able to buy a gun from the Government’s money. They advised him. [*Interruption*] I knew after. Do you remember him saying he was going to put the gun in safe keeping at the corporation? That is the type of people there are in local government. They have taught their persons in Government how to perform in local government. They can buy a gun from the taxpayers’ funds.

Sen. Mark: So what did you do about that?

Hon. J. Narine: Ask a question and I will return to this Senate and answer you.

Mr. Vice-President: Mr. Minister, I must ask you not to refer to anybody and make speeches directly to other persons across the floor, please.

Hon. J. Narine: Thank you very much, Mr. Vice-President. I was just trying to respond to what was said here so that I can go ahead and clear up some of these problems that we were having.

What I am saying is that we did not extend the life of councillors. We placed them as advisors to advise the mayors and chairmen, and they had regular meetings. I have the minutes of those meetings—month-to-month minutes—at my office. So it is not as though we did not do it for the UNC councillors. It was done across the board, without any discrimination. All the 124 councillors, plus the aldermen, mayors and chairmen, remained in the corporations enjoying the benefits of the council and advising councillors, and in turn giving service to the people whom they represent in the field. So that we had continuity. We were prepared to have the general election last year and as I indicated, we did have the general election.

I remember in 1990 I was a councillor at the St. George East county council. I went there in 1983 and was serving my second term as a councillor and became an

Municipal Corporations (Amdt.) Bill
[HON. J. NARINE]

Tuesday, March 11, 2003

advisor for two years from 1989 to 1990. I was an advisor before coming to the Parliament of Trinidad and Tobago under the NAR. Sen. Mark indicated that this Minister and this Government were against local government and we were trying to mash up local government. May I say to him, through you, Sir, that we are the ones who brought back local government last year.

Local government was damaged under the UNC when it became the Ministry of Works and Infrastructure. Why? Because it was riddled with corruption. The sum of \$52 million is now being owed for URP for those years, for giving unsigned contracts. There is a matter in the High Court today which concerns Burket Corner in Mayaro. They call it a “Bucket” Corner. A chairman got shot for that job, because they gave \$1.4 million for that project—one hard surface court enclosed by a chain link wire. That chairman was saying—and it is in the record of the minutes—that he was not taking over that project because it was not worth \$300,000, and they paid \$1.4 million for it.

Sen. Mark: What have you done about that?

Hon. J. Narine: We have not paid the other part that did not get paved—not yet—because we need to have the quantity surveyors go out there and check these things before we pay. You could sit there today and talk about 10 per cent. This Government of Trinidad and Tobago is not going to pay the corrupt people that you paid before and gave people work without contracts to the tune of millions of dollars.

I am saying to you, Mr. Vice-President, that there are many other areas that I can speak about. It is \$52 million per year in racket that was running in the URP. This is why they want it under the corporations. But I advise Sen. Mark that the URP is not under the regional corporations; it is under the Ministry of Local Government, so that your corrupt people out there cannot put their hands on it, as they did before. You would hear more about this, because I came here specifically to call local government election so that we can win 10 out of 14 corporations. This is what I am here for. [*Desk thumping*] I am saying that after here we are going to call local government election. I do not have the date in my back pocket but I have it in my head. [*Laughter*]

Sen. Mark also indicated that under Works and Infrastructure the last development programme of their corrupt regime, in the 2001/2002 budget, \$14 million was allocated for all the 14 corporations. Let me say this. The San Juan/Laventille Regional Corporation got \$750,000 for development.

PROCEDURAL MOTION

The Minister of Public Administration and Information (Sen. The Hon. Dr. Lenny Saith): Mr. Vice-President, I beg to move that the Senate continue to sit until the completion of the debate on this Bill.

Question put and agreed to.

MUNICIPAL CORPORATIONS (AMDT.) BILL

Hon. J. Narine: Thank you very much, Mr. Vice-President.

I was indicating that the 2001/2002 budget had \$14 million for the 14 corporations and Debe/Penal got \$2 million to complete the market. So it meant that some of the corporations merely got half a million dollars. This budget has \$24 million for the 14 corporations and the Chaguanas Regional Corporation got almost \$2 million. They got the most in this budget under the People's National Movement, and the Senator talks about discrimination. [*Desk thumping*]

As far as employment is concerned, Sen. Mark spoke about CEPEP taking away jobs and quoted the Minister of Works and Transport with respect to job-creation and so on. The unions, NUGFW included, went to the Chief Personnel Officer who has given a decision on that. I am certain that Sen. Mark, if he is a good trade unionist, would know that.

I made the same statement at a function at the Diego Martin Regional Corporation recently. I am sure that all of us here have some part to play with local government because we interact with the public. Whether it is taking up your garbage or cleaning your drains, people in Trinidad—Sen. Dr. McKenzie, not Tobago; I understand—would come in front of my home and work for half an hour and leave. They do eight hours work in half an hour. I was saying that. The President of the NUGFW called me two days after asking to meet with me and my ministry. Why? Because he knew that Jarrette Narine would not make a statement like that because I am not anti-worker.

I was sending a signal to the union that they are there not only for grievances. If the union would be part and parcel of the development of this nation, then the union leaders would have their big cars to drive as normal; they would have their big houses as normal, because they depend on the workers to pay their union dues. We all understand that. But if they are not part and parcel of making this country productive, they would not save their jobs. The history of saving jobs in government, when I was a trade unionist, was the same, but as a grievance officer I never tolerated a worker coming to me who did not have a leg to stand on. I would fight their matters. I never lost one. But the next time do not come back to me.

If you have to produce a fair day's work for a fair day's pay—we must get out of the situation where people are not working; they are working for half an hour and they want to keep their jobs. Let me tell you something. Their salaries are double the salaries of CEPEP and URP. The local government daily-paid workers' salaries are double. So are we getting value for money, Sen. Mark? You had better talk to your union colleagues as I am talking to them and let us get this country in a mode for productivity and accountability. [*Desk thumping*]

Sen. Mark: Under PNM?

Hon. J. Narine: Under PNM and under this Minister in the Ministry of Local Government in this PNM Government. [*Desk thumping*]

The advisors were to advise local government mayors and chairmen. They are part-time workers. I am sure there are many Opposition and Independent Senators here who have their jobs. Local government representatives are part-time. They get time off from their jobs to go to the meetings of corporations. Local government councillors go into the field night and day, Saturday and Sunday. I am still a councillor. I have never changed from that mode. My eight years in local government taught me that you need to get outside there and meet the people. Even though they are dissatisfied, you must face them honestly and squarely, because they have placed you there to represent them, not to represent yourself.

This is the situation. So to come here and say local government representatives are getting corrupt money from Government is unfair to the councillors. You have the chairman of Debe/Penal who is an executive director of a company. Should he not hold that job?

Sen. Mark: Who said so?

Hon. J. Narine: You said that there was a conflict of interest—

Sen. Seepersad-Bachan: On a point of clarification. I never said that he is not allowed to hold a position. I said the same ethics and principles must apply across the board in terms of the award of contracts and conflict of interest.

Hon. J. Narine: Mr. Vice-President, I was speaking to Sen. Wade Mark. I am still on Sen. Wade Mark. I have only one line for Sen. Carolyn Seepersad-Bachan and I have nothing for Sen. Dr. Jennifer Kernahan. If your conscience is beating you, I have nothing to do with that. Imagine my colleague who has been in government and who has been a Cabinet minister, calls me, his colleague from the trade union movement and turns around and says I am a dictator. He must understand that there are budgetary allocations for all the corporations. I have

nothing to do with that. The Government and the Opposition voted for the last budget in this House, because they felt that what the PNM had in the documents to give to the local government authorities was more than what the UNC ever gave to local government. So they voted for it.

The money is there for the corporation to use, but if your chairmen and your councillors decide that they would take it to buy guns, and would take the money when somebody's father dies to rent chairs and tents and other things for the wake—

Sen. Mark: What do you know about that?

Hon. J. Narine: I met that there. I was asking for some clarification as to how this could happen. But this Act does not provide that when the council is in operation, they have the legal authority to do all of that. So are you going to give them further authority to do other things?

Sen. Mark:—in the Constitution.

Hon. J. Narine: Yes, in the Constitution—to buy guns, to pay for private things; to go to the restaurant every day and use Johnny Walker Black and put it on the food bill. Are you going to do that? Well, you had better check your councillors before the next election and make sure you select proper persons to go up for the local government election.

Sen. Mark: We will seek your advice.

Hon. J. Narine: You are quite aware that one of your chairmen left the UNC and ran to the PNM.

Sen. Mark: I know you bribed him.

Hon. J. Narine: I did not bribe him. He was treated with equity. He was treated well under the PNM. I have the Road Improvement Fund here, where Arima got zero for six years—no money; Diego Martin, no money; Port of Spain, no money; San Fernando, no money; for six years! Sen. Baksh knows that. The records here would show you. Do you know what Couva/Talparo/Tabaquite got? In 1998, \$6 million; 1998/1999, \$9.8 million; 1999/2000, \$17.1 million; 2000/2001, \$8.249 million. This is the ministry's record. What happened last year was that \$25 million for the Road Improvement Fund was equitably distributed throughout the 14 corporations. [*Desk thumping*]

I learnt under the PNM and I was a member of the PNM since 1963 when I was 18 years old. Let me say this. We learnt equity under the People's National

Municipal Corporations (Amdt.) Bill
[HON. J. NARINE]

Tuesday, March 11, 2003

Movement, accountability, transparency. [*Desk thumping*] I came through the youth league of the PNM and will not find myself in that position that you all find yourselves in, because four persons in the country are multi-trillionaires and the others have nothing on their tables to eat. We are going to share it around. This is why you are afraid of CEPEP, because they are budding entrepreneurs in Trinidad and Tobago. [*Desk thumping*] For that funding that you have quoted there, let me tell you. [*Interruption*] What about Autorama in El Socorro? Ask your former minister.

Mr. Vice-President: Minister and Sen. Mark, I would like to ask you to desist from the crosstalk so that we could get this done quickly.

Hon. J. Narine: Thank you, Mr. Vice-President.

The CEPEP project is the envy of everyone in Trinidad at this present time. Why? They are productive. You can see them outside there. They are proud to wear their blue uniforms; they are proud to be out there with their goggles and brush-wackers and so on. This is what the money is for. The money is not for one person only. You would interpret it as that and anybody sitting in the gallery or looking at the television, would feel that that person got \$600,000 for nothing. I am just calling a figure.

Let me say to you, the programme includes payment for workers, buying materials for the jobs, buying equipment, paying for the workers' uniforms and all that. It is one of the programmes that you would always envy, because it is productive and it is making small people entrepreneurs in Trinidad and Tobago, something that you have never done. [*Desk thumping*]

Mr. Vice-President, they have banking accounts so that the money is transferred straight into their accounts, something that they never had before, and they are working continuously. If there are 80,000 persons in this country who are unemployed and URP could only employ about 7,000 per fortnight, many persons would be unemployed. But we are working towards the year 2020 and that vision is disturbing them, that we are going to be a country of which we would be proud. We are proud of this country.

PNM is a party of 47 years old. PNM never took anything from anybody. The others that came looked at our manifestos from 1956 and have stolen all the ideas. I say so today because I have researched it.

So that my colleague, Sen. Mark, must understand that budgetary allocations were made to the corporations. I did the virements for the corporations last year; I

am doing virements where it is possible. I have not heard you say—because you said I am a dictator—how I am a dictator. Not one of those corporations can say that I turned them down for anything. I turned down their trips abroad. They wanted to go and see cricket in South Africa. That is what I turned down. If they are annoyed about that, I am waiting for the new corporations to come into existence and let them benefit from this. Because there are some people who wanted to go who will not be councillors again and may not be chairmen or mayors. Why should they use the funding for foreign travel? I am not going to allow that. It is against my conscience. [*Interruption*] Do not say I travelled. Over the last two years I have not travelled anywhere. I had no reason to go anywhere to talk about decentralization. I have been talking about decentralization since 1983 when I became a member of the St. George East County Council. I have no need to go to Guyana or anywhere to talk about decentralization. I know this Act inside out.

As we are speaking about the Act, I should put into the *Hansard* a memorandum from the Solicitor General. They call me a dictator:

"From: Solicitor General

To: Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Local Government

Dated: August 21, 2002

SUBJECT:

Clarification re Request for Legal Advice concerning the Administration of Municipal Corporations

My memorandum dated August 15, 2002 with respect to advice sought on the administration of Municipal Corporations refers.

In light of the queries raised by the Honourable Minister of Local Government in his letter to the Honourable Attorney General dated August 16, 2002, I wish to clarify and expand on some of the issues raised in my Opinion.

Section 112(1) of the Municipal Corporations Act, 1990, ('the Act') sets out the expenses which shall be paid out of the Corporation Fund. These are the expenses which will be incurred during the operations of the Corporations. If such expenditure has been sanctioned by the Minister..."

And I repeat:

"If such expenditure has been sanctioned by the Minister, and therefore,

paid, such expenditure shall not be disallowed by the Auditor General when an audit takes place. Section 113(4)(f)(i) of the Act is relevant.”

It simply means that I was not acting as a dictator or contrary to law. I am not a lawyer; you are not a lawyer. I am taking the advice of the Solicitor General. Because who is the accountable person? It is the permanent secretary to the Auditor General's department. Having worked in the service before, I am not going to compromise the position of any public servant in this country. I continue:

“Section 269(1) of the Act provides that the Minister may give general or specific directions to any Council in relation to Government policy touching or concerning any matter...”

So I am to be Minister there but the Mayor of Chaguanas could do what he wants. Then you would come here if he does something wrong and hold the Minister responsible for it. Is that not so? This is why this is in the Act. You must read the entire Act. Section 269(1) states exactly that. I continue:

“and it shall be the duty of the Council to govern its actions in accordance with any such directions.”

That is section 269. I continue:

“Since the Council is not in existence, in the intervening period before elections are held, the Minister cannot give directions to a non-existent Council...”

Did you hear that?

“the Minister cannot give directions to a non-existent Council in accordance with Section 269(1) of the Act. But the Corporation has to continue to carry out its functions.”

They are functioning outside there, with the mayors, chairmen, CEO's and all the other public servants. The Minister is not micro-managing anything. I am not about to do that. I came from the local government system. It goes on:

“Therefore, by virtue of section 79(1) of the Constitution...”

You want to get constitutional reform. This is talking about the Constitution.

“the Minister who is assigned with the responsibility for Municipal and other local Government bodies, is vested with the authority under the Constitution to give general or specific directions to any Corporation on matters concerning the affairs of the Corporation.

Consequently, at this time, pending the holding of elections, the Minister has the authority to give directions to Corporations as the circumstances require.”

I could read and understand English, so I am not interfering with the councils. But they come to me from time to time to get advice because they have confidence in me, having been with the local government authorities since 1983 and having represented persons at local government level through the trade union, at NUGFW. I am placing this on the record so that it is going to be clear that it is on the advice of the Solicitor General.

Truck-borne Water Supply: Last year we were blessed—and it is not a blight when the PNM was placed into government. Last year we were blessed with rainfall in-between the dry season and we saved \$5 million and we used that savings to extend our water supply to areas where there is no water. For your information, where there are non-existent lines, local government has the responsibility to deliver a truck-borne water supply. If there are lines and no water, the Water and Sewerage Authority has the authority to go in there. We do not go in where there are lines with no water. WASA does that. We go into areas with no water and no lines.

We have an expenditure from the budgetary allocation and I can tell you we have started water distribution since last month, and this Minister will not be afraid to go back to the Ministry of Finance if we have a prolonged dry season, and ask for supplemental funding for water trucking. Water is an essential service. The PNM understands that. We are a sympathetic Government. We care about the people of Trinidad and Tobago. That is why we are here and you are there. [*Desk thumping*]

You would also understand that it is not the Minister but the permanent secretary who has the authority to spend up to \$100,000. Above \$100,000 and under \$500,000, there is a ministerial tenders committee. The chairman of that committee is the deputy CEO of the Central Tenders Board. That did not happen the way in which Sen. Smith and they gave out millions of dollars and broke it up in 20 and 40 contracts—

Sen. Smith: On a point of order. The Minister is imputing improper motives. I, Arnim Smith, have never given out a contract under the Employment Training Programme (ETP). All the contracts that were given out were approved and given out by Hart Edwards, the permanent secretary. I work under a permanent secretary; I consult him all the time; I send things to him and he does them. I never gave out any contracts so I would like the Minister to withdraw that statement. If he cannot bring the proof to this Senate, ask him to withdraw it.

Hon. J. Narine: Mr. Vice-President, they gave no contracts. There was nothing written. The sum of \$1.4 million was broken up in 15 parts, to keep it under \$100,000.

Mr. Vice-President: Mr. Minister, I know you did not say Arnim Smith gave out a contract; you said “Sen. Smith and they”. So we have to be a little careful with the specifics. But I would like to ask you to stay within the discussion of the extension of the municipal corporations.

Hon. J. Narine: Thank you, Mr. Vice-President. I was simply responding to all matters which were raised in this debate.

Sen. Smith: On a point of order. He said “Sen. Smith”, meaning me. I would like him to withdraw it if he does not have the evidence. He said, “Sen. Smith and they gave out contracts”. If he does not have the evidence, I would like him to withdraw it. I do not come here and make allegations against people.

Hon. J. Narine: Thank you, Mr. Vice-President—

Sen. Mark: Mr. Vice-President, on a point of order—

Mr. Vice-President: Did you rise to respond to Sen. Smith?

Hon. J. Narine: Yes, Sir.

Sen. Smith: I am asking you to rule.

Hon. J. Narine: Mr. Vice-President, for peace’ sake, I will withdraw that statement. [*Desk thumping*] What I am saying is that the persons who were responsible for URP gave 15 contracts under \$100,000 for the same job. They broke it up. We know how it is. I think Sen. Baksh understands it. He was a Cabinet Minister. He understands that you can break up millions of dollars into small bits for the same job, which is illegal.

They built a fishing depot in Fullerton Village going to Icacos. I passed there. It is a shed with some rooms to put fishing tackle and enclosed with chain-link wire which cost \$1.1 million. It was built on private lands. Do you believe that? Would you believe, Sen. Mark, that the UNC would erect a building by the sea on private lands? But those are the facts.

Mr. Vice-President: Hon. Senators, the speaking time of the Minister has expired.

Motion made, That the hon. Minister's speaking time be extended by 15 minutes. [*Sen. The Hon. Dr. L. Saith*]

Question put and agreed to.

Hon. J. Narine: Thank you very much, Mr. Vice-President. I understand that this does not happen often in the Senate. But today Sen. Mark is going to work for his money.

Sen. Mark: I always do.

Hon. J. Narine: The sum of \$50 million in contracts is what was owed for previous years when we took over the Unemployment Relief Programme. I do not know how much was spent; I am only speaking about what was owed to the contractors—the same contractors he is begging for. I understand that the UNC collected the money upfront and in some cases they did no work, and you expect me to pay, or the Ministry of Finance.

Let me say this. There are certain companies that are registered under UNC people's names. I have the information. The time will come for handcuffs, like the Piarco International Airport. You wait and you will hear.

Sen. Mark: Talk, talk, talk.

Hon. J. Narine: You talked for 45 minutes and I said nothing.

Sen. Mark: Take action!

Hon. J. Narine: As I said, I apologize to Sen. Dr. Jennifer Kernahan, but she did not say anything pertaining to the Bill to which I should respond. Sen. Seepersad-Bachan spoke about contracts. She was speaking about the conflict of interest clause in Act No. 21 of 1990 which states that councillors are not to be involved in contracts of their corporation. This is what was intended. No councillors are to enter into contracts in their corporation. I cannot stop a councillor from taking a contract at Petrotrin or National Petroleum, for doing nothing, because they are part-time workers. But they cannot have contracts from the corporation.

Sen. Mark: Or stop somebody from making 10 per cent.

Hon. J. Narine: Or who should be behind bars sitting all over the place and walking all over the place.

Mr. Vice-President, I simply came here this afternoon to make way for the local government election. Last year we went to the Crowne Plaza and got a document signed, but they could sign anything and turn their backs on it the following day. That is common practice. They said whosoever is given the position of Government, they will abide. But the PNM has a track record of anything that we promise, we deliver. [*Desk thumping*] From that accord, if we were not placed in Government it would have made no difference to us. It is because of that situation and the country did not decide whether to keep Barabbas or Jesus, that we ended up with an 18/18. So we had a deadlock. [*Interruption*] I said keep Barabbas, who was the government at the time. [*Desk thumping*] [*Laughter*] Who is the person that said, “hey kid, let's go home”, and two days after deny the signatures?

Municipal Corporations (Amdt.) Bill
[HON. J. NARINE]

Tuesday, March 11, 2003

So we ended up in a situation last year where it was not convenient to have local government election. It was so inconvenient because the Opposition came and frustrated the Parliament. They produced 3,000 names for a Speaker. It was impossible to have 3,000 persons as Speaker. So we had to come to the end of local government, do what we did and we are asking this Senate today to make way for the local government election. They are afraid of elections. Why do you think Sen. Mark said he would not support the Bill? It is because he is afraid of elections.

Sen. Mark: We are never afraid of anything.

Hon. J. Narine: But you lost the last one. You joined up in one. How many elections did you win?

Sen. Mark: One.

Hon. J. Narine: Did you beat Dr. Baboolal in 1991?

Sen. Mark: No. Dr. Baboolal was in the seat by me.

Hon. J. Narine: That is a normal thing. At one time my colleague wanted to come and contest the Arouca North seat and every week he was at a barber in Arouca trimming his hair. I do not know if he was wearing wigs at the time. I know Sen. Mark not to have any hair, but he was always by the barber.

So that the first part of the Bill is really asking to have an extension of one year, from July 12, 2002 to July 12, 2003. The second part is asking that we extend from three days to within ten days to put the corporations in place after the election, so that you have a ten-day period to do so. The third part is simply asking that the vice-chairman take control of the political arm of the San Juan/Laventille Regional Corporation. This is what is happening. It happened before; it is nothing new.

I beg to move. [*Desk thumping*]

Question put and agreed to.

Bill accordingly read a second time.

Bill committed to a committee of the whole Senate.

Senate in committee.

Clauses 1 and 2 ordered to stand part of the Bill.

7.00 p.m.

Sen. Seetahal: Did we deal with subclause (c)? We dealt with (a) and (b), as far as I know we did not deal with (c). I thought we were going by (a), (b) and (c).

Did we do (c) as yet? In (c) I noticed something there:

“in section 273, by inserting after subsection (1A)..”

I do not know if section 273 has (1A). As far as I know, and I have it here before me, it is 273(1). I do not know if we are renumbering 273(1) as (1A). If that is the intention it should say so.

If I may continue, secondly in what is (1B), I am seeing the last three lines refer to the appointment of aldermen. In the Act, I do not see an appointment of aldermen; I see an election of aldermen by councillors. I think 12(4) of the Act states that aldermen shall be elected by the councillors. One may want to think that means appointment, but it says “elected”.

Finally, in that second to last line which states:

“in consequence of elections held under section 11(4C).”

For consistency, there are three things in (C); Should we include something to say that what is now 273(1) is renumbered as 273(1A)?

Sen. Morean: Quite apart from the fact that we voted on it already, Act No. 36 of 1995 amended and inserted 1(A). With respect to the part about elections, we have changed the word “elections” to “election” wherever it appears. It is a typographical error.

Sen. Seetahal: Apart from the fact that we have voted already, I wanted to know about the appointment of aldermen, because we are here now. If it is that aldermen are elected, I do not see we can put appointment, that is my contention. It would be in contravention of the Act. Since we are here now, if that is so, we should correct it. I am merely pointing out that at sections 12(4)—I know they are effectively appointed, but the Act itself talks about the election of aldermen by councillors. I am talking about the word. Nowhere in that section is there a word “appointment”. If I may read it:

“Aldermen shall be elected by the Councillors, so however, that a person who has been elected as a Councillor shall not be elected as an Alderman.”

The point is that the Act refers to election. It is a different election, but it is an election nevertheless.

Sen. Morean: “Appointment” is correct.

Sen. Seetahal: Why does the Act say one thing? I think it is important for the benefit of the rest of us, rather than being told that it is correct. The Act says one

thing and we are amending an Act. It is only reasonable to explain, if the Act says something and we are now saying something else, why that is so.

Sen. D. Montano: The appointment of aldermen in consequence of elections held under section 11(4C).

Sen. Morean: That is right. The word “appointment” is correct.

Sen. D. Montano: It is appointment in consequence of the elections.

Sen. Seetahal: Sen. Montano, I do not know if there is an issue. I am merely pointing out that the Act—I do not know if you have the Act in front of you—refers to the election of aldermen. Whether you want to deem that election an appointment is not my concern, I am pointing out that the Act, which is the substantive law that is now before us, at section 12 which follows section 11, which talks about the election of councillors has the word that—

Sen. Morean: There are two stages to the thing: after they have been elected then you have the appointment. That is why we have the 10-day period within which to properly constitute the council.

Sen. Seetahal: If Members are satisfied with that. I do not know that I got an explanation but—

Sen. Mark: I think that the Senator raised a point. I think the Attorney General should give us some clarification. If the Act is talking about an election and we are talking about an amendment to the Act and we are referring to an appointment, there is some confusion there. The Senator is just trying to get some clarification. Why is it that we are talking about appointment of aldermen, when in the Act you have the election by the Council of Aldermen?

Sen. Morean: If you look at (C) it says:

“...shall cease to exist upon the election of Councillors and the appointment of Aldermen in consequence of election held under section 11(4C)”

You have the election and then they are appointed, and that is correct.

Sen. Seetahal: The problem is, if the Act is saying—I have just read it—election, why are we being told over, and over again that you have an appointment after you have an election? The Act does not say that, with respect. I just read the Act; I have it here, it is not my written Act. Section 12(4) states that aldermen shall be elected by the councillors. It is not a general election or local government election, but it is an election, nevertheless. If the Act wanted to say “appointment”

when it came through Parliament, just like us it would have said so. For consistency alone, you must have—I am speaking about the main Act. Should I hand it to those who are not sure? I do not know if you have one; I have one here.

Sen. Mark: Is there going to be a big problem if you just delete “appointment” and just have “the election of councillors and aldermen”?

Sen. Dr. Saith: I am not a lawyer, but I think the Act spells out how they get to the position where they are appointed. They get to the position to be appointed because they have to be elected by the councillors. Once that is done—we are talking about people who are to be appointed aldermen—those people will continue in an advisory capacity. It is not talking about new aldermen. To my mind, it is quite clear, you cannot talk about elected aldermen anymore because the people who are now holding those positions have been elected by the council and then appointed as aldermen. This is about the third time we are doing this and the wording has remained the same each time. You can tell me twice they were wrong, but I am saying you also go by precedent.

Sen. Seetahal: You go by precedent when it is correct, there are times when it is not. My simple point, if I may say, Sen. Chairman, is with respect to the point I have raised. If someone could show me in the Act dealing with the appointment of aldermen, there is a word “appointment”, I will be guided. I am merely pointing out that even though we want to have a commonsensical acknowledgement that you would be appointed at some time—that section 12, which is the only section dealing with that—I have seen “election” and I do not see why there should be a big debate as to why we should change the word if there is some kind of reason for that. I have asked for an explanation which, with due respect, I have not been given to my satisfaction. If the other Members of the committee feel satisfied, so be it. I think that one must act in accordance with what statute says.

Sen. Dr. Saith: I would suggest you put it to the vote. This is really a question of opinion. Can we revisit the clause?

Sen. Mark: We want a division because we want to put on record, just in case something comes up.

Question put, That the Committee revisit clause 2.

The Committee divided:

Ayes 9 Noes 18

AYES

Mark, W.

Baksh, S.

Kernahan, Dr. J.

Seepersad-Bachan, Mrs. C.

Smith, A.

Thomas, Amb. C.

Seetahal, Miss D.

Anmolsingh-Mahabir, Mrs. P.

Khan, Brother N.

NOES

Saith, Dr. L.

Yuille-Williams, Mrs. J.

Morean, Mrs. G.

Joseph, M.

Montano, D.

Enill, C,

Gift, K.

Manning, Mrs. H.

Chin Lee, H.

Dumas, R.

Abdul-Hamid, M.

Kangaloo, Mrs. C.

Ramroop, S.

Persad, Pundit M.

Hackshaw-Marslin, Mrs. J.

Deosaran, Prof. R.

King, Mrs. M.

Quamina, Dr. D.

Question negatived.

Municipal Corporations (Amdt.) Bill

Tuesday, March 11, 2003

Mr. Chairman: Therefore, according to the result of the division, clause 2 will not be revisited.

Question put and agreed to, That the Bill be reported to the Senate.

Senate resumed.

Bill reported, without amendment, read the third time and passed.

ADJOURNMENT

The Minister of Public Administration and Information (Sen. The Hon. Dr. Lenny Saith): Mr. Vice-President, I beg to move that the Senate do now adjourn to Tuesday March. 18, 2003 at 1.30 p.m. We will be continuing the Bills as they are listed on the Order Paper.

Question put and agreed to.

Senate adjourned accordingly.

Adjourned at 7.17 p.m.

WRITTEN ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS**Directors on Various State Boards
(Qualifications and Experiences)****5. *The following question was asked by Sen. Wade Mark:***

Could the Hon. Prime Minister and Minister of Finance provide this Senate with a detailed listing of the names, addresses, qualifications and experiences of the directors on the various boards in all the:-

- (1) State Enterprises
- (2) Statutory Authorities and
- (3) Public Utilities.

Could the hon. Minister state, for how long stipends and or honoraria will be paid to each director (inclusive of Chairman and Vice-Chairman) of the respective State Enterprises, Statutory Authorities and Public Utilities?

The following reply was circulated to Members of the Senate:

- a) i Listings of the names, qualifications and experience of the directors of state enterprises, public utilities and statutory authorities, are attached as Appendix I, Appendix II and Appendix III respectively.
- ii A “Statutory Authority” as defined by the Statutory Authorities’ Service Commission Regulations, Chap. 24:01 is “a local authority as defined in the Act and any Commission, Board, Committee, Council or body (whether incorporated or incorporated) established by or under an Act other than the Companies Ordinance and declared by the President to be subject to the provisions of the Act”

The Authorities listed in the Statutory Authorities’ (Declaration) Order are as follows:

Port of Spain Corporation
Point Fortin Corporation

San Fernando City Corporation
 Arima Corporation
 National Housing Authority
 Cocoa and Coffee Industry Board
 Sugar Industry Labour Welfare Committee
 National Lotteries Control Board
 Agricultural Society of Trinidad and Tobago
 Zoological Society of Trinidad and Tobago
 St Michael's School for Boys
 St Dominic's Children's Home
 St Mary's Children's Home
 St Jude's School for Girls

The Port of Spain Corporation, Point Fortin Corporation, San Fernando City Corporation and Arima Corporation are statutory authorities within the local government system and the powers of the corporation are exercised by council.

The Council, which consists of the Mayor, Aldermen and Councillors is elected to office by the electors of an electoral district in accordance with the provisions of the Representation of the People Act. In light of this no information is being provided for these local government corporations.

The Cocoa and Coffee Industry Board has no directors at this time since the term of office of this board expired in April 2002.

The Minister of Finance does not retain information on the composition of the Board of Directors of the Zoological Society as the Society is a non governmental organization whose Executive is elected by its members. No information is being provided for this board.

A listing of the names, qualifications and experience of the directors of the remaining eight (8) statutory authorities is attached as Appendix III.

- b) Stipends and honoraria will be paid to each director of state owned Enterprises and public utilities (inclusive of Chairmen and Vice-Chairmen), for as long as they remain Directors of the respective state agencies.

As with state owned enterprises and public utilities, the members of boards of statutory authorities over which the Government exercises control are paid monthly fees and allowances during their term of office.

Appendix I

RES102B

Ministry of Finance, Investments Division

DIRECTORS C.V. SUMMARY

As at January 31, 2003

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/ QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Caroni (1975) Limited		
Dr Kusha Haraksingh <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> Barrister Lincoln's Inn LLB - London PhD - London	Consultant Attorney-at-Law Lecturer-UWI
Mr William Benjamin <i>Director</i>	<i>Agricultural Consultant</i> Doctor of Philosophy (Pursuing) Master of Philosophy - Livestock Science BSc - General Agriculture	Advisor to Minister of Agriculture/ Agricultural Technical Advisor to the Exec. Council of the THA Executive Director, Tobago Development Foundation
Mr Kenneth Dalip <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Management</i> BSc - Chemistry HR Consultant- Personnel Management Services	Vice President, Corporate Services- Phipdeco Deputy Gen. Mgr, Industrial Relations- Caribbean Ispat

WHOLLY

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/ QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Mr Owen Hinds Jr <i>Director</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> Legal Education Certificate LLB BA History	Legal Apprentice, NQCL Trainee, Hobsons Attorneys-at-Law Legal Department, NHA
Mr Everett Holder <i>Director</i>	<i>Civil Engineering</i> BSc-Civil Engineering Senior Engineer-Lee Young and Partners	Associate-Errol Clarke Associates Limited Project Engineer-Trinidad Home Developers Ltd
Mr Raiffique Shah <i>Director</i>	<i>Journalism</i> Cambridge School Certificate Graduate-Royal Military Academy	Columnist/Senior Writer - Express Newspapers President-Nat Farmers & Workers Union Managing Editor-T&T News Centre Limited
Mr Rudranath Indarsingh <i>Rep-SGW TU</i>	<i>Trade Unionist</i> Bachelor of Arts Degree Advanced Level Certificate	General Secretary - ATS&GWTU Education Officer - ATS&GWTU Teacher
Community Improvement Services Limited		
Not Currently Available <i>Chairman</i>		
Ms Sonia Noel <i>Director</i>	<i>Accounting</i> Member, Institute of Chartered Accountants of T&T Fellow, Assoc. of Chartered Certified Accountants Graduate, London School of Accountancy	Ag Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Finance Dir. Social and Economic Transformation, MOF Business Analyst/Accountant II, MOF
Mr Jaggermath Soom <i>Director</i>	<i>Accounting</i> Certified Management Accountant (CMA) Prog. on Investment Appraisal & Mgmt. Advanced Taxation Course	Ag Dir Agro Based Manu. & Serv. Sector, MOF Senior Business Analyst, Min of Finance Business Analyst, Min of Finance
Estate Management and Business Development Company		
Mr Uthara Rao <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Engineering</i> MBA - Operations & Systems Mgmt CEO - M/s Carlise Tyre BE - Mechanical Engineering BSc - Stats & Actuarial Mathematics	Project Manager - Pt. Lisas & Pointe-a-Pierre Refinery Projects Senior Manager - Price Waterhouse

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Ms Margaret Parillon <i>Director</i>	<i>Accounting</i> MSc Accounting Senior Business Analyst, Min. of Finance BSc Industrial Management Studies Training in Conflict Management & Project Management	Director- Agro Based Manufacturing & Services Sector, MOF Business Analyst, Min. of Finance
Export Centres Company Limited		
Ms Patricia Butcher <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Business Management</i> Executive MBA; BSc-Management Studies Human Resource Management Certificate Human Relations Diploma	Executive Director - TTHTI Part Time Lecturer - UWI / IOB CEO - YTEPP
Ms Wendy Achim <i>Director</i>	<i>Marketing</i> Courses in Sales and Marketing; Export Marketing; Financial Management	Director, Sales & Marketing, Yorke Garments Ltd Export Committee Member, TTMA
Ms Marcia Belgrove <i>Director</i>	<i>Social Worker</i> Sales/Marketing Certificate - Kinney International Word Processing Certificate; Secretarial Diploma Courses in Mgmt, Protocol & Project Planning	Exec. Director, Rose Foundation & Rose Distributors Co. Ltd. Consultant on Micro-Enterprise Development Director, Sterling Belgrove Consultants Ltd
Mr Hilary Bengochea <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Executive</i> Executive MBA BSc	Caricom Area Marketing Mgr, Coca Cola Int'l Marketing Director, Carib Brewery Vice President, Export Marketing
Mr Jeffery Chandler <i>Director</i>	<i>Refinery Operator</i> Refinery Operators Course-Texaco Ltd Inc. Radio Amateur's Exam Cert; Open Water, Scuba Diver Course-Performance Appraisal-Methods & Systems	Refinery Operator, Texaco Trinidad Limited Director, Executive Services Limited
Ms Angela Maynard <i>Director</i>	<i>Industrial Relations</i> Certificates in Management and Psychology Diploma-Labour Studies (Personnel and Industrial) Secretarial Studies-Diploma 1 and 2	Personnel/Industrial Relations Officer-TANTEAK Personnel Administrator-National Fisheries Employees Relations Officer-Southern Sales & Services Co. Ltd
Mrs Lura Pascall <i>Director</i>	<i>Management</i> Courses in: Marketing, Food Preservation, Home Décor., East Indian dishes, Travel & Tourism, Home Mgmt Cert-Garment Construction; Cert-Home Econ	Programme Co-ordinator, Small Enterprising Business Assoc. Tutor-Vance River Adult Classes Tutor-YTEPP & Home Economics-Pt. Fortin Jr Sec.

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Ms Kathleen Pilgrim-Thornhill <i>Director</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> Bachelor of Law Degree Legal Education Certificate Certificate in Mediation	Private Practice as an Attorney-at-Law Part time Mediator Clerk I-Magistracy, POS
Export-Import Bank of Trinidad and Tobago Limited		
Mr Clarry Benn <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Economist</i> Diploma in Management Studies UWI Executive Director T&T Unit Trust Corporation Bachelor of Arts - Economics Major IMF Course in Financial Analysis & Policy	President, UTC Financial Services & Chaconia Growth & Income Fund Acting Chief Executive Officer, UTC
Mr Reza Abasali <i>Director</i>	<i>Banker</i> BSc (Economics) Certificate in Global Marketing Strategies Certificate in Financial Analysis for Credit Personnel	Teacher, Asja Boys College Personal Banking Officer, Scotiabank Consumer Interview Clerk, Scotiabank
Mr Arnold Cato <i>Director</i>	<i>Project Management</i> CIM- Project Management CPE - Public Administration BBA - International Business & Management	VP/Consultant - Ajupa Associates TT Group Equity Manager - Venture Capital Incentive Programme Account Manager - RBTT
Mr Stuart Dalglish <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Management</i> President, TTMA Director, Caribbean Business Services Ltd	Managing Director, Specialist Chemicals Ltd
Mr Abe Hadeed <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Management</i> BSc Accounting & Finance GM, Hardware & Oilfield Equip. Co Ltd	Managing Director, Trintube Ltd Director, Abjan Piping Ltd
Dr Andre Vincent Henry <i>Director</i>	<i>Political Scientist</i> BSc International Relations MSc Government MPhil (Political Science) PhD	Director - PROMALCO Vice President - Trade and Industry, TIDCO Lecturer in International History and Politics
Mr Larry Lequay <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Management</i> Bachelor of Arts Degree - Economics CEO - FCB Mortgage & Trust Co. Ltd Executive Management Programme	General Manager - First Citizens Trust & Merchant Bank Ltd Corporate Manager, Retail Banking - FCB

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Mr Kamal Mohammed <i>Director</i>	<i>Director</i> BSc-Accounting Inst of Chartered Accountant Chart Inst of Cost & Mgmt Accountants	Fin & Admin Mgr-Wood-Times Limited Financial Dir-Prodecom Int'l Limited Group Chief Accountant-Westmoorings Ltd
First Citizens Holdings Limited		
Mr Kenneth Gordon <i>Chairman -Designate</i>	<i>Publisher</i>	Chairman, CCN Chairman, BWIA Chairman, Neal & Massy Holdings Ltd.
Mr Kenneth Henry <i>Director</i>	<i>Accounting</i> ACCA OAS Course in Public Finance Course on Financial Applications for State and Local	Comptroller of Accounts Ag. Permanent Secretary Director of Budgets
Ms Lucille Mair <i>Director</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> LLB Barrister-at-Law - Lincoln's Inn (UK)	Partner - Mair & Company Senior Manager - Central Bank
Ms Sonia Noel <i>Director</i>	<i>Accounting</i> Member, Institute of Chartered Accountants of T&T Fellow, Assoc. of Chartered Certified Accountants Graduate, London School of Accountancy	Ag Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Finance Dir. Social and Economic Transformation, MOF Business Analyst/Accountant II, MOF
Mr Michael Toney <i>Director</i>	<i>Accounting</i> Chartered Accountant B:Comm	Partner, Pannell Kerr Forste, Chartered Accountants Senior Consultant, MCT & Associates Ltd Manager, Internal Audit NCB of T&T Ltd
Lake Asphalt of Trinidad and Tobago (1978) Limited		
Mr Winston Mootoo <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Economist</i> BSc-Economics Courses-Maths for Econ; Sales Promotion; Automotive Retail Train & Services; Manufacturing	Consultant - TAG Divisional Mgr Int'l Marketing-PETROTRIN Divisional Mgr Marketing-PETROTRIN
Mr Nizam Mohammed <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Management</i> PACE University, New York UWI External Classes	Managing Director Feroza's Shopping Center High School Teacher Manhattan, New York

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Mr Gerard Richards <i>Director</i>	<i>Mechanical Engineering</i> MSc - Mechanical Engineering BSc - Mechanical Engineering Diploma - Management Information Systems	General Manager - Lake Asphalt of T&T Ltd Various Engineering and Managerial Positions Mechanical Engineer I Ministry of Energy & Energy Industries
Mrs Indira Singh <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Management</i> MBA BA - Sociology Certificate in Career Guidance & Counseling	Assistant Manager-Electrosign Ltd Teacher II - Ministry of Education Manager's Assistant
Mr Garry Solomon <i>Director</i>	<i>Mechanical Engineering</i> MSc - Production Engineering & Management BBc - Mechanical Engineering	Engineer, Petroleum Co T&T Ltd Student Engineer, Fertilizers of T&T
Mr Owen Hinds <i>Director-NATUC Rep</i>	<i>Public Relations</i> Institute of Public Relations - UK Diploma-Economics Graduate-Centre for Labour Studies	President General Contractors & General Workers Trade Union Labour Relations Officer Trinidad Lake Asphalt Co. Ltd.
National Agricultural Marketing and Development Corporation		
Ms Wendy Ann Lee Yuen <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Horticulturist/Landscape Consultant</i> BSc Agriculture Landscape Consultant	Farmer Lecturer - Horticulture
Dr Joseph Laquis <i>Chairman-Deputy</i>	<i>Medical Practitioner</i> BSc - Politics Bachelor of Medicine, Bachelor of Surgery	Private Medical Practice Free Medical Clinics-Laventille, Santa Cruz Chairman-Diego Martin Central, PNM
Mr Vernon Douglas <i>Director</i>	<i>Agriculturalist</i> MSc - Animal Science Director, Extension Training & Info Serv Division, BSc - Agriculture Co-ordinated Food & Nutrition policy for T&T	Director, Extension, Ministry of Agriculture Land and Marine Resources MALMR
Mr Michael Amann <i>Member</i>	<i>Information Technology</i> Diploma Business Mgmt & Administration (ICM) Diploma Management Information Systems (ICM) BSc Electrical & Computer Engineering	Senior Systems Analyst, TSTT MIS Consultant, Office of the Prime Minister PC/Network Support Engineer, Computers & Controls

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Mr Sase N. Bisnauth <i>Member</i>	<i>Business Management</i> EMBA Degree in Int'l Marketing President, S.R. America	CEO, Radica Trading Company Ltd Chairman, Excel Furniture
Ms Natasha Mustapha-Scott <i>Member</i>	<i>Marketing</i> Exec. Masters in Business Administration Diploma in Business Administration Bachelor of Science	General Manager, TTMA Marketing Manager MDC-UM General Sales Manager MDC-UM
Ms Camille Samuel <i>Member</i>	<i>Management</i> MBA - Corporate Strategy & Economic Policy BSc - Sociology & Management	Management Consultant Managing Director, Alma Marketing Operations Director, Alma Marketing
Ms Rebecca Bain <i>Member- THA</i>	<i>Agriculturalist</i> MSc - Integrated Environmental Studies BSc - General Agriculture Diploma General Agriculture	Agricultural Officer 1 Agricultural Assistant, THA
Mr Samaroo Dowliath <i>Member-Ex-officio</i>		
National Broadcasting Network Limited		
Mr John Jeremie <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> Masters of Laws Degree LL.M Legal Education Certificate Bachelor of Laws Degree LL.B	Senior Lecturer in Law - UWI Partner - Alexander, Jeremie and Company
Ms Joy Caesar <i>Chairman-Deputy</i>	<i>Arts Representative</i>	VP-HR, Public Affairs, Operations & Tech Qual, Musical Director, Southernaires Choir
Mr Zainool Ali <i>Director</i>	<i>Engineering</i> BSc First Year-Engineering Electronic Technician Diploma <i>Executive Assistant</i>	Director, Tech Research and Applications-Borde Communications Director, Technical Services-Borde Communications Director-Sales/ Engineering-Borde Communications
Ms Joan Hackshaw-Marslin <i>Director</i>		Administrative Assistant Customer Services Alderman

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Ms Angela Hamel-Smith <i>Director</i>	<i>Human Resource Management</i> M. Phil. History BA-Honours	Group Manager - Human Resources & Communications Neal & Massy Holdings Human Resources Director - Hi-Lo Food Stores Human Resources Director - Cannings Soft Drinks & Dairy Divisions
Ms Tara Rampersadsingh <i>Director</i>	<i>Human Resource Management</i> A'Levels & O' Levels	Human Resources Finance
Mr Rohan Sinanan <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Management</i> Sales & Marketing Insurance & Real Estate	Manager, Foodmasters Supermarket
Mr George Singh Jr <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Management</i>	CEO- Southex Trade Shows and Promotions
Mr Kelvin Charles <i>Rep (THA)</i>	<i>Business Management</i> MBA; BSc-Mgmt & Sociology Certificate in Teacher Education Trained Teachers' Diploma	Deputy General Manager - First National CU Administration Manager - County Council Employees Education and Training Manager - County Council Employees CU
National Commission for Self-Help Limited		
Mr Krishna Ramkumar <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Communications Officer</i> Pursuing-Business Management Courses-Public Speaking & Effective Mgmt Dip-Theology; ACCA Section II	Head Corporate Customers Dep. T&TEC
Mr Learie Alleyne-Forte <i>Director</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> LLB Legal Education Certificate BA	Ag. Vice Principal, Siparia Junior Secondary
Ms Sheila Boodoosingh <i>Director</i>	<i>Management</i>	Personnel Mgr/HSE Coord., Lease Operators Ltd Store Manager, Hilo Food Stores Limited
Mr Rodney Butler <i>Director</i>	<i>Construction</i> Cert- Cost Planning and Estimating Diploma in Theology	Managing Director/Building Contractor, Integrity Construction Clerk of Works, NIPDEC
Mr Junior Gittens <i>Director</i>	Courses in Building Technology & Electronics	Engineering Asst., Ministry of Works

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Mr Selby Leslie <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Management</i>	Managing Director, Rainsef Financial Planning Manager of Tobago Operations, Maritime Financial Self-Employed
Mr Esau Mohammed <i>Director</i>	<i>Marketing</i> Pursuing BSc (Management Studies)	Telemarketing Representative, Direc One Call Centre Telemarketing Verifier
Mrs Ada Pollonais <i>Director</i>	<i>Teacher</i> Academy of Secretarial Knowledge 5 O'Levels	Teacher, Holy Rosary Prep. School
National Entrepreneurship Development Company Limited		
Mr Hart Edwards <i>Chairman</i>	Permanent Secretary; Min. of Labour MA (CONFAB)	Deputy Gen. Manager Industrial Dev. Corp.
Mr Earle Baccus <i>Director</i>	<i>Industrial/ Chemical Engineering</i> MSc.-Industrial Engineering; - BSc Chemical Engineering Courses-Project Evaluation, Negotiation Skills, Time Management Presentation Skills, Int'l Marketing, Strategic Project Management etc	Consultant Executive Director-Caribbean Export Dev Agency, Barbados Project Director-Caricom Export Development Project, Barbados
Ms Linda Besson <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Executive</i> MBA-Business Administration; Advanced Diploma-Association of Business Management Manager-Eastern Industrial and Community Credit Certificate-Management	Consultant-Employee/Public Relations-TCL General Manager/Corporate Secretary-Eastern Credit Union
Mr Gerard Charles <i>Director</i>	<i>Marketing</i> Mechanical Engineering Technicians PT. 1 & 11	Marketing Manager Technical Marketing Supervisor Marketing Representative
Mr Vishnu Dhanpaul <i>Director</i>	<i>Economist</i> MBA-Finance; Financial Programming & Policy-IMF Diploma-International Relations (Int'l Economics) MSc- Economics; BSc- Economics	Director CMU, MOF Asst to Executive Director, IMF Washington Asst Director CMU, MOF

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Mr Norris Jack <i>Director</i>	<i>Consultant</i> MBA (Candidate) Heriot Watt Associates of Arts Degree - Business Administration Associates of Science Degree - Accounting	Special Advisor for Tourism & Transportation, THA Business Development Officer - Planning Dept, THA Part Time Teacher, Accounting
Mr Raphael Jones <i>Director</i>	<i>Consultant</i> MSc, Technological Economics MSc, Production Engineering & Management MSc, Industrial Engineering; BSc, Environmental Science	Project Management Consultant - TICDO Chief Executive Officer - SWMCOL Executive Director - IDC
Mr Anthony Rahaal <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Management</i> Not Available Director-Premier Quality Services Limited	Managing Director / CEO Regency Manufacturers Managing Director / CEO Queensway Limited
Mr Leslie Ramcharitar <i>Director</i>	<i>Accounting</i> ACCA	Chartered Accountant Audit Manager Audit Senior
National Maintenance Training and Security Company Limited		
Mr Ronald Nurse <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Engineering</i> MSc - Highway and Traffic Engineering BSc - Civil Engineering	Managing Director - Trintoplan Head of Civil Engineering Division - Trintoplan Senior Engineer - Ministry of Works
Mr Fiaz Ali <i>Director</i>	<i>Machinist</i> Theories in Machine Shop	Director, High Tech Engineering Ltd Managing Director, Ali's Machine Shop Director, Chaguaramas Marine Engineering Ltd
Ms Gillian Andrews <i>Director</i>	<i>Educator</i> Pursuing MBA BSc Social Sciences (Industrial Mgmt)	Motivational Coach/ Training Consultant Director Co-operative Development, THA Manager, The Treasure House
Mr Knolly Beckles <i>Director</i>	<i>Agricultural Economist</i> MSc.; BSc Agricultural Economics Dip-Financial & Socio-Economics Dip-Project Mgmt & Econ Analysis	Coordinator-Ministry of Agriculture National Coordinator-IADB loan ATN/SF
Mr Lennox Koylass <i>Director</i>	<i>Banker</i> Certificate in Business Management	Senior Manager, Taurus Services Ltd Regional Manager, East Branches FCB Senior Manager, First Citizens Bank

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Mr Randall Mohammed <i>Director</i>	<i>Management</i> MBA Business Finance Associate in Risk Management BA Economics/Diploma in Business Administration	Manager, TSST Risk Control Officer, Risk Management Services Ltd. Part time Lecturer, Sch. of Mgmt & Accounting
Mrs Doleres Moore <i>Director</i>	<i>Nursing</i> Registered Nurse Certificate Midwifery Certificate Management Training	Ag Head Nurse of Eye, ENT Clinic Director of Moore's General Contracting Ltd
Mr Eric Thompson <i>Director</i>	<i>Financial Consultant</i> Bachelor of Laws Degree Anti Money Laundering Compliance Officer, RBTT Master of Arts Degree (Security Management) Certified Fraud Examiner	General Manager - Group Security and Operational Risk, RBTT Specialist Banker
Mr Norlan Watts <i>Director</i>	<i>Accounting</i> Associate of Certified Accountants Bachelor of Science - Business Management Cert. In Purchasing Procedures	Materials Manager, Caroni Materials Mgr., Chief Cost Accountant- Johnson & Johnson Chief Accountant, Cheeseborough Ponds Int'l Ltd
National Quarries Company Limited		
Mr David Sheppard <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Insurance Services</i> Cambridge School Certificate Passes	Insurance Inspector, Standard Life Assurance Co. Ltd Insurance Agent, National Life Assurance Co. Ltd Marketing Rep. Pan-American World Airways
Mr Dayle Connelly <i>Director</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> Legal Education Certificate LLB	Private Law Practice Boynes & Co, Associate Lawyer Boynes & Co Law Graduate
Mr David Edwards <i>Director</i>	<i>Accounting</i> BSC Economics ACCA Professional I&2 3 GCE 'A' Levels	Chief Executive Officer - Trinjet Services Limited Accountant - School Nutrition Company Limited Accts Dept, Food & Agriculture Corporation
Mr Harry Hospedales <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Executive</i> Regional VP- Sales and Marketing, Citibank Banking Manager, Int'l Industrial Merchant Bank Ltd	CEO/MD, General Finance Corporation

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Ms Zilda Pariagh <i>Director</i>	<i>Insurance Services</i> Dip-Business Administration Cert-Personal Financial Planning Cert-Life & Gen Underwriter of Insurance	Senior Personal Financial Advisor Director/Chairman TANTEAK Sales Rep ALGICO
Mr Rajkumar Sankar <i>Director</i>	<i>Clerk</i> Administrative Certificate - Principal Course Diploma - Human Resource Management Teacher's Diploma - Agricultural Science	Clerical Officer - Works Department, Guaito Primary School Teacher
Ms Debra Suepaul <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Management</i> Accounting, Typing CXC/ GCE Passes	Purchasing Clerk-Ministry of Works Payroll/Time Sheet/ NIS Clerk-URP Assistant Manager-Classic Launderers Limited
National Schools Dietary Services Limited		
Ms Joycelyn Bodden <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Banker</i>	
Ms Andrea Augier-West <i>Director</i>	<i>Dietician</i>	
Mr Vernon Douglas <i>Director</i>	<i>Agriculturalist</i> MSc - Animal Science BSc - Agriculture	Director, Extension, Ministry of Agriculture Land and Marine Resources Director, Extension Training & Info Serv Division, MALMR Co-ordinated Food & Nutrition policy for T&T Manager, BDC
Ms Jacqueline Figaro <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Management</i> Post Graduate Diploma in Human Resource Management BSc Management Studies <i>Education Officer</i>	Project Officer, BDC Training Officer, FCB
Ms Ingrid John <i>Director</i>	<i>Social Scientist</i> BSc	
Ms Donna-Mae Knights <i>Director</i>	<i>Businesswoman</i>	Co-ordinator, Development Projects, Change Mgmt Unit Research Specialist, Change Mgmt Unit Research Officer, Ministry of Social Development President, National PTA Vice Chairman, National PTA PRO, National PTA
Mrs Zena Ramatali <i>Director</i>		

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Ms Avril Sampson <i>Director</i>	<i>Education Administrator</i> MSc. Vocational Education Diploma - Management of School Facilities B.Sc. Vocational Education: Diploma Teacher Training	School Supervisor I, Ministry of Education Special Teacher III, Tranquility Gov't Sec. Teacher I, Mucurapo Junior Secondary
Mr Madan Singh <i>Director</i>	<i>Health Inspector</i> BSc Environmental Health Diploma Environmental Management Certificate Public Health Engineering	Chief Public Health Inspector Public Health Inspector I - IV
Ms Sally Siriram <i>Director</i>	<i>Trade Unionist</i>	
Ms Kathleen Thomas <i>Director</i>	<i>Accounting</i>	
Petroleum Company of Trinidad and Tobago Limited		
Mr Malcolm Jones <i>Chairman (Executive)</i>	<i>Chemical Engineering</i> BSc Chemical Engineering MSc Chemical Engineering	President/CEO, Titan Methanol Company Managing Director, NGC Head, Methanol & Urea Division, National Energy Corporation of T&T Ltd
Ms Charmaine Baptiste <i>Director</i>	<i>Information Technology</i> BSc in Commerce (Market Research) Certification in Project Management; Cert Systems Registered Consultant with Caribbean Business Services	Managing Director - Market Space Limited Country Marketing Manager, IBM Marketing Manager - IBM Corporation
Mr Anthony Chan Tack <i>Director</i>	<i>Project Management</i> BSc Chemical Engineering TEXACO Scholarship Courses-Refinery; Exec. Management	C.T.O., Titan Methanol Co Project Executive, Petrotrin Divisional Manager, Petrotrin
Mr Garvin Chimming <i>Director</i>	<i>Marketing Representative</i> Courses- Project Management Cambridge School Certificate <i>Business Executive</i> Pursued Degree in Commerce	Retail Sales Rep. - NPMC Purchasing Department Distribution Department Executive Chairman, Emile Elias Group
Mr Emile Elias <i>Director</i>		

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Mr José Pérez Fernandez <i>Director</i>	<i>Engineering</i> Masters Production Technology Degree Petroleum Engineering Course on Oil Production and Economy	President/General Manager - Amoco Columbia Vice President - Amoco Trinidad Vice President/Assist General Mgr - Buenos Aires
Ms Helena Immiss-King <i>Director</i>	<i>Geologist</i> BA-Geology and Geography Courses:-Adv Logging Course; Structural Geology; Tectonics & Sedimentation	Geologist, Ministry of Energy & Energy Industries
Mr Farad Khan <i>Director</i>	<i>Agriculturalist</i> Diploma in Human Resource Management BSc & MSc Tropical Agriculture	Agricultural Supervisor - Caroni Veteranarian Assistant - Broadway Animal Clinic Sugar Cane Farmer - Private Agricultural Enterprise
Dr Eddie Koury <i>Director</i>	<i>Engineering</i> PhD. Chemical Engineering M.Eng. Chemical Engineering BA. Chemical Engineering	Managing Director, ISKO Enterprises Ltd Project Manager, Aerogas Processors Facilities Engineer, Amoco Trinidad Oil Co
Mr Harry Pirtheesingh <i>Director</i>	<i>Management</i> Cambridge School Certificate Oil Production Technology Course Production Superintendent - Amoco UK Production & Supervisory and Management Courses	Production Manager - Venture Production Trinidad Ltd Senior Environmental Co-ordinator - Amoco Trinidad Oil Company Exploration Company
Mr Rammarine Ramdass <i>Director</i>	<i>Accounting</i> Certified Accountant; Tax Administration International Tax Law and Practice Oil and Gas Financial Management	Commissioner of Tax-Board of Inland Rev. Principal-R. Ramdass & Co. (Char. Acc.) Deputy Chairman-T&T Methanol Co. Ltd.
Taurus Services Limited		
Mr Joseph Toney <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> Bachelor of Law Degree Legal Education Certificate	Attorney-at-Law Minister of Government Member of Parliament
Mr Leroy Mayers <i>Dir (Min of Finance)</i>	<i>Accounting</i> Graduate, London School of Accountancy Member, Chartered Institute of Management Accts. MOF	Permanent Secretary, MOF Director of Budgets, MOF Director, Agro-based Manufacturing & Services Sector,

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Mr Carlton Grell <i>Director</i>	<i>Industrial Relations</i> Diploma-Personnel Mgmt & Ind'l Relation Internship-Personnel & Ind'l Relations	Personnel & Train Mgr-Stephens & Ross Co Industrial Rel Adviser-ICEA Personnel Director-Hilton Int'l
Mr Terrance Haywood <i>Director</i>	<i>Agriculturalist</i> Baker	Agriculturalist/Farmer
Mr Larry Howai <i>Director</i>	<i>Accounting</i> BSc-Economics Certified Management Accountant Courses -Tech, Gen Mgmt Training Program	General Manager- FCB Chief Financial Officer- Workers' Bank Development Finance Company
Mr Glen Ramjag <i>Director</i>	<i>Micro Enterprise Specialist</i> BSc- Management Studies Courses- Agri Trade Policy; Media Techn Annual Development Workers Course	Micro Enterprise Specialist Project Manager-Business Strategic Ltd Food Crop/Tree Crop Farming (27 Years)
Mr Horace Ryan <i>Director</i>	<i>Agriculturalist</i>	
The National Gas Company of Trinidad and Tobago Limited		
Mr Chiang Keith Awong <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Chemical Engineering</i> BSc-Chemical Engineering Mech. Engineering Technician's Diploma Ordinary Cert- Mechanical Engineering	CEO, Petrotrin Managing Director-T&T Oil Company General Manager, Operations-T&T Oil Co
Dr Cheryl Bennett <i>Director</i>	<i>Lecturer</i> PhD (Psychology) MBA (Marketing & HR Management) BSc (Zoology & Biochemistry)	Lecturer (Physiology) - UWI Research Fellow - Cornell University New York Lecturer - UWI - Mona
Mr Errol McLeod <i>Director</i>	<i>Trade Unionist</i> Labour Relations Officer, OWTU	President General, OWTU Refinery Operator, TEXACO
Mr Clarence Mitchell <i>Director</i>	<i>Electrical Engineering</i> NODS - National Hazard Mitigation IOB- Exec. Development Programme; Cert- Assoc of Prof Maintenance & Planning Control - UWI	Plant Engineer - Crabbs Power & Desalination Plant Manager - PowerGen Power Station Superintendent -T&TEC

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Ms Carol Pilgrim Bristol <i>Director</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i>	Corporate Secretary/Legal Adviser, Trimmar Ltd Exec. Assistant to the President, Petrotrin Project Advisor, Business Dev Group, Petrotrin
Mr Lisle Ramyad <i>Director</i>	<i>Petroleum Engineering</i>	Exploration & Production Divisional Manager, Petrotrin Operations Manager- Trintomar Exploration & Production Technical Manager- Trintoc
Mr David Small <i>Director</i> Industries	<i>Business Management</i> MBA	Planning Officer, Min of Energy & Energy Industries Petroleum Engineering Asst., Min of Energy & Energy
	Post Grad Diploma in Natural Gas Economics & Management Post Grad Diploma in Public Administration	Waterworks Operator, WASA
The Trinidad and Tobago Solid Waste Management Company Limited		
Mr Ray Brathwaite <i>Chairman (Executive)</i>	<i>Consultant</i> MBA FIPD, FISM Organizational and Human Systems Expert	Principal Consultant, Trainergistics Consulting Group Chairman, RAJ Enterprises Manager, Performance Improvement, Petrotrin
Ms Cheryl Bowles <i>Chairman-Deputy</i>	<i>Biochemist</i> BSc Biochemistry	Founder/Managing Director-Herbarium Ltd Chief Chemist - Nestle (T&T, Switzerland, UK, Venezuela)
Mr Verne Britto <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Executive</i> ACCA, RSA, ABE Dip. Mgmt Studies Certificate in Building Technology	Chairman/ MD, Dover General Contractors Ltd Chairman/ CEO, C.M.V.Y. Caribbean Ltd General Mgr/ Corp Sec, General Packaging Ltd
Mr Prannath Diptee <i>Director</i>	<i>Management</i> Incomplete Degree (3 year studies) Suffolk Univ-1 year study	Assistant Manager - Diptee's Hardware Managing Director - PC Stop 'N Shop Supermarket Director - PC Computer School
Mr Heathcliff Miller <i>Director</i>	<i>Technician</i> Cert-Occupational Health and Safety for Supervisors Cert-Effective Supervisory Training Junior Builders & Labour Studies Tech Courses	Project Co-ordinator Short Term Investment Programme Inspector of Works, Maintenance & Area Supervisor-WASA Draughtsman II-WASA
Mr Eustace Nancis <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Executive</i>	Founder-Arima Door Centre Limited Founder-General Farms Limited Owner-Polyplas (2002) Limited

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Ms Sarita Rampersad <i>Director</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> Legal Education Certificate, LLB Basic Courses in Psychology & Sociology Cert- Computer Programming & Business Administration	Attorney-at-Law, K. Roopnarinesingh Law Firm Attorney-at-Law, T&T Development Foundation Attorney-at-Law, Ministry of Legal Affairs
Mr Leroy Williams <i>Director</i>	<i>Sociologist</i> MBA; MSc- Sociology (1st Yr) BSc- Sociology Training-Mgmt Dev Prog; HR Mgmt; Safety	CEO/Principal Consultant, HR Support Limited HR Manager-Carlisle Tire and Rubber Limited Consultant in HR Management and Industrial Relations
Mr Waldorf Yearwood <i>Director</i>	<i>Management Consultant</i> MBA-Strategic Procurement Mgmt; BSc- Industrial Mgmt Cert-International Transport Mgmt; Computer Literacy Diploma-Public Administration; MCIPS	Procurement Officer-Caribbean Steel Mills Ltd Materials Manager-South-West Regional Health Purchasing Officer-PTSC
Mr Teddy Stapleton <i>Director-OWTU Rep</i>	<i>Trade Unionist</i> Secondary Level Education	Lever Brothers (West Indies) Limited OWTU-Labour and Industrial Relations Officer President-Health & Safety Committee-Lever Brothers/OWTU
Mr Rodill Clarke <i>Director-THA Rep</i>	<i>Educator/ Consultant</i> CONCACAF Coaching Certificate - Soccer Sports College Advanced Certificate - Cricket	Management Consultant Sports Administrator Formulation & Implementation of team policy
The Vehicle Maintenance Corporation of Trinidad and Tobago Limited		
Ms Dawn Seecharan-Scott <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> Bachelor of Law Legal Education Certificate	Partner, G.P Morean & Company
Ms Marlene Alfred <i>Director</i>	<i>Accounting</i> BSc-Accounting ACCA	Managing Director-Caribbean Hotel Development Co. Manager-Lever Brothers W.I Limited Financial Accountant-GTE, Sylvania
Mr Michael Annisette <i>Director</i>	<i>Industrial Relations</i> Diploma-Labour Economics Diploma-Industrial Relations Short Courses and Seminars-Labour and Industrial	Senior Clerical Officer-Port Authority of T&T Secretary-Port Authority Staff Branch Grievance Officer-SWWTU

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Ms Bonnie-Lou de Silva <i>Director</i>	<i>Administration</i> Computer Skills and Secretarial Courses Short Courses-Insurance, Management, Secretarial, Accounts etc.	Marketing Services Supervisor, SWMCOL Ag. Mgr of Department-SWMCOL Snr Administrative Asst Marketing Dept-SWMCOL
Mr Jason Gordon <i>Director</i>	<i>Electrical Engineering</i> BSc-Electrical Engineering Professional Engineering (B.O.E.T.T.); A.P.E.T.T. MSc (yr 1 & 2) Electronics & Instrumentation Programme	Project Manager, Call Centre Consolidation-TSTT Fleet Manager-TSTT Network Maintenance Support Manager-TSTT
Mr Orville Moore <i>Director</i>	<i>Mechanical Engineering</i> Mechanical Engineering Technician; BSc Engineering (Mechanical) Transport; Quarring; Shotfiring; Blasting Design Electronics Technology and Advanced Trouble Shooting I&II	Mechanical Engineer I-Studley Park Quarry, Tobago Mechanical Engineer Technical-CARIRI Scientific Assistant I-Tobago County Hospital
Mr Premchand Nandlal <i>Director</i>	<i>Chemist</i> BSc Chemistry Conf-Steel Making; Direct Reduction & Wire Drawing; Ammonia & Urea Production	CEO, NPMC Deputy Managing Director, PCS Nitrogen Trinidad Ltd T&T Urea Co Ltd, Chief Executive Officer
Ms Sonia Noel <i>Director</i>	<i>Accounting</i> Member, Institute of Chartered Accountants of T&T Fellow, Assoc. of Chartered Certified Accountants Graduate, London School of Accountancy	Ag Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Finance Dir. Social and Economic Transformation, MOF Business Analyst/Accountant II, MOF
Mr Joseph Ross <i>Director</i>	<i>Auditor</i> BSc Management Studies Certified Internal Auditor; Dip. In Environmental Mgmt Cert in Auditing Quality Mgt Systems & Int'l Safety Mgt Systems Audit	Operations Auditor- NP; Tutor in Fraud Acct.-UWI Cost Accountant & Manager Audit- WASA Cost Accountant- Ministry of Finance & Planning
Mr Ernest Williams <i>Director</i>	<i>Information Technology</i> BSc-Computer Science and Mathematics -eMIBA	Head, Information Systems-NPMC IT Consultant Engagements on Projects Lecturer-UWI-JOB; SBSC

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Tourism and Industrial Development Company of T&T Limited		
Dr Aleem Mohammed <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Medical Practitioner</i> BSc (Hon) M.B.B.S	Medical Practitioner-San F'do Gen Hos Chairman - SM Jaleel & Co. Ltd
Mr Samuel Martin <i>Chairman-Deputy</i>	<i>Economist</i> Managing Director, Algico Corporate Manager, BWIA	CEO, TSIT
Ms Fredericka Adams <i>Director</i>	<i>Travel Advisor</i> Certified Travel Advisor Supervisor, Amar Holdings	Manager, BA Travel and Tourism Accounts Clerk, Ministry of Works
Mr Roger Joseph <i>Director</i>	<i>Management</i> Dip. Aviation Mgmt Studies ACCA Adv. Dip Industrial Relations	Project Manger - Oper./Crew Mgt Caribbean Star Airline Project Manager Oper. Auto, Crew planning - BWIA Manager - Crew Sceduling BWIA
Ms Edwina Leacock <i>Director</i>	<i>Management Accountant</i> BSc Management Chartered Institute Mgmt Accountant Effective Speaking & Human Relations Course	PS, Ministry of Trade & Industry Dir, Agro-Based Manuf Ser Sector-Min Fin Senior Business Analyst-Min of Finance
Mr Renrick Nickie <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Management</i> MBA BSc Management	Exec. Manager, Unit Trust Director, TIDCO Director, Chaconia Financial Services
Mr Junior Regrello <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Management</i>	Managing Director -EZ Rentals Customs License - Trinidad & Tobago Custom Brokers Manager - Southern Wholesale Stores
Dr Ronnie Sookhoo <i>Director</i>	<i>Biologist</i> PhD - Philosophy MA - Biology BA - Biology	Consultant- Spectrum Medical Services Managing Director- United Scientific and Hospital Supplies Ltd General Manager- Industrial Laboratory Research Ltd
Mrs Karen Tesheira <i>Director</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> Legal Education Certificate Diploma in International Relations Bachelor of Law (LLB)	Industrial Relations Officer - Cannings Group of Companies State Solicitor - Ministry of Legal Affairs Course Director/Tutor – Hugh Wooding Law School

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Mr Michael Small <i>Director-THA Rep</i>	<i>Hotelier</i>	Managing Director of Sandy Point Village Director of Tourism Development Authority Founding Director of New BWIA
Mr Andrew Aleong <i>Director-TTMA Rep</i>	<i>Marketing</i> MBA BA	Albroso Limited Price Waterhouse
Trinidad and Tobago Forest Products Company Limited		
Mr Vishnu Musai <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Accounting</i> Chartered Ass. of Cert. Accountants UK Institute of Chartered Accountants T&T	Public Accountant-Vishnu DK Musai & Co. Secretary/Accountant - GTM Life Insurance Management Accountant with Min. of Finance
Mr Sheriff Faizool <i>Chairman-Deputy</i>	<i>Forestry</i> BSc Forestry (1st Division) MSc Park and Recreation Resources	Deputy Director-Northern Range Reafforestation Pro. Director Ag.-Forest Resource Inventory and Mgmt. Deputy Conservator of Forests
Mr Boysie Boodram <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Management</i> Importer/Exporter/Distributor School Leaving Certificate	Managing Director, BR&S Marketing Ltd Production Manager, England Sub-contractor, London
Ms Suzette Liverpool-Bailey <i>Director</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> LLM International & Corporate Law Legal Education Certificate Bachelor of Laws	Legal Trade Specialist - MEDFA Corp Sec - NLJSA Legal Counsel - Petrotrin; Attorney-at-Law - NP
Mr Ainsley Nichols <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Executive</i> School Leaving Certificate	GM - CGA GM - Lake Asphalt GM - TLA
Ms Sonia Noel <i>Director</i>	<i>Accounting</i> Member, Institute of Chartered Accountants of T&T Fellow, Assoc. of Chartered Certified Accountants Graduate, London School of Accountancy	Ag Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Finance Dir. Social and Economic Transformation, MOF Business Analyst/Accountant II, MOF
Mr Balkrishna Rampersad <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Management</i> Primary/Secondary	Businessman

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Ms Jacqueline Jack <i>Director-NATUC Rep</i>	<i>General Secretary</i> FES/CCL	Ag. General Sec. - NUGFW 1st Deputy General Secretary
Trinidad and Tobago Free Zones Company Limited		
Dr Wilbert Winchester <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> BA (Econ) LL.B Certificate of Legal Education	Owner of Private Practice Chairman MEGA Insurance Owner of Management Consultancy Firm
Mr Boxil Charles <i>Director</i>	<i>Insurance Services</i> Master of Public Health/ Health Administration MSc Agricultural Economics BSc Economics	Insurance Manager, ALGICO CEO, Community Hospital of Seventh Day Adventists Branch Manager, Maritime Financial Group (San Fernando)
Ms Carol Guide <i>Director</i>	<i>Management</i> 6 GCE Ordinary Level	Manager - Guide's Funeral Home Party Area Manager, Campaign Manager, Local & General Election Assistant Librarian, Petrotrin
Mr Randolph Haynes <i>Director</i>	<i>Management</i> Bachelor of Law Degree Corp-Corp Exec Dev Program Public Mgmt; C'bean Trade Conference	Corp Secretary-T&T Ind'l Dev Corp North American Dir-T&T Ind'l Dev Corp Sales Representative-Siemens Limited
Dr Samuel Howard <i>Director</i>	<i>Consultant</i> PhD-Quantitative Genetics & Biology M.Sc-Genetics & Reproductive Physiology; Dip-Mgmt B.Sc-Animal Science; D.I.C.T.A-Tropical Agri	Principal Management Consultant - Integrated Natural Resource Mgt Director of Research - Nat Germplasm Resource Mgt Chief Technical Officer-Min of Agriculture
Mr Christopher Jackson-Smith <i>Director</i>	<i>Trade Unionist</i> Cert-Effective Speaking & Human Relation Supervisor Mgmt Course-Leadership Skill Dip-Adv Tech & Vocational Training	President-Bank & Gen. Works Credit Union General Council Member-Nat Trade Union Accounts/Payroll Clerk-Alstons Engineer
Mr Cecil Mahabir <i>Director</i>	<i>Management</i> MBA (Incomplete) BA Economics & Political Science Diploma Petroleum Technology	Managing Director - A. Mahabir Engineering Ltd. Construction Technician - Highway Divi, Canada Production Assistant - Steel Co of Canada

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Ms. Cheryl Ryan Mohammed <i>Director</i>	<i>Marketing</i> Certificate in Tour Guiding Certificate in Data Processing	Executive Director - L & M Promotions Marketing Official - The Football Co. of T&T Marketing Representative - Ambassador Hotel
Trinidad and Tobago National Petroleum Marketing Company Limited		
Mr Paul Murphy <i>Chairman -Designate</i>	<i>Marketing</i> BSc-Economics MBA-Marketing	Exec. Director, Comfort Engineering Neal & Massy Trintoc International
Mr Winston Andrews <i>Director</i>	<i>Human Resource Management</i> MBA; MSc Industrial Relations Cert-Adv Graduate Study in Business Teachers Dip; BBA Management	General Manager - Human Resource Services, TSST Assistant General Manager - Human Resources, TSST General Manager- ISCOTT
Mr Anthony Campbell <i>Director</i>	<i>Surveyor</i> Dip-Quantity Surveying Post Grad Studies-Construction Mgmt	Qty Surveying-T&T, CARICOM Countries, Private Sector and Government, Mt Hope Maternity Hospital & Domestic Housing
Mr Adrian Clarke <i>Director</i>	<i>Accounting</i> Associate of the Chartered Association of Certified Accountants (ACCA) Certified Document Imaging Architech (CDIA) Fellow of the Life Management Institute - (FLMI)	Chief Executive Officer - C-Technologies Limited and CyberCapture Ltd Chief Finance Officer - HealthNet Limited Financial Analyst - C L Financial
Mr Steve De Las <i>Director</i>	<i>Management</i> MBA Diploma in Management Technician's Diploma	Mechanical Maintenance Manager - Hydro Agri Trinidad Ltd Maintenance Manager - Hydro Plant and Shipping Assistant Manager - Electrical and Instrument
Mr Victor Mitchell <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Management</i> MSc. Petroleum Engineering BSc Chemical Engineering	Manager, Operations Support Services - Trimmer Ltd Drilling & Workover Manager - Trimmer Ltd Operations Manager - Trimmer Ltd
Mr Herman Persad <i>Director</i>	<i>Accounting</i> FCCA GCE A' Levels	Financial Controller - Gulf City Ltd Audit Manager - Ernst & Young Chartered Accountants

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Mrs Magna Williams-Smith <i>Director</i>	<i>Administration</i> BSc Health Sciences Diploma in Educational Evaluation Registered Nurse	Student Services Department, NIHERST Office of the Vice President, NIHERST Health Science Instructor, NIHERST
Ms Heidi Wong <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Mgmt/ Natural Gas Mgmt</i> Masters of Business Administration Post Grad Diploma in Management Studies Diploma in Natural Gas Management; BA - Econ & Maths	Senior Energy Analyst, Min of Energy Senior Planning Officer, Min of Energy Planning Officer IV/ Economist II, Min of Energy
Urban Development Corporation of Trinidad and Tobago Limited		
Mr Calder Hart <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Economist</i> Economics Post Graduate at MIT	CEO- The Home Mortgage Bank President- Saskatchewan Housing Corporation Executive Chairman- Saskatchewan Securities Commission
Dr Krishna Bahadoorsingh <i>Director</i>	<i>Political Scientist</i> PhD	Independent Senator Dir/Chairman-Jang Estates Limited Director-Tadad Publishing Co Limited
Mr Robert Le Hunte <i>Director</i>	<i>Accounting</i> MSc Accounting & MBA Certificates-Tourism Mgmt & Strategic/Int'l Marketing Bachelor of Arts- Economics <i>Attorney-at-Law</i> BSc	Corporate Manager, Republic Bank Group Treasurer & Area Credit Mgr, Republic Bank Credit Mgr & Operations Manager, Republic Bank
Mr John Mair <i>Director</i>		Principal - Mair & Co.
Mr Wayne Maughan <i>Director</i>	<i>Economist</i> MSc - National Dev-Project Planning BSc - Management	Economist/Project Development Consultant Senior Consultant Project Mgmt & Planning - Min of Planning & Dev
Mr Madan Rammarine <i>Director</i>	<i>Accounting</i> Association of Chartered Certified Accountants	Consultant - Hamlyn Mike & Co, Chartered Accountants Managing Director - Gem Shop Co Ltd Financial Controller - Maraj Jewellers
Youth Training and Employment Partnership Programme (YTEPP) Limited		
Ms Jennifer Johnson <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Marketing</i> Diploma, Management Studies Certificate in Personnel Management and Industrial Relations	Mkt Dir, Plant Engineering & Maintenance Serv. Ltd Minister of Youth, Sports, Culture and Creative Arts Member of Parliament, GORTT

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Ms Gillian Andrews <i>Director</i>	<i>Educator</i> Pursuing MBA BSc Social Sciences (Industrial Mgmt) <i>Attorney-at-Law</i>	Motivational Coach/ Training Consultant Director Co-operative Development,THA Manager, The Treasure House Director, Habitat for Humanities
Ms Sasha Braithwaite <i>Director</i>	<i>Educator</i> Teacher's Diploma	Taught & Counsellor Secondary Students - (22 yrs) Taught at Primary School level - (6 yrs)
Ms Cheryl Duncan <i>Director</i>	<i>Human Resource Management</i> BSc Child Development & Family Relationships Advanced Studies in Self-Image Psychology/Sports Psychology Coach/ Sports Administrator; Human Resource, Consultant <i>Insurance Services</i>	Founder/CEO- Quantum Possibilities Ltd Insurance Agency Manager Sales Trainer & Personal Financial Planner
Mr Trevor James <i>Director</i>		Account Assistant, National Life of Canada Ins. Co.
Mrs Brenda Jones <i>Director</i>		
Ms Laurel Lezama <i>Director</i>	<i>Flight Attendant</i> 3 - A'Levels, 8 - O'Levels Teacher - Summer Vacation Camp	Flight Attendant - BWIA Replacement Teacher - St. Xavier's
Ms Myrna Samuel <i>Director</i>	<i>Psychiatric Nurse</i> MA-Social and Community Work Studies Certificate-Youth and Community Work Registered Psychiatric Nurse	Director, Social Services Min of SYA Supervisor, Social Services-UK Tower Community Liaison Worker-London Borough
Ms Hermia Smart-Findley <i>Director</i>	<i>Training Specialist</i>	
Mr Harold Suepaul <i>Director</i>	<i>Education Administrator</i>	School Supervisor 1 Principal Teacher
Mr Ulric Warner <i>Director</i>	<i>Human Resource Management</i> MBA; Certificate in Quality Management Post Grad Diploma in Public Administration BSc Industrial Management	International Human Resources Consultant - Conoco Inc Manager, Strategy - Conoco T'ad Inc Manager, Human Resources - Conoco T'ad Inc

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Ms Trixi Guy <i>Director-Tobago Rep</i>	<i>Business Management</i>	
MAJORITY		
Agricultural Development Bank of Trinidad and Tobago		
Mr Hubert Alleyne <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Banker</i>	Exec Director-Royal Bank Foundation Member-Royal Merchant Bank & Finance President/Founder-ROYTEC
Mr Trevor Murray <i>Chairman-Deputy</i>	<i>Agricultural Economist</i> MSc.-Agricultural Economics BA-Economics; Dip-Econ Mgmt & Planning Dip-Project Plan & Mgmt; Public Admin	Snr Project Analyst-Min of Agriculture Project Analyst II-Min of Agriculture Planning Officer-Min of Agriculture
Dr Ronald Barrow <i>Director</i>	<i>Entomologist</i> Dip-Agriculture; PhD.-Entomology MSc-Medical Entomology; BSc-Entomology Dip-DJCTA with Credit	Dir of Agri Services-Min of Food Production Dir of Research-Min of Food Production Entomologist-Min of Agriculture
Mr Keith Paul <i>Director</i>	<i>Financial Management</i> ABA Associate Degree Banking & Finance F.I.C.B. - Fellowship Institute of Canadian Bankers	Senior Financial Planner, C.L. Financial Ltd CEO, C.C. Beverage Co. Ltd. Marketing Manager, KCV Consulting
Mr Michael S. Persadsingh <i>Director</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> Bachelor of Law Degree Legal Education Certificate Teacher-Ministry of Education	Private Practice-Attorney-at-Law Owned and Managed Several Businesses in the Construction Sector
Ms Indra Sinanan Ojah-Maharaj <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Management</i>	Owner/Manager, Sinanan's Travel and Tours Secretary, Sangre Grande Chamber of Commerce
Mr Rollin Edison Bacchus <i>Director-THA Rep</i>	<i>Clergyman</i>	
Business Development Company Limited		
Mr Ganesh Sahadeo <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Accounting</i> Chartered Accountant	General Manager, YKK West Indies Ltd Audit Manager, Ernst & Young Financial Controller, National Brewing Co Ltd

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Mr Michael Callender <i>Director</i>	<i>Management</i>	Area Manager, North-Royal Bank of T&T General Manager-C'bean Banking Corp, St Vincent Mgr, Commercial Banking-Royal Bank of T&T President, Eastern Credit Union
Mr Gary Cross <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Management</i> Diploma in Social Administration Certificate in Co-operative Studies Diploma in Business Management	Marketing Manager - Unit Trust Corporation Principal - Chaconia Finacial Services Co-owner - Bay Sports & Coastal Tours
Mrs Gayle Daniel-Worrell <i>Director</i>	<i>Marketing</i> EMBA - (currently pursuing) BA - Finance Course in Strategic Marketing Management	Agribusiness Divisional Mgr - MTS Mgr Agriculture Projects & Services Dept - MTS Divisional Mgr - MTS
Mr Noel Gayle <i>Director</i>	<i>Agriculturalist</i> MSc- Agricultural Extension and Administration BSc- Agriculture	Director, Mktg & Sales-Tatil Life Mgr, Training and Organisation Dev-Maritime North Unit Branch Mgr-Maritime
Mr Hugo Mc Farlane <i>Director</i>	<i>Human Resource Management</i> BSc-Business Administration UMRA Programmes; Cert-Train & Org Dev; Team Cert-Quality Improvement; Chartered Leadership Program; Real Estate	Branch Manager, FCB, Couva Branch Manager, FCB, Sipparia Branch Manager, NCB, San Fernando
Mrs Vashti Pheko <i>Director</i>	<i>Management</i> MBA, Marketing and Finance BSc Management Studies	Director, Stollmeyer Ltd Joint Liquidator, Aranguez Estates Ltd Chairman, Consolidated Appliances Ltd
Mr John Sellier <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Management</i>	Business Consultant Change Leader- Small Business Dev. Co Regional Manager-Small Business Dev. Co
Mr Andre Phillips <i>Director-Tobago Rep</i>	<i>Business Executive</i> BA-Degree- Econ.Hist. & Management Post Graduate Certificate in Int'l Marketing	Co-ordinator, Divestment Secretariat Deputy Governor of the Central Bank of T&T Executive Director-T&T Unit Trust Corp
National Enterprises Limited		
Mr Jerry Hospedales <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Economist</i> MA Economics (Monetary and International) BA Arts and Science (Economics & Spanish) Diploma-International Relations	

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Mr Kenneth Henry <i>Director</i>	<i>Accounting</i> ACCA OAS Course in Public Finance Course on Financial Applications for State and Local	Comptroller of Accounts Ag. Permanent Secretary Director of Budgets
Mr Frank Look Kin <i>Director</i>	<i>Petroleum Engineering</i> MSc. Mineral Engineering Management Professional Degree-Geophysical Engineering	President, National Gas Company Vice President-Business Development, NGC CTO, Ministry of Energy
Mr Jeffrey Maxime <i>Director</i>	<i>Banker</i> Pursuing MBA	Citibank - Assistant Vice President KMPG Peat Marwick - Auditing and Accounting
Mr Leroy Mayers <i>Director</i>	<i>Accounting</i> Graduate, London School of Accountancy Member, Chartered Institute of Management Accts. MOF	Permanent Secretary, MOF Director of Budgets, MOF Director, Agro-based Manufacturing & Services Sector,
Dr Selwyn Ryan <i>Director</i>	<i>Political Scientist</i> PhD -Political Science BA-History	Director-Inst of Social & Econ Research Head, Dept of Gov't-UWI Snr Lecturer-UWI
Mr Ross Alexander <i>NATUC Rep</i>	<i>Trade Unionist</i> Labour Relations Certificate in Mediation Issues Courses in Industrial Relations	Education Officer & General Council Member- NATUC Secretary General- SWWTU Education Officer- T&T Labour Congress
Mr David Dulal-Whiteway <i>Rep-Republic Bank</i>	<i>Business Management</i> MA Business Administration BSc Management Studies	Exec. Director, Republic Bank Ltd
Mr Ruthven Jaggassar <i>Rep-Royal Bank</i>	<i>Accounting</i> Certified & Corporate Accountant Manager-Frederick Street Branch	Asst. General Manager Manager-St. Augustine Branch
National Helicopter Services Limited		
Mr Ulric Mc Neil <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Business Management</i>	Corporate Manager, BWIA Aviation Management Consultant Aircraft Engineer

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Cmdr Louis Baptiste <i>Director</i>	<i>Lt. Commander</i>	Pilot
Mr Richard Eckel <i>Director</i>	<i>Flight Engineering</i> US ATP Ratings B747 USA Flight Engineer (Turbojet Powered) FAA Class I Medical	Flight Engineer-Pan American World Airways-JFK NY Flight Engineer - BWIA Piarco Airport Captain/Co-Pilot - Texaco Oil Company
Mr Clarence Mitchell <i>Director</i>	<i>Electrical Engineering</i> NODS - National Hazard Mitigation IOB- Exec. Development Programme; Cert- Assoc of Prof Maintenance & Planning Control - UWI	Plant Engineer - Crabbs Power & Desalination Plant Manager - PowerGen Power Station Superintendent - T&TEC
Dr Cheryl Bennett <i>Director-NGC</i>	<i>Lecturer</i> PhD (Psychology) MBA (Marketing & HR Management) BSc (Zoology & Biochemistry)	Lecturer (Physiology) - UWI Research Fellow - Cornell University New York Lecturer - UWI - Mona
Capt Nicholas Nothnagel <i>Member-Ex-officio</i>	<i>Flight Engineering</i> Air Service Training; Ind Relations Flight Engineer Training; DC6 Type Tech UK Commercial Pilot Licence (Helicopter)	Manager/Pilot - NHSL Deputy Chief Pilot-AMOCO Pilot-Bristow Helicopters
Point Lisas Industrial Port Development Corporation Limited	<i>Transition Management</i> MSc Business Administration Defense Planning and Resource Management ISO Implementation	Transition Manager -Maritime and Fisheries Institute of T&T Project Manager-Spancrete Caribbean Limited Commanding Officer-TTCG
Cdr Kayam Mohammed <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Economist</i> Diploma in Management Studies UWI Executive Director T&T Unit Trust Corporation Bachelor of Arts - Economics Major IMF Course in Financial Analysis & Policy	President, UTC Financial Services & Chaconia Growth & Income Fund Acting Chief Executive Officer, UTC
Mr Clarry Benn <i>Director</i>		
Mr Junior Joseph <i>Director</i>		

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Mr David Lewis <i>Director</i>	<i>Business Management</i> Printing and Graphic Arts Management Management Seminar on Supervisory Skills Seminars on Finance for Business, International Trade etc	Managing Director, Label House Co-Founder and Director of Digi Signs, Package House, Valu Label
Mr Etienne Mendez <i>Director</i>	<i>Engineering</i> BSc - Civil Engineering Construction Manager	President, GEO Technologie Ltd CEO & Senior Project Mgr- Interchange Engineering
Mr Raffique Shah <i>Director</i>	<i>Journalism</i> Cambridge School Certificate Graduate-Royal Military Academy	Columnist/Senior Writer- Express Newspapers President-Nat Farmers & Workers Union Managing Editor-T&T News Centre Limited
Mr Lloyd Walters <i>Director</i>	<i>Consultant</i> BSc - Industrial Engineering Diploma in Applied Chemistry Training in Sugar Technology	Factory Manager, Jamond Enterprises Production Supervisor and Manager
Ms Doris Wong <i>Director</i>	<i>Banker</i> Fellow of Chartered Institute of Bankers UK Associate Chartered Institute of Secretaries & Administrator Associate of Chartered Institute of Bankers UK	CEO, Institute of Banking and Finance Secretary, Bankers Association of Trinidad and Tobago Project consultant, Credit Risk Management, Republic Bank Limited
LESS THAN 50%		
BWIA West Indies Airways Limited Mr Lawrence Duprey <i>Chairman</i>		Senator Legal Adviser
Mr Anthony Jacelon <i>Chairman-Deputy</i> (GORTT)	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> S.C; BA (Laws); L.L.M. C.E.C.D; A.C.I. Arb.	
Mrs Indira Maharaj-Ramrekersingh <i>Director</i> (GORTT)	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> LLM Petroleum Law and Policy Legal Education Certificate LL.B, B.A.	Attorney-at-Law, Ministry of Energy & Energy Industries Legal Officer, Ministry of National Security Senior State Counsel/ Legal Advisor to Leader of the Opposition

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Mr Michael Small <i>Director (GORTT)</i>	<i>Hotelier</i>	Managing Director of Sandy Point Village Founding Director of New BWIA Director of Tourism Development Authority
Mr Gordon Deane <i>Director (Regional Priv)</i>	<i>Insurance Services</i> Fellow Chartered Insurance Institute (FCII) Assoc of Chartered Insurance Institute (ACII) Mgmt Program; Snr Exec Mgmt Program	Business & Insurance Consultant Mgr Director-Tatil Life Mgr Director-Crown Life C'bean Ltd
Mr Krishna Narinesingh C.M.T <i>Director (Regional Priv)</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> Articles of Clerkship Intermediate and Final Exams Under the Law Society - United Kingdom	Former Partner - T.M Kelshall & Sons Former Partner - Laurence Narinesingh & Co. Solicitors, Conveyancers & Notaries Public
Mr Rodney Shastri Prasad <i>Director (Regional Priv)</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i>	
Mr Rajveer Ranawat <i>Director-Int'l Private</i>	<i>Financial Executive</i>	
Mr Michael Stanfield <i>Director-Int'l Private</i>	<i>Financial Executive</i>	
Mr John O'Brien <i>Rep-Employee</i>	<i>Pilot</i>	
Metal Industries Company Limited		
Prof Kenneth Julien <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Electrical Engineering</i> BSc in Electrical Engineering PhD in Electrical Power Systems	Executive Chairman- Kenesjay Systems Limited Professor-UWI (30 years) Headed Energy Task Force
Mr Lionel Albert <i>Director</i>	<i>Management</i> MEd - Administration Certificate in Addiction Studies Certificates in Management, Counseling, Communication, Motivation	SPO/STO - Trintoc/ Petrotrin PPO (Management Training) - Caroni SPO (Personnel Management) - MTS
Ms Ganying Ching <i>Director</i>	<i>Banker</i> Training and Development in General Management, Leadership, Customer Service, Banking and Financial Services Management.	Snr Asst Manager-Royal Bank, Independence Sq Manager-Royal Bank, St. James

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Dr Clifford Dyer <i>Director</i>	<i>Education Administrator</i> Doctor of Education, MA Industrial Education BSc; Certified Technical Teacher Technical Certificate in Automotive Engineering	School Supervisor-Tech Vocational Education & Training Teacher Training, Adult Education Research Assistant & Teacher
Mr Khalid Hassanali <i>Director</i>	VP-Corporate Administration, Petrotrin <i>Training in Telecommunication</i>	
Dr Clement Imbert <i>Director</i>	<i>Mechanical Engineering</i> PhD Mechanical & Metallurgical Engineering MSc Metallurgical Quality Control BSc Mechanical Engineering	Undergraduate and Graduate Teaching Supervision of Graduate Research Mechanical Engineer, CAIRI
Mr Ronald Nurse <i>Director</i>	<i>Engineering</i> MSc - Highway and Traffic Engineering BSc - Civil Engineering	Managing Director - Trintoplan Head of Civil Engineering Division - Trintoplan Senior Engineer - Ministry of Works
Prof Clement Sankat <i>Director</i>	<i>Engineering</i> PhD- Engineering MSc- Mechanical Engineering BSc- Mechanical Engineering	Head, Dept of Mechanical Engineer Asst Dean, Faculty of Engineering Chairman-CARIRI
Ms Carol Telemaque <i>Director</i>	<i>Geologist</i> BSc Geology	Geological Advisor, Petrotrin
Trinidad and Tobago Mortgage Finance Company Limited		
Mr Calder Hart <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Economist</i> Economics Post Graduate at MIT	CEO- The Home Mortgage Bank President- Saskatchewan Housing Corporation Executive Chairman- Saskatchewan Securities Commission
Mr Colin Kagaloo <i>Director (GORTT)</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> LLB	Senior Partner, Fitzwilliam, Stone Furness-Smith & Morgan
Mr Louis Andre Monteil <i>Director (GORTT)</i>	<i>Financial Executive</i> Fellow, Assoc. of Chartered Certified Accountants	Group Financial Director, CL Financial Ltd Chairman, National Housing Association

NAME

Ms Sonia Noel
Director (GORTT)

Mr Rudranath Indarsingh
Director-NIB

Mr Gerard Pinard
Director-NIB

Ms Inez Sinanan
Director-NIB

PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS

Accounting
Member, Institute of Chartered Accountants of T&T
Fellow, Assoc. of Chartered Certified Accountants
Graduate, London School of Accountancy

Trade Unionist
Bachelor of Arts Degree
Advanced Level Certificate

Chemical Engineering
B-Eng. Degree (Chemical Engineering)
Diploma-Personnel & Industrial Relations

Insurance Services
MBA (Finance & Marketing); Associate in Arts
BA; Training: Alternate Dispute Resolution
Training: Developing Quality Serv.Culture

EXPERIENCE

Ag Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Finance
Dir. Social and Economic Transformation, MOF
Business Analyst/Accountant II, MOF

General Secretary - AT&S&GWTU
Education Officer - AT&S&GWTU
Teacher

Chemical Engineer-Petroleum Co of T&T
Human Resource Mgmt-Petroleum Co of T&T
Snr. Employee Relations Officer, Petrotrin

Risk Analyst-Continental Insur. Division
Underwriting Mgr-General Insurance Div
Underwriter-AFIA Worldwide Insurance Co.

RES102B

Appendix II

Ministry of Finance, Investments Division

DIRECTORS C. V. SUMMARY

As at January 31, 2003

CORP-STATUTORY

Airports Authority of Trinidad and Tobago

Mr Linus Rogers
Chairman

Electrical Engineering
MSc, Electrical Engineering - Communications
BSc, Electrical Engineering - Communications
Adv Diploma, Human Resource Mgmt

Ms Beverly John-Toney
Chairman-Deputy

Attorney-at-Law
LLB
LEC

Corporate Engineering Manager - TSST
Training Manager - TSST
Manager, Central Office Maintenance North West-TSST

Senior Legal Counsel, NGC

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Mr Franklyn Greaves <i>Member</i>	<i>Social Scientist</i> MSc - Business & Public Admin BSc - Psychology & Allied Science	Labour Recruitment Officer, Local Govt GORTT Business Mgmt, PepsiCo Inc. Personnel Mgmt, Hydro-Ontario
Ms Joan Massiah <i>Member</i>	<i>International Relations</i> MSc - International Relations Diploma - International Relations; BA - French Training in Int'l & National Security Issues	Chief Executive Officer, National Security Council Permanent Secretary, Office of the PM Foreign Service Officer V, Min of Foreign Affairs
Mr Francis Pedro <i>Member</i>	<i>Civil Aviation</i> Training in Air Traffic Control/ Aircraft Airworthiness/ Air Traffic control radar/ Civil Aviation Mgmt Aviation Safety Certificate	Deputy Director, Civil Aviation Chief Instructor, Civil Aviation Training Centre Flight Operations/ Licensing Officer
Mr Allan Powder <i>Member</i>	<i>Private Businessman</i>	THA Rep. AATT
Mr Hilton Guy <i>Member-Ex-officio</i>	<i>Commissioner of Police</i>	
Mr Ralph Newton <i>Member-Ex-officio</i>	<i>Ag Comptroller of Customs</i>	
Mr Kumar Sirjusingh <i>Member-Ex-officio</i>	<i>Chief Immigration Officer</i>	
Port Authority of Trinidad and Tobago		
Mr Noel Garcia <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Economist</i> MBA BSc Econ	Meridian Developers Limited - CEO NIPDEC, General Manager NIPDEC, Administrative Manager
Mr Ian Welch <i>Chairman-Deputy</i>	<i>Engineering</i> BSc - Chemical Engineering	Managing Director, PCS Nitrogen Operations Manager, Fertrin Engineering Manager, Fertrin
Mr Foster Cummings <i>Commissioner</i>	<i>Business Management</i> Assoc of Arts - Corp Studies, Cipriani Labour College National Dip Co-op Mgmt, Cipriani Labour College Mgmt and General Development, Butler Institute of Labour	Co-operative Officer, Commissioner for Corp. Dev. Director, California Youth Centre Teacher, Indian Trail Centre, Couva

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Ms Dianne Holman <i>Commissioner</i>	<i>Accounting</i> Cert-Options, Futures and Other Financial Derivatives Chartered Certified Accountant A' Level Graduate	
Mr Gordon Laughlin <i>Commissioner</i>	<i>Business Management</i>	Projects & Agency Manager
Mr Winfield Quamina <i>Commissioner</i>	<i>Insurance Services</i> Social Sciences Diploma Trained Teachers Diploma	Public Service Teaching Service Life Insurance Sales
Mr Sais Narayan Tiwary <i>Commissioner</i>	<i>Project Consultant</i> BSc Economics	Director/Secretary, Diproinduca Trinidad Limited Business/Project Consultancy in T&T and the Caribbean Director, Gencon Ltd
Ms Ruth Van Lare <i>Commissioner</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> LLB	Practicing Law since 1977
Public Transport Service Corporation		
Mr Ethelbert Paul <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Insurance Services</i> Course in Agency Management Advanced Management Programme	Managing Director, ALGICO Mayor of POS Agency Manager, ALGICO
Mr Garth Cameron <i>Chairman-Deputy</i>	<i>Accounting</i> Bachelor Degree - Accounting Dip. - Oil & Gas Accounting; Project Management Adv Int'l Programme in Oil & Gas Financial Mgmt	Team Leader-Acc't Business Unit, BP Amoco Systems Accountant, BP Amoco Team Leader-Budgets Group, BP Amoco
Ms Marvo Harper <i>Member</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> Legal Education Certificate Bachelor of Law Degree Diploma-Public Administration	Personnel Relations Officer II Tutor U.W.I. Alderman, POS City Corp
Mr Mahadeo Jagmohan <i>Member</i>	<i>Sales Representative</i> Diploma - Human Relations Diploma - Psychology & Effective Speaking	Member of the Senate Chair, Labour Relations Committee, PNM Marketing Sales Rep, Hindu Credit Union Co-op

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Mr James Morton <i>Member</i>	<i>Police Officer</i>	Self-Employed - Joinery, Agriculture Special Reserve Police Corporal - Police Service of T&T
Mrs Zena Ramatali <i>Member</i>	<i>Businesswoman</i>	President, National PTA Vice Chairman, National PTA PRO, National PTA
Ms Hyacinth Whiteman <i>Member</i>	<i>Social Worker</i> Social Work Training Management Training	Social Welfare Supervisor Social Welfare Adviser Assistant Teacher
Mr Mc Colman Williams <i>Member</i>	<i>Mechanical Engineering</i> Dip-Automotive Eng'g; Works Mgmt Cert Ord & Higher Nat Course-Mech'l Engineer Mech'l, Automobile & Machine Shop Work	Engineering Contractor-Zamac Engineering Manager-Caroni (1975) Ltd Superintendent-Shell Trinidad Limited
Trinidad and Tobago Electricity Commission		
Mr Devanand Ramlal <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> Legal Education Certificate Bachelor of Law Degree BSc - Economics	Consultant-Capildeo & Capildeo Assoc Attorney-Capildeo & Capildeo Legal Adviser-Sanatan Dharma Maha Sabha
Mr Hakeem Ahmad <i>Member</i>	<i>Education Administrator</i> MSc - Accounting BSc - Management Studies (Industrial) Seminars-Mgmt; Acc'g; Exec Leadership	Principal - Hakeem Ahmad & Co. Chartered Accountants Snr. Audit Professional - Pannell Kerr Forster Senior Manager, Credit - Corporate Banking Unit, FCB
Mr Daniel Dookie <i>Member</i>	<i>Business Management</i> Masters Degree, Business Administration Postgraduate Diploma, Management Advanced Diploma, Business Administration	Lecturer, Roytec Marketing Representative, Guardian Life Senior Lecturer, Institute of Tertiary Tutors
Ms Gloria Hanson <i>Member</i>	<i>Clerk</i> Certificates in Management & Business Administration Certificate in Public Relations, Marketing & Advertising Accounting Technician Course	Communications Clerk, Petrotrin Manager's Secretary, Canadian Pacific Limited Accounts Clerk, Toronto General Hospital

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Mr Cyril Myers <i>Member</i>	<i>Information Technology</i> MSc Computer Science (currently pursuing) BSc Computer Science & Physics	IT Manager, RBTT Bank Limited Manager, Branch Banking, RBTT Bank Limited Senior Systems Programmer, RBTT Bank Limited
Mr Marcus Nelson <i>Member</i>	<i>Electrical Engineering</i> National Certificate in Electrical Engineering	Area Manager, T&TEC (Tobago) Senior Engineer, T&TEC; Area Engineer, T&TEC Managing Director, Nelson & Nelson Ltd
Mr Chandrabhan Sharma <i>Member</i>	<i>Engineering</i> MSc Power Systems (Dist.) BSc Electrical Engineering PhD Electrical and Computer Engineering	Deputy Dean, Faculty of Engineering, UWI Senior Lecturer, Dept of Electrical & Computer Eng., Lecturer, Dept of Electrical & Computer Eng., UWI
Mr Acherson Wells <i>Member</i>	<i>Electrical Engineering</i> EMBA Business Administration BSc Electrical Engineering	Manager, Refinery Maintenance - Petrotrin Senior Maintenance Superintendent - Petrotrin Head Refinery Maintenance - Trintoc
Trinidad and Tobago Postal Corporation		
Ms Patt Christopher <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> LL.B (Hons), Professional Bar Exam, Dip. Advanced Communications Skills, Dip. Strategic Marketing Alternative Dispute Resolution, Cert. U.K. Oil & Gas Law	Corporate Communications Manager (TSTT) Public Relations Manager (TATIL) Manager, Personnel & Public Relations (United Security Life Ins. Co.)
Mr Franklyn Jeremiah <i>Chairman-Deputy</i>	<i>Banker</i>	
Mr Cloyd Blackman <i>Member</i>	<i>Insurance Services</i> Business Management	Branch Mgr, Mega Insurance Salesman with various Industrial Companies Member of THA Board
Mr Basdeo Maharaj <i>Member</i>	<i>Financial Management</i> Business Management Courses in Public Relations & Information Technology	Executive Asst., OPM Events Co-ordinator, Min. of Foreign Affairs Executive Asst. to the Prime Minister
Ms Haida Mohammed <i>Member</i>	<i>Management Consultant</i> Masters Degree - Education BA - Education Courses in Human Resource Mgmt	Administration Manager-Process Plant Services Ltd Group Human Resource Mgr-McEnergy Alstons Admin/ Human Resource Mgmt-NEC, TTMC

NAME

Mr Raymond Phillip
Member

PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS

Economist
BSc - Economics
Diploma - Public Relations; Labour

EXPERIENCE

Postmaster General
Senior Economist
Planning Officer II

Water and Sewerage Authority

Mr Roland Baptiste
Chairman

Lecturer
BA MA - History, Political Science
Dip. Management
MSc - Mgmt Education & Org Change

Senior Lecturer, Dept. of Mgt Studies, UWI
Deputy Director, UW/IOB
Chief Personnel Officer, GORTT

Mr Rawlinson Agard
Chairman-Deputy

Business Management
MA - Public & Business Administration
BA - Econ & Political Science
Teachers Diploma

Lead Consultant, Systems Management Consultants Ltd
Manager HR/Admin, NGC
Asst HR Mgr, TSTT

Mr Jonathon Adams
Commissioner

Financial Consultant
BSc - Business Administration
Adv Dip. - Building Construction
One year Co-operative studies

Agent/ Financial Consultant - CLICO
Agent/ Financial Consultant - Mega Insurance Co Ltd
Tutor/Facilitator - National Training Board

Mr Christopher Chin Kong
Commissioner

Chemist

Self employed businessman

Mr Thomas Denoon
Commissioner

Business Management
Dip. Principals & Practices of Management
Certificate Course in Accounting
Dip. Air Conditioning, Refrigeration & Elec. Appl

Assemblyman, THA
Authorized Officer, NIB
Checker/Costing Clerk

Mr Michael Mohammed
Commissioner

Industrial Sales
GCE O'Levels

City Treasurer and Chief Accountant-POS Corporation
Audit Semi-Senior-Ernst and Young
Lecturer (part-time)-Students Accountancy Centre

Ms Sandra Parmesar
Commissioner

Accounting
ACCA
Dale Carnegie Leadership Training
Shirley Rudd Outley Mgmt Training

NAME

Ms Leandra Ramcharan
Commissioner

PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS

Attorney-at-Law
MA - Business Law
LLB
BA (History & Sociology)

EXPERIENCE

Attorney-at-Law, Supreme Court of T&T
Criminology Lecturer, UWI
Teacher, Bishop Anstey High School

RES102B

Appendix III

Ministry of Finance, Investments Division

DIRECTORS C.V. SUMMARY

As at January 31, 2003

BOARD-STATUTORY

Agricultural Society of Trinidad and Tobago

Ms Wendy Ann Lee Yuen
Chairman

Horticulturist/Landscape Consultant
BSc Agriculture

Farmer
Lecturer - Horticulture
Landscape Consultant

Mr Lyle Donawa
Chairman-Deputy

Agricultural Manager
Management Courses

Member of Transport Board & National Training Agency
Agricultural Manager, Caroni Limited

Ms Shirley Cupid
Member

Farmer

Farming (over 30 years)

Mr Lennox Emamdin
Member

Farmer

Valuator
Private Farming

Mr Franklyn Greaves
Member

Social Scientist
MSc - Business & Public Admin
BSc - Psychology & Allied Science

Labour Recruitment Officer, Local Govt GORTT
Business Mgmt, PepsiCo Inc.
Personnel Mgmt, Hydro-Ontario

Ms Jennilyn Hamblin-Raphael
Member

Human Resource Management
Diploma in Public Administration/Labour Studies
Certificate Management Studies
BSc Management Studies
Agriculturalist

HR Officer, T&TEC
Secretary, Las Cuevas Farmers Assoc.
Part-time Farmer

Mr Anthony Joseph
Member

Project Officer I, Min of Local Govt
Seventeen Years experience in Agriculture
Valuation Division, Min of Finance

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Mr Norman Kistow <i>Member</i>	<i>Agriculturalist</i>	Supervisor, Forestry Division Member, Agricultural Co-operative Experience in Cocoa & Rice Farming Farming (19 years)
Mr John Maingot <i>Member</i>	<i>Animal Husbandry</i> Degree in Animal Husbandry	Regional Agricultural Consultative Committee VP, County Agricultural Consultative Committee Secretary/Treasurer, Thick Vlg Agricultural Society
Mr John Mitchell <i>Member</i>	<i>Farmer</i>	Consulting for FAHO/CFNI
Mr Floyd Neckles <i>Member</i>	<i>Agricultural Scientist</i> MSc - Agriculture BSc - Agriculture Dip.-Business Studies & Public Administration	Project Director, Sugarcane Feeds Centre Commercial Farming Manager, Las Hermanas Estate
Mr Glen Ramjag <i>Member</i>	<i>Micro Enterprise Specialist</i> BSc- Management Studies Courses- Agri Trade Policy; Media Techn Annual Development Workers Course	Micro Enterprise Specialist Project Manager-Business Strategic Ltd Food Crop/Tree Crop Farming (27 Years)
Mr Earl Herbert Sampson <i>Member</i>	<i>Farmer</i> Dip.-Eastern Caribbean Farm Institute	Manager-Marper Farm, Ministry of Agriculture Manager-La Reunion Plant, Propagation Plant Field Officer, Agricultural Society of T&T
Mr Donaldson Wilson <i>Member</i>	<i>Farmer</i>	President, Naprima District Agricultural Society Farming - esp. local produce and herbs
Mr Pooran Rattan <i>Member- NATUC Rep</i>	<i>Financial Executive</i> Fellow, Assoc. of Chartered Certified Accountants	Group Financial Director, CL Financial Ltd Chairman, National Housing Association
National Housing Authority	<i>Land Surveyor</i> BSc Land Surveying Sciences Course-Global Positioning Systems Course-Global Warming and Sea Level Rise	Land Surveying and Hydrography-Govt of St. Lucia Director of Surveys and Commissioner of State Lands-GORTT OIC Hydrographic Surveying Unit-Lands and Surveys Division
Mr Louis Andre Monteil <i>Chairman</i>		
Mr Francis Charles <i>Chairman-Deputy</i>		

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Mr Faris Al-Rawi <i>Member</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> LL.M; Certificate in Legal Education LLB	Attorney-at-Law, Private Practice Assoc Attorney-at-Law-JD Seller & Co Legal Advisor-Permanent Iraqi Delegation to UNESCO
Mr Rajnath Chankar <i>Member</i>	<i>Business Management</i>	Director, South West Marketing Ltd The Welding & Tool Company Ltd South West Hardware & Oilfield Supplies
Mr Geoffrey Herrera <i>Member</i>	<i>Architecture</i> Bachelor of Architecture Space Utilization and Function Planning Project Management	Joint Partner-Herrera MacLean ACP Assoc Architect-Newel Lewis Broadbridge Assoc
Mr Krishna Kantasingh <i>Member</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> BSc Industrial Management LLB Legal Education Certificate	Community Development Officer Teacher II Attorney-at-Law
Mr Joel London <i>Member</i>	<i>Human Resource Management</i>	
Mrs Hazel Rogers Dick <i>Member</i>	<i>Accounting</i> Fellow, Certified Chartered Accountants ACCA	Deputy Mayor/Mayor - City of San Fernando Financial Consultancy City Clerk/ Borough Treasurer Accountant
Mr Robert Giuseppe <i>Member- NATUC Rep</i>	<i>Trade Unionist</i> Dip. & Cert- Labour Economics & Labour Studies Dip.-Human Resources, Management & Industrial Rel Fellow of ILO Univ. of Turin	Executive Member of NUGFW Executive Member of NTUC Chief Negotiator for NUGFW
Mr Clifton Winchester <i>Member- THA</i>	<i>Education Administration</i>	THA Representative on NHA Board
National Lotteries Control Board		
Mr Louis Lee Sing <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Mass Communication</i> Diploma-Mass Communication Executive Management	Executive Chairman- Citadel Limited Managing Director- Radio Vision Ltd/Superior's Infinite Prod. Ltd CEO/Managing Director- ICN

Ms Cheryl Guide <i>Member</i>	<i>Office Assistant</i> Hairdresser	Office Assistant - Guide's Funeral Home Time Keeper/ Supervisor Ministry of Works Home Hairdresser
Mrs Norma Lewis Phillip <i>Member</i>	<i>Social Worker</i>	Minister in the Ministry of Finance Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Finance Minister in the Ministry of Local Govt & Ministry of Health
Ms Lyndsay Parmashwar <i>Member</i>	<i>Business Management</i> Executive Skills for the 2000's Diploma Course Executive Management Personal Development Course	Purser - BWIA Senior Flight Attendant - BWIA Junior Flight Attendant - BWIA
Mr Carl Groome <i>Member- THA</i>	<i>Agriculturalist</i> Credit Diploma in Agriculture Professional Rural Youth Leadership Training Project Mgmt & Other Tech Areas in Agriculture	Editor-Division of Agriculture's Magazine, THA Television Producer-Information Unit, THA Co-ordinator-4H & Young Farmers Programme, THA
St. Dominic's Children's Home Dr Dorrell Philip <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Psychologist</i>	
Sr Maria Shirley Gay <i>Member</i>	<i>Religious Education</i>	Catholic Nun
Ms Eunice Gittens <i>Member</i>	<i>Social Worker</i>	Director, National Family Services
Judge Stanley John <i>Member</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i>	
Sr Catherine Therese Mc Comie <i>Member</i>	<i>Religious Education</i>	Catholic Nun
Mr Darryl Nunes <i>Member</i>		
Sr Helen Scott <i>Member</i>	<i>Religious Education</i>	Catholic Nun
Ms Marilyn Yearwood <i>Member</i>		

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
St. Jude's School for Girls		
Sr Joan Charlerie <i>Manager</i>	<i>Education Administrator</i>	Manageress, St Jude's School for Girls Catholic Nun
Ms Sharon Ahye Romeo <i>Member</i>	<i>Human Resource Management</i>	Human Resource Officer Probation Officer
Sr Joanne Browne <i>Member</i>	<i>Education Administrator</i>	Asst. Manageress, St Judes School for Girls Catholic Nun
Mr Mark Chang <i>Member</i>	<i>Accounting</i> Chartered Accountant	
Sr Antoinette Dickie <i>Member</i>	<i>Education Administrator</i> Bachelor of Philosophy in Educ Studies Diploma-Teacher of the Deaf Teachers Diploma	Regional Superior, Carmelite Sisters Child Care Worker-Holiday Home, England Superintendent-Lady Hochoy Home
Ms Joanne Julien <i>Member</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i>	Private Practice as an Attorney-at-Law Director, T'bad Building & Loan Member, Disciplinary Committee- Law Assoc.
Mrs Grace Smith-King <i>Member</i>	<i>Education Administrator</i>	School Supervisor
St. Mary's Children's Home		
Rt. Rev Calvin Bess <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Diocesan Bishop</i>	Human Resource Specialist
Ms Patricia Rousseau <i>Manager</i>	<i>Social Worker</i>	Manager, St. Mary's Children's Home
Rev Kenley Baldeo <i>Member</i>	<i>Religious Education</i>	Teacher I Minister of Religion
Mrs Brenda Fraser <i>Member</i>		
Ms Merle Gay <i>Member</i>	<i>Education Administrator</i>	President, Child Welfare League Retired School Supervisor

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Rev Jemmott Hazlewood <i>Member</i>	<i>Minister of Religion</i>	
Mr David Patrick <i>Member</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i>	
Ms Margaret Phillip <i>Member</i>	<i>Auditor</i>	
Ms Karen Pierre <i>Member</i>	<i>Lecturer</i>	
Mr Fitzroy Thomas <i>Member</i>	<i>Education Administrator</i>	Retired School Supervisor
St. Michael's School for Boys		
Mr Anthony Taitt <i>Chairman</i>		
Mr Vernon Clark <i>Member</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i>	
Ms Eulyn Dove <i>Member</i>	<i>Education Administrator</i>	Retired School Supervisor
Dr Merle Hoyte <i>Member</i>	<i>Professor</i>	
Mr Roland Maundy <i>Member</i>	<i>Skills Training</i>	Asst. Director, Metal Industries Company
Mr Errol Pilgrim <i>Member</i>	<i>Special Education</i>	
Mrs Joanna Shaw-Lloyd <i>Member</i>	<i>Social Worker</i>	Retired Social Worker
Mr Robert Shurland <i>Member</i>		Director, Tourist Board
Mrs Doreen St. Hill <i>Member</i>	<i>Nutritionist</i>	

<u>NAME</u>	<u>PROFESSION/QUALIFICATIONS</u>	<u>EXPERIENCE</u>
Mr Fitzroy Thomas <i>Member</i>	<i>Education Administrator</i>	Retired School Supervisor
Sugar Industry Labour Welfare Committee		
Mr Lennox Sankersingh <i>Chairman</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> Bachelor of Science Bachelor of Law Legal Education Certificate	Attorney-at-Law-Private Practice Assoc Tutor-Hugh Wooding Law School; Legal Counsel, Caroni Ltd Lecturer in Law-Cipriani Labour College
Mr Winston Cummings <i>Member</i>	<i>Mechanical Engineering</i> Certificate Basic Management Training Certificate Human and Industrial Relations Mgmt Certificate Mechanical Drawing	Mechanical Engineer Caroni (1975) Limited Vice Chairman Sugar Welfare Committee Vice Chair/Chief Grievance Officer- Assoc of Tech & Supervisory Staff
Mr Ashmead Mohammed <i>Member</i>	<i>Industrial Relations</i> 3rd Year Degree in Industrial Relations Diploma - Agriculture; Cert - Radio Broadcasting Cert - Industrial Relations, Marketing, Dale Carnegie Course	Farm School Instructor - Min of Agriculture Agricultural Assistant I - Min of Agriculture Clerk I - Min of Finance
Mr Lallan Rajaram <i>Member</i>	<i>Farmer</i>	PRO, TICFA Farmer
Mr Clarence Rambharat <i>Member</i>	<i>Attorney-at-Law</i> LLB	
Ms Ann Marie Seegoolam <i>Member</i>	<i>Sales Representative</i> GCE O'Levels Sales Market Research	Heller Chemicals, Account Marketing/Sales Rep Ganeesingh Drugs, Sales Vernon Pharmaceuticals Imports, Sales/Marketing
Mr John Jaglal <i>Member- NATUC Rep</i>	<i>Industrial Relations</i> Industrial Relations Courses Communications & Leadership, Social & Medical Effects of Drug Abuse Courses	Exec Officer-Sugar & Gen Trade Union Head, Maintenance Dept-Sugar & Gen Union Nat Insur Claims Officer-Sugar & Gen

**Private Legal Services
(Retention by the Attorney General and/ or
Director of Public Prosecutions)**

19. Sen. Robin Montano asked the hon. Attorney General:
- (a) Could the hon. Minister provide this House with the following information:
 - (i) The names of all attorneys-at-law in private practice and the private law firms that have been retained by the Office of the Attorney General and/or the Director of Public Prosecutions for the period December 25, 2001 to date?
 - (ii) The matters for which the said attorneys-at-law and/or law firms were retained?
 - (b) Could the hon. Minister inform this Senate about the number of all requisitions made to each attorney-at law and/or law firm inclusive of any refreshers?
 - (c) Could the hon. Minister further inform this Senate about:
 - (i) the amount of money paid to each attorney-at-law or law firm to date?
 - (ii) The amount of money outstanding to each attorney-at-law or law firm for each matter to date?

Pursuant to her reply to question 19, earlier in the proceedings, the Attorney General (Sen. The Hon. Glenda Morean) caused to be circulated to Members of the Senate the following statistics:

**LEGAL FEES PAID TO PRIVATE ATTORNEYS
FOR THE YEAR 1996**

NAME	PARTICULARS	AMOUNT	TOTAL
M. G. Daly & Co	Professional fees re: -HCA 1097/95 - N Boodram vs DPP -HCA 495/96 - Dole Chadee vs the AG	51,750.00 150,070.00	

NAME	PARTICULARS	AMOUNT	TOTAL
Russell Martineau	-HCA 4536, 4537/86 3625/91 AG vs V. Nunez & Co. -HCA 4020/95 Bholia Nandlal v DPP Professional fees re: -HCA 1097/95 – V. Nunuz vs DPP -HCA 1122/79 -A. Hosein vs AG -CA 31/96 – CPO vs Gladys Gafoor -Tribunal # 3/94 PSA vs CPO -HCA 2060/92 - L. Sanchoy vs AG & COP -HCA 2061/92 - P. Martin vs AG & COP -HCA 580/94 - L. Ashby -HCA 2187/96 - Ken Ali & S. Baboolal vs AG -HCA # 766 & 767/96 -Judicial Review - Z. Baharry & Gov't of USA -Judicial Review - P. Boodram & S. Eversley etc -HCA 2762/95 - O. Seapaul v AG	6,900.00 51,750.00 57,500.00 8,050.00 51,750.00 34,500.00 5,750.00 5,750.00 8,625.00 63,342.00 45,788.40 207,061.24 57,500.00 86,250.00	260,470.00
Rolston Nelson	Professional fees re: HCA # W5/95 Reinsurance of T&T Professional fees re HCA #1304/93 Olton v AG & ors	86,250.00 41,400.00	631,866.64 127,650.00
De la Bastide & Jacelon	Professional fees re: 2569, 2684/95 - O. Seapaul vs P. Manning & AG	86,250.00	86,250.00
Sonny Maharaj	Professional fees re: HCA # 3844/90 - Arbitration Seereeram Bros. vs AG	86,250.00	86,250.00
Claude Denbow	Professional fees re: CA # 139/95 Reinsurance Co. of T&T	92,000.00	92,000.00
Karl Hudson Phillips	Professional fee on brief iro -R. Nadidke v J. Theodore, Ministry of National Security. -Conference with Energy team NGC & Atlantic LNG -HCA- 2098/96 -CA 103/96 K Ali & S. Baboolal -Extradition of Z. Beharry -HCA 3063/93 - Judicial Review, Charles Dougdeen -Raffick Sahadath & C. Baptiste -State v N. Boodram -HCA 766/96 S. Wanza & ors vs the AG	31,188.00 16,980.90 52,164.00 40,572.00 429,520.74 66,794.30 5,796.00 448,831.78 51,621.00 86,250.00	1,143,468.72 86,250.00
Allan Alexander	Fee on brief re: HCA # 663/96 T. Reyes & CPO vs G. Gafoor	86,250.00	86,250.00
Ewart Thorne	Professional fees re:	138,000.00	

NAME	PARTICULARS	AMOUNT	TOTAL
	-HCA 3482/95 CL Financial & the AG -CA # 11/88 P. Beharry & A. Jack	51,750.00	189,750.00
Theodore Guerra	Professional fees re: State vs Dole Chadee & ors	440,384.35	440,384.35
David Turner Samuels	Professional fees iro; Jamaat al Muslimeen & O. Seepaul	110,677.20	110,677.20
Simons, Muirhead & Burton Solicitors	Professional fees re: Settlement of L. Sankar v The State Privy Council Appeal No. 22/93	96,215.38	96,215.38
Kibedi & Co	Professional of fees & disbursements re: Privy Council Appeal of Ashook Dookie vs State	22,537.61	22,537.61
Messrs Charles Russell & Co.	Professional fees re: Preparation of brief in the matter of Dole Chadee & ors for Murder etc. Privy Council Taxing fees- N. Boodram & ors Privy Council Appeals in respect of; -D. Sukram vs State -R. Sahadath vs State -E. Penny vs State -K. Teesdale vs State -M. Wanza vs State -F. Khan vs State -C. Smart vs State	284,357.71 9,090.35 226,140.04	
Timothy Cassell QC	Professional fees re: The State v Dole Chadee & ors leading evidence, preparing of brief, conferences etc.	1,556,062.45	519,588.10
Ingledeu Brown Bennison	Petition for special leave to appeal to the Judicial Committee of the Privy Council re Michael Wanza	15,845.25	1,556,062.45
Geoffrey Robertson	-Professional fees for the Preparation of preliminary report on Media Laws for Trinidad	92,213.00	15,845.25
Maureen Rajnauth Lee	-Professional advice/opinion on Habeas Corpus Bill	10,233.19	102,446.19
Sonny Maharaj	Professional fees re: HCA 4730/91	2,875.00	2,875.00
Fenton Ramsahoye	Professional fees for Arbitration proceedings – Seereeram Bros.	92,000.00	92,000.00
TOTAL	Professional fees re: Extradition of Z. Beharry	5,796.00 74,922.00	80,718.00
		\$5,743,304.89	\$5,743,304.89

**LEGAL FEES PAID TO PRIVATE ATTORNEYS
FOR THE YEAR 1997**

NAME	PARTICULARS	AMOUNT	TOTAL
Russell Martineau	Professional fees re: -CA #129/93 C. Vincent vs COP -CPO vs TTUTA # 1/97 -Balliram Ramberran vs the AG -Felix Durity vs AG -Appeal # 2/97 Min of Labour vs TTUTA -R. Crane vs E. Rees & ors	34,500.00 116,000.00 862.50 46,000.00 28,750.00 13,800.00	239,912.50
Allan Alexander	Professional Fees re: M Ramdhanie & ors vs the AG Fees for brief and appearance in court Fees re: Claims by E. Elias for damages	57,500.00 57,500.00 5,750.00	120,750.00
Elaine Greene	Professional Fees re: brief on Prop. Amend. On under Dangerous Drugs Act. Professional fees re: Ken Gresham & ors vs the AG Professional fees re: DPP vs Gaya Persad Sahadeo	9,000.00 70,000.00 25,000.00	104,000.00
Mahendra Mathur	Professional fees as Arbitrator re: Seereeram Bros. Ltd & AG	15,000.00	15,000.00
Karl Hudson Phillips	-Professional fees re: Preliminary Inquiry re: Ferreria vs Ramdhanie -Professional fees re: State vs Constantine & Williams -Re: Question of Parliamentary Privileges ex-parte the AG -Payment being US Gov't vs Z. Beharry	780,561.93 214,871.75 8,694.00 128,180.16	1,149,696.99
Tajmool Hosein	-Professional fees re: Memorandum of Understanding re: Southwire Const. & Head of Agreement with Noisk Hydro. Professional fees re: brief for opinion Ministerial salary	17,389.15 -20,125.00	-20,125.00

NAME	PARTICULARS	AMOUNT	TOTAL
Dolsingh & Dolsingh	Professional fees re: Privy Council Appeal -E. Mc Collins -George Constantine -David Ross -A. Edwards & A. Thomm -W. James & T. Briggs -Dennis John -E. Lawrence -W. Solomon -K. Thomas	3,000.00 5,235.00 3,900.00 4,350.00 4,350.00 3,900.00 3,900.00 3,900.00 3,900.00	
Martin Daly & Co	Professional Fees re: Rosie Blanchfield & ors Professional Fees tend for 3 days Breach of copyright inter media systems ltd	138,000.00 155,250.00 17,250.00	310,500.00
Fenton Ramsahoye	Professional fees for advice & services rendered re: - To SG re HCA 110/97 & HCA 754/97 -Conference of Telecommunication & Opinion on counsel of Shareholders Agreement -Conference with AG & ors -Opinion on amendment to Bill -Services rendered to AG on position of Attorneys at Law -Galbaransingh Judicial Review Committee	6,000.00 183,256.40 2,500.00 9,448.50 3,149.30 322,143.30	526,497.50
Gerald Stewart	Professional fees re: State vs Ramdhanie & ors	125,200.00	125,200.00
Rolston Nelson	-Cost for refresher in HCA 3892/90 Jamaat al Muslimeen vs Jules Bernard -Appearance on ex parte re: Filing of Injunction	64,400.00 57,500.00	121,900.00
Daltons	Professional fees iro HCA 834/97 & 1000/97 re: P. Manning vs the AG	213,669.90	213,669.90
Messrs Charles Russell & Co.	-Meeting and advising AG and preparing documents for Counsel and communicating with SG and instructing counsel with respect to matter of N. Boodram and ORS. -Researching and drafting proposed new Rules to govern criminal petitions from T & T to the Judicial Committee; communicating with the SG Professional fees representing the State in appeals of; -S. Jurisingh, P. Matthews & F. Mohammed v. A.G. – Ramdhan vs State -Glenroy Francis & ORS vs State	61,014.02 260,930.58 124,706.99 39,205.72 42,975.50	

NAME	PARTICULARS	AMOUNT	TOTAL
	-S. Sandy vs State -L. Saroop & H. Ramnath -Mc Collins vs the State -Jaikaran Tokai & ors vs the State	58,405.05 78,549.00 365,445.72 260,930.58	1,292,163.16
David Turner-Samuels	-Amount for advising the A.G. on matters of National Interest (THA Draft Bill, Draft Legislation re: Pratt & Morgan decision with respect to Dangerous Drugs Act) -Professional fees re: court appearances in the following: Judicial review – I. Galbaransingh -HCA 834/97 – Application of P. Manning for Judicial review Advising on: 1. 18 th Report of Ombudsman 2. Criminal Justice Bill 1997 3. Drugs and Firearms court Bill 1997 Constitution Amendment Bill 1997 Amendment to the standing orders of the HOR & S and Senate Professional fees for advising the AG on Financial Fees Act and matters of M. Ramdhanie, Geesham Toolstie, and John Beharry.	50,491.07 312,366.84	
	Withholding taxes to BIR.	318,769.38	
	Professional fees & disbursement for advising the AG on number of matters:	68,261.94	
	1. HCA – Ali Meah John Ltd. vs AG 2. HCA Land Acquisition Act and the application of Narwani and Co. 3. Poverty Eradication and Equity Building – whether the President could take active role in poverty council. 4. Procedure to be used for regular appointments in Industrial Court Letter of protest from His Honour Judge Elcock. 5. Note for Minister of Legal Affairs – Separation of portfolios. 6. Report of the Ombudsman 7. HCA R. Rorell & ors. Leon Mc Call & ORS and 10 others Vs A.G.	467,299.30	
	Professional fees for Advising the Speaker of the House of Representatives	145,688.20	1,292,163.16
Ingledeu Brown Bennison & Garret	Professional fees iro petition for special leave to appeal to the Judicial Committee on behalf of Errol Mc Collins	16,640.00	16,640.00
Anthony White	-Professional fees iro meeting with Shareholders Agreement relating to T&T Methanol Co. Ltd -Fees for Judicial Review by T&TUTA	23,747.63 7,964.33	31,711.96
Timothy Cassell	Professional fees re - Appeal of Dole Chadee & ors.	2,488,699.70	2,488,699.70

NAME	PARTICULARS	AMOUNT	TOTAL
BD Hewitt & Co.	Legal representative Re: Privy Council Appeal of Fazal A. Khan	5,000.00	5,000.00
Dynamally Int. Group	Consulting fees for Opinion on Green paper	47,248.50	47,248.50
Andrew Mitchell	Advising on phone and Meeting on Dangerous Drugs Act	9,707.40	9,707.40
S. Rutter & Co	Professional fees re: Privy Council Appeal - David Ross vs State - Angel Thomas vs State - D. John vs State - W. James vs State	69,030.40	69,030.40
Del la Bastide & Jacelon	Report on Port Authority vs G Gafoor	402.50	402.50
Sonny Maharaj	Professional fees Re: Seereeram Bros. vs the State	46,000.00	46,000.00
TOTAL		\$8,353,167.24	\$8,353,167.24

**LEGAL FEES PAID TO PRIVATE ATTORNEYS
FOR THE YEAR 1998**

NAME	PARTICULARS	AMOUNT	TOTAL
David Turner Samuels	-Professional fees for advising the Solicitor General & Law Commission on Several Bills, Cases etc. between 2-26/6/97 -Preparing Two opinions, Advice in writing on alleged contempt etc	86,204.76	111,204.76
Geoffrey Robertson	Professional fees for Advising the AG & Opinion on; -Change of Financial year, -Proposed National Racing Commission Legislation -Constitution Amendment Bill 1998. -Constitutionality of Dangerous Drugs Act -Proceeds of Crime Bill, -Mutual Assistance in Criminal Matters Bill -Equal Opportunities Bill 1998.	70,724.53	82,124.42
Charles Russell & Co	Professional fees & disbursements re: Learie Alleyne Forte v AG & COP Professional fees for representing the State in Privy Council Appeals of: -Keiron Thomas vs State -Angel Thomas vs State -Albert Edwards vs State	155,957.15	152,848.95
		937,672.13	

NAME	PARTICULARS	AMOUNT	TOTAL
	-Anthony Johnson vs State -Allie Mohammed vs State -H. Constance vs State -D. John vs State -W. Jackson vs State -E. Lawrence vs State -P. Holder vs State -Moses vs State -G. Constance vs State		1,093,629.28
S. Rutter & Co.	Being professional fees for representing Gerald Wilson & Keiron Thomas before Privy Council	30,179.79	30,179.79
Kibedi & Co	Professional fees re Privy Council Appeal of Fazal Khan vs. State	18,793.31	18,793.31
Messrs Simon, Muirhead & Burton	Professional fees & Disbursements in Privy Council Appeal of Peter Holder Vs the State	98,080.13	98,080.13
Nabarro Nathanson Lord Wilberforce	Fees & Disbursements in Privy Council Appeal of A. Moses Vs the State	101,747.38	101,747.38
Jakob TH Moller	Consulting & Advising the Judicial Committee of the Privy Council in relation to rights of speech in criminal matters on behalf of T&T	2,649.17	2,649.17
Karl Hudson Phillips	Drafting legal opinion in respect of accession to the optional protocol to the International Covenant on civil and political rights. -Professional fees re: Memo of Understanding -Appearing iro review US Gov't v Z. Beharry -State vs N. Ramdhanie & ors -Sgt. St. Cyr vs M. Paul & ors -Judicial Review re: I Nsaumeh	25,200.00 8,694.00 87,346.29 289,800.00 146,047.70 156,723.00	25,200.00 25,200.00
Pollonais Blanc	Payment to obtaining award arbitration re: Seereeram Bros vs the AG	7,500.00	7,500.00
Fenton Ramsahoye	Professional fees re: Death Penalty Professional fees re: HCA 1000/97 P. Manning vs Hector McLean Speaker	25,196.00 193,579.50	218,775.50
Dolsingh & Dolsingh	Professional fees re application for special leave of appeal re: -D. Baptiste, & ors -C. Charles -A. Noel & ors -Natasha de Leon -D. Thomas -T. Barrow -W. Prince Informa Pauperis -N. Williams	7,750.00 3,900.00 9,100.00 3,900.00 3,900.00 5,050.00 3,900.00 4,100.00	41,600.00

NAME	PARTICULARS	AMOUNT	TOTAL
Sonny Maharaj	Professional fees re: HCA 3844/90 re: Seereeram vs AG	23,000.00	23,000.00
Allan Alexander	Professional fees re: HCA 1000/97 P. Manning vs Hector McLean Speaker	221,000.00	221,000.00
M. G. Daly & Partners	Professional fees re: -HCA 157/94 Teaching Service Commission vs R.L. Maharaj -HCA 461/97 Peter John vs COP & AG -Judicial Review Air Caribbean vs Air Transport -HCA 1494/98 H. Hilaire -HCA 178/98 Appeal against H. Hilaire -HCA 1680/98 Civil App. Vs Prisons -Consulting fees re: Seizure of Motor Vehicles by state officers	40,250.00 92,000.00 138,000.00 172,500.00 138,000.00 86,250.00 28,750.00	695,750.00
Trevor A Lee	Professional fees rendered as arbitrator Re: HCA 630/80 E. Elias vs AG	85,000.00	85,000.00
Elaine V Greene	Professional fees re: -HCA 1202/97 D. Dass & E. Greene -HCA DPA # 5/97 DPP vs Ashford Ragoobar	114,650.29 22,500.00	137,150.29
Norman J Singer	Consulting Services iro laws rendered to the Ministry of the AG	163,872.75	163,872.75
Russell Martineau	Professional fees re: -HCA 2592/97 E. Rees vs R. Crane -HCA 1164/98 J. Ramiah vs AG -HCA 326/98 J. Boodhoo vs AG -HCA 1373/98 D. Thomas vs Comm. Of Prisons -HCA 1680/98 W. James & ors vs C. Baptiste & ors -HCA 1164/98 J. Ramiah vs AG & ors -HCA 791/98 G. De Gannes vs AG	80,500.00 86,250.00 86,250.00 212,750.00 86,250.00 5,750.00 46,000.00	603,750.00
Rolston F. Nelson	Professional fees re: -HCA 2592/97 E. Rees vs R. Crane -Jammal al Muslimeen vs Jules Bernard, Commissioner of Police	80,500.00 71,300.00	151,800.00
Gregory C. Armorer	Professional fees re: -HCA 1494/98 Appeal of H. Hilaire etc -Requisition fee on brief for High Court Matters	84,510.25 18,000.00	102,510.25
TOTAL		\$4,774,652.55	\$4,774,652.55

**LEGAL FEES PAID TO PRIVATE ATTORNEYS
FOR THE YEAR 1999**

NAME	PARTICULARS	AMOUNT	TOTAL
Charles Russell & Co	Professional fees for – representing State before the Privy Council in the following appeals: -Campbell vs State -Stena Nautica vs State - Charles vs. State -D. Baptiste vs State -S. Dwarika vs State -A. Garcia vs State -H. Hillaire vs State -I. Ramjattan vs State -D. Ross vs State Extradition of G. Stokes -G. Stafford vs State -W. Solomon vs State -T. Barrow vs State -T. Briggs vs State -G. Wilson vs State Payment of Invoice #101419	500,000.00	
	Professional fees re: - Appeal of Dole Chadee & ors	34,633.76	
	Professional fees in respect of opinion provided on Privy Council & Human Rights	1,272,590.94	
	Professional Charges and disbursements for representing the State in Privy Council	204,620.63	
	Appeals -Herbert Ferguson Vs State -H. Yatali vs State -Mario Pedro vs the State	95,140.98	
Charles Russell & Co	Professional fees for representing the State in Privy Council Appeals -D. Baptiste & ors vs State -W. James vs State -Darren Roger Thomas vs State -M. Reid vs State -H. Hillaire vs the State -Mohammed vs. State -W. Caesar vs State -I. Ramjattan vs State	1,777,467.97	

NAME	PARTICULARS	AMOUNT	TOTAL
	-N. Boodram & ors vs State -W. Jackson vs State -M. Francois vs State -W. Bernard vs State -C. Peters vs State		4,351,042.31
Professor Zander QC	Professional Fees – Privy Council Appeal Natasha De Leon vs the State	40,803.33	40,803.33
David Turner Samuels	Professional charges for preparing Report on newly proposed Rules of the Supreme Court	100,000.00	100,000.00
Geoffrey Robertson	Advising in writing on revised project, newly proposed rules of the Supreme Court, conditions of service for Judges etc, THA matters and legal privileges of the AG and Cabinet.	51,939.81	51,939.81
Anthony Sean Hudson	Professional fees re: Administration of Justice (Miscellaneous Provisions) Bill 1999	2,183.69	2,183.69
Escritorio Calcano Vetancourt	Payment for Legal services rendered re: Jamaat Al Muslimeen v J. Bernard, Col. R. Brown and AG.	2,974.13	2,974.13
S. Rutter & Co	Legal Advice to the Attorney General	134,412.20	134,412.20
Andrew Mitchell QC	Professional Fees re: Petition for special leave to appeal to the Privy Council -D. Baptiste vs State -A. Papan vs State -G. Moore vs State -R. Clarke vs State -G. Tahahoo vs State -K. Seepersad Vs State		
Andrew Mitchell QC	Being professional fees for: advice on Money Laundering Cases	16,613.47	16,613.47
Pullig & Co	Cost of upgrading ticket and providing advice in the matter of the State vs Albert Baboolal	126,768.00	126,768.00
Martin Daly & Partners	Professional fees re: -HCA 2548 - N. Boodram vs C. Baptiste & ors -Appearance 7-8/3/99 -Cost in requisition re Article in Daily Express -CA 233/98 Dole Chadee & ors vs the AG	11,436.61	11,436.61
		213,900.00 69,612.00 40,250.00 69,000.00	

NAME	PARTICULARS	AMOUNT	TOTAL
	-Cost of Constitutional Motion Dole Chadee & ors -Cost of requisition 1305/99 -Brief on HCA 2187/98 -HCA 1990/98 -HCA 1387/99	138,000.00 86,250.00 69,000.00 28,750.00 138,000.00	852,762.00
Russell Martineau	Professional fees re: -HCA 2548 N. Boodram vs C. Baptiste & ors -HCA 3840/95 – Rhonda Ramjag vs AG -HCA 3261/98 – J. Boodoo vs AG -Privy Counsel Hearing 15/4/99 -CA # 144/96 -Cost of Constitutional Motion Dole Chadee & ors -Cost of requisition 1569/99 -Cost of requisition 2187/98 -Cost of requisition 1990/98 -Cost of requisition 233/98 -Cost of requisition 1305/99 - Cost of requisition 569/97	227,700.00 28,750.00 6,900.00 40,000.00 63,250.00 138,000.00 17,250.00 69,000.00 28,750.00 29,000.00 86,250.00 51,750.00	786,600.00
Rolston Nelson	CA # 137/97 – Gentle vs. AG	57,500.00	57,500.00
Jakob T.H. Muller	Researching & drafting of Legal Opinion	25,192.80	25,192.80
Karl Hudson Phillips	Professional fees re: -CA # 140/96 -1804/98 D. Baptiste vs Commissioner of Prisons -2119/98 K. Thomas vs Commissioner of Prisons -HCA 2118/98 -HCA 1804/98	52,192.75 29,718.88 86,940.00 86,940.00 173,880.00	429,671.63
Dolsingh & Dolsingh Co.	Professional fees re Appeal for Special leave ifo -D. Ramona & ors -Cost of contract service to the Min of Ins Lance Lashley -Amit Mawlah	89,000.00 74,900.00 3,900.00	167,800.00
Mira Dean Armorer	Professional fees re: -HCA # 531/99 I. Noumeh -Cost in requisition re Judicial Project Sector Reform -CA # 212/98 D. Baptiste vs the AG -Cost of requisition re the Planning of Development of Land #2 -Cost of requisition re D. Chadee Application -Cost of requisition re: Abuses by Police Officers and/or Public Servants	6,400.00 2,850.00 750.00 5,000.00 2,850.00 750.00	

NAME	PARTICULARS	AMOUNT	TOTAL
	-Cost of requisition re: report on misuse & abuse of State Powers	4,657.97	23,257.97
Dennis Wickham	Expert witness for the State	35,436.38	35,436.38
Rikki Harmanan	Professional fees for Services rendered; -HCA # 3982/90	50,000.00	50,000.00
TOTAL		\$7,266,394.33	\$7,266,394.33

**LEGAL FEES PAID TO PRIVATE ATTORNEYS
FOR THE YEAR 2000**

NAME	PARTICULARS	AMOUNT	TOTAL
Fenton Ramsahoye	-Professional fees for services rendered to the Ministry of the Attorney General -Cost of requisition Judicial Review Proceeding S# 246/2000 -CA # 101/99	875,228.75 65,000.00 252,000.00	1,192,228.75
David Turner Samuels	Advising the AG on the Pensions Act	40,000.00	40,000.00
Messrs Charles Russell & Co.	Professional fees re: Privy Council Appeal -Anthony Briggs v. the State -Dave Carter v. the State -Giselle Stafford v. the State -Special Leave as Poor Persons -Professional fees for services rendered -Election of Alderman	433,543.62 277,296.02 178,815.25 503,512.64 50,625.75 1,425,207.20	2,869,000.48
Rikki Harmanan	Professional fees for Services rendered re: -HCA 2292/94 & 2982/90 -HCA 3982/90 Jamaat al Muslimeen vs Jules Bernard & ors	56,000.00 6,500.00	62,500.00

NAME	PARTICULARS	AMOUNT	TOTAL
Andrew Mitchell	Professional fees for services rendered re: -Proceeds of Crime -State Vs Albert Baboolal	95,322.64 497,345.00	592,667.64
Collyer – Bristow Solicitors	Professional Services rendered in Privy Council Appeal of -Rannath Harrilal vs State -Cletus Timothy & ORS vs State	707,831.64 314,490.76	1,022,322.40
Burson Marsteller	Professional fees for Advisory Services rendered to the Attorney General	319,146.72	319,146.72
Timothy Cassell	Professional fees & disbursements for representing the State in the matter of ; -Director of Public Prosecutions (T&T) vs Maharaj & ors -Advising AG's Dept, prosecuting in the matter of N.Sooklal & F. Mansingh vs the State		
Mira Dean Armorer	Professional fees re -HCA 531/99 & CA #101/99 -cost in requisition Judicial Sector Reform Project -cost in requisition 101/99 -HCA 906/2000 -HCA 412/89, CA # 146/97 -HCA 632/00 - Dr. Chatoorgoon vs PSC & AG -HCA 1313/00 – CCN vs the AG -HCA 777/98 -Professional fees for meeting with AG	715,688.70 15,290.00 3,350.00 4,000.00 10,500.00 35,000.00 4,000.00 30,000.00 22,500.00 34,250.00	715,688.70
Russell Martineau	Professional fees re: -CA# 140/ 98 -HCA 1713/99 - Star Telecommunication vs Dir. Tel. -HCA 3982/90 - Jamaat al Muslimeen vs Jules Bernard & ors -HCA 784/2000 - Ministry of Health vs PSA Brief & Appeal -Special Tribunal # 8/2000 PSA vs CPO -H. Hilaire vs the State	22,250.00 86,250.00 143,750.00 57,500.00 69,000.00 80,500.00	158,890.00
Martin Daly & Partners	Professional fees re: -HCA 1413/99 Judicial Review	72,500.00	459,250.00
			72,500.00

Written Answers to Questions

Tuesday, March 11, 2003

NAME	PARTICULARS	AMOUNT	TOTAL
Dolsingh & Dolsingh	Professional fees re: -Rannath Harrilal Special Leave to Privy Counsel	56,500.00	56,500.00
R.C. Nzerem	Professional fees for services rendered -Commission of Enquiry into the Administration of Justice	89,193.39	89,193.39
Messrs Lovell White Durant	Professional fees re: -Appeal of H. Hilaire & ors vs the State	95,002.20	95,002.20
Messrs Simmons & Simmons	Professional fees re: -Appeal of H. Hilaire & ors vs the State -Cost of producing records for Privy Council	95,002.20 4,645.52	99,647.72
Geoffrey Robertson	Professional fees for services rendered	3,150.00	3,150.00
Sir Godfray Le Quesne	Professional fees re: -A. Briggs vs the State -D. Thomas & ors vs the State -Preparation of Government on Civil & Political Rights	28,631.08 107,909.55 35,836.85	172,377.48
Karl Hudson Phillips	Professional fees re: -Ex Parte US Government vs K. Lorie -M. Ramdhanie & ors vs the State -Appointment as Special Counsel to the Anti Corruption Squad -Cost in requisition re: Convey. & M'gce Bill 2000 -Investigation into the Airport Contract -Opinion EBC & Airport Contract	5,796.00 44,613.10 623,489.50 40,250.00 718,677.84 512,741.10	1,945,567.54
James Dingemans	Professional fees for advising the Attorney General	15,221.10	15,221.10
S. Rutter & Co	Professional fees for services rendered	32,471.68	32,471.68
Phillippa Kaufmann	Professional fees for services rendered re: -Independence of the Judiciary	129,012.66	129,012.66
Daltons	Professional fees re: -HCA 326/98 -HCA 100/00 S 246/00	2,000.00 450.00	2,450.00
Greenbug & Traurig	Professional Services rendered re: - State vs THA	24,908.15	24,908.15
Dr. E. Faye Williams	Interview with Ian Ali, Ohio, USA	16,468.12	16,468.12

NAME	PARTICULARS	AMOUNT	TOTAL
Simmons Murhead & Burton	Professional fees for appearing before the Privy Council	410,291.96	410,291.96
Gerald Hutchinson	Professional Services rendered to the Ministry of the Attorney General	1,500.00	1,500.00
C.A. Serrano & Co	Cost in requisition HCA 128/99, CA 141/99	540.00	540.00
Norma E. Maynard Marshall	Professional fees for services rendered	10,800.00	10,800.00
Anand Ramlogan	Professional fees for services rendered	28,500.00	28,500.00
TOTAL		\$10,637,796.69	\$10,637,796.69

**LEGAL FEES PAID TO PRIVATE ATTORNEYS
FOR THE YEAR 2001
January to April**

NAME	PARTICULARS	AMOUNT	TOTAL
Rikki Harmanan	Professional fees re: -cost in requisition re: HCA 2292/94, 3982/90	22,500.00	22,500.00
Russell Martineau	Professional fees re: -cost in requisition Special Tribunal # 8/00	86,250.00	86,250.00
Dolsingh & Dolsingh	Professional fees Privy Council Appeal re: -K. Langton & Glenroy Bishop -Sheldon Roach	8,100.00 6,100.00	14,200.00
Andrew Mitchell	Professional fees re: -Albert Baboolal vs the State	86,128.20	86,128.20
Sir Godfray Le Quesne	Professional Fees re: -Inter American Court on Human Rights -Cases before the Human Rights Commission	33,494.30 43,519.50	77,013.80
Collyer- Bristow, Solicitors	Professional fees re: -Appeal to the Judicial Committee of the Privy Council -Sheldon Roach vs the State	86,106.15 15,043.68	178,163.63
Messrs Charles Russell & Co.	Professional fees re: -Amendment to the Constitution -C. Timothy & ors -D. Baptiste & ors -Robert Mohammed vs the State	245,266.14 154,356.68 608,488.95 65,960.90	1,074,072.67

Written Answers to Questions

Tuesday, March 11, 2003

NAME	PARTICULARS	AMOUNT	TOTAL
James Guthrie	Professional fees re: -Election Motions	651,925.75	651,925.75
Clyde & Co. Ltd	Professional fees & disbursement re: -Extradition of C. Manichand & R. Karim	204,288.56	204,288.56
Ali Deonanan & Associates Ltd	Professional fees re: -HCA 228/99	14,375.00	14,375.00
Jonathan Walker	Professional fees re: - CA # 19/81 – R. Crane vs E. Rees & ors	18,000.00	18,000.00
Gregory C. Armorer	Professional fees re: -HCA 3223/00 -	75,000.00	75,000.00
Mira Dean Armorer	Professional fees re: -HCA 3223/00 – -HCA 1325/93 & 220/98	50,600.00 13,000.00	63,600.00
V. O. Alcara	Professional fees re: -HCA 3223/00 -	20,000.00	20,000.00
M. Hamel Smith & Co.	Professional fees re: -cost in requisition W. Peters & B. Chaitan vs the AG	85,000.00	85,000.00
Howard Stevens	Professional fees re -H. Hilaire vs the State	57,389.40	57,389.40
TOTAL		\$2,727,907.01	\$2,727,907.01

Appendix 1

PART 1

Payment of legal Fees and Disbursements by the Ministry of the Attorney General to Attorneys -at – Law in Private Practice for the period 25/12/01-24/01/03

Matters for which Attorneys were retained prior to December 25, 2001 but for which payments were made between 25.12.01 – 24.01.03

Date Retained	Attorney	Services/Matter	Amount
1998	Russell Martineau	Fee on Brief –H.C.A. 569/97 C.A. 140/98 Felix Durity -v- AG	\$86,250.00
1998		Refreshers- 6/6/01, 21+22/11/01 H.C.A. 2457/97 Denise Parris -v- Persel Jack # 8881 and AG	\$15,525.00 \$20,700.00
11/01		H.C.A. 3293/01 – Ramesh L. Maharaj and Gittens – Appeal to the Privy Council	\$296,125.00
22/11/01		H.C.A. No. 349/2001 & Civil Appeal No. 17 of 2001 and General Legal Services in giving advice to EBC	
8/1/01	Sir Godfray Le Quesne Q.C	Professional Fees / Advice - Privy Council William Chaitan and Winston 'Gipsy' Peters -v- AG	\$36,579.00
06/04/01		Payment of fees for services rendered in favour of Dhanraj Bispath – re: Police Sergeant	\$156,143.30
		Professional Fees Constitutional Motion H.C.A.395/01 Dhanraj Singh -v- AG	\$170,002.00
		Advice – Amendments to the Constitution of T&T and the State -v- Brad Boyce	\$71,220.18
05/01	Michael Ford	H.C.A. 603/01 - Martin Joseph Gen Sec P.N.M -v- The EBC.	\$2,978.27
05/01	Karl Hudson-Phillips	H.C.A. 603/01 - Martin Joseph Gen Sec P.N.M -v- The EBC.	\$11,500.00

Date Retained	Attorney	Services/Matter	Amount
12/01	Sophia Chote	Appearing on behalf of the State for December, 2001	\$8,000.00
09/05/01	Mark Strachan Q.C.	Professional Fees Constitutional Motion H.C.A.395/01 Dhanraj Singh -v- AG	\$313,567.05
31/05/01	James Guthrie, Q.C.	Preliminary advice – Re: The Death Penalty in Trinidad and Tobago Professional Fees -Alvin Seereeram v – AG Clint & Troy Gocking vs The Attorney General ; Commissioner of Police & Comptroller of Customs; Advice re Chaitan and Peters Professional Fees –Advice Amendments to the Constitution	\$9,121.20 \$184,571.66 \$78,949.50 \$36,235.13
08/01/01 Oct/Nov/01	Charles Russell Solicitors	Professional Fees / Advice - Privy Council William Chaitan and Winston Gipsy Peters –v- AG	\$59,850.59
05/01	Charles Russell Solicitors	H.C.A.603/01- Martin Joseph Gen Sec P.N.M -v- The EBC. & Re: Michael Maharaj & Others	\$29,107.46
16/05/01		Professional Fees Caribbean Communication Network Ltd –v- AG	\$282,074.97
24/5/01		Professional Fees - Rajkumar -v- K. Lalla and Ors	\$617,952.94
31/05/01		Professional Fees – H.C.A 3127/01 Clint & Troy Gocking –v- AG & Ors. Refreshers 22/10/01-31/1/02	\$266,441.90 \$78,949.50
07/06/01	Charles Russell Solicitors	Professional Fees - Rosie Blanchfield & Ors.-v- Ag and Anor.	114,291.86
05/01		Professional Services rendered in the Petitions of B. Debideen and Ors re: appeals to the Privy Council Professional Services rendered – Re: Appeal to the Judicial Committee of the Privy Council –Amir Mowlat & M. Parris	\$348,668.21 \$74,133.20

Date Retained	Attorney	Services/Matter	Amount
01/11/01		Petition for Special Leave to appeal the Privy Council – Re: Norbert Williams vs the State	\$24,260.05
11/01		Payment for professional fees for services rendered at Privy Council – re: Special leave to appeal – R. Taylor v the State; Ashook Kumar, J. Khan v. The State; Ap. Douglas, K. Ling & D. Lendore, I. Villar v. The State, N. Mark v. The State and K. Culppeppers v. The State.	\$588,857.54
2001	Deborah Peake	Continuing retainer for Professional Services rendered at the Privy Council and to instruct Counsel in appeals before the Privy Council Re: Sean Cedeno & K. Logan v. the State	\$134,705.46
		H.C.A.603/01- Martin Joseph Gen Sec P.N.M -v- The EBC.	\$6,900.00
		Professional Fees / Advice - Privy Council William Chaitan and Winston 'Gipsy' Peters –v- AG	\$59,850.59
		H.C.A. 3293/01 – Ramesh L. Maharaj and Gittens – Appeal to the Privy Council	\$226,165.90
28/08/01	Mira Dean Armorer	Professional Fees H.C.A. 632/00 Anand Chattagoon –v- AG	\$117, 250.00
09/11/01	Andre Des Vignes	Professional Fees – HCA 1008/00 Nigel Rajkumar –v- Magistrate Margaret Alert	\$9,200.00
21.6.01	Timothy Cassel, Q.C.	Professional fees – Re: Michael Maharaj & Nine others – Appeal against Conviction for Murder	\$1,007,183.58
	Bindra Dolsingh	Re: Appeals to the Privy Council – Parbatee Sandra Dass, Farayad Edoe, Rawle Ghany, Amin Mohammed	\$8,000.00
	Pollonais Blanc, De La Bastide & Jacelon	Requisition - Re: A number of matters relating to the North West Regional Health Authorities	\$43,351.25
	Howard Stevens	Angel Thomas – Application under s. 64 of the Supreme Court of Judicature – Advice	\$13,681.80
	M. Hamel Smith & Co	Dhanraj Singh v. Director of Public Prosecutions and the Attorney General - Appearance on behalf of the Director of Public Prosecutions	\$288,000.00

Date Retained	Attorney	Services/Matter	Amount
	Geoffrey Robertson Q.C.	Payment of fees for services rendered – Re: Justice Kangeloo	\$1,980.26
	Messrs Simons Merchead & Burton	Payment of costs incurred by the Appellant in the UK – re: Dean Cedeno Kerwin Logan v The State	\$83,286.76
November 2001	Professor Bogdanor	A written opinion and advice provided to the President	\$17,764.20
13.8.01	Hobsons	Preparation Lease – Re: Lease rental of premises at Sweet Briar Road to accommodate the ACS Headquarters	\$20,291.11
	Geoffrey Robertson Q.C.	Professional fees for advising the Attorney General on a number of matters	\$96,391.05
12.01	Greenberg Taurig	Fees for legal services through November 30, 2001 – Re: Republic of Trinidad and Tobago v Allan P D'Araaj	967.77
1999	Bindra Dolsingh	Re: Appeals to the Privy Council – Parbattee Sandra Dass, Parad Edoo; Rawle Ghany; Amin Mohammed	\$8,000.00
		Professional fees – Application for Special Leave to Appeal to the Privy Council by Johnny Richardson	\$4,100.00
	Timothy Straker Q.C.	Advice on litigation and Election in Trinidad and Tobago	908.54
1999	Bindra Dolsingh	Professional Fees – Re: Appeal of George Moore to the Privy Council	\$4,100.00
		Appeal of E. Beckles to the Privy Council	\$4,100.00
		Appeal of Ashook Kumar	\$4,100.00
		Appeal of Robert Mohammed	\$4,100.00

Date Retained	Attorney	Services/Matter	Amount
August, 2001	Mr. Anthony Bradley	Advice Given on the role of the Attorney General & the Director of Public Prosecutions in the conduct of Public Prosecutions	\$7,789.32
December, 2001	Charles Russell Solicitors	Professional Services in respect of opinion relating to section 36(1) of the Supreme Court of Judicature Act	\$25,933.84
	James Guthrie	Professional Services: Re: The Representation of the People Act – Amendments to the Offences Against the Person Act	\$23,607.50
2001	Sir Godfray le Quesne QC	Professional Services – Re: The State vs Brad Boyce	\$47,215.00
	Charles Russell Solicitors	Professional fees – Re: Advice Amendments to the Constitution	\$48,313.50
	Howard Stevens	Re: Advice – Admin – Moulah – Application under s. 64 of Supreme Court of Judicature Act	\$14,631.90
	Simons Muirhead & Burton	Professional Services – Re: Privy Council Appeals – Mohammed & Ors	\$417,936.50
	Sir Timothy Cassell Q.C.	Re: Appeal of M. Madray & Ors.	\$241,650.00
	Charles Russell Solicitors	Re: M. Francois v The State; T. Ramcharan v The State	\$144,594.58
	Howard Stevens	Re: Angel Thomas	\$12,193.25
	Sir Timothy Cassell	Re: Appeal of Inspector Marcelle, Maharaj, Michael & Ors.	\$320,960.00
	Howard Stevens	Wenceslaus v The State	\$12,538.00

TOTAL**\$7,815,747.76**

Part II

Matters relating to Corruption

Payment of legal Fees and Disbursements by the Ministry of the Attorney General to Attorneys -at - Law in Private Practice for the period 25/12/01-24/01/03

Date Retained	Attorney	Services/ Matter	Amount
13/02/02	Russell Martineau	Commission of Enquiry into the EBC - Fee on Brief & Refreshers- 14/3 - 22/3/02, 25/3 - 4/4/02, 8/4 -18/4/02,22/4 -15/5/02	\$348,450.00 \$186,300.00 \$93,150.00
13/02/02	Deborah Peake	Commission of Enquiry into the EBC - Fee on Brief & Refreshers- 14/3 - 22/3/02, 25/3 - 4/4/02, 8/4 -18/4/02,22/4 -15/5/02	\$232,300.00 \$124,200.00 \$62,100.00
06/03/02	Lloyd Barnett	Professional Fees – Civil Appeal 100/02 H.C.A 733/02 Northern Construction –v- Attorney General	\$246,090.00 \$250,191.10
07/03/02	Stanley Marcus	Legal Fees – H.C.A 733/02 Northern Construction –v- AG Refreshers 17/4/02 – 10/5/02	\$276,000.00 \$74,750.00 \$184,000.00
07/03/02	Michael A. Quamina	Legal Fees – H.C.A 733/02 Northern Construction –v- AG Brief and Refreshers 17/4/02 – 10/5/02	\$100,000.00 \$ 26,750.00 \$ 26,750.00 \$ 60,000.00
08/03/02	M. Hamel Smith & Co.	Legal Fees – H.C.A 733/02 Northern Construction –v- AG Brief and Refreshers 17/4/02- 10/5/02	\$77,200.00 \$100,000.00
14/03/02	Alexander Jeremie & Co.	Professional Fees – H.C.A 733/02 Northern Construction –v- AG	\$185,626.50 \$184,558.89
2002	Karl Hudson-Phillips	Or services rendered in connection with the establishment of the Anti-corruption Bureau and advising on a number of matters	1,608,106.45
2002	Roy Holford	Part payment of fee on brief – Re: The State vs Galbaransingh & ors	\$200,000.00
	Gilbert Peterson	Part payment of fee on brief – Re: ASP Maurice Piggott vs Ishwar Galbaransingh & ors	\$200,000.00

Date Retained	Attorney	Services/ Matter	Amount
05/02	Andre Des Vignes	Commission of Enquiry into the Construction of Biche High School - Fee on Brief & Refreshers 4/6 – 14/6/02 10/6 – 12/6/02 17/6 – 18/7/02, 23/7 – 31/7/02,	\$168,000.00 \$47,625.00 \$172,500.00 \$34,500.00
05/02	Ian L Benjamin	Commission of Enquiry into the Construction of Biche High School - Fee on Brief & Refreshers 4/6 – 14/6/02 10/6 – 12/6/02 17/6 – 18/7/02, 23/7 – 31/7/02,	\$120,750.00 \$23,000.00 \$115,000.00 \$23,000.00
10/05/02	Clive Phelps Snr.	Professional Fees Commission of Enquiry into the Piarco Airport Development Project	\$30,000.00 \$200,000.00 \$75,000.00 \$45,000.00
10/05/02	Clive Phelps Jr	Professional Fees Commission of Enquiry into the Piarco Airport Development Project	\$50,000.00 \$150,000.00 \$20,000.00 \$37,500.00
22/05/02	Theodore Guerra	Professional Fees Commission of Enquiry into the Piarco Airport Development Project – Pre hearing work and refreshers	\$10,000.00 \$30,000.00 \$200,000.00 \$75,000.00 \$45,000.00 \$75,000.00 \$630,000.00
22/04/02	Margaret Rose	Professional Fees Commission of Enquiry into the Piarco Airport Development Project – Pre hearing work and refreshers	\$50,000.00 \$20,000.00 \$150,000.00 \$25,000.00
	Elaine V. Green	Part payment of requisition re: Supt Maurice Piggott v Ishwar Galbaransingh & Ors re: Piarco Airport Project – fee on brief	\$143,750.00

Date Retained	Attorney	Services/Matter	Amount
	Karl Hudson-Phillips	Part payment for the cost of services as lead Counsel in the Preliminary Inquiry – Supt. Piggott vs Galbaransingh & Ors	\$500,000.00
	Roy V. Holford	Part Payment of fees re: The State vs Galbaransingh & Ors	\$100,000.00
	Gilbert Peterson	Part payment of professional fees in the case of ASP Maurice Piggott vs Ishwar Galbaransingh & Ors	\$100,000.00
	I.W. Harracksingh & Co.	Professional fees: Re: Anti-corruption Bureau Investigations	\$13,620.00
	Alexander Jeremie & Co.	Refreshers for 17/4 – 10/5/02 – Re: HCA 733 of 2002	\$57,208.61
	Roy Holford	Part payment of fee on brief – The State vs Galbaransingh & Ors.	\$50,000.00
	Roy Holford	Part Payment of fee o brief re The State vs Galbaransingh & Ors	\$50,000.00
	Karl Hudson-Phillips	Part payment of fee on brief re Supt. Piggott vs Galbaransingh & Ors	\$100,000.00
	Elaine V. Green	Part payment of fee on brief re: Supt. Piggott vs I. Galbaransingh & Ors	\$174,375.00
	Karl Hudson-Phillips	Part payment of fee on brief – Re: Supt. Piggott vs Galbaransingh & Ors.	\$174,375.00
	Alexander Jeremie & Co.	Fee on brief of disbursement Re: CA: No. 733 of 2002	\$184,558.89
	Karl Hudson-Phillips	Part payment of fee on brief – Re: Supt. Piggott vs Galbaransingh & Ors.	\$174,375.00

TOTAL

\$10,010,661.94

Part III

Payment of legal Fees and Disbursements by the Ministry of the Attorney General to Attorneys -at - Law in Private Practice for the period 25/12/01-24/01/03

Date Retained	Attorney	Services/Matter	Amount
03/01/02	Russell Martineau	Advice - Provision of Allowance to Members Industrial Court	\$17,250.00
04/01/02		Fees on Brief HCA 3556/01 Lloyd David Elcock - v- AG	\$172,500.00
17/01/02		General Legal Services - HCA 349/01 CA 17/01 Election and Boundaries Commission	\$148,062.50
09/02		Fee on Brief CA 97/02 Appl by F Bobb and G. Moses	\$69,100.00
03/01/02	Elton Prescott	Professional Fees HCA 3367/01 - Application by DPP for Judicial Review	\$138,000.00
05/02		Opinion - Refusal of Senior Public Officers to work in RHA.	\$43,700.00
14/01/02	Roy Holford	Professional Fees Legal Representation Corporal Allan Ramai and PC Stephen Edwards	\$10,500.00 \$6,000.00
22/1/02	Vanessa Gopaul	Professional Fees - HCA 12/18/99 Dindial Paltoo v. Attorney General Refreshers 26/3/02	\$20,000.00 \$2,000.00
01/02	Sophia Chote	Appearing on behalf of the State for January, 2002	\$8,000.00
02/02	Sophia Chote	Retainer for February, 2002	\$8,000.00
03/02	Sophia Chote	Retainer for the month of March, 2002	\$8,000.00
02/02	James Guthrie	Professional fee Advice & Opinion Possible amendments to the Constitution	\$36,235.13

Date Retained	Attorney	Services/Matter	Amount
15/2/02	Nicole M. Basraj	Legal Representation – Constable Sydney Gill. & P.C. Stephen Bernard	\$10,000.00
13/05/02 05/07/02		Sgt. Ramsingh Celestine Phillip & P.C. Kevin Louison P.C. Joseph Fortune	\$10,000.00 \$30,000.00 \$10,000.00
01/03/02	Kelvin Ramkisson	Legal Representation Constable Bruce	\$9,500.00
26/02/02		Constables Seedan, Reid, Renrick Mc. Leod Sargent Mohammed	\$12,500.00 \$10,000.00
19/11/02			
04/4/02	Martin Daly	Fee on brief – Balkissoon Roodal v. the State before Court of Appeal CA 64/99	\$230,000.00
04/04/02	Gilbert Peterson	Professional fees. Balkissoon Roodal v. Attorney General	\$200,000.00
16/07/02		Legal Representation – P.C. Maloo	20,000.00
05/04/02	Douglas L. Mendes	Professional fees – Advice on Convening Parliament	\$40,000.00
28/06/02		Fee on Brief & Refreshers 16/9-8/10/02 HCA 2081/02 Application by Oswald Wilson, Lance Murray, EBC for leave to apply for Judicial Review	\$168,000.00 \$50,000.00
04/02	Seenath Jairam	Professional fees - No. A2/02 Between Hon. Minister of Labour and Cooperatives v. the PSA of Trinidad and Tobago (Injunction)	\$345,000.00
04/02	Henley Wooding	Professional fees – Re: No. A2 of 2002 Application for injunction on behalf of Hon. Minister of Labour and Cooperatives vs the PSA	\$165,000.00
04/02	Dharmendra Punwasee	Professional fees - No. A2 of 2002 - Ministry of Labour and Cooperatives vs the PSA	\$151,090.00

Date Retained	Attorney	Services/ Matter	Amount
17/04/02	Peter M. Howell	Legal Representation-Ag.Corpl Austin & P.C. Appplewhite	\$12,500.00
01/05/02	Anthony A. Jack	Legal Representation P.C Mohammed	\$11,000.00
05/04/02	Alexander, Jerome & Co.	Professional Fees – Advice on Parliament Convening Application by Oswald Wilson, Lance Murray, EBC for leave to apply for Judicial Review	\$17,250.00 \$168,000.00 \$50,000.00
10/5/02	Judith Jones	Fee on brief and refreshers HCA 915/02 – DPP v. Magistrate G. Gonzales	\$17,250.00
08/07/02	Mervyn Campbell	Fees on brief – HCA 2081/02 Application by Oswald Wilson Lance Murray, EBC for leave to apply for Judicial Review	\$168,000.00
12/07/02	Lloyd G. Barnett	Professional Fees HCA 2081/02 Application by Oswald Wilson Lance Murray, EBC for leave to apply for Judicial Review	\$215,319.80 \$160,289.76 \$118,125.00
20/08/02	Ken Wright	Legal Representation - P.C. Richard	\$13,500.00
June, 2002	Mr. Anthony Bradley	Professional Services re: The Constitution and the Meeting of Parliament	\$5,760.70
	Merlin Boyce	Payment for the preparation of lease Re: 7 Lothians Road	\$2,050.40
4.4.02	Martin Daly	Part Payment of fee on brief in the matter – Balkissoon Roodal v The State before the Court of Appeal CA No. 64 of 1999	\$115,000.00
	John S. Jeremie	Professional fees – Re: H.C.A. No 2081 of 2002	\$168,000.00
	Montano & Company	Preparation of Deed of Lease Re: No. 46 Park Street, Port of Spain	\$25,726.85
	Nicole Basraj	Legal Representation for No., 10492 PC Simboonath Rajkumar	\$10,000.00

Date Retained	Attorney	Services/ Matter	Amount
	Wheeler & Co.	Preparation of Lease re Lease/Rental of Warehouse No. 6 Fernandes Ind. Centre	\$5,913.50
	Russell Martineau	Preparation of Lease – Re: Lease/Rental of Warehouse – No. 4 Fernandes Ind. Centre	\$3,523.34
	Martin Daly	Fee on brief – Re: HCA: No. 2663 of 2002 Re: Application by F. Bobb & G. Moses for Judicial Review	\$138,000.00
	Ian Roach	Fee on brief – Re: HCA – No. 2663 of 2002 – Application for Judicial Review	\$86,250.00
	Charles Russell Solicitors	Professional Services rendered to the Office of the President	\$87,198.19
	Anthony Bradley	Professional Services re Lincoln Jeeps	\$26,644.90
	Charles Russell Solicitors	Professional fees – re: Advice – Constitution and the Meeting of Parliament	\$5,184.30
	Charles Russell Solicitors	Re: C. Forbes – The State: Rajkumar v. K. Lalla & Ors	\$617,952.94
	John S. Jeremies	Re: A. Seereeram V. The Attorney General =: C. Bethel v The State	\$184,571.66
	Anthony Jack	Refreshers for 16/9 – 8/10/02 re: HCA 2081 of 2002 Wilson & EBC	\$50,000.00
	Joan Charles	Legal Representation for PC Mohammed	\$11,000.00
	Peterson Lambert & Co.	Retainer for November, 2002	\$11,000.00
	Peterson Lambert & Co.	Legal representation for PC Maloo No 12357	\$20,000.00

Date Retained	Attorney	Services/ Matter	Amount
	J.D. Sellier	Preparation of Lease – Rental of Office at 112 Edward Street, PORT OF SPAIN	\$5,355.50
	Joan Charles	Retainer for December, 2002	\$11,000.00
	Overseas Payments processed		
January 2001	Charles Russell Solicitors	Gypsy & Chaitan	\$102,961.00
July, 2002	Charles Russell Solicitors	Registrar of Industrial Court	\$71,699.00
	Charles Russell	W. Bernard v. The State	\$25,271.00
	Dr. Lloyd Barnett	Refreshers Re: HCA No. 2081 of 2002 – 16/9 – 30/9/02	\$118,125.00
November 14, 2002	Sir Timothy Cassell QC	Snr. Supt. Wellington Virgil v Basdeo Panday	Requisition Outstanding
November, 2002	Sir Timothy Cassell QC	The State vs Dhanraj Singh	Requisition Outstanding
August, 2002	Theodore Guerra SC	The Police v Suresh Maharaj	Requisition outstanding

Total

\$4,984,859.44

Payment of Legal Fees and disbursements
For the period May 2001-December 2001

Sub Head/Item/Sub Item	Payee	Matter/Services	Amount	
02/001/16 Consulting and Other Contracted Services	Russell Martineau	Special tribunal No.8 of 2000 PSA V CPO	40,825.00	
	Sophia Chote	Retainer for April, 2001	8,000.00	
	Mira Dean Armorer	HCA #S-93/2001 R. Moonilal V The AG HCA # 157/2001 R. Augustus V The AG	10,000.00	
	Mira Dean Armorer	HCA#S-220 of 1998 Jowelle Taylor De Souza V SRP E. George & others.	1,500.00	
	Mira Dean Armorer	HCA No.S 1325 of 1993 Deo Ramdath V The AG	1,500.00	
	Dolsingh & Dolsingh & Co.	Appeal for Special Leave to Appeal to the Privy Council by Tackoor Ramcharan	2,000.00	
	Dolsingh & Dolsingh & Co.	Appeal for special Leave to Appeal to the Privy Council by Ann Marie Boodram	2,000.00	
	Hobsons	Preparation of deed of Lease Re: 78 Independence Avenue, San Fernando.	3,836.00	

Sub Head/Item/Sub Item	Payee	Matter/Services	Amount
02/001/16 Consulting and Other Contracted Services	Gregory Carter Armorer	CA No. 21 of 2001 – Peters V AG and Anor Ca No. 22 of 2002 – Chaitan V AG and Anor	60,000.00
	Mira Dean Armorer	CA No.21 of 2001 – Peters V AG and Anor CA No.22 of 2001 – Chitan V AG and Anor	52,000.00
	James Guthrie, Q.C.	Rep. Of the People Act, Amendments to offences against the Person Act.	89,376.00
	James Guthrie, Q.C	Re: Election 2000; Committee to look into the seizure and detention of Motor Vehicles; 76 (2) of the Constitution.	467,180.23
	M. Hamel Smith & Co.	Winston Peters & Williams Chaitan v the AG	60,000.00
	Pollonais, Blanc, De La Bastide & Jacelon	Preparation of deed of Lease Re :No.26A South Quay, POS	14,639.50
	Broomes Lestrade- Procter	Preparation of Deed Re: Lease Rental of #400, EMR Rd, Sangre Grande	3,729.08
	Charles Russell	Petitions for Special Leave to Appeal – Alfred Frederick and Others	539,325.86
	Sir Godfray Le Quesne	The State V Brad Boyce	4,617.35
	Timothy Straker	Opinion Re: Constitution of Republic of Trinidad and Tobago	18,469.40
	Sir William Wade	Opinion Re: Constitution of Republic of Trinidad and Tobago	27,704.10

Sub Head/Item/Sub Item	Payee	Matter/Services	Amount
02/001/16 Consulting and Other Contracted Services	Collyer-Bristow	Appeal to the Judicial Committee of the Privy Council of G. Moore	41,292.45
	Sir Godfray Le Quesne	Opinion on the Powers of the President RE: Appointment of Senators and Ministers	55,056.60
	Charles Russell	Andrew Dottin & Others V The State	998,572.30
	P.N. Bhagwatia	Opinion on the Powers of the President	10,108.92
	Green and Spiegei	Legal Opinion pursuant to the Canadian Citizenship Act, 1947 and Citizenship Act, 1977	11,140.57
	Joan A. Foy	Legal Opinion on US Immigration and Nationality Law	19,502.72
	Collyer Bristow	Privy Council Appeal-Sheldon Roach	15,043.68
	Karl Hudson Phillips	HCA No. 603 of 2001 M. Joseph V The EBC	202,860.00
	M. Hamel Smith & Co.	HCA No. S-93 of 2001 – R. Moomial V The AG HCA No. 157 of 2001 R. Augustus V The AG	153,719.35
	Russell Martineau	-do-	138,000.00
	Russell Martineau Theodore Guerra	HCA No. 2457 of 1997 D. Parris V P Jack #8881 and the AG	127,650.00
	Deborah Peake	HCA No. 603 of 2001 M. Joseph V The EBC	135,240.00
	M. Hamel-Smith & Co. Karl Hudson-Phillips	HCA No.S-395 of 2001 – Dhanraj Singh V The AG Two (2) days Conferences – London Sir Godfray Le Quesne, Q.C. & Others	126,934.85 5,750.00

Sub Head/Item/Sub Item	Payee	Matter/Services	Amount
02/001/16 Consulting and Other Contracted Services	Gregory Armorer	HCA No.157 of 2001- R. Augustus V The AG HCA No.S-93 of 2001 R. Moonilal V The AG	15,000.00
	Geogrey Robertson, Q.C	Opinion Re. The subject of Mr Justice Kangeloo, Telecommunications Bill, Aviation Bill, Contempt of court issues.	94,461.15
	James Guthrie, Q.C.	Re. Clint and Troy Gocking V The AG & Others	180,920.00
	Mark Strachan, Q.C.	Re. Dhanraj Singh V The AG and the DPP	832,232.00
	Ashmead Ali & Co.	Preparation of Deed of lease Ref. No. 43-45 Frederick Street, POS	4,620.90
	Sir Godfray Le Quesne	Advance Re: Election 2000 and appointment of Prime Minister Re: The State V Brad Boyce	84,727.65
	Anthony Bradley	Services provided re Lecture on 'Relations between the Executive and the Judiciary	11,594.31
	Charles Russell	Herbert Ferguson & Others V The AG	497,063.64
	Charles Russell John S. Jeremie	K. Seepersad V The State L. De Four V The State	68,253.75
	Collyer Bristow	Appeals to the Judicial Committee of the Privy Council of K. Persad and R. Jairam	80,793.00
	Charles Russell	Appeals to the Judicial Committee of the Privy Council of K. Persad and R. Jairam	257,434.10
	Charles Russell	V Thomas and M Edmon V The State	83,195.42

Sub Head/Item/Sub Item	Payee	Matter/Services	Amount
02/001/16 Consulting and Other Contracted Services	Andrew Mitchell, Q.C.	The State V Albert Baboolal & Others	187,248.60
	James Guthrie, Q.C.	Advice on Clint & Troy Gocking V The AG & Others	2,252.65
	Howard Stevens	Wenceslaus James – V The State	13,515.90
	Sir Godfray Le Quesne	Opinion Re: Appointment of Ag. Prime Minister	9,010.60
	Charles Russell	Angela Ramdeen V The State	180,561.47
	Charles Russell	Dhanraj Singh's Constitutional Motion	71,237.80
	Anthony Bradley	Karvin Langton V The State	13,929.30
		Opinion Re The Constitution of Trinidad and Tobago	6,094,907.01
		Sub Total for May-December 2001	2,727,907.01
		Sub Total for January – April 2001	<u>8,822,707.31</u>
		Sum Total for 2001	