



Sixth Report of the

JOINT SELECT COMMITTEE ON
LOCAL AUTHORITIES, SERVICE COMMISSIONS
AND STATUTORY AUTHORITIES
(INCLUDING THE THA)

On an
Inquiry into the Efficiency and Effectiveness of the
Teaching Service Commission (TSC)

Third Session (2017/2018), 11th Parliament

Sixth Report

of the

Joint Select Committee on Local Authorities, Service
Commissions and Statutory Authorities
(including the THA)

on an

Inquiry into the Efficiency and Effectiveness of the
Teaching Service Commission (TSC)

Third Session (2017/2018), Eleventh Parliament

HOR PAPER NO. :

SENATE PAPER NO. :

PARL NO: 14/3/48-7

Ordered To Be Printed

Committee Membership

Mr. H.R. Ian Roach	Chairman
Ms. Ramona Ramdial, MP	Vice-Chairman
Dr. Lovell Francis, MP ¹	Member
Mr. Darryl Smith, MP	Member
Mr. Esmond Forde, MP ²	Member
Mrs. Jennifer Baptiste-Primus	Member
Mr. Nigel De Freitas	Member
Ms. Khadijah Ameen	Member

Secretariat Support

Mr. Julien Ogilvie	Secretary
Ms. Khisha Peterkin	Assistant Secretary
Ms. Terriann Baker	Graduate Research Assistant

Publication

An electronic copy of this report can be found on the Parliament's website using the following link:
http://www.ttparliament.org/committee_business.php?mid=19&id=242&pid=28

Contacts

All correspondence should be addressed to:

The Secretary
Joint Select Committee on Local Authorities, Service Commissions and Statutory Authorities (including the THA)
Office of the Parliament
Levels G-7, Tower D
The Port of Spain International Waterfront Centre
1A Wrightson Road Port of Spain Republic of Trinidad and Tobago
Tel: (868) 624-7275 Ext 2277 / 2627 Fax: (868) 625-4672
Email: jsclascsa@ttparliament.org

Date Laid in HOR: 02.02.2018

Date Laid in Senate: 23.01.2018

¹ Dr. Lovell Francis replaced Mr. Stuart Young w.e.f December 01, 2017.

² Mr. Esmond Forde replaced Mr. Faris Al Rawi w.e.f December 01, 2017.

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Term
DPA	Director of Personnel Administration
MOE	Ministry of Education
THA	Tobago House of Assembly
TSC	Teaching Service Commission
UTT	University of Trinidad and Tobago
UWI	University of the West Indies

Contents

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	7
SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS.....	9
INTRODUCTION	12
Summary of Evidence, Findings and Recommendations.....	16
Objective 1: To evaluate the Performance of the Commission relative to the execution of its Mandate	16
Objective 2: To Determine Whether the Resources, Systems and Procedures of the Teaching Service Commission are Sufficient to Allow it to Operate Efficiently	30
Objective 3: To Determine the Challenges Affecting the Operations of the Commission and the Possible Solutions for Alleviating these Challenges.....	38
Appendices	45
APPENDIX I.....	46
APPENDIX II	55
APPENDIX III.....	92
APPENDIX IV	99
APPENDIX V	101
APPENDIX VI	103
APPENDIX VII.....	105
APPENDIX VIII	108

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE NO.	DETAILS	PAGE NO.
1	Recurrent Expenditure of the TSC for the period 2014-2017	13
2	Number of candidates interviewed for the years 2011 to 2016	17
3	Information on the majority of applications received for various positions	30

LIST OF APPENDICES

APPENDIX NO.	DETAILS	PAGE NO.
Appendix I	Minutes of the Proceedings	46
Appendix II	Verbatim Notes	55
Appendix III	Status of Vacancies in Secondary and Primary Schools As at March 13, 2017	92
Appendix IV	Subject areas for which interviews are conducted	99
Appendix V	The number of vacancies where there are no available candidates on the Order of Merit Lists	101
Appendix VI	measures/ initiatives taken by the TSC and MoE to improve the efficiency of the teaching service	103
Appendix VII	Number of officers persistently irregular and unpunctual per education district	105
Appendix VIII	Permanent Secretaries assigned to the Ministry of Education for the years 2014 to 2017	108

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- 1.1. At its Eleventh meeting held on Wednesday 30th November, 2016, the Committee resolved to inquire into the Efficiency and Effectiveness of the Teaching Service Commission (TSC) and agreed that the following three (3) objectives would guide the inquiry:
 - To evaluate the performance of the Commission in executing its mandate.
 - To determine whether the resources, systems and procedures of the Teaching Service Commission are sufficient to allow it to operate efficiently.
 - To determine the challenges affecting the operations of the Commission and the possible solutions for alleviating these challenges.
- 1.2. The Committee agreed to meet in public with officials of the TSC and the Ministry of Education (MoE) on Wednesday 22nd March, 2017.
- 1.3. Oral and written evidence was obtained based on the objectives listed above. Some of the significant issues which were highlighted during the course of the inquiry included:
 - a) The reasons for the delays in the filling of vacancies in the positions of Principal, Vice-Principal, Head of Department and Dean;
 - b) The failure of the MoE to implement the moratorium proposed by the TSC to fill the middle management positions in schools;
 - c) The implications of the *Concordat* on the filling of vacancies in the teaching service;
 - d) The issues and challenges associated with filling vacancies in the position of School Supervisors I and II;
 - e) The procedures in place to treat with absenteeism and irregularity among teachers;
 - f) The procedure for treating with Teachers who have exhausted their Sick Leave and Casual Leave allowances;
 - g) The circumstances surrounding the delay in the upgrading of UTT teachers;

- h) The need to inform the public of the subject areas in the teaching service that have a deficit of Teachers and areas that are saturated;**
- i) The issue of understaffing and the lack of financial resources at the Service Commission's Department;**
- j) The status of the revised Teaching Service Regulations (the Public Service Regulations were adopted by the Teaching Service Commission).**

1.4. Based on observations made during this inquiry, the Committee has proffered recommendations which we believe will appropriately address the issues highlighted. A summary of these recommendations follows this Executive Summary.

1.5. We anticipate that the Parliament, the TSC, the MoE, the Ministry of Finance and other stakeholders would give due consideration to the findings and recommendations contained in this Report with a view to improving the services of the TSC. The Committee looks forward to reviewing the Commission's response to this Report, which becomes due, sixty (60) days after it is presented to the Houses of Parliament.

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

The following is a consolidated list of recommendations proposed by the Committee:

The Committee recommended the following:

- i. **Both the MoE and Service Commissions Department should publish a list of vacancies in the teaching service on their websites. This list should detail the following:**
 - a) **Title of the position**
 - b) **the subject area to be taught;**
 - c) **the corresponding qualifications required; and**
 - d) **the number of positions available for each subject area.**

The database should ideally be updated on a weekly or monthly basis Social media platforms should be utilized where possible.

- ii. **The TSC should take all necessary action to exercise its disciplinary powers vested in it by Section 125 of the constitution. The exercise of such power must be moderated by the necessary legal advice so as to avoid frequent judicial reviews and other forms of legal action on the part of aggrieved teachers.**
- iii. **The establishment of a structured and reliable one-person tribunal system. Screening and selecting appropriate persons to serve on these tribunals should be done methodically and in collaboration with the Ministry of Education.**
- iv. **The MoE should consider implementing an electronic swipe system in all schools as a more efficient means of recording the arrival and departure times of school officials. Even more feasible will be the implementation of a time recorder with the technology to flag teachers who have crossed the 180 minutes late trigger immediately.**

- v. That the TSC collaborate with the MoE to identify cost effective strategies for providing Primary and Secondary School Principals training in the areas of Leadership and Risk Management.
- vi. The MoE provide mandatory training for Principals to be able to effectively perform the procedures outlined in the Progressive Discipline Model. This would ensure that they can be held accountable for their action/inaction.
- vii. Arguably, the Concordat should not discriminate against qualified persons who are not being hired as a result of not being of a school's religious persuasion.
- viii. The TSC and the DPA must focus on boosting internal efficiencies with a view to optimizing the output of existing staff.
- ix. The establishment of a designated quarterly meeting date for meetings between the TSC and MoE. Robust and efficient inter-agency collaboration and communication is essential for the operational efficiency of both parties.
- x. The Ministry and the Commission should approach the amendment of the legislation as a special project and should adopt the commensurate project management strategies to ensure that the process is efficiently managed.
- xi. The TSC should focus on effectively executing its existing mandate before seeking to assume additional responsibilities.
- xii. The delegation of powers and the decentralization of operations must be undertaken subject to a comprehensive feasibility analysis. Such an analysis must involve the assessment of the monitoring capacity of the TSC on one hand and the implementation capacity of the Ministry of Education on the other.

- xiii. The relevant stakeholders should jointly examine the feasibility of having the members of all Service Commissions serve on a full-time basis, as the current work arrangement for Commissioners is impractical and inefficient. Advancing this recommendation may require:
- an amendment to Section 126 of the Constitution;
 - additional financial allocations for the compensation of commissioners for full-time duties.
- xiv. Technical support and/or grant funding from international organisations should be fully explored as a means of improving the current state of ICT in the Service Commission's Department.

INTRODUCTION

Background

- 2.1. The Teaching Service Commission (TSC) was established in accordance with section 124 of the Constitution of the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago. Section 125 outlines the responsibilities of the TSC which include to appoint, promote, transfer, second, confirm appointments and attend to disciplinary matters relating to Teachers.
- 2.2. Section 129 of the Constitution gives the Commissions the right to regulate their own procedure. The TSC adopted the Public Service Commission Regulations, 1966 with retroactive effect from September 26, 1966.
- 2.3. The Commission is also guided by a Concordat which pre-dated the Constitution and prescribes the relationship between the Ministry of Education (MoE), denominational boards and the Education Act Chapter 39:01.

Organizational Structure

- 2.4. Section 124 provides *inter alia* that:
 - i. the TSC shall consists of a Chairman and four other members.
 - ii. the President appoints members of the TSC after consultation with the Prime Minister and the Leader of the Opposition;
- 2.5. The current members of the Commission were appointed in 2014 :

Dr. Fazal Ali	- Chairman
Ms. Anushka Alcazar	- Member
Ms. Joanne Joseph-Hannays	- Member
Mr. Christopher Steele-Eytle	- Member
Ms. Elizabeth Crouch	- Member

- 2.6. The Director of Personnel Administration (DPA) and the Teaching Service Secretariat provide administrative and advisory services (in particular, legal and regulatory services) which enables the TSC to effectively discharge its mandate.³

Fiscal Expenditure

- 2.7. The Recurrent Expenditure of the TSC for the period 2014⁴-2017⁵ is outlined in Table 1 below:

Table 1

Recurrent Expenditure of the TSC for the period 2014-2017

2014 (Actual)	2015 (Actual)	2016 (Estimates)	2016 (Revised Estimate)	2017 (Actual)
\$506,456.00	\$295,789.00	\$450,000.00	\$340,000.00	\$125,000.00

Objectives of the Inquiry

- 2.8. The Committee agreed that the objectives of the inquiry would be as follows:
- To evaluate the performance of the Commission relative to the execution of its mandate;**
 - To determine whether the resources, systems and procedures of the Teaching Service Commission are sufficient to allow it to operate efficiently;**
 - To determine the challenges affecting the operations of the Commission and the possible solutions for alleviating these challenges.**

Conduct of the Inquiry

- 2.9. The Committee reflected on inquiries into the operations of the TSC which were conducted by previous Joint Select Committees. In this regard, the Committee

³<http://www.scd.org.tt/index.php/en/the-service-commissions/167-teaching-service-commission/tsc-role-responsibilities-a-composition>

⁴<http://www.finance.gov.tt/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/Recurrent-Expenditure-2016-Final.pdf>

⁵<http://www.finance.gov.tt/wp-content/uploads/2016/10/Numbered-Draft-Estimates-Revenue-2017.pdf>

was able to identify and highlight some of the main reoccurring and systemic issues affecting the TSC. This revision formed the basis of the Committee's first letter to the Commission which sought status updates on the progress achieved by the Commission further to recommendations proffered by previous JSCs.

2.10. A public hearing was held with representatives of the TSC and the MoE on Wednesday 22 March, 2017 at which time the Committee interviewed the officials on issues relevant to the inquiry objectives.

2.11. At the public hearing, the TSC and MoE were represented by the following officials:

Teaching Service Commission

- i. Dr. Fazal I. Ali, Chairman
- ii. Mrs. Elizabeth Crouch, Commissioner
- iii. Mr. Martel Waldron, Executive Director, HRM
- iv. Ms. Natasha Seecharan, Legal Adviser

Director of Personnel Administration

- i. Ms. Anastasius V. Creed, Director of Personnel Administration

Ministry of Education

- i. Mrs. Lenor Baptiste-Simmons, Permanent Secretary
- ii. Mrs. Sharon Ashman-John, Deputy Permanent Secretary
- iii. Mr. Ashram Deoraj, Director, School Supervision & Management Division
- iv. Mr. John Roopchan, Director, Curriculum Division
- v. Ms. Kavar Williams, Director, HR

- vi. Ms. Margaret Lewis, Director, HR
- vii. Ms. Donnis Bourne, Director, HR

2.12. The Minutes and Verbatim Notes are attached as Appendix I and Appendix II respectively.

Summary of Evidence, Findings and Recommendations

Objective 1: To evaluate the Performance of the Commission relative to the execution of its Mandate

Vacancies in the Teaching Service

- 3.1.1. Effective 1st January, 2017, the Teaching Service Commission (TSC) has been working towards filling approximately 900 vacancies in offices including Teacher I-III and Technical Vocational Teacher I-IV. As at 15th March, 2017 only 187 of these vacancies were filled.
- 3.1.2. **Appendix III** provides the Status of Vacancies in Secondary and Primary Schools as at March 13th, 2017.

The Reasons for the Delay in the Appointment of Teachers

- 3.1.3. Based on the evidence received from the TSC, for the period 2011 to 2016, there are 2,810 persons on the Commission's order of merit list, these persons were interviewed and were waiting to be placed in schools. The order of merit list is valid for three (3) years. The officials of the TSC informed the Committee that there were no vacancies for these candidates because there was a surplus of applicants for certain subject areas such as Social Studies, Sociology and the Natural Sciences.
- 3.1.4. Based on evidence received from the MoE, the subject areas that were oversubscribed for Teacher II /III positions are:
- Biology;
 - Physics;
 - Chemistry;
 - Social Studies;
 - Geography;
 - History;
 - Mathematics; and
 - Business.

3.1.5. The subject areas for which interviews were conducted are outlined in **Appendix IV**. A breakdown of the number of candidates interviewed by year is illustrated at Table 2:

Table 2
Number of Successful Candidates for the years 2011 to 2016

Year	Number of Successful Candidates
2011	449
2012	483
2013	362
2014	379
2015	558
2016	579
TOTAL	2810

Source: Teaching Service Commission dated 17 March, 2017

3.1.6. Furthermore, the Committee was informed that there was a delay in interviews for certain subject areas for example, whereas the TSC conducted interviews for Mathematics up to 2016. In contrast, the TSC is now in the process of interviewing applicants from 2013 for subject areas such as Chemistry, Physics and Biology. Additional, the Commission advised the Committee that it was in the process of interviewing applicants from the years 2013 and 2014 for the subject areas of Social Studies and Sociology.,

3.1.7. Notwithstanding, the TSC indicated that there was a dearth of applications received for the following subject areas:

- i) Drama/Dance/ Theatre Arts;
- ii) Visual Arts;

- iii) Music;
- iv) Physical Education;
- v) Technical Subjects; and
- vi) Electronic Data Processing Management/Typing/Office Procedures.⁶

3.1.8. The MoE also submitted that the undersubscribed Teacher II/III positions were in areas of Dance/Drama, Music and Spanish.⁷ The number of vacancies for the respective subject areas where there were no available candidates on the order of merit lists is at **Appendix V**.

3.1.9. Previously, the MoE advised that it visited the University of Trinidad and Tobago (UTT) and the University of the West Indies (UWI) to provide information on the subject areas for which there may be teaching vacancies and to guide potential applicants on the qualifications for teaching. However, the MoE could not confirm whether such visits occurred over the last year.

The Effect of the Concordat on the Filling of Vacancies in the Teaching Service

3.1.10. The Committee was informed that another reason for the delay on the appointment of teachers is the unwillingness of certain Board-run schools to accept qualified teachers who were not of the same religious persuasion. The officials advised that this was supported by the provisions in the Concordat of 1960.

3.1.11. In 2016, the MoE held stakeholder consultations where issues regarding the Concordat were discussed. Some recommendations regarding the Concordat and the relationships with the Boards of Management were included in a White Paper.

⁶ Source TSC dated April 26, 2017

⁷ Source MoE dated April 29, 2017

Middle Management Positions (Deanship and Heads of Department)

The Correlation between the Absence of Middle Management and Violence in Schools

3.1.12. One of the members of the Commission observed that there was a one-to-one correlation between the absence of the middle management (Deans and Heads of Departments) and violence in the respective schools.

3.1.13. Additionally, the TSC indicated that the MoE has identified some schools where the issues of student violence/indiscipline may have been attributed to the lack of sufficient administrative leadership. The TSC also indicated that in some schools, approximately 50% of the students were failing in all subject areas. In such circumstances, the TSC indicated that it acts swiftly to fill these offices.

Proposed Moratorium to Advance the Filling of Middle Management Positions

3.1.14. The MoE observed that since 2013 the positions of Dean and Head of Department were being filled by informal arrangements. To address this lack of transparency in the process, the MoE advertised the positions of Dean on February 15th, 2016 to ensure:

- that the most senior candidates were appointed;
- that the candidates were subjected to the requisite process; and
- that candidates were not solely selected based on performing the duties of a Dean or Head of Department.

3.1.15. To advance the filling of middle management positions, the TSC indicated that it approached the MoE and the Director of Personnel Administration (DPA) for a moratorium. However, due to the MoE's Circular Memo dated February 15, 2016 which advertised the vacancies for the middle management positions, the Committee was advised that the Ministry did not accept the moratorium. A

Memo was issued by the DPA three months subsequent to the positions being advertised, on May 31, 2016.

3.1.16. Some of the details outlined in the memo issued by the DPA dated May 31th 2016 were:

- The Commission will no longer require that the officer apply for transfer only when the office has been advertised and be subjected to an interview to determine their suitability for transfer;
- The officers can apply at any time to the Permanent Secretary, MoE for a transfer from his/her substantive school to any other school where a similar vacancy exists;
- The arrangement refers to all the administrative positions in primary and secondary schools;
- The officer must give specific reason(s) for the request.

Lack of Delegated Authority Vested in Principals to make ad hoc Appointments

3.1.17. The evidence taken from the MoE suggests that Principals are not authorised to make *ad hoc* acting appointments to senior teaching or middle management positions. This limitation was attributed to the procedures involved with remunerating such persons as well as the development of legitimate expectations. The MoE therefore advised that such appointments should be based on a seniority listing.

Status of the Filling Positions of Dean, Heads of Department and School Supervisors

3.1.18. The TSC informed the Committee that the screening and shortlisting processes were conducted and that interviews were to commence in April, 2017 to fill two hundred and sixty (260) Dean, positions (Secondary) in Trinidad. As it pertains to Tobago, it

was indicated that there are currently twelve (12) vacant offices of Dean (Secondary) that the Commission is seeking to fill by the third quarter of 2017.

3.1.19. The Committee was advised that the TSC is progressing with interviews for School Supervisor I and II positions. However, the terms and conditions of the delinked officers remain very contentious and need to be addressed immediately.

The Process Used to Fill Vacant Positions

3.1.20. The TSC indicated that promotions and appointments are generally fixed according to seniority rather than meritocracy because of outdated provisions of the regulations. Notwithstanding, the TSC has supported the concept of merit rather than seniority. The TSC elaborated that it is not only keen on filling the positions of Dean and Heads of Department as a matter of urgency but is also concerned about employing the right persons for the positions. In this regard, the TSC is reviewing the questions for interviews and the criteria for appointing Deans. Additionally, the TSC indicated that based on the notion that promotion does not make a person a leader, Principals also need to be trained to become leaders and risk-takers.

The Utilisation of Selection Boards to Expedite the Filling of Positions

3.1.21. The Committee was advised by the MoE that a proposed key strategy for the filling of positions at both the primary and secondary levels involves the establishment of a Selection Board comprising members of the TSC and the MoE as well as retirees with relevant experience to expedite interviews as prescribed by the DPA by memo dated December 13, 2016.

3.1.22. Notwithstanding, the TSC indicated that it had not considered the option of using retirees on a voluntary basis. However, consideration was given to paying retired

School Supervisors, Principals and others \$100.00 per hour in accordance to Cabinet's approval to assist with interviews in the Teaching Service. On average, 60 to 70 interviews are conducted on a monthly basis and 100 to 120 during peak times. See **Appendix VI** for details regarding the measures/ initiatives taken by the TSC and MoE to improve the efficiency of the teaching service.

Activities in Tobago

3.1.23. The Committee was advised that the Commission held two meetings on the island where it was recognised that no Curriculum Officers were appointed to Tobago. In this regard, a Curriculum Coordinator was recruited for Tobago and the TSC indicated that interviews for Curriculum Officers to service Tobago would be concluded in early April, 2017. The TSC also indicated that interviews for the following positions (Tobago) were conducted on March 15th, to 17th, 2017 as scheduled:

- Principal (Primary);
- Vice Principal (Primary); and
- Senior Teacher (Primary).

Disciplinary Matters

Absenteeism and Irregularity

3.1.24. The Committee was informed by the Commission of the alarming absenteeism and irregularity rates among teachers. For example, in the educational district of St. George East, twelve (12) officers were in excess of 2,000 minutes late per annum. The TSC submitted the statistics on the number of officers who were persistently irregular and unpunctual per educational district at **Appendix VII**.

3.1.25. The TSC also indicated that it wrote to the Permanent Secretary, MoE on numerous occasions regarding its dissatisfaction with the irregularity and

punctuality of some officers and was given the assurance that the MoE would be initiating disciplinary action against teachers who have been late for one thousand (1000) minutes for the years 2014 and 2015. By letter dated December 28, 2017, the Ministry of Education advised that only Principals of Secondary Schools are exempted from recording their time of arrival or departure in the Attendance Register.

3.1.26. Further, the TSC indicated that it informed the Permanent Secretary of the MoE to initiate disciplinary action against sixteen (16) named Teachers who have been tardy in excess of four thousand (4000) minutes in 2015. However, the Service Commission Department has not received any report of any action taken by the Ministry on any of the named Teachers. As a result, the TSC took a decision in March, 2017 to appoint investigating officers to investigate the allegations of misconduct against the teachers.

3.1.27. The MoE admitted that it is constrained in its ability to conduct investigations in a timely manner because of the volume of investigations and the limited staff available to conduct same. Notwithstanding, the Ministry indicated that it is in the process of identifying persons to conduct investigations. A total of 108 disciplinary matters at both the primary and secondary levels were expected to be referred to the TSC.

3.1.28. Interestingly, the Director of School Supervision & Management at the MoE claimed that it was not in receipt of official correspondence regarding the punctuality trigger of 180 minutes per annum late for teachers, as mandated by the TSC. However, the MoE indicated that it has been monitoring the “trigger” and has captured a large number of persons who have been excessively tardy. Persons who have reached level five, which is the final stage of the formal

disciplinary process, must be reported by the Principal to the Permanent Secretary for transmission to the TSC for action. The MoE stated that based on their records they have identified 300 officers who have been persistently unpunctual.

MoE's Procedure for Treating with Absenteeism and Irregularity

3.1.29. A Progressive Discipline Model is used to treat with cases of unpunctuality and absenteeism which involves counselling, a first warning, a first verbal warning, a first written warning, and second written warning. Subsequently, the case is referred to the Permanent Secretary, MoE for transmission to the TSC for action.

3.1.30. The MoE also indicated that Principals are required to submit regularity and punctuality reports on a monthly basis to the Ministry's Head Office through the respective District Offices. As at March 2017, regularity and punctuality reports for the year 2016 were being compiled by the MoE.

3.1.31. The Committee was also advised by the MoE that Principals are responsible for recording the number of late minutes, and communicating in writing to the respective teachers. However, the MoE underscored the importance of principals adhering to the proper procedures in dealing with matters of this nature. The MoE admitted that many Principals were not trained in the Progressive Discipline Model.

Power of the TSC to Appoint Investigative Officers

3.1.32. The TSC stated that it has the authority, once aware of a case of delinquency to take action on the respective officer. The Senior Legal Counsel of the Service Commission's Department confirmed that the Constitution vests the power of discipline of officers in the Commissions. Additionally, similar to the Public Service Commission, the TSC can appoint Investigative Officers.

3.1.33. The Committee was further advised that the Public Service Regulations as adopted by the MoE, delegates authority to the MoE to establish one-man tribunals to deal with disciplinary matters.

The Procedure for Treating with Teachers who have exhausted their Sick Leave and Casual Leave Allowances

3.1.34. The MoE indicated that in instances where teachers have exhausted their fourteen (14) days vocational leave, any leave that is not covered by any other type of leave would be without pay. In the case of extended sick leave, the Permanent Secretary exercises discretion in granting such leave based on the quantum of leave and the officer's regularity. Persons who take sick leave regularly or those on extended sick leave for a number of years are referred to the Ministry of Health. The Ministry of Health then establishes a tribunal to determine the officer's fitness for duty.

3.1.35. The MoE also indicated that the principal keeps a tally of the days as recorded. Information on teachers who have exhausted or exceeded their sick or casual leave eligibility is also forwarded to the MoE and the District Offices. The systems at the Ministry are designed to flag officers with perennial irregularity in attendance.

3.1.36. Additionally, the MoE indicated that, a system existed where the CEO and the DSS examined the data and visited schools to raise the awareness of officers who were irregular at the respective schools.

Upgrading of Teachers with UTT Degrees

3.1.37. The Commission reported that the Bachelors in Education programme had some pedagogical shortcomings which required remedying. The University then

embarked on a one-time “Bridging Programme” to address the gaps in B. Ed programme. After successful completion teachers became eligible to be upgraded to Teacher III.

3.1.38. The Committee was advised that most persons involved in the Bridging Programme were upgraded to the Teacher I position (Primary). Since the Bridging Programme, UTT has made the required adjustments to its B. Ed programme. Additionally, in 2013 the Chief Personnel Officer advised that persons who completed the Bachelor of Education degree (Secondary Specialisation) were eligible to be considered for the office of Teacher I (Secondary). The Commission further reported that UTT has not been able to meet the necessary qualification requirements for Secondary teachers in certain subject areas. The MoE indicated that it continues to collaborate with the UTT regarding upgrades necessary for the Secondary School positions. It was also indicated that, courses required for the upgrades can be sourced at any comparable tertiary level institution.

Findings

Based on the evidence set out in the previous section the Committee took particular note of the following:

Vacancies

1. As at 15th March, 2017, there were over 700 vacancies pending in the Teaching Service.
2. It was evident that the oversubscription and under subscription for certain subject areas may have arisen as a result of the public not being adequately informed of the subject areas for which there are existing teaching vacancies.
3. The TSC is wasting resources by continuing to assess and interview applicants for subject areas that are saturated and for which there are no vacancies;

4. There is need for the MoE to continue to provide appropriate guidance to aspiring teachers regarding the most feasible subject areas to become qualified.
5. Senior Teachers have been unofficially executing the responsibility of Deans and Heads of Departments due to the slow rate of the filling of teaching vacancies. The Committee believes that the MoE has to be proactive and address the appointment of middle management in schools on a timelier basis.
6. The terms and conditions of the delinked officers (School Supervisors I and II) needs to be re-evaluated in the short-term.
7. The TSC has attempted to apply principles of meritocracy in its assessment of teachers for promotion.
8. We agree that Principals require supplemental training in leadership and risk management.

Disciplinary Matters

9. The TSC is seeking to exercise its powers vested under the Constitution and appoint Investigating Officers to address habitually absent and irregular teachers.
10. Principals should be to be trained in the Progressive Discipline Model in order for it to function effectively and so where necessary, Principals can be held accountable for his/her failure to abide by the precincts of the model.
11. It appears that the Ministry is amenable to establishing one-man tribunal as a means of expediting the processing of disciplinary matters.

There is need to introduce a more modern and reliable system for recording the arrival and departure of teachers at schools.

Recommendations

- i. We recommend that both the MoE and Service Commissions Department publish on their websites a list of vacancies in the teaching service. This list should detail the following:
 - a) Title of the position
 - b) the subject area to be taught;
 - c) the corresponding qualifications required; and
 - d) the number of positions available for each subject area.

The database should ideally be updated on a weekly or monthly basis Social media platforms should be utilized where possible.

- ii. We recommend that the TSC take all necessary action to exercise its disciplinary powers vested in it by Section 125 of the constitution. The exercise of such power must be moderated by the necessary legal advice so as to avoid frequent judicial reviews and other forms of legal action on the part of aggrieved teachers.
- iii. We concur and recommend the establishment of a structured and reliable one-person tribunal system. Screening and selecting appropriate persons to serve on these tribunals should be done methodically and in collaboration with the Ministry of Education.
- iv. We recommend that the MoE consider implementing an electronic swipe system in all schools as a more efficient means of recording the arrival and departure times of school officials. Even more feasible will be the implementation of a time recorder with the technology to flag teachers who have crossed the 180 minutes late trigger immediately.

- v. **We recommend that the TSC collaborate with the MoE to identify cost effective strategies for providing Primary and Secondary School Principals training in the areas of Leadership and Risk Management.**
- vi. **We recommend that the MoE provide mandatory training for Principals to be able to effectively perform the procedures outlined in the Progressive Discipline Model. This would ensure that they can be held accountable for their action/inaction.**
- vii. **Arguably, the Concordat should not discriminate against qualified persons who are not being hired as a result of not being of a school's religious persuasion.**

Objective 2: To Determine Whether the Resources, Systems and Procedures of the Teaching Service Commission are Sufficient to allow it to Operate Efficiently

Lack of Human Resources

Shortage of Staff to Screen and Shortlist Applications

3.2.1. The Committee was informed that the TSC received over 2000 applications for vacant teaching positions which require to be screened and shortlisted. Some data was provided in Table 3 below:

Table 3

Information on the majority of applications received for various positions

Office	No. of Applications Received
Principal (Primary)	441
Vice Principal (Primary)	252
Senior Teacher (Primary)	312
Head of Department (Primary)	154
Dean (Secondary)	467
Total	1,626

3.2.2. The screening and shortlisting of interviewees and recommendations for promotions is the responsibility of the Teaching Service Secretariat's Special Unit. However, the Unit currently comprises only five (5) persons. The Commission indicated the need for an additional six (6) Human Resource and Clerical Support employees to complement the Special Unit.

Lack of Human Resource Advisors and Human Resource Officers

3.2.3. The Committee was informed that the TSC is supported by a Human Resource Department that is comprised of twenty-six (26) officers who are responsible for *inter alia* monitoring and supporting the Commission's oversight of approximately 17,000 teachers. Out of the 26 officers seven are Human Resource Advisors who are directly involved in the filling of vacancies within the TSC. The Public Management Consultancy Division (PMCD) advised that the standard to be used is one hundred (100) to one hundred and fifty (150) persons to an officer.

3.2.4. In the interim, the TSC is seeking to concentrate its efforts on:

- a. filling the vacant positions of Deans, Vice-Principals and Principals;
- b. advertising the vacant posts according to educational districts rather than a particular school because the process is time consuming; and
- c. Clearing the backlog of disciplinary matters.

Decentralization of the Teaching Service Commission

3.2.5. The TSC informed the Committee that it envisages a decentralized TSC with offices/sub-offices in the seven (7) educational districts in Trinidad and one (1) in Tobago to support the incremental delegation of authority to school administrators and the Ministry of Education. The ultimate goal of this concept will be for a principal to manage the respective school, in terms of overseeing promotions and transfers and for the TSC to have a monitoring role.

3.2.6. The TSC indicated that it also envisions, a modern teaching service that encompasses lifelong teacher education, progression and promotion linked to continuous lifelong higher education, career rebooting, a qualifications framework for progression, progression based on merit and competencies, performance reviews and performance goals, updated job descriptions, accountability and transparency in student performance, regularity and punctuality of teachers,

compliance with school strategic plans, a duty of care, district of goals and national priorities.

- 3.2.7. The TSC established that some of the tasks involved in attaining a modernised teaching service fall outside of its remit and will accordingly demand cross-sector commitment and joint leadership.

The Current Status of the Teaching Service Regulations

- 3.2.8. The TSC indicated that it has been operating under the guidelines of the Public Service Commission's Regulations. However, the Commission prepared its own Regulations but it has not been submitted for the Prime Minister's approval because while finalizing the regulations, the TSC took particular note of the need for significant amendments to the Education Act. The Commission suggested that the Act should be modified to address:
- a. the absence of provisions related to Early Childhood Care and Education;
 - b. the human resource capacity must be increased to initiate and develop its institutional capacity; and
 - c. the outdated existing legislative and regulatory framework which does not cater to the changing environment and future needs of education.
- 3.2.9. The TSC, therefore agreed to examine a framework for its regulations to be developed in tandem with the proposed Education Act to allow greater efficiency and management of the education system. It was stated that the regulations are being revised by the Commission with the assistance of the SCD's Legal Officers and were expected to be completed by the end of May, 2017.

Policy Proposals for New Draft Regulations

3.2.10. The TSC advised that the following are some of the policy changes to be included in the proposed regulations:

1. Discipline

- *Mediation* has been included as an option within the disciplinary process.
- *Case Management* in an effort to have matters handled efficiently and expedited.

2. Filling of Vacancies in Schools

- provisions to expedite the flow of information from the Ministry of Education to the Service Commissions Department pertaining to vacancies in the teaching service.
- Provisions for the wider circulation of notices of the vacancies.

3. Appointments on Promotion-

The criteria of selection for appointment on probation, appointment to fill a vacancy or an interim vacancy now include:

- That the applicant's "**psychological fitness for the duties of the office**" is to be taken into account;
- his devotion to duty "as evidenced by his ability to fulfil his professional and legal obligations, his acceptance of responsibility for his own actions and those entrusted to his care and his ability to utilize and find opportunities to improve himself for the good of the service"; and
- "his attendance and punctuality records".

4. First Appointments

- It is proposed that the medical examination for a first appointment include both a **physical and mental assessment**.⁸

⁸ TSC submission dated April 26, 2017 page 4

The Teaching Service Commission (Delegation of Powers) Order

3.2.11. The Committee was informed that the Commission has also prepared a Teaching Service Commission (Delegation of Powers) Order to accompany the new regulations which is intended to delegate more powers to the Permanent Secretary, MoE and to give delegated powers to the Chief Administrator and the Administrator, Division of Education, THA. However, with a new Education Act and new regulations the Commission will revisit the delegation orders.

The Need for Additional Powers for the TSC

3.2.12. The TSC has been calling for additional powers in order to enhance its effectiveness in relation to monitoring and managing teachers and to proposed adjustments to the teaching curriculum in the national interest. The TSC indicated that the Commission can be more effective if granted more powers such as:

- a. To manage the payroll of teachers under its purview;
- b. To facilitate teachers' career progression and professional development;
- c. To monitor and manage teachers' work performance and conduct;
- d. To review and establish the standards and requirements of education and teacher training;
- e. To determine teaching curriculum in specified areas of national development; and
- f. To determine the code of conduct of teachers.

Findings

Based on the evidence set out in the previous section the Committee took particular note of the following:

Lack of Human Resources

1. The screening of applications for teaching and administrative positions have been delayed due to the lack of sufficient human resources.

2. There is also need for additional Human Resource Advisors in the TSC to enable it to effectively perform its functions.

Stakeholder Relationship

3. Evidenced by the fact that the last formal meeting held between the TSC and the MoE was held in December 2016, perhaps there is a basis for more frequent meetings between both parties to discuss strategic policy matters and methods of implementation concerning the management of human resources in the teaching service. Additionally, the Committee noted a few instances where both entities failed to provide information requested of each other within the designated timeframe. In an environment with severe resource shortages, both entities must be mindful that collaborative efforts are now even more critical and as such, all barriers to cooperation must be urgently eliminated.

Decentralization and modernization of the TSC

4. The Committee noted the proposal of the TSC to delegate its powers by decentralizing its operations at the Educational District level.
5. Given the existence of serious information exchange issues between the MoE and The TSC, this Committee questions whether the TSC, is prepared in the short to medium term to also manage the further delegation of powers.

New Regulations and Legislation

6. The Committee acknowledges the efforts of the TSC to prepare revised draft regulations and concurs with the methodical process that is being applied. Arguably, the effective operationalization of both the Act and the Regulations are interdependent. Amending both the regulations and the Education Act simultaneously ought to allow for a more synchronized regulatory framework for the teaching service. However, this Committee is concerned that the responsibility for amending the two pieces of legislation lies within the purview of separate

authorities. This Committee has observed that the implementation of legislative modifications by the Service Commissions and other state bodies tend to be an extremely protracted process. We trust that this initiative is not similarly plagued.

Additional Powers for the TSC

7. The current members of the TSC have proposed additional powers for the TSC. However, there was an absence of accompanying empirical data to justify this proposal. In examining this proposal more closely the Committee suggests that the TSC consider the following:
- a. Has the Commission been effectively executing its existing mandate?
 - b. Does the Service Commissions Department possess the resources to assume the responsibility for payroll, curriculum reform and teacher training?
 - c. Will the existing arrangement where the members of the Commission serve on a part time basis be maintained?

This Committee proposes that the Commission ought to focus on improving the systems and procedures required for the efficient execution of its existing mandate rather than increasing its current workload without the necessary technical and administrative support.

Recommendations

- A. Given, the current financial constraints confronting the state, the resources for the recruitment of additional staff may not be readily available. In this regard, The TSC and the DPA must focus on boosting internal efficiencies with a view to optimizing the output of existing staff.**

- B. We recommend the establishment of a designated quarterly meeting date for meetings between the TSC and MoE. Robust and efficient inter-agency collaboration and communication is essential for the operational efficiency of both parties.**
- C. The Ministry and the Commission should approach the amendment of the legislation as a special project and should adopt the commensurate project management strategies to ensure that the process is efficiently managed.**
- D. We recommend that the TSC focus on effectively executing its existing mandate before seeking to assume additional responsibilities.**
- E. The delegation of powers and the decentralisation of operations must be undertaken subject to a comprehensive feasibility analysis. Such an analysis must involve the assessment of the monitoring capacity of the TSC on one hand and the implementation capacity of the Ministry of Education on the other.**

Objective 3: To Determine the Challenges Affecting the Operations of the Commission and the Possible Solutions for Alleviating these Challenges.

The Need for Training for Investigators / Training for Investigators

- 3.3.1. Investigating Officers are appointed by the Permanent Secretary, MoE in accordance with the provisions of Regulation 90 of the Public Service Commission Regulations as adopted by the TSC. A Schools Supervisor is appointed by the Permanent Secretary to investigate a matter where an allegation of misconduct occurs. However, it was indicated that some investigative reports were not properly prepared. In such cases, these matters were returned to the Ministry for a further investigation.
- 3.3.2. Additionally, the Commission has also noted that some investigative reports are submitted late to the SCD and that those delays sometimes are due to the workload of the School Supervisors who also perform their normal functions in addition to conducting investigations.
- 3.3.3. In the past, the Commission and officers of the SCD held workshops with Schools Supervisors on the disciplinary process in the Teaching Service. However, the TSC does not currently have the funds required to conduct the necessary training into the disciplinary process.

Human Resource and Operational Challenges

- 3.3.4. The evidence indicated that the Commission Secretariat has suffered from high attrition among experienced staff either through external appointments and promotions or retirements. This shortage of experienced staff has led the Secretariat to implement a strategic work and development programme which involves mentoring, coaching, on-the-job training, increased supervision, monitoring, auditing and staff engagement.

3.3.5. The following were cited as major issues affecting the operation of the Commission:

- the non-computerized systems;
- the small complement of staff relative to the large work load;
- the lack of resources - financial and human;
- the deficiencies of the existing Regulations;
- accommodation.

Matters that can be dealt with by the School District/and or Ministry

3.3.6. The TSC indicated that the following matters are being handled by Disciplinary Tribunals in accordance with the current regulations:

- Use of obscene language by officers to other members of staff;
- Heated disagreements amongst staff members;
- Heated disagreements between officers and senior and middle management;
- Wilful disobedience or disregard of a lawful order;
- Absence without leave;
- Lack of courtesy to a member of the public, a student or other officer of the Teaching service;
- Failure to perform required lawful duties in a proper manner.

3.3.7. However, the proposed Delegation Order delegates breaches such as these to the PS and the Administrator of the Division of Education of the THA. Additionally, mediation is proposed to be an option to deal with breaches of regulation.

3.3.8. The MoE indicated that discipline in the Teaching Service under Regulation 90 has not been delegated to the Ministry and as such, is still under the purview of the TSC.

High Turnover of Permanent Secretaries Assigned to the MoE

3.3.9. The Committee was informed of the relatively high turnover of Permanent Secretaries assigned to the MoE during the period 2014 to 2017. The appointments were as follows:

- 2014, three (3) PSs were appointed over a 12 months period;
- 2015, seven (7) PSs were appointed for the same period.

3.3.10. Details on the number of Permanent Secretaries assigned to the MoE for the years 2014 to 2017 is at **Appendix VIII**. The DPA explained that the high turnover of Permanent Secretaries was attributed to the following:

- the number of PS that have retired in the position;
- the realignment of Ministries;
- the large portfolio of Education; and
- the length of time it takes to find the person/s who are the 'best fit' for the Ministry.

Status of Filling of Offices of Deputy Permanent Secretary in the MoE

3.3.11. The MoE was assigned three (3) Deputy Permanent Secretaries due to the Ministry's large portfolio. Responsibilities are distributed per DPS as follows:

1. Human Resource matters from ECCE to Tertiary;
2. Infrastructure and General Administration; and
3. Information Technology and Strategic Management.

3.3.12. The Committee noted that the two DPSs in the MoE were on acting appointments and was advised by the DPA that the SCD is awaiting additional information from an external agency as well as vetting reports from the Ministry of National Security to complete the filling of the offices of Deputy Permanent Secretaries no later than April, 2017.

Findings

This Committee is cognizant that reports of previous Joint Select Committees have addressed these and other matters related to the operations of Service Commissions. As such, the following findings and recommendations though based on evidence received further to this inquiry, would reinforce those proffered in previous Parliamentary Reports.

The Need for Full-Time Commissioners on the TSC

1. The Committee noted that all members of the TSC currently serve on a part-time basis which is adversely affecting its operations. We agree that an appropriate model, whereby Commissioners operate on a full-time basis should be considered given the wide scope of responsibilities of the TSC.

Urgent Training for Investigators / Training Needed for Investigators

2. The Committee also agrees that given the potential legal ramifications for failure to adhere to proper protocols and procedures while executing an investigation training for all persons responsible for investigating disciplinary matters is an imperative.

The High turnover of PSs

3. The high turnover of PSs has impacted the performance of the MoE.
4. There is an urgent need to ensure stability at the Executive level of the Ministry through the placing of Permanent Secretaries who are not close to the retirement age.

Human Resource and Operational Challenges

5. Like the other Service Commissions, the TSC's operations are being adversely affected by institutional deficiencies including a shortage of funds, a shortage of staff and a lack of ICT devices and infrastructure.

Recommendations

- A. The relevant stakeholders should jointly examine the feasibility of having the members of all Service Commissions serve on a full-time basis, as the current work arrangement for Commissioners are impractical and inefficient. We are mindful that advancing this recommendation may require:
- an amendment to Section 126 of the Constitution;
 - additional financial allocations for the compensation of commissioners for full-time duties.
- B. We find it extremely difficult to conceptualize how a central human resource management body can operate efficiently without the effective infusion of ICT. Notwithstanding financial limitations, this matter should be prioritized. In addition, technical support and/or grant funding from international organisations should be fully explored as a means of improving the current state of ICT in the Service Commission's Department.

The Committee respectfully submits the foregoing for the consideration of the Parliament.

Mr. H.R. Ian Roach
Chairman

Ms. Ramona Ramdial, MP
Vice-Chairman

Mr. Darryl Smith, MP
Member

Mrs. Jennifer Baptiste-Primus
Member

Mr. Nigel De Freitas
Member

Ms. Khadijah Ameen
Member

January 19, 2018

APPENDICES

APPENDIX I

Minutes of the Proceedings

EXTRACT OF THE MINUTES OF THE 14TH MEETING OF THE JOINT SELECT COMMITTEE APPOINTED TO INQUIRE INTO AND REPORT ON LOCAL AUTHORITIES, SERVICE COMMISSIONS, STATUTORY AUTHORITIES (INCLUDING THE THA) HELD IN THE ARNOLD THOMASOS ROOM (EAST) AND THE J. HAMILTON MAURICE ROOM, MEZZANINE FLOOR, OFFICE OF THE PARLIAMENT, TOWER D, 1A WRIGHTSON ROAD, PORT OF SPAIN ON WEDNESDAY MARCH 22, 2017

PRESENT

Members

Mr. H. R. Ian Roach	Chairman
Ms. Ramona Ramdial, MP	Vice-Chairman
Mrs. Jennifer Baptiste-Primus	Member
Mr. Nigel De Freitas	Member
Ms. Khadijah Ameen	Member

Secretariat

Mr. Julien Ogilvie	Secretary
Ms. Khisha Peterkin	Assistant Secretary
Ms. Katharina Gokool	Graduate Research Assistant

ABSENT

Mr. Faris Al-Rawi, MP	Member (Excused)
Mr. Stuart Young, MP	Member (Excused)
Mr. Darryl Smith, MP	Member (Excused)

Also present were:

The Officials of the Teaching Service Commission and the Service Commissions Department

Dr. Fazal Ali	Chairman – TSC
Mrs. Elizabeth Crouch	Member – TSC
Ms. Anastasius Creed	Director Personnel Administration
Ms. Natasha Seecharan	Legal Adviser
Mr. Martel Waldron	Executive Director, HRM (TSC)

The Officials of the Ministry of Education

Mrs. Lenor Baptiste-Simmons	Permanent Secretary (Ag.)
Mrs. Sharon Ashman-John	Deputy Permanent Secretary (Ag.)
Mr. Ashram Deoraj	Director, School Supervision & Management Division
Mr. John Roopchan	Director, Curriculum Division
Ms. Kevlar Williams	Director, Human Resources
Ms. Margaret Lewis	Director, Human Resources
Ms. Dennis Bourne	Director, Human Resources

PUBLIC HEARING WITH OFFICIALS OF THE TEACHING SERVICE COMMISSION

- 6.1 The Chairman reconvened the meeting (*in public*) at 10:05 a.m.
- 6.2 Introductions were made.
- 6.3 The Chairman highlighted the objectives of the inquiry and acknowledged the submissions that the Committee received from the Teaching Service Commission and the line Ministry.

Opening Statements

- 7.1 The Chairman invited the Chairman of the Teaching Service Commission to make a brief opening statement. He informed the Committee of the following –
 - i. that based on the Global Competitiveness Index 2016/2017, Trinidad and Tobago placed 107th ;
 - ii. a number of policy documents are being developed by CARICOM and the Government of Trinidad and Tobago with the aim of formulating an Education Strategy going forward. As such the TSC has engaged Deloitte and Canadian Consultants in an institutional strengthening project;
 - iii. that the TSC is aiming to decentralize the operations of the Commission in the seven educational districts and in Tobago; and
 - iv. that the Commission aims to modernize the teaching service through cross-sector commitment and joint leadership with the Ministry of Education;
- 7.2 The Chairman invited the Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Education to make a brief opening statement. She informed the Committee of the following:
 - i. that the TSC and the MoE have a collaborative working relationship; and

- ii. The Commission and the officials of the Ministry have regular meetings to address policy and administrative matters with a view to improving the efficiency of the teaching service.
- 7.3 The following issues arose from the discussions held with the officials of the TSC and the Ministry of Education:
- i. **The Status of the Teaching Service Regulations**
- The Chairman requested an update on the TSC Regulations. The Chairman-TSC informed the Committee that the Regulations were completed, however, whilst the Regulations were being finalized the Commission recognized that the Regulations would be based on the outdated Education Act of 1966. As such, the Regulations were not forwarded to the Prime Minister for approval. The Commission proposed to seek Cabinet's approval to review the framework of the Education Act and subsequently make the necessary legislative amendments.
- ii. **The Number of Accounting Officers who have been Assigned to the Ministry**
- a. The Chairman enquired about the "Acting" status of the Permanent Secretary and the Deputy Permanent Secretary who were present. The DPA advised that with regard to the PS, the Public Service Commission is in the process of filling the vacancies. With regard to the DPS, assessments are expected to be completed shortly and it is anticipated that appointments will be made.
- b. The Chairman-TSC raised the issue of the number of PSs and DPSs that were assigned to the MoE from 2014 to 2016. In 2014, three PSs were appointed over a 12 months period; in 2015, seven PSs were appointed for the same period. The DPA further advised that the reasons for the number of changes was due to:
- Permanent Secretaries retiring and others leaving the public service;
 - the realignment of Ministries and portfolios;
 - the length of time it takes to find the person who is the 'best fit' for the Ministry; and
 - The change in Government
- c. The Committee was informed that due to the Ministry's large portfolio, there are two Permanent Secretaries and three Deputy Permanent Secretaries, each one has different responsibilities, inclusive of Human Resources, infrastructure and general administration and IT and Strategic Management.
- iii. **The Reasons for the Delay in the Appointment of Teachers, HODs, VPs Principals and School Supervisors**

Teachers (Secondary Schools)

- a. The Chairman of the TSC informed the Committee that currently there is a merit list comprising 2, 810 teachers who were successfully assessed and interviewed but are awaiting placement in Secondary Schools, this list is valid for a period of three years. The reasons for the delay in the appointment of Teachers are:
 - A surplus of applicants in certain subject areas of Social Studies, Sociology and the natural sciences, although the assessments in these subject areas were completed in 2013 and 2014 respectively, these persons are still waiting to be interviewed for over three to four years.
 - The placement of Teachers in Board Schools which operate under the Concordat, some of these schools do not accept teachers who are not of the same faith.
 - The shortage of persons with the necessary qualifications in Physical Education, Theatre Arts and Music, as such these subject areas are difficult to fill.

Deans and Heads of Departments

- a. The Commission recognized that there was a correlation between the schools that do not have a middle management structure, the level of violence in schools and the academic performance of schools. In order to address these issues the Commission subsequently proposed to the Ministry that a Moratorium be given to the qualified persons with the requisite years of service who have been acting in these positions for a period of time. The Commission reported that the Ministry did not accept the Moratorium and due to the constant pressure from the Commission the positions were advertised in 2016. The Committee was advised that perspective persons were screened and short listed, interviews will be conducted shortly.
- b. The Director of HR advised that the Ministry did not accept the Moratorium because the advertisement of the vacancies was circulated via Memo dated February 16, 2016. The DPA subsequently issued a Memo dated May 31, 2016, three months after the position was advertised. The Ministry has observed an informal arrangement in school whereby teachers fulfil the responsibilities of Deans/HoD. However, these persons acting are not entitled to compensation for their additional efforts and do not receive the requisite salary adjustment.
- c. The Ministry suggested that such appointments should be based on the seniority list. The Chairman of the TSC indicated that due to the outdated Regulations

appointments are still based on seniority rather than qualifications and the person's ability to relate with the students.

School Supervisor

- a. The Committee was informed that the Commission will be conducting interviews for the positions of School Supervisor I and II but the Terms and Conditions of these officers have not been finalized.

iv. The High Level of Absenteeism and the Punctuality of Teachers

- a. The Chairman-TSC brought to the Committee's attention the issues of absenteeism and punctuality of school officers. He indicated that in the educational district of St. George East, 12 officers were in excess of 2, 000 minutes late. The Ministry of Education stated that based on their records they have identified 300 officers who have been persistently unpunctual.
- b. The following statistics from the Commission are in regard to the number of officers who were persistently irregular and punctuality of officers per educational district:
 - in the North-Eastern District - 49 officers;
 - in the South-Eastern District - 17 officers; and
 - in St. George East - 34 officers.
- c. He also highlighted the failure of the Ministry to refer disciplinary matters with respect to delinquent officers to the Commission. The TSC sought legal advice and was advised that under the regulations and the Constitution, the Commission has the authority to appoint an Investigating Officer to review the matters.
- d. The Chairman sought clarification from the Ministry on the reasons for the delay in referring matters related to irregularity and unpunctual officers to the Commission. The PS informed the Committee that the proper practice is for the Principals to record the number of minutes teachers were late and issue a warning letter to the officer informing them of same. If more than three letters are issued, a report is forwarded to the Ministry for disciplinary action. The Ministry has to confirm the information but many times records are not properly maintained because many of the Principals have not been trained to follow the Progressive Discipline Model.

TTUTA and the Issue of Absenteeism and Punctuality

- e. The Chairman enquired whether TTUTA was encouraged by the Ministry to engage its members on the issues of irregularity and punctuality at schools. The Director of School Supervision and Management Division advised that due to the regular meetings between the Ministry and the Union, he is aware that there have been on-going conversations between TTUTA and the Union to address these prevailing issues.

v. The Legal Department of the Ministry of Education

The Chairman expressed concern that the MOE did not include its Legal Counsel to accompany the team at the hearing. The PS admitted that there were only two Legal Officers II attached to the Ministry at this time and she believed that questions on human resource and the industrial relations could be answered by the HR Director. The PS informed the Committee that the staff shortage in the Legal Unit was due to merging of the different Ministries, some officers returned to their substantive posts and others were on contract which resulted in a loss of institutional memory at the Ministry. The PS informed the Committee that the positions of Director, Legal and Legal Officers were advertised and persons were short listed, interviews are expected to be conducted by mid April 2017.

vi. The One-Man Tribunals

In order to address the number of pending disciplinary matters in relation to absenteeism and punctuality, the Ministry, having adopted the Public Service Regulations has proposed that authority be delegated to the Commission to facilitate one-man tribunals. The Committee agreed that this method should be instituted as it would address the backlog and reduce the need for legal representation at each disciplinary hearing.

vii. Issues that have been Prioritised by the Teaching Service Commission

The Chairman expressed his dissatisfaction with the apparent dysfunction of the operation of the TSC and the public service and as a result he requested that the DPA identify key areas of prioritization by the Commission. The DPA informed the Committee that the key areas to be addressed were indiscipline in schools and filling all vacancies in the Ministry especially the senior positions.

viii. The Impact of Staffing Issues at the TSC Secretariat

The DPA highlighted the issues of staffing at the TSC's Secretariat, she stated that currently there are seven Human Resource Advisors charged with the responsibility to monitor and support 17, 000 teachers. Although the Public Management

Consultancy Division (PMCD) advises that the standard to be used is 100 to 150 persons to an officer. The staffing issues at the Commission led to the development of an internal policy to concentrate the Commission's limited resources in the following areas:

- a. filling the vacant positions of Deans, Vice-Principals and Principals;
- b. to advertise the vacant posts according to educational districts rather than a particular school because the process is time consuming;
- c. Clearing the backlog of disciplinary matters.

ix. The Bridging Programme for graduates of UTT's B. Ed programme

- a. The Chairman-TSC informed the Committee that the Bridging Programme was developed in conjunction with the UTT, the Ministry of Education (though its Curriculum Division) to address the gaps in the B. Ed degrees programmes offered by the UTT.
- b. Members also enquired into the reasons for the delay in the upgrading of Teachers who have completed the Bridging Programme, as some persons have been waiting for seven years. The Director Curriculum Division advised that the Primary School teachers were upgraded. However, UTT has not been able to meet the necessary requirements for Secondary teachers in certain subject areas. The teachers were advised that the courses can be completed at other tertiary level institutions.

x. The Strategic Policy of the Ministry of Education and the Teaching Service Commission

- a. The PS informed the Committee that the last meeting of the Executives of the Ministry and the Commission was held in December 2016. The main issues discussed were:
 - the policy guidelines in relation to the transfer of teachers; and
 - expediting the filling of administrative vacancies.
- b. The recommendations emanating from this meeting were:
 - the promotion for all senior qualified teachers; and
 - the use of the selection board and various panels to clear the backlogs of interviews.

xi. The Government's Policy on Schools Providing Accommodation for the Differently-Abled

The PS informed the Committee that all newly constructed schools were to be outfitted for the differently-abled, inclusive of bathrooms, access ramps, elevators (only in primary schools in the Port of Spain area) and specialist rooms in all ECCE Centres and Primary schools. An annual allocation is assigned to retrofit certain schools. The PS also advised that the Ministry works in conjunction with the Ministry of Planning and Development to standardise the facilities for the disabled student population.

xii. Annual Reports of the Teaching Service Commission

The Committee questioned the Commission on its failure to submit its Annual Reports for the years 2013, 2014 and 2015. The DPA indicted that The Annual Report for 2013 will be submitted by April 2017; the Reports for 2014 and 2015 no later than June 2017; and the Report for 2016 by August 2017.

7.3 The Chairman then invited the Chairman of the TSC and the Permanent Secretary of the Ministry of Education to make closing comments.

Request for Additional Information

8.1 The Teaching Service Commission and the Ministry of Education were requested to provide certain information in writing that they were unable to provide during the hearing.

ADJOURNMENT

9.1 The Chairman thanked all present for attending.

9.2 The meeting was adjourned at 12:34 p.m.

I certify that the Minutes are true and correct.

Chairman

Secretary

April 21, 2017

APPENDIX II

Verbatim Notes

EXTRACT OF THE VERBATIM NOTES OF THE FOURTEENTH MEETING OF THE JOINT SELECT COMMITTEE APPOINTED TO INQUIRE INTO AND REPORT ON LOCAL AUTHORITIES, SERVICE COMMISSIONS, STATUTORY AUTHORITIES (INCLUDING THE THA), HELD IN THE ARNOLD THOMASOS ROOM (EAST), LEVEL 6 (IN CAMERA) AND (IN PUBLIC) IN THE J HAMILTON MAURICE ROOM, MEZZANINE FLOOR, TOWER D, INTERNATIONAL WATERFRONT CENTRE, #1A WRIGHTSON ROAD, PORT OF SPAIN, ON WEDNESDAY, MARCH 22, 2017 AT 9.40 A.M.

PRESENT

Mr. H. R. Ian Roach	Chairman
Miss Ramona Ramdial	Vice-Chairman
Miss Khadijah Ameen	Member
Mrs. Jennifer Baptiste-Primus	Member
Mr. Nigel De Freitas	Member
Mr. Julien Ogilvie	Secretary
Miss Khisha Peterkin	Assistant Secretary
Miss Katharina Gokool	Parliamentary Intern

ABSENT

Mr. Faris Al-Rawi	Member [<i>Excused</i>]
Mr. Stuart Young	Member [<i>Excused</i>]
Mr. Darryl Smith	Member [<i>Excused</i>]

TEACHING SERVICE COMMISSION

Dr. Fazal I. Ali	Chairman
Mrs. Elizabeth Crouch	Commissioner
Mr. Martel Waldron	Executive Director, HRM
Ms. Natasha Seecharan	Legal Adviser

MINISTRY OF EDUCATION

Mrs. Lenor Baptiste-Simmons	Permanent Secretary
Mrs. Sharon Ashman-John	Deputy Permanent Secretary
Mr. Ashram Deoraj	Director, School Supervision & Management Division
Mr. John Roopchan	Director, Curriculum Division
Ms. Kevan Williams	Director, HR

Ms. Margaret Lewis

Director, HR

Ms. Donnis Bourne

Director, HR

DIRECTOR OF PERSONNEL ADMINISTRATION

Ms. Anastasius V. Creed

Director of Personnel Administration

Mr. Chairman: Once again, good morning, ladies and gentlemen. Welcome to the Fourteenth Meeting of the Joint Select Committee on Local Authorities, Service Commissions and Statutory Authorities (Including the THA). This morning's Committee hearing is to deal with the Teaching Service Commission and the Ministry of Education. This hearing is being convened for the enquiry into the efficiency and the effectiveness of the Teaching Service Commission. My name is H.R. Ian Roach, I am the Chairman and I am assisted by Vice Chair Ramona Ramdial, and the other members which I will invite to introduce themselves.

[Introductions made]

Mr. Chairman: Thank you very much. I will now invite members of the Teaching Service Commission to introduce themselves, starting with the Chairperson.

[Introductions made]

Mr. Chairman: The other members include?

[Introductions made]

Mr. Chairman: What about the DPA?

[Introductions made]

Ms. Creed: Chair, if I may, I also have two other representatives, Allison Hughes the Director of Corporate Services and Marcia Pile-O'Brady, Deputy DPA with the responsibility for the Teaching Service Commission.

[Introductions made]

Mr. Chairman: Thank you very much. Could we ask the Ministry of Education to identify themselves to the Committee?

[Introductions made]

Mr. Chairman: Thank you very much. Just to remind you all the objective of this enquiry, one, is to evaluate the performance of the Commission in executing its mandate; two, to determine whether the resources, systems and procedures of the Teaching Service Commission are sufficient to allow it to operate efficiently; and three, to determine the challenges affecting the operations of the Commission and possible solutions for alleviating these challenges. The last occasion the Commission appeared before this Joint Select Committee to account for its execution of its mandate was February 27, 2015. Well, it was at the Tenth Parliament, certainly not the Eleventh.

I will now invite Dr. Ali, Chairman of the Teaching Service Commission, to give some opening remarks, brief.

Dr. Ali: Thank you, Chairman. The Teaching Service Commission and the Ministry of Education, we are pleased to appear before you here today, on the 22nd day of March in 2017 to appear before you as a witness. The Teaching Service Commission is presenting here today against knowledge of a Global Competitiveness Index 2016/2017 report in which the institutional pillars, the United Kingdom is ranked as 14, Barbados ranked as 44 and Trinidad and Tobago ranked 107. We are also using as a backdrop, Sen. Roach and hon. Members, that Caricom is at present writing an

HR and development strategy and education strategy 2030, and we are also presenting against a background that the Government of Trinidad and Tobago has developed a 2030 vision document for Trinidad and Tobago which lists service excellency as a priority by 2020.

And it is against these documents and the fact that we have just come out of an institutional strengthening project with Deloitte and consultants from Canada that we are here before you, and very briefly, Sen. Roach and hon. Members, what we would like to indicate to you, at the outset, is that we would like to start by stating, we envisage a future state for the Teaching Service Commission in which we decentralize the Teaching Service Commission in the seven educational districts and in Tobago, a total of eight locations to support stage and incremental delegation of authority to the seven educational districts and the Division for Education in Tobago.

Secondly, Sen. Roach, we envisage a modernization of the teaching service to include lifelong teacher education, progression and promotion linked to continuous lifelong higher education, career rebooting, a qualifications framework for progression, progression based on merit and competencies, performance reviews and performance goals, updated job descriptions, accountability and transparency in student performance, regularity and punctuality of teachers, compliance with school strategic plans, a duty of care, district goals and national priorities. And we understand that some of these tasks fall outside the mandate of the TSC and will demand cross-sector commitment and joint leadership resolve. Thank you for the opportunity to make these opening statements, Sen. Roach.

Mr. Chairman: Thank you very much, Dr. Ali. I will now call on the Permanent Secretary for the Ministry of Education, Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons, to make brief opening comments.

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: The Teaching Service Commission and the Ministry of Education enjoy a collaborative working relationship. Meetings are held on a fortnightly and a monthly or at needs basis to clarify and provide support in the management of administrative matters. Also at the strategic level, meetings are held to ensure that there are timely interventions relevant to both policy and again administrative matters to improve the efficiency of the teaching service. A key strategy that has been proposed is the establishment of a selection board comprising members of both the Teaching Service Commission and the Ministry's officials, as well as retirees with relevant experience to expedite the conduct of interviews and thus filling of positions, again, at the administrative level, so both primary and secondary level.

We, again, look forward to continue working after listening to Mr. Ali and listening to what he has said in terms of the delegation of authority at the eight district levels and the new strategies that are being proposed and outlined, we will continue to work with TSC to ensure that these—again, that they are contextual. That it is not one size fits all across the board but that we look at what they are and we actually assess and we make—well, at least we adopt the strategies that will actually bear fruit. Thank you.

Mr. Chairman: Thank you very much, Mrs. Simmons. The first question I would like to ask Dr. Ali, on the last occasion, you all appeared before the Tenth Parliament, the Joint Select Committee, there was mention or there was—I would want to use the word undertaking—that the Public Service Regulations were being revised and it was supposed to be available, that is almost a year ago. What is the position with that today?

Dr. Ali: Hon. Members, I am happy to report to you that we have brought a complete regulation. It is finished. However, I would like to point out that while the commission was busy writing and finalizing these regulations, that

we were actively involved with the Ministry of Public Admin in the institutional strengthening project. We found ourselves trying to create regulations based on a 1966 Education Act, an Act which does not even cover Early Childhood Care and Education; an Act that has many gaps. And in working with the Ministry of Public Administration and the consultants, we felt, although we completed the regulations, we would not send these regulations to the hon. Prime Minister. Instead, we have decided that we want to ask the Prime Minister and his Cabinet to look at a framework for a new Education Act and for the regulations to be developed in parallel with the new Act that will allow greater efficiency and management of the education system.

Mrs. Baptiste-Primus: Thank you kindly, Mr. Chairman and good morning once again. You said that the 1966 Education Act is outdated with too many gaps. Is that the only justification within your proposal for the formulation of a new Education Act?

Dr. Ali: No, hon. Minister. What you would find, hon. Minister, is that as we move the Government service from a personnel model of 1962, 1958, towards a more HR functionality, and we give to various Ministries greater HR capability, what you would find is that the central agencies of the state: the office of the CPO, the office of the DPA and the Commissions, they have remained the same size, but the demand on the services has increased in 2017 so it creates a bottleneck. So what you will find, for example, Minister, is that a director of HR, let us say in the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, would still be sending to the Public Service Commission, all the matters for promotions, transfers, secondments and so on. The delegation of that authority to these persons is something that we would like to see happen.

In terms of education, we would like to write an Education Act—to have an Education Act. If we attempted to send the regulations now, the regulations must work with the Act and therefore the regulations will be very backward looking to 1966. We want to create something for the Government that could take us from 2017 and into the future.

Mrs. Baptiste-Primus: Mr. Chairman, what I was really interested in is you sharing the critical bases upon which this new Education Act will evolve. The rationale, you know, why not amend the 1966? Why a completely new Act? Within that context.

Dr. Ali: It is a very interesting question you asked and I am glad. In Trinidad and Tobago, what we are experiencing, when there is a general election and we have new governments, Ministries are collapsed into one sometimes, they are broken into more than one Ministry and therefore, the public service spends a lot of time creating the establishment. We have now a mega Ministry, Ministry of Education, that is overseeing everything from ECCE to Phd. Right. We are not sure what this new Education Act might look like. All we could do is propose a framework to work with the Chief Parliamentary Counsel in creating or even amending, as you suggest, the existing Education Act to be more encompassing and to deal with a future state of education.

We would like to see, for example, the seven educational districts, including the THA in Tobago, manage education for themselves and the commission has simply a monitoring role. The ultimate goal would be for a principal to run their school, to oversee promotions and transfers and other things like that. But this is a—yes, Sen. Roach.

10.25 a.m.

Mr. Chairman: Let me just interject here. You did say that the regulations were completed, right?

Dr. Ali: Yes, it is finished.

Mr. Chairman: Right. And it is not being made available?

Dr. Ali: Well, it could be made available.

Mr. Chairman: It has not been sent to the Prime Minister, you said?

Dr. Ali: Not at yet, no.

Mrs. Baptiste-Primus: Chairman of this Commission, if you are saying that a new Education Act, you are hoping that a new Education Act would emerge, have you all engaged the various stakeholders with regard to that issue? Or is it a proposal from the Commission itself? Because it would seem to me that if the Commission has a point of view like that, the Commission has the authority to engage the stakeholders and place the proposal and then move from there.

But I am not getting a feel that there is solidity in what you are saying about the new Education Act. I am not getting that feel. Where exactly are we? Is it that there is a firm proposal for a new Education Act or is the Commission contemplating the amendment of the present Act? And if you are contemplating a new Education Act, have you engaged the stakeholders in consultation? Do you propose to engage the stakeholders in consultation? Because I cannot see the Commission arriving at such a position with all parties concerned having a say in the direction.

Dr. Ali: May I answer? Thank you. Thank you, Minister. The consultancy on institutional strengthening end on the 9th of March this year and the recommendations of the consultants went to Cabinet and we were informed by DPA and the consultants that Cabinet had accepted the recommendations of the report.

When we look at what the future state of the government service is supposed to look like, then we have to be mindful that if we are moving towards that future state of all government services and the provision of services, then submitting the regulations as is would really be backward. What has happened, hon. Minister, is that public service sent their regulations and it was returned this year, in 2017. I would allow DPA to comment on that.

Mr. Chairman: But, sorry, before you go, the Public Service Regulations and the Teaching Service Commission Regulations, are they one and the same thing now? I know the Teaching Service Commission Regulations were adopted from the Public Service Teaching Commission, is that being rectified into two separate things, now?

Dr. Ali: Yes, hon. Minister.

Mr. Chairman: Okay. So let us address—so we were speaking, I do not know if I set you off wrong by speaking about the Public Service Regulations. We are speaking about the Teaching Service Commission Regulations. Is that what is prepared and ready at this point in time?

Dr. Ali: Yes, it is ready, Minister.

Mr. Chairman: No, no, no. I am just Chairman. I am not Minister at all, please. I do not want that portfolio.

We would return to that shortly, right? I just want to ask the DPA, because what is quite striking this morning for me, when you all were introducing yourselves from the Ministry, two Permanent Secretaries in the Ministry of Education because it is a large portfolio being the Ministry of Education. They both seem to be acting. Is that correct?

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Yes, Sir.

Mr. Chairman: Sorry.

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Yes, Sir, we are acting.

Mr. Chairman: Now, who is responsible for that? Is it the DPA? Is that your area of—

Ms. Creed: The Public Service Commission.

Mr. Chairman: The Public Service Commission.

Ms. Creed: That is right. I can respond on behalf of the Public Service Commission, especially with regard to the Deputy Permanent Secretary. The Public Service Commission is in the process of completing a recent assessment for the Office of Deputy Permanent Secretary, which the outcome would be filling of offices as Deputy Permanent Secretary. So, it will entail persons who were acting, if they have been successful, being appointed, or new persons being appointed based on the assessment. That is with regard to the Deputy Permanent Secretary.

With regard to the Permanent Secretary, the Commission has put its mind to the filling of offices of Permanent Secretary and they are in the process of having that discussion to send that matter forward.

Mrs. Baptiste-Primus: Thank you, Chairman. Madam DPA, the assessment of the Deputy Permanent Secretaries, you said, has been completed.

Ms. Creed: No, I said it is in the process of being completed.

Mrs. Baptiste-Primus: In the process. How soon would that process be completed?

Ms. Creed: The Commission, we are awaiting an external agency, which has to provide the Commission with some additional information, the vetting, and we have been informed by national security we should be getting the vetting report by the end of March, after which the Commission would be able to finalize that whole process and fill the offices there, hoping to fill those offices no later than in April.

Mrs. Baptiste-Primus: Excellent, so that those Deputy Permanent Secretaries who, unfortunately may not be successful in the assessment, will revert to their substantive positions?

Ms. Creed: Well, it depends on how many persons are successful and how many offices are to be filled. So, the outcome of it, you know, I cannot speak to that right now because at the end of the day, if you have 40 vacant offices and only, let us say 20 persons were successful—I am just using random figures—you could only fill 20 offices. So, there may be instances where, if the Commission does not have a portfolio of everyone filling, you may have persons who will continue to act.

Mrs. Baptiste-Primus: And how many vacant positions of Deputy Permanent Secretaries are there?

Ms. Creed: I cannot answer that off the bat right now. I did not put my mind to that for this session.

Mr. Chairman: Miss Ramdial would like to ask a question.

Miss Ramdial: Good morning all. I want to delve a little bit into the operations of the TSC so I will ask Dr. Fazal Ali: What are the reasons for years of delay for interviews, appointments, upgrades for teachers, heads of departments, vice-principals, principals and school supervisors?

Dr. Ali: Okay, I will answer, Minister, but Sen. Roach just for the record, these are the completed regulations.

Mr. Chairman: For the purposes of these proceedings you could refer to me Member and Chairman. All right?

Dr. Ali: I would feel rather odd if I disrespect you like that.

Mr. Chairman: No, no, no, no. It is not disrespect. It is just protocol. So you will be in good stead.

Dr. Ali: Okay. So the regulations are here, and on the matter of Permanent Secretaries, and as we are looking at service, hon. Minister Baptiste, you know we call ourselves the Teaching Service Commission, so it is a service and

we are serving the children. This lofty Commission is serving children. I am coming to you.

Miss Ramdial: Sure, sure.

Dr. Ali: We are serving children. That is our final client. In 2014, we had three Permanent Secretaries over the 12 months; in 2015, we had seven Permanent Secretaries come into the Ministry of Education in 12 months.

Mr. Chairman: How many?

Dr. Ali: Seven. In 2016, we had six Permanent Secretaries come into the Ministry of Education, coming and going. I would go back and see the astonishment on your face. In 2014, we had Miss Daniel, Miss Simone Thorne and Natasha Barrow. In 2015, we had Miss Daniel, Angela Siew, Sandra Jones, Amradeen Ali, Jacqueline Johnson, Gillian Mc Intyre and Miss Natasha Barrow. In 2016, we had Mr. Amradeen Ali, Gillian Mc Intyre, Natasha Barrow, Jacqueline Johnson, Angela Sinaswee-Gervais, Lenore Baptiste-Simmons. In 2017, thank God, we have two who have been staying with us, Miss Lenor Baptiste-Simmons and Miss Angela Sinaswee-Gervais. This has really, honestly, members, disrupted the Commission in delivering. Because if you divide this by 12 months, the number of persons by 12 months, it is very difficult for the two Ministers to function with this type of movement.

Mr. Chairman: Definitely so. What accounts for that?

Dr. Ali: I will have to leave that to the DPA.

Mr. Chairman: Yeah. We would really like to hear from her.

Ms. Creed: At this point in time?

Mr. Chairman: Yeah, yeah.

Ms. Creed: The Public Service Commission, for instance, we have had Permanent Secretaries who have retired. We have had persons who have left the public service. We have had, with the realignment of Ministries and the portfolios, they have had the movement of Permanent Secretaries from one Ministry to other Ministries after discussions with the PS to the Prime Minister and the Commission. They have had discussions with regard to where maybe there may be better fits, how we could get Ministries and Departments to be able to operate better because the Commission, in fulfilling its mandate, decided to have discussions with stakeholders to ensure that we can have better fit in some instances, aside from the fact that the Constitution requires that any proposals from the Commission at that level has to go to the Prime Minister.

So, as a result of that we had some changes in the portfolios. The Commission is, at this point in time, hoping that there will be stability in Ministries and Departments and that is why we are looking at the filling of the offices so that there can be some stability in the Ministries and Departments at that level.

Dr. Ali: I return to the question of Senator Ramdial. Now, the 1962/1958 practice of persons simply walking off the pavement and submitting an application to the Ministry of Education has to stop. Because when you look at where we are, members, mathematics interviews, we are quite up to date. We are up to 2016. In the natural sciences, chemistry, physics and biology, we are doing 2014 and 2013; social studies, sociology, we are doing people who applied in 2013.

What is happening is people apply, their credentials are assessed, the PS will then write to the person and tell them they have been assessed as Teacher III, chemistry for secondary and then they are advised that the Commission will call them for an interview. The Commission will then call them for an interview and they will pass this interview.

Let us say this happened in the year 2000. They got this letter from the Commission that they have passed the interview to be a Teacher III for chemistry, but the Ministry of Education has no vacancy for any chemistry teacher in no school, and in some cases we might have someone with an excellent first-class chemistry degree but the board schools are unwilling to accept someone who is not of their faith.

Mr. Chairman: They are not willing to?

Dr. Ali: They will not be willing to accept someone who might not be of their persuasion.

Mr. Chairman: That is because of the Concordat?

Dr. Ali: Yes. So what has happened is, right now, hon. Members, the Teaching Service Commission, under the DPA, we have interviewed roughly 3,000. The exact figure is 2,810. That is the exact figure. Two thousand, eight hundred and ten people are on the order of merit list. These people are waiting to be placed in schools, but there are no vacancies.

We also have to understand, hon. Members, where I am calling for a new Education Act and a new method of recruitment. Hon. Minister, I am so glad that you are here because I really want to engage you on some thinking.

Mr. Chairman: But Dr. Ali, if I may. You have a merit list before you?

Dr. Ali: Yes. We have on the merit list 2,810 persons.

Mr. Chairman: Now, from my recollection a merit list is valid for two years or a year. Is that not so? So, if within that period of time those persons are not allocated or posted somewhere, that comes to naught.

Dr. Ali: That is correct, Sir. The list lasts three years, Sen. Roach.

Mr. Chairman: It lasts for three years now?

Dr. Ali: It is valid for three years.

Mr. Chairman: And those interviews were completed when?

Dr. Ali: I can tell at different points in time, for example, I can give you a good idea. It also depends on throughput from the universities operating on the island. So, for example, hon. Members, you would find few people might do a degree in PE or in music. So there is always a shortage of persons leaving tertiary institutions to hold teaching positions in the system. So we are very up-to-date on this. But someone with a degree in sociology, they are so numerous. In sociology, we have only reached the people who applied in 2013 and we are now in 2017, because there is an oversupply from the tertiary institutions and the Ministry of Education cannot absorb it.

Miss Ramdial: All right, Dr. Ali, that is with respect to interviews for new teachers but what about upgrades, promotions, principals and vice-principals who have been acting for years, have applied for their promotions and upgrades? What are the problems associated with those operational issues?

Dr. Ali: Okay. Principals, deans and heads of departments, and so on, the last time in the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago that the position for deanship was—that would not be totally correct. We have two advertisements. One came out in 2013, for deans and heads of departments. That was before this Commission was sitting in the TSC. Right? One member of this Commission, the distinguished Mrs. Elizabeth Crouch, took home for days upon days and nights, and did a hand analysis of the schools without deans and heads of departments and colour-coded it. What we found, hon. Members, was that there was a one-to-one correlation between the absence of the middle management in the schools—the deans and heads of departments—and the violence in the schools. All the schools where there was

no middle management, you have violence.

We, therefore, went to the Ministry, and on bended knees we asked them—and the DPA is here—we begged for a moratorium that all the persons who are qualified and acting in those positions for a period of time and they have the years of service and the qualification, let us interview them immediately and appoint them to stabilize those schools and let us interview for those that are lacking. The moratorium was not accepted and the Ministry opted instead in 2016, under pressure, constant pressure from us to stabilize the schools, to advertise. So, the position for deanship and head of department has been advertised. People have been screened and shortlisted and the interviews will take place shortly.

Miss Ramdial: Just one more question. What about the issues with school supervisors, because I saw you had a number of vacancies for school supervisors also?

Dr. Ali: There are a number of officers on the delinked schedule and we are pressing ahead with interviews for SS I, SS II. But the terms and conditions of these delinked officers remain very contentious and it is something that needs addressing immediately.

You would also find that we sympathize with the Ministry of Education and the Permanent Secretaries there, because we have noticed that the executive management team of the hon. Minister, several of them are acting, some of the positions are vacant, and it is not making us feel comfortable that the Minister has the support that he needs to be effective. The both Ministers do not have the necessary executive management support to be very effective.

Mr. Chairman: Thank you, Dr. Ali. Ms. Creed, as DPA, what Dr. Ali just said in dealing with the middle management issue and not getting the immediate support from the Ministry in confirming persons on moratorium to act in middle management, what leverage do you have as DPA in dealing with these issues with the Teaching Service Commission? I am a bit confused with that.

Ms. Creed: The Teaching Service Commission, in conjunction with the administrative, including myself—there was a meeting with the Ministry of Education and in an attempt to find a short-term solution to the office of deans, we came up with a proposal and we were trying to work with the Ministry to see if that would have been an option. The Ministry in its wisdom felt it was better to advertise. At the end of the day, the DPA provides—*[Interruption]*

Mr. Chairman: If I may. Just one second. When you say the Ministry's wisdom, who makes that decision, is it the Minister or the Permanent Sec making these decisions?

Ms. Creed: Well, I would not be able to answer that. The PS would have to answer that at her level. I cannot.

Mr. Chairman: Who do you communicate with?

Ms. Creed: The DPA communicates with the PS and the staff of the Ministry. Right? We do not communicate to the Minister. As public officers, we communicate with each other. As the PS had indicated, we have been having frequent meetings finding out, between Service Commissions Department and the Ministry of Education, looking for solutions to see how quickly we could get things to do. I am assuming in the PS case she will approach her Minister. In my case, I would approach the Teaching Service Commission.

Dr. Ali: Sen. Roach, if I may, Sir?

Mr. Chairman: Could either one of the Acting Permanent Secretaries in the Ministry of Education address what has just been raised here by your colleague, Ms. Creed, the DPA, concerning the moratorium. Why you all did not accept

that moratorium?

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Hon. Chair, I would like to refer the question to one of my colleagues, the Director of HR, who would have been present at those meetings. Yes? Because I would not have been privy. What you are stating is 2015.

Mr. Chairman: You would not have been there.

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Yes. So I can ask someone who has institutional memory with respect to this matter.

Mr. Chairman: Could you identify yourself?

Ms. Williams: Good morning again, Kevan Williams, Director HR, with responsibility for secondary schools.

Mr. Chairman: Is your mike on?

Ms. Williams: Yes, it is.

Mr. Chairman: Okay.

Ms. Williams: With responsibility for secondary schools, the teaching staff in secondary schools. The positions of deans were advertised by circular memorandum 15th of February, 2016. This was done to ensure that there was a fair and transparent process in the filling of the vacancies. The DPA did write by memo dated 31st of May, 2016. This is after the circular would have gone out for the position of dean, to have persons—I would just indicate some of the new policy that they would have indicated. The new policy:

The above-mentioned officers can apply at any time.

This refers all the administrative positions in primary and secondary schools.

The above-mentioned officers can apply at any time to the Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Education for a transfer from his/her substantive school to any other school where a similar vacancy exists.

The Commission will no longer require that the officer apply for transfer only when the office has been advertised and be subjected to an interview to determine their suitability for transfer.

And there are seven points on this new policy. I would not read the entire policy.

The Ministry at that time felt—and this is substantiated by our data when we went out to the schools, that there have been—since the last set of promotions took place in 2013—there have been some informal arrangements taking place at the schools, which HR would not have been informed of. In this instance, to ensure that persons who are genuinely senior and not just appoint persons who were performing the duties and would not have gone through the requisite process, that the best process at that time would be to advertise the position to ensure transparency and fairness and that all persons who are eligible for the post, that they be considered and that the vacancies be filled accordingly.

Mr. Chairman: Let me ask you a question. From experience, right, where you have in a school somebody is acting as head of a department or dean, does the principal have that authority to make that ad hoc appointment?

Ms. Williams: Those appointments should be made on the basis of a seniority listing.

Mr. Chairman: No, first of all, Miss, does the principal have that authority?

Ms. Williams: To—

Mr. Chairman:—make ad hoc appointments?

Ms. Williams: No.

Mr. Chairman: No, he does not. Because I know the issue that arises from that after is the fact that the person will be there for a year, two years acting and then not paid for it and request pay.

Ms. Williams: Right, and request pay.

Mr. Chairman: So that is where the problem comes.

Ms. Williams: Yes, and in some of those instances, the person most senior may not be the person who would have been put up to act.

Mr. Chairman: As well?

Ms. Williams: Yeah.

Mr. Chairman: Okay, thank you.

Mrs. Baptiste-Primus: Chairman, permit me. But would not such a situation develop precisely because of the lack of action on the part of the Ministry? Because a principal would have a situation on his or her hands, where there is a need for a dean or head of department would make that request to the Ministry and there is no feedback to the principal and, therefore, the principal invariably would act out of frustration and would identify the most senior person within the school environment, not necessarily the most senior person on the seniority list? Because the principal has a school to run and has to ensure the violence that the Chairman of the Commission spoke about, that all of us as parents and as citizens we are concerned about the violence in the schools. So that, from where I sit, the Ministry has to be a little more proactive and to address issued on a more timely basis.

I know for a fact, and I know there are all kinds of issues, legitimate issues. But the bottom line is that those schools, those positions, are not being filled on a timely basis. That is the bottom line. And the Ministry has to improve on its level of efficiency in meeting and treating with this situation. We cannot have our children in the schools behaving as they are behaving.

Mrs. Crouch: Chairman, I would like to respond very deeply to what our Minister is saying, because of the violence in schools, that this Commission is not only interested in filling these positions as a matter of urgency but we also want to get involved in the types of questions that are asked of the persons who apply to be deans, because to be a dean it is not just simply a question of promotion. You have to be able to care for children. Do you care about children? Do you have an understanding of their psychosocial needs? Are you going to be positive in what you do with them? Your job is not to suspend or be punitive. So this Commission is very, very interested in the kinds of interview questions that are asked of the persons who will be applying. So that the country puts forward a cadre of caring, thoughtful, responsive individuals.

We are very pained when we see those videos of children rolling around on the ground. Where is the dean? Who is looking after them? A school is a community. And these deans are supposed to be a particular type of person. And so we are looking at the interview questions, so that the selection is not only about having an academic qualification. Thank you.

Mr. De Freitas: Good morning. I just wanted to add to that. I am glad you raised that point, because I was listening as the discourse was taking place and I am hearing the word “seniority” being thrown about, and I was wondering in my head why it is that we are still using seniority as a method of promoting individuals when qualification is, as you rightly stated, something that is more important? I thought that seniority might have been a better way or a faster way

to appoint people to positions, reducing time. But we are now hearing that that is not even the case with seniority.

I do not know how it works, so I would like an explanation as to why we are still using seniority because in my head, I am thinking that there is a list of individuals who are there in the establishment, seniority being that you have been there for a while and, therefore, if you need to appoint someone, it is a matter of going through whatever processes you have for promotion and putting them into the position.

So I am not understanding why, under seniority, it is taking so long, when that does not even take into account qualifications. So I do take your point whereby you really need to find out if the person is qualified for that position as a dean or middle management. So can I get an explanation from, I guess somebody on the panel as to why we are still using seniority, as opposed to strict qualification when you can put it out there in advertisement and get someone coming in?

Dr. Ali: Outdated regulations, I am glad to hear you say that, Sen. Roach, and therefore that is why the Commission is calling for a new Act and accompanying regulations.

But I want to answer Sen. De Freitas. At the meeting where we proposed to both hon. Ministers of Education to do this moratorium; it was on the 24th of February, 2016. Mrs. Crouch told both Ministers that promotion is one thing but to promote somebody does not make them a leader. Principals need training to become leaders and risk takers. So we have been trying to embrace the idea of merit, rather than seniority—Sen. De Freitas, merit, rather than seniority—and we are hoping that we are able to groom people into leadership positions. People need training to become leaders, to be great leaders of schools.

When you look at a head of department, hon. Members, a head of department in mathematics must be a master teacher. When you go to Fr. Lai-Fook in St. Mary's College and he takes out 2015 Cape Unit II past papers, he has worked out every problem using algebraic solutions, a solution in geometry, a solution in matrices and he can solve the single problem in four different ways and he has worked them out. Even when they get distinction and I ask him: How did the boys do this year Fr. Lai Fook? He would say to me: “If it was up to me I would fail all of them.” These are master teachers. Not everybody could become a head of a department. You have to supervise, oversee all the internal assessments, the IAs and the SBAs that go to CXC.

I want to point out something before I leave this issue, Sen. Roach. It is distressing to this Commission—and I am giving you just a little insight. I am looking at 2015, the period 2009 to 2015. Right?

10.55 a.m.

In one school, I have 44.7 per cent of the children, not one pass. In another school—I do not want to call the names of the schools—I have 47 per cent of the children, not one pass; 31 per cent, not one pass. I can call this school because the figures here from 2009 to 2015 is 0000—

Mr. Chairman: Try—

Mr. Ali: You do not want me to call it?

Mr. Chairman: Yeah, I prefer you not to.

Mr. Ali:—which means you have 100 per cent pass rate. And as we go through from 2009 to 2015, this other school here, a 56.3 per cent failure rate, that is no pass, you know, not in one subject; 30.6 per cent; 27.3 per cent; 22 per cent; 43 per cent failure rate. That is not one pass.

Mr. Chairman: Mr. Ali?

Mr. Ali: Yes, Sir.

Mr. Chairman: I would appreciate if you can probably share that with the Committee, not now but we would arrange to have it here. Could you just take a question concerning what you are discussing here with member Ameen?

Miss Ameen: Dr. Ali, I am listening to you and it seems that while the grass is growing the horse is starving. We complain about the inefficiencies, we complain that the children are not passing CXC and their exams, and the fact is that many of those children do not have teachers. They go through their entire time in school without teachers, without deans, and then we criticize, we look at the statistics and criticize. While I know Commissioner Mrs. Crouch indicated that you are reviewing the questions that would be asked and the criteria for appointing deans, the fact is that in many schools, teachers perform these services voluntarily because of some ability or leadership skills that their colleagues and their principals would have recognized. They, of course, may be the ones who would be recommended by the principal to serve in these positions and to be given the opportunity to be confirmed. I am sure that was part of the rationale for asking for the moratorium. Years continue to pass while deliberations take place with regard to determining what question to ask, and our children are being failed by every one of us in this room because we are deliberating on what question to ask. There are many teachers who are frustrated by the system and, at some point, we have to put a stop to it.

When I hear the concerns being expressed, I am thinking about the end result. Dr. Ali indicated that the end result is that we serve the children, and the Teaching Service Commission is failing the children. Those pass rates, those failure rates are a clear indication of that. I want to ask if any new consideration or recommendation could come from you with regard to, perhaps—while you are waiting for consultation to review the Act, I endorse your recommendation to review that 1966 Act and I understand why. I am asking if the recommendation for a moratorium comes again, the people who are in this room will be in a position to reconsider that, so that these vacancies—even if the persons who are appointed are not the ideal person, it is better to have half a bread than no bread at all. As we are, our children are starving because of lack of bread.

Mr. Ali: Sen. Ameen, I want to clear up one issue. The persons who the commission was going to look at for this moratorium, we were not going to bypass any regulation. They would have to be suitably qualified, have the years of experience and meet all of the criteria of the State to hold that position. So some of them are suitably qualified, well qualified, fit for the position and have the years of experience, and they were going to be interviewed. It was not going to be an adhococracy, it was not going to be ad hoc. They were going to be interviewed and go through the rigour of an interview and then if they pass the interview, we would appoint them to stabilize the schools. The commission is not in charge of the schools and so the commission itself is not failing the children, but we feel deeply when we look at the pass rates in certain education districts. Right?

The other problem, Sen. Roach and members, is that we are greatly distressed that the irregularity and the punctuality of officers is horrendous. I told hon. Ministers, in my last meeting with them, I believe that the children are ringing the bell. I do not know who is starting school in the morning, because when I look at these figures, we have here in St. George East, 12 people in excess of 2,000 minutes late. We have in the eastern district, other people. In one district at the secondary level, North-Eastern District, we have 49 officers persistently irregular and

unpunctual. In South-Eastern 17; in St. George East, 34 of them persistently irregular and unpunctual. We have been writing and asking for the necessary action against these officers, Sen. Roach, to be taken.

Mr. Chairman: You write to the Ministry of Education?

Mr. Ali: Permanent Secretary.

Mr. Chairman: The Permanent Secs.

Mr. Ali: We have written on numerous occasions. What the Commission has decided, after seeking guidance with counsel, is that the regulation says, when the Commission becomes aware. Well, we are very aware and, therefore, we are moving towards having these officers on this file here discipline for irregularity and unpunctuality because the children, Sen. Ameen, are suffering. Parents are bathing their children in the morning, plaiting their hair, sending them in a taxi and sending them to school, but I do not know who is ringing the bell.

Mr. Chairman: What you are saying is that you have realized from the regulations that the Teaching Service Commission has the authority, once it becomes aware of the delinquency, to take action directly?

Mr. Ali: Yes. Sen. Roach, I would allow Senior Legal to comment on it.

Mr. Chairman: Yes.

Ms. Seecharan: Well, the Constitution vests the power of discipline in the Commissions. I know there are some administration arrangements between the Ministry and the Commission, but just like under the Public Service Commission where IOs can directly appointed, we have advised the Teaching Service Commission that they can directly appoint the IOs as well, because they cannot turn a blind eye when they have this level of statistics.

Mr. Chairman: The investigating officer you are speaking of, right?

Ms. Seecharan: Yes, sorry. Investigating officers.

Mr. Chairman: Okay, thank you very much. The Permanent Secretary, what is the Ministry doing about this particular problem?

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Is it possible for me to ask the officer with respect to industrial relations, the Director, to give you the statistics, because again the response, listening to the chairperson, Mr. Ali—

Mr. Chairman: I want to know a policy. What is the policy being implemented to deal with it?

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Well, the policy with respect to industrial relations has been that the Ministry of Education has to follow through in terms of ensuring that the principals—the principals have to record the number of late minutes. They have to write to the officer. There is a procedure. Many times the information reaches the Ministry of Education and we are ready to take action, we have to go back into the records to ensure that each step is recorded. That the person is written to, the person responds at least three times before we can take action.

Mr. Chairman: If I may stop you here. Now, unfortunately, when I am looking at the persons who are appearing before this Joint Select Committee this morning, I notice the Teaching Service Commission came with their legal person, Ms. Seecharan, who just addressed us. One of the first things I noticed was there was no legal person from your Ministry, and I wanted to know why was that, because a lot of what we are dealing with thus far has to do with operations, discipline, punctuality and all of that—service being provided efficiently to the very same students we are interested in, and we are supposed to be looking after. Your legal department plays a critical role in a lot of what we are speaking about here now. Why is such a person not before us?

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Because we had four persons, I had brought the person who specifically liaises with the legal department, the Director of HR. I am sorry.

Mr. Chairman: No, no, no, but that was not good enough. You need to have the legal person here, because just like I am hearing the number of persons that pass through that Ministry in terms of PSs, I want to believe from my experience dealing with matters at the Teaching Service Commission that the legal department as well also has that fluidity in terms of—I do not want to use—I mean that rapid turnover, and hence not being able to either accumulate the competency, the institutional efficiency by the rapid turnover in the Ministry, and that has to be a problem. And that problem has been going on for as long as I have been in contact or have been dealing with matters concerning the Teaching Service Commission. So what is being done about that?

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: I know with respect to the IR, I looked at the questions and I felt that the person—well, we have the director here—at least we have the director on board who liaises with the HR—and I felt that at that point I could have brought the Director of HR to respond.

In terms of the fluidity, the Ministry of Education, we are now trying to get a director for the legal department. We have two Legal Officers II at the Ministry, and because of the merger we lost some officers, again, persons who were on contract and also with the public service. They had to return to their substantive positions and, again, institutional memory, we have lost that. At this time, we are trying to increase the number of legal officers but we only have two legal officers—well two Legal Officers II and one and we are now going out again to advertise for some of the senior positions. They are all contract positions.

Mrs. Ramdial: So could you give us a timeline as to how soon these officers will be brought on board?

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: It has been shortlisted. Because we advertised, we have shortlisted and we are ready to go out for interviews. So I am hoping by the end of well April, mid-April, that we will have somebody selected.

Miss Ameen: PS, through you, Mr. Chair, there is one Deputy PS in this Ministry?

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: No.

Miss Ameen: How many?

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: I have three, three Deputy Permanent Secretary positions.

Miss Ameen: So all the issues relating from early childhood to tertiary education now fall within this one Ministry?

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: That is correct.

Miss Ameen: The issues that have been identified, some of them go before your time. I was wondering, with regard to the fact that this Ministry of Education is now what you call a “super Ministry” and you have several Deputy PSs, if the responsibilities of the Ministry has been split and assigned specifically to Deputy PSs or if you just share according to—

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: No, no. This, I brought the HR. This is the Deputy Permanent Secretary with responsibility for HR matters from the ECCE to tertiary. We also have Deputy Permanent Secretary with respect to infrastructure and general administration and we have one with respect to IT and strategic management. So we have split the portfolios. The portfolios are split.

Miss Ameen: Thank you, appreciated.

Mrs. Ramdial: All right. So I want to move on a little bit. You wanted to ask?

Mrs. Baptiste-Primus: Chair, thank you kindly, Chairman. To the Permanent Secretary, I am not too sure that I am clear in terms of the high levels of absenteeism and irregularity the Chairman of the Teaching Service Commission mentioned. I heard you say that even if the principals submit the information, at some point in time you have to go back into the records to determine whether or not proper procedures were followed. It goes back to the question: What is the policy in place? Is a principal advised via a policy document that you speak to a teacher at least on three occasions, then you follow that up with a warning letter in writing? How many such warning letters are to be issued?

When the principal is submitting the report to the Ministry, is there not a standardized approach so the principal will know I have to attach the copies of warning letters, I also have to document in the report the dates on which I would have verbally spoken to the teacher? If that is so, how come at the ending when the investigation is to be launched, the Ministry still has to go back and verify? I am a bit puzzled by that because if the policy procedures are followed then the Director of HR would have the full breadth of information before her in order to take the necessary action. I am a bit confused. If there are clear guidelines then why is—is it that the principals are not following the guidelines?

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: In many instances, we went through the data and in many instances while we have in the records the figures, because on a monthly basis punctuality and regularity, the figures come to the Ministry and it is recorded. However, when we check with the schools, in many instances, that procedure that you outlined is not being adhered to. But to elaborate further, I have the DSS with responsibility for punctuality and regularity who will elaborate further.

Mr. Deoraj: Good morning, Chairman and members, and I appreciate the question, and given your background. Progressive discipline is what is followed from the beginning to the end starting with counselling, first warning—first verbal warning, first written warning, second written warning and then it is referred to the Permanent Secretary for onward transmission to the Teaching Service Commission for action. We have compiled files on over 300 persons, at present, who have gone beyond, what we call persistently unpunctuality.

I would just like to draw a little bit of background in terms of the principals. A lot of them had not been trained properly in following the progressive discipline model to the letter and that has now been rectified. We have captured data showing from the trigger that is set by the Teaching Service Commission of 180 minutes per annum late for teachers. It is interesting that the actual trigger set by the Teaching Service Commission really only appeared in the Magazine called *TSC Speaks*. It really did not come in a memo to the Ministry of Education stating that this was the exact trigger for disciplinary action to be taken against any member of the teaching service for unpunctuality. In fact, I have never seen that memo.

But having given that, the fact that the TSC can set the bar, given that their remit is discipline, the Ministry of Education has been following that trigger and we have now captured, to a large extent, the number of persons who would have abused their punctuality by being tardy on X amount occasions per month amounting to what we would now want to follow the discipline process, and those who have reached level five, which would be onward transmission and report to the Permanent Secretary for the TSC, over 300 persons would now face the Teaching Service Commission for unpunctuality.

In terms of irregularity, well we know that the process for that is very simple. Where the teachers have

exhausted their 14 days vocational leave, any leave after that not covered by any other type of leave would necessarily be without pay, because you have exhausted your 14.

In the case of sick leave where you go over your 14 days, it would now fall into the realm of extended sick leave, and the recognition that it must be signed by a DMO or a public health officer in a hospital or so to be accepted. Even so, the Permanent Secretary will still have the discretion whether to grant the extended sick leave dependent on the quantum and the regularity. If it persists, if you see somebody taking extended sick leave over a number of years or too regularly, what we will do is refer that person to the Ministry of Health to get a tribunal together to determine that person's suitability for performance of their duty, and that would then go to perhaps retire somebody in the public interest and so on. But in terms of unpunctuality, we as a Ministry have been very serious in pursuing those persons who have been habitually unpunctual, and we are hoping that those files get to the commission and actionable in the shortest possible time.

Mr. Chairman: There is a problem I can perceive immediately from what you are saying. Given the efficiency of collecting that data, that information, you realize that it is a system and we have problems along that system. Because at the end of the day when that information reaches the Teaching Service Commission it has to be prosecuted. If you are labouring with two legal officers in the Ministry of Education who I believe are charged with prosecuting those matters for the Teaching Service Commission, you really have a problem. That is one that has been identified.

The second thing is, can there be some proactive means of remedying this from the level of engaging TTUTA—the union for the teachers—in terms of getting them on the same page to take responsibility and engage their members in a more proactive way stemming that problem? Because in Trinidad we are always looking for remedies as opposed to being proactive to stop it from happening or curtail it earlier in its transgression or is about to be transgressed. Could you respond to that for me please?

Mr. Deoraj: Yes, Chairman, I would love to respond to that. With regard to TTUTA, we meet TTUTA on a regular basis and TTUTA has spoken to their members in terms of continuous dialogue in addressing the whole unpunctuality issue. The main point that you raised and which I have a lot to say about it in terms of if we look at the Public Service Regulations which we adopted, under the Public Service Regulations you have the delegated authority to have the one-man tribunal. So for our civil servants, for example, you can have that. That is something I think that the Ministry has raised in the past and should be pursuing the delegated authority in the Teaching Service, so all unpunctuality matters can be quickly dealt with in-house with the Ministry of Education.

We have persons who have been trained who can act as judges, prosecutors or defenders, and really it is fairly a straightforward exercise when dealing with unpunctuality, simply because the officer who have been persistently unpunctual would have signed a monthly return verifying that this is the amount of minutes late and times late per month. At the end of the accumulation of that, given the triggers and going through the progressive discipline process, at the end of it there can only really be only one outcome, because it has been verified by yourself as the person who is the officer who would have accumulated X amount of minutes and have signed to that monthly.

Mr. Chairman: Well, Mr. Deoraj, thanks for what you have just said. I always wondered why it is the Commission never used more often—my experience, I have never seen them used it at all—the one-man tribunal thing where it eliminates the presence of attorneys, which we could add length to things that can be done in a very shorter space of

time for matters that are not as controversial like, as you say, delinquency. So that would be a matter for the policy of the Teaching Service Commission, why have they not engaged that? To me it saves resources and it saves time. So, I would like to hear from them on that basis.

Mr. Ali: We wanted to move towards the one-man tribunal and we looked at a number of difficulties, Sen. Roach. One of the problems was that, as you all know, public officers in a certain rank do not sign the book.

Mr. Chairman: I do not know that.

Hon. Member: Range 45.

Mr. Chairman: Principal.

Mr. Ali: Principals. And to be quite open, if the teachers are seeing that the principal is not at the school, how do we structure these one-man tribunals in the schools?

Mr. Chairman: No, no, no. Dr. Ali, the one-man tribunal has to do at the level of the disciplinary process, not in the schools themselves.

Mr. Ali: We were looking at—in regional consideration of it, we were looking at doing it at a district level and how to do some of these tribunals, but we have not delegated that authority as yet, because we are still looking at all of the complexities of it. But what I am hearing from you, Sen. Roach, I want to point out that although the matters we have discussed so far seem to be delinked, they are not.

When you look, Sen. Roach, at the schools without the deans and the middle management, Mrs. Primus, with the absence of deans and heads of departments, and you look at the schools with the violence and you look at the schools with the horrendous failure rates and you look at the absenteeism, it is almost a one-to-one mapping. In Port of Spain and environs, in 2015, we have a total 15,863 minutes late. That is primary. In secondary, the figure is 472,400 minutes late across North Eastern, South-Eastern, St. Patrick, St. George, Port of Spain, Caroni and Victoria. I also want to point out, Ms. Ameen that for the CAPE, in 2016, 266 candidates got no subjects. When we looked at the data from 2010 to 2016 over a six-year period, we are seeing, hon. Members, the number of students—

Mr. Chairman: Dr. Ali, let me interject here with some of the concerns coming from other members here. What we are interested in is what is being done about it. The data is one thing, stats is one thing, it gives information, but what are you doing with what you have before you?

Dr. Ali: What we are doing now?

Miss Ameen: Chair, if I may just add to that. I want us to be careful because you are saying that the schools with the highest levels of irregularity and unpunctuality are the ones that have more violence. The violence in the school is not necessarily as a result of the absenteeism because many teachers absent themselves because they are at risk. There are many teachers who may sign in and leave or go late because they are afraid of the violence in the schools, so one feeds into the other. So let us not be conclusive about that as if it is one way alone.

I join the Chairman in indicating that I am anxious to hear your recommendations or what recommendations have you put forward to the Ministry, and then in turn we could ask the Permanent Secretary, if she could, give us an indication as to what are the things that hinder those recommendations from being implemented. So I really want us to get solution oriented at this time.

11.30 a.m.

Dr. Ali: Yes, I agree with you. We have written to the Ministry several times about this persistent irregularity and unpunctuality among the officers, and therefore seeing the inaction and seeing the poor performance of the students, we have decided, as I said at the opening here, that we are going to initiate the appointment of investigative officers to pull together the information on these delinquent teachers.

I would like my Executive Director, Mr. Martel Waldron, to point out to the members how many occasions we wrote about persistent irregularity and unpunctuality. We wrote to the Ministry about it. We were hoping that they would initiate the procedure, possibly under Regulation 90, because that as you know, Mr. Chairman, is the normal procedure. We were waiting for the trigger to come from the PS. But in writing and hoping to get the trigger, we were not getting the trigger.

Mr. Chairman: Dr. Ali, what seems to be coming out of here is almost like a table tennis game. This to and fro, who is supposed to do this, who is supposed to do that, who is supposed to do this, who is supposed to do that, and up to now we have not really been satisfied with anything in terms of solutions to the problem that you all are speaking about. You all are just saying this is what it is, this person is supposed to be this, this person is supposed to be that, I mean, it just sounds like—I do not know. This is what is going on here.

Dr. Ali: We are selecting persons to be IOs to investigate the list of persons who have bad regularity and punctuality.

Mrs. Baptiste-Primus: Mr. Chairman, I would like to pose a specific question to the Permanent Secretary at the Ministry of Education, by asking whether or not there is a system in place to flag teachers who have exhausted or exceeded their sick leave or casual leave eligibility?

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Yes, member Primus-Baptiste, as with all systems the Ministry is flagged. The information comes to the Ministry, the information also goes to the district offices. The principal keeps a tally of the days as recorded. The information goes through the School Supervision Division at the district, it comes to the Ministry and it is flagged. Then the Ministry takes action.

Most of the time it will be classified, “Leave without pay”“, and then they begin to look at this person, if this is perennial in terms of whether they are regular in terms of attendance. It is being flagged. We even had a system in place where we had the office of CEO and the DSS looking at the data and actually going into schools to make sure that people are aware that this person is irregular, and whatever systems are in place to ensure that persons become regular, that we are actually treating with the issue of regularity and punctuality.

Mr. Chairman: Miss Creed, as the DPA, you have a privileged position being the DPA, probably not an envious position, but you can oversee a number of the platforms in terms of the public service. You are a very key person in terms of bringing linkages.

You have heard this morning since you are sitting here, probably I would hope most of which you all have probably been aware of already. Yes?

Ms. Creed: Yes.

Mr. Chairman: I am disturbed, I am unhappy, and I am sure I am not speaking of my own feelings here. I am sure my other members share the same sentiments. What is coming out here is total dysfunction and chaos. That is what it seems to be, dysfunction and chaos in a significant aspect of our public service. Almost every morning we are hearing a number of things with the schools in terms of the behaviour and all the other issues that are being brought

before us here this morning. They are not new.

As the DPA who has been there, and I think unlike the PSs who have been changing frequently, you have been there for some time I want to believe, three years. Could you give us some semblance of comfort of what is being piloted, prioritized by the Teaching Service Commission or what has been suggested to the Ministry to deal with things that are critical in a prioritized way, in a short-term, medium-term and a long-term perspective? Nothing is clear, where that is concerned, to me, for this morning.

Ms. Creed: Chair, two issues that are a priority to the Commission and that have been the matters that have been placed before the Commission for consideration is, one, dealing with the indiscipline in the schools. Although it is delegated, it is still the responsibility that lies with us and that is why the Commission was advised that we should appoint the investigating officers and get the matters going immediately. That has been one approach.

The other approach is attempting to fill all the offices, especially at the senior levels in the Ministry. The offices have been advertised in cases. First of all, I have to tell you one of the issues that I have at Service Commissions Department is that the secretariat that supports the Teaching Service Commission comprises seven human resource advisors, and it is their responsibility to monitor and to support the Commission for approximately 17,000 teachers. I want to start there.

The Public Management Consulting Division normally has a nice ratio that they use, which is like 100 to 150 persons to an officer. So I do not have to do the maths for you if I tell you I have 7 HR officers and the rest are clerical support in that unit. So one of the things that we have been attempting to do is to support the Commission as much as possible, but with limited resources. Because we had limited resources, we had discussions with the Commission and the Commission decided we would focus on the persons—this was the Commission's policy—we are to focus on filling deans, vice-principals, principals, et cetera, but it is the same seven officers we have on board that have to provide the support for the interviews, set up all the administrative work that has to be done.

So at Service Commissions Department, yes, we have had some achievements which were sent to you, and that is one of the things that we have looked at very critically in seeing how fast we could fill those offices to provide the permanent staff in those Ministries and Departments. The practice in the past had been that we would advertise per school. I had a discussion with the team from the Teaching Service Commission and the Commission, and a recommendation that we start to advertise by district. If you have to advertise, principal, St. Mary's, that is a whole process. Then principal, Holy Name Convent, that is a whole process. Principal, St. Joseph Convent, the time line, the resources we do not have.

So the recommendation that came from the Service Commissions Department is let us advertise in districts. When the persons come for an interview we make it clear to them, we are advertising for the district of St. George West, asking them to indicate—please indicate at the level of the interview—you do not know if you are successful or not—where you are not interested in. So I am not interested in working in this particular school; I do not want my name on the list for this particular school. A system like that has also been recommended to be put into place from our side, so that at least the interviews could move faster. We are also looking to see how quickly we could get the disciplinary matters moving.

The Legal Officer, Service Commissions Department also wanted to come into the discussion with regard to

the disciplinary matters, if she may, Chair.

Mr. Chairman: Before we turn on to her, I am very glad to hear what you said, that you all have moved from the specific schools to the district. That certainly is a better use of resources, so that is something positive and something to be commended.

Ms. Seecharan: Chair, the Commission has been advised that they could directly appoint the investigating officers, and actually previously it was done through the Ministry. It is the first time actually that we are hearing they have all these IR procedures that they go through before. If you look at the procedure in the Commission's regulations—because remember the Constitution has vested them with these functions and then the regulations prescribe the procedure that we follow. Those IR procedures are not there. So once it is a clear breach of the code and you are going to invoke the disciplinary process, they can proceed to do it. I do not know internally—I am hearing what the Ministry's administrative procedures are in terms of IR and what they think they need to follow first.

So I think maybe in order to expedite, we will have to have some discussions in terms of at what point they are going to invoke. Then she is also saying that they classify the leave as leave without pay. So if you are classifying the person's absence, then we will not be able to take disciplinary action. I think we need to have, coming out of today, maybe some discussion to rectify those things.

Mr. Chairman: Based on what you are saying, the problem remains with the Ministry of having a very efficient legal department, a very well-staffed legal department, and two attorneys to deal with the large number of disciplinary matters is certainly not cutting it. It really cannot. They too will want to leave, because I am sure they will be overly burdened. I am sure that is an incentive to leave. It has to be addressed as a matter of urgency.

Is it a problem in attracting and keeping them because of a lack of proper remuneration or because of the burden of the work involved?

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: I am thinking it is both, in the sense that they are contract positions. Most persons are looking for tenure. Most persons are looking for tenure; they are contract positions within the service. As you said, the work; right now the matters beyond the IR is that we have contractors for physical projects, we have quite a number. Then we have a number of matters before the court that we have to address. So it is a heavy workload, because it is a really large Ministry.

Miss Ramdial: I just wanted to ask about the UTT teachers who are coming out of UTT every year and they are unable to get upgrades. What are the issues with the UTT teachers versus teachers trained in other tertiary institutions?

Dr. Ali: What I would like to say, as I answer, is that there is really not a mass chaos, but there is need for affirmative action on irregularity and unpunctuality. We have to take decisive action on this, because it affects the performance of the students. I would not say we are in chaos, but we need action on these things.

One of the things the Commission did—I am going to answer your question, member—because of the public service, we could not get the full use of the IRIS platform. The Commission embarked on using open source technology, Google Maps to do a geographic mapping of all the schools in Trinidad and Tobago, primary and secondary. I am sure you have used Google Maps. When you google a school, you see the little orange blob comes up. From that we were uploading data into that system, so we would know the student and teacher ratio and the number of people appointed, who are not appointed, who are acting and so on. So that is one very positive thing that

we are doing.

On the UTT matter—when the UTT degrees were created and people went to UTT and did their degree and completed, they would send their degree to the Ministry of Education and that transcript and the degree would go to Mr. John Roopchan, who is here today, and he will do the assessment of that degree. All degrees, whether they are from UWI or wherever, are assessed and then they write a letter to the PS of Ministry of Education saying that John has completed a degree in chemistry, is assessed, Teacher II chemistry, and can teach up to CAPE syllabus or up to Form 5. They make very clear statements, very briefly, where the person can go and how far.

What happened when the UTT degrees were assessed, the Ministry of Education found that, for example, the geography degree from UTT was missing 14 courses that would allow such a person to teach the CAPE syllabus. I have here a complete list of all of the missing courses in each of the degrees. So history was missing seven, geography was missing 14, sociology missing three, agricultural science missing 12.

Miss Ramdial: Dr. Ali, just to cut you across. So we would have known this for quite some time. What is UTT, from your recommendation, doing about this gap that exists?

Dr. Ali: I had to recuse myself from any discussion on that at the Commission. When the meetings were held, I would excuse myself, because at that time I was holding the office of the provost of UTT.

Now what was done at UTT—because the people would come to me and complain to me as their provost by the hundreds—we mounted a bridging programme to fill these gaps and we agreed with the Ministry of Education, Curriculum Division and the persons at Alexandra Street at that time, that these were the gaps for these people to be upgraded up to Teacher III. We mounted those programmes. The graduates were informed, they attended the bridging programme, so they now have the prerequisite content, and as fast as they complete the bridging, they are upgraded. The Ministry of Education, Miss Keva, would send the list of persons who have finished the bridging and they would be upgraded.

Mr. De Freitas: Thank you for the information that you have given. I am starting to get a clearer picture as to what is happening. It seems that the Service Commission is taking a more analytical approach in terms of dealing with some of the issues with regard to the schools right up to the tertiary level.

What I am starting to figure out is that there are some huge, huge breakdowns in the entire system. So I am hearing from you that there are gaps in the degrees at UTT, but there are vacancies in the schools, which mean that the schools need teachers, and then I am hearing that you have interviewed 2,810 individuals, none of whom can be put into the vacancies because they have degrees in a different science than you needed.

So what I am saying is that the way this thing is supposed to work, as far as I understand, is that there is supposed to be circle or a feedback loop. So for example you know what vacancies are in the country in regard to the schools. If you need 100 chemistry teachers, and that is fed into UTT or whatever system by which they go and get their degrees, so that if I want to be a teacher and I look on the Service Commission's website or the Ministry's website, I know that over the next five years there is a requirement for 100 chemistry teachers. Therefore, I may take the decision at my level to enter into a chemistry degree.

What is happening is that people want to be teachers, but they are going and doing courses that they want to do—chemistry, physics, geography, does not matter—and then finding out after that they have wasted six, seven, eight

years because there are no jobs for geography or chemistry or whatever it is. So there is a breakdown in that feedback loop. They are supposed to get that information before they enter the degree, so that when they come out, they know that there is a job waiting.

My suggestion is that you fix that. That could be fixed. You do not need new regulations, you do not need a new Act. That is information feedback. You will start to see individuals funnelling into the correct degrees so that you can fill these vacancies.

Secondary to that, the 2,810 individuals that have been successfully interviewed, you have to give them an opportunity to either switch the degree, upgrade in some form or fashion, so they can start to fill those vacancies. The question I can ask you is: Who is the oldest individual that you have interviewed, not by age but in terms of time? What is that person doing now? I am sure they are not home waiting on you to call them, because a vacancy pops up in the particular degree they are in. But if you let them know that, listen, we do not need geography right now, but we need chemistry, you can then give them the ability to go and do an associate degree or another degree in the one that you need, so that they can enter the teaching service. So you can engage them at that particular point. That is just dealing with that system in that way. Information getting at the front of the line as opposed to the end of the line.

The second thing that I want to say is I am not exactly sure in terms of dealing with the punctuality issue what is happening. How do you all capture that data? Is it still that when teachers come to school they write in a book that they arrived at this time, and then they sign off at the end of the month? Let me say this. If you are capturing that there is an issue with punctuality now, in other words when they sign in they are actually saying that they are coming late, they are doing that because there are probably no consequences.

When you start to implement these consequences, what happens? I arrive to school at 9.30 when I am supposed to arrive at 9.00, and I say I arrive at 9.00. Therefore, you need to change that system of capture. There is technology today that you can capture the teachers when they come in so that the flag goes off immediately when they cross that 180 trigger, and then that goes to the principal and then it goes through the system.

Mr. Chairman: Before anybody responds, there is I think Mr. John Roopchan, you are the Director of Curriculum? I think you should answer that question.

Mr. Roopchan: Thank you, Chair. I just wanted to bring some light to the matter concerning qualifications for teaching and the nature of programmes that have been implemented in the school system. What I want to say is that when we assess candidates for teaching in schools in Trinidad and Tobago, we try to align their qualifications with the requirements for implementation of the school curriculum. The implementation of the school curriculum as in the case of people doing CAPE and CSEC programmes and things like that, there are certain modules and components that would require a certain qualification.

So when applicants are coming in with applications for teaching—and they can obtain that from a myriad of universities or tertiary providers across Trinidad and Tobago, and internationally now. There was a time in the past when we just had one or two institutions, and it was not a problem. So there was a standard, but now we have to interrogate the qualifications of every candidate to see to what extent their qualification aligns to the requirements for implementation of the school curriculum.

Miss Ramdial: Just to cut you across Mr. Roopchan. Mr. Ali said that there have been bridging gaps with the teachers

from UTT doing the required courses so that they can be upgraded. The issue is we have UTT teachers who have done these specific courses to reach the grade, and yet still we have UTT teachers waiting six years and seven years to be upgraded, and that responsibility lies with the Ministry of Education. So what are we doing there?

Mr. Roopchan: If I may continue, the issue concerning the bridging programme was one that the Ministry of Education initiated, because we recognized back in 2012 or thereabouts—you would know that with the onset of the Teachers Training College and the bringing about of UTT that there were candidates who would have now been pursuing their programmes through UTT and they recognize that there were gaps, that they were not completing the exact content and pedagogy that we wanted for implementation of the primary school and lower secondary school curriculum, which was traditionally offered through the Teachers Training College of the past.

We met with the UTT in particular. When I say we, the Ministry of Education, and in particular, the Curriculum Planning and Development Division. The technical officers met and we went through and identified the gaps. The Ministry of Education had consolidation with UTT to bridge these gaps, fine.

Now the bridging of the gap was completed and a recommendation was sent forward with a listing of all the people who had successfully completed the bridging programme. Some of them have been—I would say most of them—have been upgraded to the Teacher I position, which is what the primary school teachers would have, coming out of the traditional training colleges. So the programme now was seen fit and meeting the requirements to teach, and they were given the Teacher I primary position.

Miss Ramdial: What about secondary school teachers and their upgrade?

Mr. Roopchan: For those who attended the secondary programme, they were not part of that bridging that we did back then. That bridging that was done in 2013 was for primary in particular, but we have continued to meet with UTT, and we have identified for secondary areas there are various subject areas that they offer there, programmes with specialization. So we have identified and the Chair there has pointed out that there are certain courses we saw that they were deficient with.

Now the completion of these courses, we have not limited it to UTT. We have identified when we review the qualifications of persons who may have fallen short in their qualifications to teach at the secondary level and be given the highest assessment, which is a Teacher III, we identify what courses they need to do and we recommend that they pursue these courses at UTT or any comparable tertiary institution provider. Some of them, UTT has been unable to bridge the requisite gap to this time, but this is why we have said that they can source it from any comparable tertiary level providers. In many instances, there are people who have completed and have been upgraded, but those who have not met the requirements, I suppose they would still be waiting.

Mrs. Baptiste-Primus: Permit me please, Chairman, thank you kindly. Mr. Roopchan, for those teachers who have bridged the gap and have not been upgraded, how do you propose to address such a situation? As a Minister, I received a complaint about two months ago of a teacher in that position, who had bridged the gap and her pay grade has not been upgraded. Can I advise her to send her matter to you to be addressed?

Mr. Roopchan: What I can say is that if you send her to me I will ascertain whether the qualifications have met the requirements and the matter would then be forwarded to HR for further action.

Mrs. Baptiste-Primus: I think she was part and parcel of those who came out at some point in time, because she did

indicate in her letter that she was required to do some additional courses, which tells me she falls within the grouping to bridge the gap. So I certainly shall advise her to communicate with you.

Mr. Roopchan: Sure.

Mr. Chairman: Mr. Roopchan, what is coming out of this, is it there is not a shortage of teachers per se in Trinidad and Tobago?

Mr. Roopchan: There is a shortage in certain areas. As pointed out earlier, there are some areas that we have a flux of teachers that are just too many. So people who might be applying to enter the teaching service at this point in time, let us just say in business studies, they would probably have to wait another four years because they get an interview, because there are so many teachers and applications as well, and there are no vacancies there. But there are other areas like physical education and the theatre arts and things like that where we are really undersubscribed, we do not have any teachers there.

Mr. Chairman: So how easy is it to do a conversion to accommodate the needs with the supply? How easy is it to make a sort of an adjustment?

Mr. Roopchan: Are you speaking of conversion of posts, Chair?

Mr. Chairman: No, from degrees, yes. If there is a shortage—because one of the questions that was going to follow from here, this is why I am asking this, because it may not be necessary to ask that—if you have a shortage and we have a Caricom catchment of teachers, when do you go to reach outside to Caricom members to fill the shortage that we have here? That is why I am asking that as a prelude to that. So you answered adequately, I would not necessarily have to ask that question, but it is out. So could you respond please?

Mr. Roopchan: What I am aware of, even though we are in a shortage position at this point in time, we have been having discussion. The curriculum department of the Ministry of Education has been meeting with all tertiary providers in Trinidad and Tobago. We are aware that there are cohorts of teachers being trained through UTT, through USC right now who may be able to fill some of the vacancies in the not too distant future. So I am saying while we await that, I know that a meeting may be turned out shortly.

Miss Ameen: Mr. Roopchan, I wanted to ask. I did not get if you specifically, if UTT has fixed the problem. I know the bridging situation was a temporary measure, but have they fixed and corrected the curriculum to ensure that the courses being offered now cover the requirements of the Ministry? That is one.

Secondly, have you done or are you in a position to do—and this is for any member—an assessment to indicate the areas where there are requirements for teaching, so as to inform applicants before they go into the service? Because a number of members mentioned that that ought to be done. But have you been able or do you intend to undertake such an exercise, so that the people who are graduating will fill the needs that exist at present. So if those two questions could be addressed.

11.55 a.m.

Mr. Roopchan: Sure, Miss Ameen. The fixing of the problem—since our meeting with UTT with regard to the primary qualification and that 2013 bridging that we did, their programme has been adjusted and it has been accepted. But I just want to alert you, too, that curriculum is normally reviewed both on the Ministry's side and the tertiary institution's side, you know, according to best practice every three to five years. And I think, UTT is right now

revisiting theirs again. And in fact, as we speak here I know that one of my officers, she is meeting with representatives from UTT to ensure that there is alignment. So, we continue to engage our providers, and I am saying, wherever that happens and with any provider, we make ourselves available to ensure that we have that information sharing.

With regard to the assessment of vacancies, I know that we have in the past, I cannot say for within last year or so, but I know in the past I have been part of a team, before I became director, through the HR department that we will visit the tertiary institutions. We used to go to UTT and UWI to let them know what are the qualifications for teaching, what are the areas that we have, what are the areas that are depleted and to guide potential applicants as to, you know, how they can come into the service.

Mr. Chairman: Okay.

Mrs. Baptiste-Primus: Thank you very kindly, Mr. Chairman. Dr. Ali—no, the Ministry of Education, Permanent Secretary, in your submissions you indicated that meetings, and I quote:

Meetings have been held at the strategic level with members of the TSC and the executives of the Ministry of Education.

I have three questions I would like to ask you. When was the last meetings held between the TSC and the Ministry of Education to discuss strategic policy matters concerning the management of human resources in the teaching service? Two: what were the main issues discussed? And three: please provide information on relevant recommendations which emanated from those discussions?

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: To the first question with respect to the meetings, the last meeting I have on record was held in December of 2016. And if we go to, under the same bullet two, we looked and we examined the policy guide and the transfer of teachers. We also, as I had earlier indicated, we had determined that we were going through with respect to the selection board in terms of expediting with respect to the filling of vacancies in the administrative areas. And one of the recommendations that flowed out of that, as I said, was the selection board and therefore, those various panels.

The expediting of the process for promotions in school and a new policy had, well on May 31, 2016, again, for the discussions with respect to the implementation of this new policy, and the guidelines include that officers to apply at any time to the Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Education for a transfer from his or her substantive post to any school where a similar vacancy existed. So that the Ministry would have been able—the officer must give specific reasons for the request, and the TSC would no longer require that that officer apply only for a transfer only when the office has been advertised and be subject to an interview.

The other matter was the recommendations for promotion for all senior qualified teachers. Yes? Right. So, we had looked at the selection board in terms of expediting these matters.

Mr. Chairman: Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons, again, could you tell us what is the policy concerning schools being differently abled friendly at this point in time? What is the Government's policy concerning that?

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Which way? Now, all our schools a decision was taken, I am trying to recall the year, that all new schools, as well as those that could have been retrofitted that they would have been outfitted. We had started with the ECCE centres, even the new centres. We had outfitted in our users' briefs, we had identified the areas. We had rooms that were to be like padded rooms. We had identified bathrooms, the ramps; we had identified specialist

areas in from the ECCE to primary. What had happened is that the Ministry had started constructing new schools, primary, and we are outfitting. So all of those schools were outfitted with those specialist rooms for special schools.

We were working along, for example, with the School for the Blind and so on. We were outfitting those schools. Every year we would have put like, we would have had an allocation and we would have outfitted some of the schools and we would have been doing repairs. But we had a policy for special schools, that was when we had sufficient funds and our secondary schools were being outfitted. And if you look at the schools themselves, you would have seen ramps being built. We had elevators, for example, we built in Port of Spain the new primary schools, we had outfitted elevators and so on.

Mr. Chairman: But what may be helpful to us, if you can provide us in written form the number of schools that are yet to be outfitted, those that have been fitted and those that are to be outfitted, both secondary and primary.

Are you aware—I guess, just last week I was informed by a teacher that one of the government primary schools, Tranquility Government Primary School, is somewhat outfitted with access ramps, but there is a student attending that school at this point in time who is differently abled in a wheelchair and is unable to attend a number of her classes because of lack of proper access. Are you aware of that?

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: And that is the Tranquillity Primary?

Mr. Chairman: I think it is the secondary school. I think it is secondary.

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Well, I know that there is a policy with respect to—what we would ask is that the teachers relocate to the floors, at least where possible, so that this child, over the time if this child is unable because Tranquility would have been one of the schools—

Mr. Chairman: I think it is secondary because home-ec is not—

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: If it is secondary because the primary has the—but that school would have been one of those schools that would have been built many years ago and while there have been ongoing repairs, I know we would not have had, at that time, we would not have had for physically challenged, well, students, that they would not have outfitted it. But one of the policies had been that over the years that you follow this child who has that disability, whatever the disability is. So that if you are physically challenged, the teachers made arrangements to keep whatever classroom at a certain level that this child would have been able to have access.

Mr. Chairman: Well apparently that is not what is happening.

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: And this is Tranquility? Right.

Mr. Chairman: And that cannot be a short-term thing; that cannot be a long-term thing. That could only be short term.

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: But again, you have to look at the space. For us to retrofit some of the schools, we do not have the land, so most of the time we try to place the child, well again, we will have to look at the policy in terms of placement of children with the various—into the schools where we actually have the ramps and we have the elevators to provide the access. Because in Tranquility, again, the space constraints would not allow us to retrofit, because when you need—in most of the new schools we had gone for like primary five acres, secondary 10, so that we had that breadth with the curriculum, but also to ensure that we had physically challenged, the ramps, everything in place. So those older schools, it was a challenge, but again, I would look at it and see how we can best treat with it. Because

I know even the elevators, because it is an old building, I do not know how we would then outfit.

Mr. Chairman: But when you are doing that, who do you take on board? Do you work with the Ministry of Planning and Development? Do you work with the Ministry of Health? I mean, right now there is no law governing the standardization of disabled facilities in terms of how the ramps are supposed to be—

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Yes.

Mr. Chairman:—the length and so forth?

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Yes.

Mr. Chairman: I mean, I go about because of my circumstances and I looked at a number of them. Look at the building that they just built there and opened on Queen's Park West, that would be Queen's Park East, the NIS building, NIB's new building—

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Yeah.

Mr. Chairman:—you have an access there right by, on the main street, the main thoroughfare, it is right next to a box I do not know if it is electricity or telephone. It is right next to the traffic light. I mean, it is impossible to have access to that. That is done without thought. So, there must be some policy there when people go about doing things like that to inform what are the proper things to be done, otherwise it is just wasting money again because that ought to be dug up. That would not be properly utilized for who it was meant to be service.

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: I think what we had decided is that we were going to take a person with the disability and allow them to, at least, work along with us in terms of preparing the users and architects.

Mr. Chairman: Yeah.

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Yeah? Because we had—when we were looking at the new construction, we did take into consideration the policies that were being, you know, we do liaise with the Ministry of Social Development and Family Service, we work with the Ministry of Health. But in terms of the—we worked with the engineers and the architects when we were doing. Right? But I understand that we needed also to look at, to utilize, at least to work along with someone who had, for example, is wheelchair bound that they would help us. But what was happening is, again, in specific areas like Port of Spain and San Fernando, space constraints meant that we—when we are doing new construction, we go more for the elevators rather than the ramps, things. And as you said, looked to see the bathrooms. We normally would utilize somebody who would fit to see the opening, should it be this, you know, the opening, the doors.

Mr. Chairman: Let me tell you something, it is not a guess game, you know, and you do not really have to revert only to somebody who is challenged, you know. There are engineering specifications.

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Yes.

Mr. Chairman: There are international bodies.

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Well, that is what we—

Mr. Chairman: United States standardized—

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Right. Yes.

Mr. Chairman:—to show you what you need to do. And you have local bodies who can assist you with that information as well.

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Yes. We have that. We have done that, but we have not been looking at new construction at this point. What we have been trying to do is to complete those that have been started, complete construction.

Mr. Chairman: But I certainly would like you to look into the issue I raised with Tranquility.

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Yes. Your Tranquility.

Mr. Chairman:—the particular individual. There may be others like her.

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: And it is at Tranquility.

Mr. Chairman: And it is at Tranquility Secondary School because, I think, it is the home-ec class. She is not able to access and some other classes as well. Mr. De Freitas.

Mr. De Freitas: I just wanted to ask one question. The Commission in your submission, the Commission, you also indicated that the Commission has also been working on finalizing the Teaching Service Commission delegation of powers order. So I just wanted to find out what is the status of that?

Dr. Ali: The delegation orders, we have done delegation orders for the completed regulations, but once we do a new Education Act with new regulations we will have revisit the delegation orders because they go hand in hand.

But in your previous contribution you made a very important point, as well as Sen. Roach mentioned the Caricom. And you are quite correct Sen. Roach because we are looking—if we are revising the 1966 Education Act, you will have to take into account the Act No. 26 of 1996 as amended in 2003 that allows for the free movement of university graduates, artistes, musicians, media workers, sports persons and other people under the CSME. So this is something very important that you touched upon, Sen. Roach.

Also, if you are revising the 1966 Act, we should look very carefully at the local school board regulations of 2000 to support decentralization and stage delegation and what these boards are doing at these schools.

Now, the other thing that was overlooked is that, for the first time since 1962, hon. members, this Commission sat in Tobago. The Commission went to Tobago and sat in Tobago, twice in Scarborough, honouring and recognizing the people of Tobago.

Also, in our management meetings with the division for education in Dutch Fort we recognized that at no time curriculum officers were appointed on the island of Tobago, and we set about getting that rectified. That has been a great achievement of the Commission to get those vacancies created and for curriculum officers to be interviewed and for persons to be placed in such positions in Tobago.

Mrs. Crouch: For the first time there is a curriculum coordinator. We found it quite shocking when we went to Tobago that there was this lack of curriculum coordinator, curriculum officer. We felt that a disservice had been done to the children there because the breadth of knowledge that the curriculum division brings, I think, had just bypassed them. They were very anxious to have these posts filled and identified. We spent a lot of time in Tobago getting a curriculum coordinator for the island for the first time, and we were amazed at the highly qualified people who were just there waiting to be put into those positions. And we continue now to fill the post of curriculum officers, and as I said, Chair has indicated that this is a first. At no time before had this matter been addressed and I know we have the support of the administrators in Tobago now that this has been done.

Mr. Chairman: Ms. Creed, I think you want to say something.

Ms. Creed: Yes, Chair. To member De Freitas, the review of the Education Act does not impact totally on the

delegation order and in discussions I am not sure if that was clear. The Commission would be looking to proceed with delegation, further delegation to the Ministry of Education in areas such as the one, and Tobago, in areas such as further temporary, acting, one-man tribunal, et cetera. So that is something that in the pipeline that would be sent out to the Prime Minister as soon as the Commission gives us the final sign-off which we expect to do very shortly.

Dr. Ali: I also want to add, since 1962 there has been no delegation to Tobago, THA. So, we are actively pursuing that. We are actively pursuing that and we have been sitting in Tobago. We have been keeping management meetings at Dutch Fort with the division for education, and the curriculum officers for Tobago we guide them how to create the necessary instruments to get the 12 offices created and advertised in 2015. The interviews started in November of 2016 and they will conclude early in April in 2017.

So, I must say we, the Teaching Service Commission has given a lot of attention. It is not enough. They need much more, but we have given attention to Tobago that was not given to it before in the independent history of the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago.

Miss Ramdial: All right. Just some quick questions. The TSC has been asking for more powers, that is, to monitor and manage teachers, and secondly, to determine teaching curriculum in specified areas in national development. Can you, Dr. Ali, justify the reasons for wanting these additional powers?

Dr. Ali: Yes. If you notice, hon. members, from our presentation today jointly with the Ministry of Education, as member De Freitas noticed, the TSC is providing great oversight over the entire system. We are looking right down to the students' performance, the irregularity, the punctuality of the officers. We are looking at the boards of the schools. We are looking at the CSME, and what our Prime Minister would have to agree with on movement of people under the CSME and the qualifications framework, the Caribbean CVQ and all of these things in different areas. This is not something far away. This future is now. And we would want, for example, to have greater authority to monitor regularity and punctuality.

When we develop our new google map, we roll out our new google map system that will work together with the IRIS platform of the Public Service Commission. We would want to embed inside of there a grade book so we would know the grades and the marks of the students and how they are performing. And we would have information on the regularity and the punctuality of the teachers.

We want to know, for example: what is the state of education in Victoria; how many principals are acting; how many are not appointed; how many teachers are missing in various curriculum areas? As the DPA indicated, it was her brilliant idea, when this Commission came into being that we should interview for the positions for a district rather than do it for a school. And so, if we got the additional powers, I think, working together with the Ministry of Education we could rectify a lot of the problems we are discussing here today.

Mr. De Freitas: I just wanted to, as you reminded me, with the interviewing by district to just raise one point. As much as interviewing by district may help you collate the resources, limited as they are, what I wanted to point out as you did mention that they all come for an interview, and at some point along the interview stage they will indicate what particular school they would be interested in. Just be mindful that what that might do is that you find, let us say if you have interviewees all wanting to go to one school, and if you have nine schools available then you are left with eight still without a principal or a vice-principal. So they would try to, you sort of create a sort of competition for

particular schools which does not help you solve the original problem which is getting principals and vice-principals. You may want to look at interviewing everybody, and those that are successful you place them. If you give them the option, you are going to create that problem where, like I said, they will all want to go for particular schools.

Mrs. Crouch: I want to say something. I want to respond.

Ms. Creed: Your recommendation has been noted.

Mrs. Crouch: I would like to just respond to what the member is saying. I have been amazed at the extent to which there is legal challenge to every single thing that the Commission has to do. Indeed, if legal is not present we literally cannot make a decision about discipline or promotion or appointments. Judgments guide the way we operate now. I was amazed that somebody challenged age 46. A teacher wrote challenging that. I knew, I always accepted that once you are 45 that is it, you cannot be reemployed. This teacher said, I am 45 until I am 46, and that was a first.

So, I also want members of the Committee to understand that for Commissioners like ourselves, we literally do not proceed with key decisions on anything unless Ms. Seecharan is there. And it is a very cobbling thing. What is the law? What is the judgment? Promotions, appointments, upgrades, there is a lawyer attached to every one of those situations.

Miss Ameen: Thank you, Chairman. One very quick question. I commend the decision to interview by district. And the districts were designed prior to 1990, and it worked where the regional corporations, the Ministries of Work and Transport, Education, all the Ministries had the same administrative areas by county. The boundaries, the county boundaries have changed. We now have regional corporations and the boundaries have changed. Has any consideration ever been given to change the administrative districts, because those counties do not exist anymore, geographically? They do not exist. They exist administratively in many Ministries. So, I just want to ask: if any the consideration has been given to changing the boundaries of the administrative districts to come in line with the current local government municipality boundaries? One. And if not, is it something that could be considered when you have reviews so that you would have alignment of all the services? Yes.

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: I think I can respond.

Mr. Chairman: Ministry.

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Yes, from the Ministry level because, again, with respect to the districts, the districts, again, established by the Ministry of Education and we would have looked at this a couple years ago and we would have aligned. But what we had done we had looked at it in terms of a geographic information system. So, once the new boundaries had been defined to local government, the Ministry would have then just been able to situate everything. So we would have put everything in a map.

We would have also gone through, we had done a policy document with respect to the realignment and the rationalization, because again, with respect to education district within Trinidad—

Miss Ameen: Well those municipal boundaries—

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: So, yes.

Miss Ameen:—changed in 1990.

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Yes. Yes. I know. But what I am saying, we would have looked at it over the time and we would have determined the policy, and once it goes into place we would have looked, we were waiting upon, once

it had passed for the regional, the new boundaries, we would have been able to just work along with the new boundaries. Because again, it is placing our primary, secondary, ECCE and defining a new district.

Miss Ameen: Those boundaries were revised in 1990—

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: That is right.

Miss Ameen:—27 years ago.

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: But remember local government—

Miss Ameen: So, I am asking if in those—

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: No.

Miss Ameen:—27 years, if there was ever any consideration to bring the administrative districts—

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: No.

Miss Ameen:—in line with the line municipal boundaries which came about in 1990?

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Yes. But even in terms of our planning, the issues we have had over the years is that while we had administrative boundaries which are now referred to as our education districts, even in terms of our planning we would have been following, as you said, the EDs and the municipal boundaries. So we had to maintain those because, again, if you are looking at poverty, areas of poverty, looking at social development and all of that, we would have kept those boundaries for planning purposes. But for administrative or teaching, but what we had noted was that there were quite a lot of other Ministries that had varying boundaries, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Social Development and Family Services, and all the Ministries were waiting upon the new legislation, once—then we would move because we had to align all of our boundaries.

And even in listening, again, this is an aside to what was said before, going forward as a Ministry I will note to the Commission and they have looked at what you would call looking at the socio-economic, looking at what is happening, looking at what is happening with CSME and all of that, setting up a GIS system in terms of noting what are punctuality and regularity. And I would like them to understand the role that the Ministry is playing, that the Ministry is set up in such a way that research guides what we do, that we understand when you are looking at information and data—for example, if you are looking at local government or you are looking at what is happening in the economy or what is happening with the social, it helps us to work along as a team rather than the Commission stating that we would be doing such and such which borders on what the Ministry of Education is supposed to be doing.

So all I am saying, a plug for the Ministry of Education here that we work along and in alignment with the Ministry of Education as we have been doing—well, the Ministry of Education along with the Commission in ensuring that we, at least, improve the overall teaching service because there are lines and there are boundaries at which we would not like us to cross, but that we work together collaboratively.

Mr. Chairman: Thank you very much, PS. I hope your invitation has been taken up by the Teaching Service Commission who is your close neighbour right now. Ms. Creed.

Ms. Creed: Chairman, if I may? It really shows that when you have changes in leadership, because that, for instance, even the discussion with regard to doing interviews according to districts, the meeting that we had and I am now thinking to myself that the present PS would not have been there at the time that was discussed. So, you know, if all

those things were discussed before, so I realize now that we now have to start all over as—we have been meeting and moving ahead; we have to re-establish again.

Mr. Chairman: Thank you for that. Ms. Creed, what I want to ask and we are coming to a close shortly, a closure shortly, is that, what has emanated from the discussions this morning is that it seems to be—and what is ironic as well is that the problem is about staffing, it is about deploying the resources, getting the best fit for this position, that position and so forth. But you yourself at the Teaching Service Commission and as the DPA your problem is understaffing as well. That is what is ironic. It is understaffing, if I hear correctly, and it is under-resources as well. So, how are we to deal with this? Because it certainly stands and it permeates everything that we have discussed about here. Because if you—yeah? Am I correct?

Ms. Creed: Yes. You are correct. And what we had done as a department as the Service Commissions Department in recognition of our limitations, we have just planned with what the resources that we have. So, ideally if we would like to be able to do 100 things, we can only do 30, based on the resources, that is how we have—we have project ties and planned ahead what we could do, when we could do it with the resources that we have, be it persons, space, et cetera, funds, you know. So—

Mr. Chairman: So has your budget been cut significantly in this budget?

Ms. Creed: Yes. We have been—also we have felt the effect of the economy and what we have attempted to do is to do what we can do with the resources that we do have.

Mr. Chairman: But how has that impacted the significant—an impact that you need to make as a public service? I mean, it is one cutting, but how has that impacted significantly—that probably some overtures probably could be made to have something to address as an urgency because this is a critical area we are dealing with. This affects everything in our society because these are our future leaders, our future everything, police officers, doctors, nurses, the works.

12.25 p.m.

Ms. Creed: Well, the Commissions have come together and we have been having general discussions to see, even with the limited resources we have, if we could look at maybe one selection. We are looking at options under the circumstances, but I would agree with you that if we are provided with further resources in some areas that staffing and funds that would be able to assist us. Because, even the interviews that we speak about, we have to pay persons. But, for instance, lack of funds, we did some Skype interviews recently—so we are looking to find means and ways to get around the issues that we have as best as we can.

Mr. Chairman: And the last question from me is that the Concordat, that seems to be a problem, is that being addressed among—I mean, the relevance of it, it came about in what? In 1960-something or even before that, the Concordat? It is not at that level?

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: That was not—

Mr. Chairman: In the Ministry? Well, could you answer that for us? Could you shed some light? The ministerial—but, you all have an input in it in advising the Minister?

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Yes, the Concordat of 1960, we have—well, last year, and I was not at the Ministry at the time, again, we would have had these consultations and one of the things was to look at the Concordat, and some recommendations were made and they have been put forward in a White Paper with respect to how we move forward

with respect to the Concordat and the relationship with the boards of management.

Mr. Chairman: Miss Ramdial, you have a question?

Miss Ramdial: No.

Mr. Chairman: No? Okay, I would like to thank you all very much—I think Miss Ramdial has a question.

Miss Ramdial: Yes, just the last question and this is to the TSC. Your annual reports, there have been no submission for 2013, 2014 and 2015. Can you give us the reason why?

Dr. Ali: Yes, we have them ready. We have just some tidying up to do and we will submit them shortly. Just to close off on a ray of light, Sen. Roach, I want the members here to leave knowing, very quickly—very quickly, I will take one minute—

Mr. Chairman: Dr. Ali, I am going to invite you to make your closing remarks, you want to do that at this point in time?

Dr. Ali: Yes.

Miss Ameen: Chair, if he could just include—when you say shortly, if you could give like at the end of what month, or date, or year?

Dr. Ali: Yes.

Mr. Chairman: Okay, so you may do so now.

Dr. Ali: Thank you. Thank you, Sen. Roach. Principals secondary, we will be doing 17 schools, interviews confirmed for the third week of March this year; principal primary, vice-principal primary, senior teacher primary in Tobago, we will be doing those from the 15th—those were done from the 15th to the 17th March; vice principal secondary, offices advertised in 15, we will be doing 19 schools in April and May of this year; the curriculum officers of Tobago, that will be concluded by April, Madam, by 2017 of this year; dean secondary, advertised in 2016, interviews that will begin April 2017 to fill 260 vacancies—

Mr. Chairman: Dr. Ali, we have that information here.

Dr. Ali: Right. So, as you could see from the plan here, there is a work plan in order to staff the schools and support the education enterprise with the necessary staff.

Miss Ameen: Including dates and times?

Dr. Ali: So, we have dates and times, all being scheduled, officers are being informed, invited with letters and everything, so there is a work plan going forward.

Miss Ameen: The annual reports?

Dr. Ali: The annual reports, we are just tidying them up with statistics, all of this stuff, and you will be getting them.

Mr. Chairman: Ms. Creed, I will now invite you—

Miss Ameen: When?

Dr. Ali: I think you should be able to get at least two reports from us by April.

Mr. Chairman: Thank you. Okay, Ms. Creed can you—you would like to make some closing remarks?

Ms. Creed: If I may, Chair.

Mr. Chairman: Sure.

Ms. Creed: To the member—to just clarify the member, I was just putting my mind to the reports, I would indicate

by—the 2013 would be submitted in April, 2014/2015 no later than June, and the 2016 by August 2017.

Just to close, I would like to thank the Committee for the opportunity to have us here for us to be able to share with the Committee. I once again want to be able to say that we just recently—we are in the process of—we just concluded our institutional strengthening exercise with the consultants who have identified a lot of areas—recommendations pertaining to governance, legislation, technology, et cetera, pertaining to the Service Commissions Department, and if it is that the Service Commissions Department as the secretariat to the four Commissions are provided, we would better be able to support the Commissions in their constitutional mandate. Thank you.

Mr. Chairman: Thank you very much. PS.

Mrs. Baptiste-Simmons: Once again, thank you for the opportunity to be here. We have listened and we have heard that institutional strengthening that is ongoing, that we would be able to benefit. And to the Teaching Service Commission, we would be able to benefit through that. We have noted also that a framework for the new Act, Education Act, has been defined, because in the Ministry we were looking at revision of the Act to include the areas that we know have been excluded, and this we are working on.

Again, we noted the whole issue with future state that was recognized, and the decentralization in terms of what is happening with our local government, and how we can benefit from that. Also, again, we heard that we would be the one-man tribunal that by next month, I think, we would be able to get those things ongoing. At least we can start. Again, we heard about the initiation under Regulation 90(d), the investigating officer, that the Commission is going to take that on board and work along with the Ministry of Education with respect to regularity and punctuality. I was asked to look at Tranquility, and I would remember Tranquility Secondary with respect to the students having access and equality of treatment there with respect to the classes.

And, again, the Ministry, we are hoping to see the positions filled both at the administrative level in our schools as well as within the Ministry itself through the Commissions, the Service Commissions and, again, we are hopeful that we can actually impact and make our schools become a more peaceful place for our students.

Mr. Chairman: Thank you very much. Before I thank you all, I would just like to say that this morning's deliberations or exchanges, some of it has been encouraging, some of the initiatives have been taken by the Teaching Service Commission to deal with addressing some of what I consider chronic problems in the system, in the fact that they are challenged with lack of adequate resources, which is something not only the Teaching Service Commission, but most of the public service is challenged with now because of obvious economic challenges that are facing the country.

I am also encouraged by the fact that soon to have the new regulations which, to me, play a critical role in the affairs of the Teaching Service Commission. That is way too long outstanding, it needs to come to fruition at this point in time. I know that public servants—I know the challenge most times because they are not adequately resourced, and a lot is demanded of them. Certainly, on behalf of other members here, we would like to thank them for their services. We would like to thank the Teaching Service Commission for your contributions, and hopefully we can work as a team. We have listened to what you have said, and we hope in our report we will be able to reflect that and make suggestions that would be taken up and actioned as soon as possible in the circumstances, to make our system work better for all of us and our children.

So, on behalf of all the members here and myself, I would like to thank you for coming, and I would like to bring these proceedings—before I bring these proceedings to a close I would just like to—for the public purposes—say that the Third Report of an Enquiry into the SWRHA which focused on the human resources and equipment at the San Fernando General Hospital was presented in the Senate on March 14th and in the House of Representatives on March 15th 2015. The website is also available on the Parliament website www.ttparliament.org.

There being no further business, I would like to adjourn this hearing, and thank you very much. Good afternoon.

12.34 p.m.: *Meeting adjourned.*

APPENDIX III

Status of Vacancies in Secondary and Primary Schools

As at March 13, 2017

STATUS OF VACANCIES IN SECONDARY AND PRIMARY SCHOOLS
As at March 13, 2017

SECONDARY

Job Title	No. Of Positions on Establishment	No. of Positions Vacant	No. of Positions Filled	No. of Positions Vacant with Bodies	STATUS
Principal (Secondary)	125	38	87	38	Eighteen (18) positions were advertised by Circular Memorandum #11 dated April 22, 2015. Fourteen (14) positions were advertised by Circular Memorandum #9 dated February 15, 2016. 6 vacancies which occurred after the issue of 2016 Circular are to be advertised. All applications received by the MoE were forwarded to the DPA in April 2016. These advertisements include all vacancies due to compulsory retirement with effect from December 31, 2016
	144	45	99	45	

Job Title	No. Of Positions on Establishment	No. of Positions Vacant	No. of Positions Filled	No. of Positions Vacant with Bodies	STATUS
Vice Principal (Secondary)					Nineteen (19) positions were advertised by Circular Memorandum #12 dated April 22, 2015. Thirteen (13) positions were advertised by Circular Memorandum #10 dated February 15, 2016. 13 vacancies which occurred after the issue of 2016 Circular are to be advertised. All applications received by the MoE were forwarded to the DPA in August 2016.
Head of Department (Secondary)	660	240	420	-	Positions have persons performing duties but no formal acting arrangements in place. Positions to be advertised following presentation of Staff Audit Report
Deans (Secondary)	577	192	385	-	Positions have persons performing duties but no formal acting arrangements in place Positions advertised by CM #8 dated 15/02/16 All applications received by the MoE were forwarded to the DPA in June 2016.

Job Title	No. Of Positions on Establishment	No. of Positions Vacant	No. of Positions Filled	No. of Positions Vacant with Bodies	STATUS
					These advertisements include all vacancies due to compulsory retirement with effect from December 31, 2016
Teachers III/II/I (Secondary) Technical Vocational Teachers I-IV	5952	195	5757	-	

PRIMARY

Job Title	No. Of Positions on Establishment	No. of Positions Vacant	No. of Positions Filled	No. of Positions Vacant with Bodies	STATUS
Principal (Primary)	451	191	260	191	Vacant positions were advertised by Circular memorandum 108 which were advertised and remain vacant. 83 vacancies occurred after the last circular and would be advertised in 2017 All applications received by the MoE were forwarded to the DPA. These advertisements include all vacancies due to compulsory retirement with effect from June 30, 2017

Vice Principal (Primary)	102	53	49	53	Vacant positions were advertised by Circular memorandum 35 which were advertised and remain vacant. 18 vacancies occurred after the last circular and would be advertised in 2017 All applications received by the MoE were forwarded to the DPA. These advertisements include all vacancies due to compulsory retirement with effect from June 30, 2017
Head of Department (Primary)	233	103	130	103	Vacant positions were advertised by Circular memorandum 66 which were advertised and remain vacant. 37 vacancies occurred after the last circular and would be advertised in 2017 All applications received by the MoE were forwarded to the DPA. These advertisements include all vacancies due to compulsory retirement with effect from June 30, 2017
Senior Teacher (Primary)	330	189	141	189	Vacant positions were advertised by Circular memorandum 125 which were advertised and remain vacant. 64 vacancies occurred after the last circular and would be advertised in 2017 All applications received by the MoE were forwarded to the DPA.

					These advertisements include all vacancies due to compulsory retirement with effect from June 30, 201
Assistant Teacher/Teacher I (Primary)	7699	38	-		
Special Education Teacher I	66	64			Positions to be advertised by April 2017
Special Education Teacher II	23	4			

APPENDIX IV

Subject areas for which interviews are conducted

Subject areas for which interviews are conducted:

- i. Mathematics
- ii. Natural Sciences
 - Physics
 - Chemistry
 - Biology
- iii. History
- iv. Social Studies/Sociology
- v. Principles of Business/Principles of Accounts/Management of Business
- vi. Economics
- vii. English
- viii. Drama/Dance/Theatre Arts
- ix. Spanish/French
- x. Computer Science/Information Technology
- xi. Visual Arts
- xii. Physical Education
- xiii. Music
- xiv. Geography
- xv. Agricultural Science
- xvi. Home Economics
 - Home Management
 - Clothing and Textiles
 - Food and Nutrition
- xvii. Technical Subjects
 - Electrical
 - M.E.T
 - Woodwork
- xviii. Electronic Data Processing Management/Typing/Office Procedures

APPENDIX V

The number of vacancies where there are
no available candidates on the Order of
Merit Lists

No. of vacancies where there are no available candidates on the Order of Merit List:

○ Auto Diesel/Auto Mechanic	3
○ A/C & Refrigeration	2
○ Construction/Carpentry	6
○ EDPM/OA	6
○ Electrical Installation	1
○ HE: Clothing & Textiles	4
○ Machine Shop	6
○ Masonry	5
○ Plumbing	5
○ Tailoring	4
○ Woodwork	11
○ Welding	5
TOTAL	58

APPENDIX VI

Measures/ initiatives taken by the TSC
and MoE to improve the efficiency of the
teaching service

Measures/Initiatives taken	Status of implementation/success of initiative
(ii) Re-examination of the “policy” guiding the transfer of teachers from Denominational Schools to Government Schools	Discussions are under way to finalise the policy guiding the transfer of teachers and administrative staff in Primary and Secondary Schools.
(iii) Expedite the process for promotions in schools	The DPA by memoranda dated May 31, 2016, implemented a new policy to facilitate the transfer of officers holding Administrative offices in the Teaching Service. This new policy guidelines includes, inter alia: • Officers to apply at any time to the Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Education for a transfer from his/her substantive school to any other school, where a similar vacancy exists. The officer must give specific reasons for the request. • TSC will no longer require that the officer apply only for a transfer only when the office has been advertised, and be subjected to an interview to determine their suitability for such transfer. • recommendations for the promotion of all senior qualified teachers who have been acting as Dean (Secondary) and/or Head of Department (Secondary) for more than one (1) year. The Ministry of Education, recommended that the Teaching Service Commission consider the utilisation of the Selection Boards for the filling of the vacancies. This is based on the previous successes of this initiative. The DPA by memo dated December 13, 2016, agreed in principle for the engagement of additional suitably qualified experienced, retired persons in the field of education to serve on Selection Boards to interview candidates for Administrative Offices in the Teaching Service. The Ministry of Education is in the process obtaining additional information from the Teaching Service Commission to guide the process.
(iv) Timely sharing of information between the MoE and TSC	Operational meetings held with staff of the DPA and the MoE and communications via the internet as necessary to facilitate: • The prompt sharing of information • Collaboration to improve processes • Answering of queries • Regular meetings at the operational and strategic level

APPENDIX VII

Number of officers persistently irregular
and unpunctual per education district

Number of officers persistently irregular and unpunctual per education district

District	<u>No. of Teachers</u>		<u>Minutes Late</u>	
	2014	2015	2014	2015
<u>PRIMARY</u>				
St. Patrick	1	1	3,722	2,526
St. George East	15	8	27,957	10,277
Port of Spain & Environs	28	12	53,582	15,863
Caroni	4	1	7,717	6,745
Victoria	5	2	7,049	2,657
<u>Total</u>	<u>53</u>	<u>24</u>	<u>100,027</u>	<u>38,068</u>
<u>SECONDARY</u>				
North Eastern	45	49	79,372	111,636
South Eastern	4	17	3,481	30,950
St. Patrick	6	3	7,717	7,941

St George East	54	34	102,310	56,968
Port of Spain & Environs	93	59	193,915	136,070
Caroni	20	46	48,970	96,658
Victoria	33	18	53,424	32,177
<u>Total</u>	<u>255</u>	<u>226</u>	<u>489,189</u>	<u>472,400</u>
<u>Total – (Primary and Secondary)</u>	<u>308</u>	<u>250</u>	<u>589,216</u>	<u>510,468</u>

Source: Teaching Service Commission dated 17th March, 2017

APPENDIX VIII

Permanent Secretaries assigned to the
Ministry of Education for the years 2014 to
2017

Permanent Secretaries assigned to the Ministry of Education for the years 2014 to 2017

Year	No. of Permanent Secretaries serving the MoE that year	Names of Permanent Secretaries
2014	3	4. Mrs. Jennifer Daniel; 5. Ms. Simone Thorne; and 6. Ms. Natasha Barrow.
2015	7	1. Mrs. Jennifer Daniel; 2. Ms. Angela Siew; 3. Mrs. Sandra Jones; 4. Mr. Amradeen Ali' 5. Ms. Jacqueline Johnson; 6. Ms. Gillian Mc Intyre and 7. Ms. Natasha Barrow.
2016	6	1. Mr. Amardeen Ali; 2. Ms. Gullian Mc Intyre; 3. Ms. Natasha Barrow 4. Ms. Jacqueline Johnson; 5. Mrs. Angela Sinasee-Gervais; 6. Mrs. Lenore Baptiste- Simmons
2017	2	1. Mrs. Lenore Baptiste Simmons 2. Ms. Angela Sinaswee-Gervais