



SEVENTH REPORT OF THE

THE COMMITTEE ON

PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION
AND APPROPRIATIONS

SECOND SESSION OF THE 11TH PARLIAMENT

INQUIRY

Examination into the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs with specific reference to Follow-up to the First Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee and Current Expenditure Related to Official Travel to Tobago.



Public Administration and Appropriations Committee

The Public Administration and Appropriations Committee (PAAC) is established by Standing Order 102 and 92 of the House of Representatives and the Senate respectively. The Committee is mandated to consider and report to Parliament on:

- (a) *the budgetary expenditure of Government agencies to ensure that expenditure is embarked upon in accordance with parliamentary approval;*
- (b) *the budgetary expenditure of Government agencies as it occurs and keeps Parliament informed of how the budget allocation is being implemented; and*
- (c) *the administration of Government agencies to determine hindrances to their efficiency and to make recommendations to the Government for improvement of public administration.*

Current membership

Mrs. Bridgid Mary Annisette-George	Chairman
Dr. Lackram Bodoe	Vice-Chairman
Ms. Nicole Olivier	Member
Mrs. Ayanna Webster-Roy	Member
Mr. Clarence Rambharat	Member
Mr. Daniel Dookie	Member
Mr. Wade Mark	Member
Mr. Ronald Huggins	Member
Brig. Gen. (Ret.) Ancil Antoine	Member
Ms. Jennifer Raffoul	Member

Committee Staff

The current staff members serving the Committee are:

Ms. Keiba Jacob	Secretary to the Committee
Ms. Sheranne Samuel	Assistant Secretary
Mr. Brian Lucio	Graduate Research Assistant
Ms. Rachel Nunes	Graduate Research Assistant

Publication

An electronic copy of this report can be found on the Parliament website using the following link:

http://www.ttparliament.org/committee_business.php?mid=19&id=232&pid=28

Contact Information

All correspondence should be addressed to:

The Secretary
Public Administration and Appropriations Committee
Office of the Parliament
Levels G-9, Tower D
The Port of Spain International Waterfront Centre
1A Wrightson Road, Port of Spain, Republic of Trinidad and Tobago
Tel: (868) 624-7275 Ext 2872, 2873; 2409 Fax: (868) 625-4672
Email: paac@ttparliament.org

Date Laid in HOR: January 12, 2018

Date Laid in Senate: January 16, 2018

Table of Contents

Public Administration and Appropriations Committee.....	2
Members of the Public Administration and Appropriations.....	4
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	5
1. INTRODUCTION	7
THE COMMITTEE.....	7
METHODOLOGY.....	9
2. ISSUES, OBSERVATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	12
APPENDIX I.....	26
Questions submitted to Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs	27
APPENDIX II.....	29
The Inquiry Process	
APPENDIX III.....	32
Minutes of Meetings.....	32
Appendix IV	38
Verbatim	38

Members of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee



Mrs. Bridgid Mary
Annisette-George
Chairman



Dr. Lackram Bodoe
Vice Chairman



Ms. Nicole Olivierre
Member



Ms. Jennifer Raffotl
Member



Mrs. Ayanna
Webster-Roy
Member



Mr. Ronald Huggins
Member



Mr. Wade Mark
Member



Brig. Gen. (Ret.)
Ancil Antoine
Member



Mr. Clarence Rambharat
Member

Mr. Daniel Dookie
Member

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Public Administration and Appropriations Committee (PAAC) is established by Standing Order (S.O.) 102 and 92 of the House of Representatives and the Senate respectively. The Committee is mandated to consider and report to Parliament on:

- a) the budgetary expenditure of Government agencies to ensure that expenditure is embarked upon in accordance with parliamentary approval;
- b) the budgetary expenditure of Government agencies as it occurs and to keep Parliament informed of how the budget allocation is being implemented; and
- c) the administration of Government agencies to determine hindrances to their efficiency and to make recommendations to the Government for improvement of public administration.

This Report of the PAAC for the Eleventh Parliament contains the details of the examination of the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs on —

- › Follow-up to the First Report of the PAAC on an Examination into the Current Expenditure of Ministries and Departments under three (3) Sub-Heads: Current Transfers and Subsidies, Development Programme —Consolidated Fund and Infrastructure Development Fund; and
- Current Expenditure for fiscal year 2017 with specific reference to official travel to Tobago.

In undertaking this examination, the Committee decided to undertake follow-up based on the Ministry's response to the First Report of the Committee as well as the current expenditure of the Ministry as regards official travel to Tobago. The Committee employed two (2) mechanisms: written submissions and a Public Hearing. The Committee made a call for written submissions to the Ministry and thereafter focused on a review and analysis of the written submissions. Subsequently, the Committee conducted a Public Hearing with the Ministry. The approach

adopted by the Committee took into account issues identified throughout the examination and time constraints.

The Committee has proffered recommendations related to the issues identified. Observations and recommendations are presented in chapter 9.

1. INTRODUCTION

THE COMMITTEE

The PAAC of the Eleventh Republican Parliament was established by the revised Standing Orders to:

- examine current public expenditure, thereby capturing the full budget cycle by providing Parliamentary oversight of the implementation of the budget; and
- conduct a real time examination of the expenditure of Ministries and Departments.

In the 11th Parliament the Members of the Committee were appointed by resolutions of the House of Representatives and the Senate at sittings held on Friday November 13, 2015 and Tuesday November 17, 2015 respectively. However, by a Resolution of the Senate passed on December 19, 2016, Dr. Dhanayshar Mahabir was appointed in lieu of Ms. Melissa Ramkissoon. Additionally by a Resolution of the Senate passed on November 28, 2017, Mr. Ronald Huggins was appointed in lieu of Ms. Allyson Baksh and Ms. Jennifer Raffoul was appointed in lieu of Dr. Dhanayshar Mahabir. Further by a Resolution of the House of Representatives passed on December 01, 2017, Brig. Gen. (Ret.) Ancil Antoine was appointed in lieu of Mr. Maxie Cuffie.

By virtue of S.O. 109(6) and 99(6) of the House of Representatives and the Senate respectively, the Chairman of the Committee is the Speaker. At its First Meeting held on January 27 2016, Dr. Lackram Bodoë was elected as the Vice-Chairman. Additionally, in order to exercise the powers granted to it by the House, the Committee was required by the Standing Orders to have a quorum. A quorum of three (3) Members, inclusive of the Chairman or Vice-Chairman, with representatives from both Houses, was agreed to by the Committee at its First Meeting.

The Committee in the discharge of its Parliamentary Financial Oversight function of monitoring the implementation of the budget focused on the following, as it relates to the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs:

- 5> Follow-up to the First Report of the PAAC on an Examination into the Current Expenditure of Ministries and Departments under three (3) Sub-Heads: Current

Transfers and Subsidies, Development Programme — Consolidated Fund and Infrastructure Development Fund; and

); Current Expenditure for fiscal year 2017 with specific reference to official travel to Tobago.

The objective of the Committee's inquiry was to determine whether there was accountability, transparency and value for money in the use of public funds.

METHODOLOGY

Determination of the Committee's Work Programme

At an in-camera meeting of the Committee held on Wednesday November 16, 2016, it was agreed that the Committee would:

- i. engage in a follow-up inquiry with the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs; and
- ii. examine a specific aspect of the Ministry's current expenditure as it relates to travel.

Review of Documents

The Committee deliberated on the budget documents, namely:

- i. The Draft Estimates of Expenditure
- ii. The Ministry of Finance's Call Circular
- iii. General Warrant

The Committee also deliberated on the Ministerial Response of the MSYA. The Committee noted the total allocations for Current Transfers and Subsidies, Development Programme -Consolidated Fund and the Infrastructure Development Fund for 2017 were as follows:

Sub-Head	Total — 2017
Current Transfers and Subsidies	\$241,264,099
Development Programme — Consolidated Fund	\$10,400,000
Infrastructure Development Fund	\$61,000,000

Current Transfers and Subsidies refers to the transfer of funds to Regional Bodies, Non-Profit Organisations, State Enterprises and Subsidies e.g. The Sport Company of Trinidad and Tobago.

The Development Programme consists of the Consolidated Fund and Infrastructure Development Fund. This constitutes the Capital Expenditure component of the National Budget and is used by the Government as a strategic tool to effectively execute its policies and achieve its national development objectives. This expenditure is intended to fund projects and programmes which are investments geared collectively towards stimulating economic growth and achieving high human development.

- The Consolidated Fund refers to Direct Charges from the Consolidated Fund; and

- The Infrastructure Development Fund refers to a transfer from the allocation to the Ministry of Finance.

The Committee determined the examination would begin by a call for written responses to the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs to questions posed by the Committee. Questions were sent on May 25, 2017 and written responses were requested to be submitted by May 29, 2017. The written responses were received on June 02, 2017.

Implementation of the Work Programme

The Committee deliberated on the Ministerial Response of MSYA and responses to its follow-up questions and decided on an examination in public based on the content of the responses and matters in the public domain.

The Inquiry Process

The Inquiry Process outline steps taken by the Committee when conducting an inquiry into an entity or issue. The following steps outline the Inquiry process followed by the PAAC: Identification of entity to be examined;

- i. Preparation of Inquiry Proposal for the selected entity. The Inquiry Proposal outlines:
 - Description
 - Background;
 - Overview of Expenditure
 - Rationale/Objective of Inquiry; and
 - Proposed Questions.
- ii. Consideration and approval of Inquiry Proposals by the Committee and upon approval, questions were forwarded to the entity for written responses;
- iii. Requests for written comment from the public made via Parliament's website, social media accounts, newspaper and advertisements;
- iv. Preparation of an Issues Paper by the Secretariat for the Committee's consideration, based on written responses received from the entities. The Issues Paper identifies and

Appendix I. ¹ Questions sent to the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs are included in

summarises any matters of concern in the responses provided by the entity or received from stakeholders and the general public;

v. Review of the responses provided and the Issues Paper by the Committee;

vi Conduct of a site visit to obtain a first-hand perspective of the implementation of a project (optional);

vii. Determination of the need for a Public Hearing based on the analysis of written submissions and the site visit (if required). If there is need for a public hearing, the relevant witnesses will be invited to attend and provide evidence. There is usually no need to examine the entity in public if

a. the Committee believes the issues have little public interest; or

b. the Committee believes that the written responses provided are sufficient and no further explanation is necessary.

viii. Issue of written request to the entity for further details should the Committee require any additional information after the public hearing.

ix. Report Committee's findings and recommendations to Parliament upon conclusion of the inquiry.

x. Receive Ministerial Responses. Review responses.

xi Engage in Follow-up.

2. ISSUES, OBSERVATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

ISSUES

1. Short-Term Employment/ Human Resource

In its follow-up based on the Ministerial Response to the recommendations contained in its First Report, the Committee learnt that the Ministry had commenced a review and rationalisation of its short-term employment, but it was yet to be completed. At the time of the inquiry, the MSYA had not met with the Public Management Consulting Division (PMCD) of the Ministry of Public Administration and Communications and the Chief Personnel Officer for assistance in conducting an organisational structure review. Included in this review would be the Physical Education and Sport Division², which was described as having peculiar positions which were outdated and had proven difficult to fill. The Ministry was of the view that the consultation with PMCD and the Chief Personnel Officer should only be held when official documentation could be produced to justify the MYSA's position on the way forward for the review and rationalisation of the organisational structure. The Committee is concerned about the progress made in the review and rationalisation of short-term employment and the overall organisational structure since its last report.

With regard to vacancies, the Government Human Resource Services was engaged to fill thirty-seven (37) positions. These positions were filled and of the thirty-seven (37), nine (9) were filled by persons who were previously employed at the Ministry on a short-term arrangement. Seven (7) at the time of the inquiry were yet to assume duty. Thirty-one (31) short-term positions were eliminated and thirty (30) persons remained on short-term employment.

² / There were 111 positions on the Establishment for this Division of which 46 positions were substantively filled and there were 55 vacancies.

³ Some of the peculiar positions of the Physical Education and Sport Division Physical Education Sport Officers, Sport Development Officers, Specialised Coaches, etc.

Recommendations:

- *The Ministry should complete its review and rationalisation exercise by March 09, 2018. and provide a status update to the Committee by March 14, 2018.*
- *The Service Commissions Department should make every effort to fill the vacancies on the establishment as relates to the MSYA which would assist in reducing the number of persons on short-term employment. The Commission should provide a status update to the Committee by March 14, 2018.*
- *The Ministry should seek the approval of the Service Commissions Department for it to recruit peculiar positions under Public Service Regulation 15(57).*

2. Maintenance plans

The Committee was informed that the organisational structure for the new national centres had not yet been approved. In the interim the SPORTT recruited On-the-Job trainees in the areas of clerical officers, engineers and technicians. The Company was in the process of evaluating over 400 applications for engineer positions in the Facility Management Unit, however, there was no indication when this exercise would be completed and persons hired. The Committee expressed concern about the lack of human resources for the operationalisation of the maintenance plans at the various facilities.

The Committee also learned that new Nationals: the Aquatic Centre, the Cycling Velodrome and the Tennis Centres, had facility specific maintenance plans which were among the deliverables of the Design-Build contract. Also included in the deliverables was the training and certification of local staff in order to enable self-sufficiency in

(5) Notwithstanding subregulation (4), a Permanent Secretary or Head of Department may with the consent of the Public Service Commission and in consultation with the Director of Personnel Administration by-

(a) circular memorandum; and
(b) publication in the Gazette,

give notice of vacancies which exist in offices specific to the particular Ministry or Department to which any eligible officer may apply. - [http://scd.org.tt/attachments/article/ its/Public Service Commission Regulations.pdf](http://scd.org.tt/attachments/article/its/Public%20Service%20Commission%20Regulations.pdf)

operations. However, there were no maintenance plans for the smaller facilities. The Ministry officials stated that they were liaising with SPORTT to develop maintenance plans for the smaller facilities.

Recommendations

- ***The Ministry should possess an approved organisational structure for the new national centres by January 31, 2018 and provide the Committee with a report by March 14, 2018.***
- ***The Ministry should complete the evaluation of applications and fill the engineering vacancies by January 31, 2018 and provide the Committee with a status report by March 14, 2018.***
- ***The Ministry should ensure the completion and implementation of maintenance plans for smaller facilities by December 31, 2017 and provide the Committee with a status report by March 14, 2018.***

3. Refurbishment and Upgrade of Multi-Purpose Stadia

The conditional assessments of all mega facilities/national stadia i.e. Haseley Crawford Stadium, Ato Boldon Stadium, Dwight Yorke Stadium, Larry Gomes Stadium and the Manny Ramjohn Stadium, commissioned by SPORTT were completed. It was indicated that before maintenance plans could be implemented for the stadia, upgrades had to be undertaken. Officials revealed that in the past, maintenance at these facilities was reactionary.

With regard to the assessments, the MSYA through SPORTT issued a Request for Proposal (RFP) on November 22, 2011. Knaggs Rosser Ltd. won overall for ***all*** five (5) stadia. However, the Tenders Committee opted to award consultancy contracts to the (5) top ranked bidders with a fixed percentage fee between 5.5% and 7.5% of total works assessed by the companies. Subsequently, then Executive Manager, Projects Department, SPORTT, queried Knaggs Rosser Ltd. past submission on a previous occasion for works

at SPORTT. Knaggs Rosser Ltd. refused to submit documentation and a recommendation was made to remove Knaggs Rosser Ltd. and award bidders 2-6 instead. The recommendation was taken and the following bidders (2-6) were awarded:

- CEP Limited (Previously 2nd highest bidder) — Hasely Crawford Stadium — contract sum: \$188,464,242.50
- Phoenix Project Management Design Ltd. (Previously 3rd highest bidder) — Dwight Yorke Stadium — contract sum: \$93,150,000.00
- Alpha Engineering and Designs (Previously 4th highest bidder) — Ato Boldon Stadium — contract sum: \$76,364,252.24
- APR Associates Limited (Previously 5th highest bidder) — Larry Gomes Stadium — contract sum: \$67,616,887.80
- Altura Ltd. (Previously 6th highest bidder) — Mannie Ramjohn Stadium — contract sum: \$79,721,878.95

The allocations represented the highest ranked contractor being awarded the Stadium with the most extensive scope.

Additionally based on a recommendation from the Executive Manager, Projects Department, SPORTT, the total consultant fee payment was computed as 10% of the final contract price rather than the originally stated 5.5% to 7.5%. The Committee was advised that the consultant price represented a percentage of the contractor's contract sum and would not be settled upon until the contract was awarded. The Committee was also advised that in most cases, the consultant price would be 10% for small projects and 4.5% for large project (i.e. upward of \$10 million).

However, the Committee was concerned that the contract payment for the refurbishment and upgrade of multi-purpose stadia was at variance with the industry norm as stated by the MSYA. It was stated via written submission that queries directed to the Quantity Surveyors assigned to the projects revealed that the budget estimates used for computing Consultant payments represent a negotiated figure that fell somewhere between SPORTT's and the respective Consultant's project budget estimates.

Additionally, the funds disbursed and to be disbursed by the MSYA for consultancy services were not aligned with what was originally agreed between the parties. Further, SPORTT's internal projected estimates for upgrade works reveal significant variations from the estimates of the external consultants. Consequently SPORTT may be exposed to risks inclusive of interest penalties and contract termination costs. However, based on written submissions it would appear that the contracts were subject to FIDIC Model Services agreements⁵. It was indicated that "it was extremely uncertain whether future Cabinet allocations would be aligned with these "necessary" but "costly" proposals given the current fiscal challenges facing the nation". However, the Dwight Yorke and the Hasely Crawford Stadiums were described as being in "urgent" need of particular repairs/upgrades, which if not done would threaten the hosting/staging of successful future events. It was further indicated that the Hasely Crawford Stadium has depreciated in status from a facility requiring routine maintenance to one which requires significant capital investment for its functional and structural integrity.

As regards the Dwight Yorke Stadium the Committee learned that the MSYA intends to hand over the stadium to the THA, once approved by the Cabinet. However, it was agreed that before this is done, repair and maintenance works would be carried out on the stadium.

Recommendations

- ***The MSYA in collaboration with the Ministry of Finance should ensure that funds are available to pay to contractors the outstanding fees.***
- ***The Ministry should take measures to suspend/terminate existing Model Service Agreements given existing financial constraints.***
- ***The MSYA should seek Cabinet's approval for the allocation of funds to address emergency works at the Hasely Crawford Stadium and the Dwight Yorke Stadium.***

⁵ Model Services Agreement, 4th Edition 2006 -4.6.1 "The Client may suspend all or part of the Services or terminate the Agreement by giving at least 56 days' notice to the Consultant⁴ and the Consultant shall immediately make arrangements to stop the Services and minimize expenditure' — excerpt from written submission by the Sport Company of Trinidad and Tobago dated August 11, 2017.

- *The MYSA through SPORTT, should as far as possible endeavour to maintain industry standard and practices as regards consultancy pricing (for small and large projects). Proper justification should be provided for any deviations from what is standard practice.*

4. **Site Visits**

The Committee was concerned to note that while the Ministry conducted site visits to sporting and youth facilities, site visit reports were not produced. Additionally, there was no schedule for site visits and these visits were being conducted in an ad hoc manner. It was revealed that site visits would usually only be conducted if maintenance and infrastructure works were required.

Recommendations

- *The Ministry should make the submission of site visit reports mandatory*
within a specified time subsequent to a visit. A schedule for site visits should be established at the start of each financial year.
- *The Ministry should ensure that site visits are not only be initiated if and when maintenance and infrastructure works is required.*

5. **Accountability and Transparency**

The Committee was informed that the Ministry was undertaking a series transformational initiatives geared toward culture change (particularly with regard to procurement and the effectiveness and efficiency of the Ministry). Ministry officials admitted that external professional help might be necessary.

The Committee learned that the Ministry did not have a strategic plan. It was indicated that the creation of a strategic plan hinged on the youth policy, sport policy and administrative reform, which were incomplete.

Additionally, as a means of improving accountability and transparency, the MSYA indicated the following internal controls were strengthened:

- The procurement systems and procedures in the MSYA were reviewed for addressing areas of weakness and ensuring compliance with the Public Procurement and Disposal of Public Property Act, 2015;
- The Accounting Officer implemented the "Open Tendering Procedure" whereby, requests for goods/services/supplies and works to be undertaken, were properly advertised;
- Recommendations arising from the Auditor General's Reports were being actioned;
- Applicants for grant funding were now placed on separated files for profiling and verifying applications, historical funding was being monitored and tracked, etc.

Based on written submissions received, the Ministry indicated that it had an obligation to ensure proper management and prudent use of the allocated financial resources and that value for money was achieved. However, the Committee was not convinced that this was being achieved. The Committee was, however, concerned that the Ministry may still be wanting in the achievement of this goal.

Moreover, the Committee has noted with great concern a number of allegations of corruption or wrong doing at the Ministry over a number of years. The Committee is of the view that there need to be a systematic review at the Ministry to ensure that there are mechanisms in place to curb these types of activities.

Recommendations

- ***The Ministry should provide a status update to the Committee on the progress with its change initiatives by March 14, 2018.***
- ***The Ministry should take urgent steps to complete the sport policy, youth policy and the administrative reform and thereafter the completion of its strategic plan and provide a status report on its progress by March 14, 2018.***

- ***The Ministry of Finance must conduct a comprehensive review of the internal controls at the MSYA.***
- ***The Ministry of Finance should also ensure that the Internal Auditors and Accounting Staff at the MSYA are adequately trained.***

6. Whistleblowing

Based on written submissions received from the MSYA, the Committee noted that the Accounting Officer was concerned with confidentiality at the Ministry. The Committee also noted, and as reported to the Head of the Public Service, that with regard to official travel to Tobago "breach of confidentiality and the provision of official documents to the media [was] being actively investigated".

Additionally, the Human Resource Unit was requested to reiterate to staff the following laws which could be enforced as part of the Code of Conduct regulating the Public Service:

- The Civil Service (Amendment) Regulations 1996: Legal Notice No. 217 Chapter XI Code of Conduct. Sections 134-146;
- Exchequer and Audit Act Chapter 69:01;
- Financial Regulations and Instructions 1965;
- Public Procurement and Disposal of Public Property Act, 2015;
- Integrity in Public Life Act Chapter 22:01, Sections 23-29 (Conflict of Interest); and
- Data Protection Act 13 Of 2011, Chapter 22:04, Section 99 - Whistleblower Protection.

However, the MSYA did not have a whistleblower policy and up to the time of the inquiry were not considering one. The Accounting Officer was of the opinion that such a policy should be a Public Service initiative.

The Committee is of the view that given the history of the Ministry, employees should be encouraged to come forward and highlight suspected wrong doing or questionable

practices via formal means i.e. guided by whistleblower policy. In this way, more informal means such as leaks to the media may be minimised. The Committee also agrees that there is need for whistleblower legislation to govern the entire Public Service.

Recommendations

- ***The Ministry of the Attorney General and Legal Affairs should take immediate steps to ensure the re-introduction and passage of the Whistleblower Protection Bill, 2015.***
- ***The MSYA should ensure that the proper processes and procedures are in place for the implementation of whistleblower policy.***

7. Sports Commission

The Ministry was in the process of establishing a Sports Commission which included a Sports Institute. A tender was issued requesting the engagement of a consultant to assist in the establishment of the Commission. It is intended for this Commission will take full responsibility for sports inclusive of infrastructure, management and administration. The Ministry itself would then focus on policy development.

Recommendations

- ***The MSYA should provide a status report on the progress made in the establishment of the Sports Commission, inclusive of the proposed structure, cost and how the Commission will more effectively deal with the infrastructure, management and administration of sport by March 14, 2018.***

8. Travel to Tobago

The Committee learned that the MSYA and SPORTT's two-day trip to Tobago was originally carded for the week of May 08, 2017, however, given the opening of the Brian Lara Cricket Academy on May 12, 2017 and the invitation to the Tobago House of Assembly Sports Awards on May 20, 2017, it was decided it would be more cost effective

to combine attendance at the THA Sports Awards with the planned discussions with the THA Division of Sport and Youth Affairs on matters of mutual interest and collaboration. Among the matters discussed were:

- 5th Caribbean Regional Youth Leaders' Summit to be held in Tobago (26th - 30th September 2017);
- Prohibition Notice Issued Pursuant to Section 74 (1) of the Occupational Safety and Health Act, No. 20 of 2004 on the Dwight Yorke Stadium with effect from 19th January 2017;
- Overall State of Disrepair of the Dwight Yorke Stadium inclusive of flooding, lighting and maintenance issues;
- Collaboration with THA for the procurement of Lighting at the Dwight Yorke Stadium;
- National Youth Awards;
- Review and Development of the National Youth Policy;
- CARICOM Youth Ambassador Programme;
- National Youth Organisation Registration;
- National Sport Policy/ Tobago Sport Policy;
- Provision of Sporting Equipment to Pembroke Youth Centre.

Nine (9) Ministry officials were invited and authorised to attend the THA Sports Awards, seven (7) of whom were required for the original trip with regard to meetings with the Division of Sport and Youth Affairs. A request was made to include an additional three (3) persons to attend the Awards.

In the case of SPORTT, three (3) officials attended the Awards and had meetings with the THA.

The trip cost ninety-one thousand, nine hundred and ten dollars and forty-three cents (\$91,910.43) for MSYA and nine thousand, three hundred and fifty-four dollars and ninety-nine cents (\$9,354.99) for SPORTT. The cost was broken down as follows:

Item	MSYA	SPORTT
Travel/ Airfare	\$3,600	\$900
Accommodation	\$77,910.43 (12 persons, 19-22 May, 2017)	\$4,112.99 (3 persons, 1 night) \$2,742 (2 persons, 1 night)
Car Rental	\$10,400 (4 vehicles, 19-22 May, 2017)	\$1600 (1 vehicle, 20-22 May, 2017)
Total	\$91,910.45	\$9,354.99

The Committee learnt that there was no budgeting ceiling established, for costs associated with travel at the MSYA.

The Accounting Officer indicated that value for money was achieved from the Tobago trip. However, the Committee was concerned that no options for accommodation were considered other than the Magdalena Grand Beach and Golf Resort, in spite of the acknowledgement of its high rates. It was further admitted that there was no justification precluding the Ministry from using other accommodation. Based on the Ministry's submission outlining a breakdown of accommodation expenses, the Committee noted that even seemingly mundane items such as juice appeared to amount to significant sums (approximately \$1500 for 9 persons). At the hearing, the Accounting Officer admitted that a bit more prudence should have been exercised with regard to the size of this delegation and the duration of the visit.

Recommendations

- *The Ministry must develop a policy guidelines for cost saving measures for local, regional and international travel for all levels of staff at the Ministry as well as the Permanent Secretary and the Minister. A document outlining these guidelines should be provided to the Committee by March 14, 2018. The policy should include the recommendations detailed below:*

- *The Ministry should ensure that persons embarking on travel are absolutely necessary for the business to be conducted as a means of reducing unnecessary expenditure.*
- *The Ministry should also take immediate steps to institute a ceiling/cap for costs associated with travel, requiring sufficient and proper justification and approvals for any travel that exceeds the limit.*
- *The Ministry of Finance should formulate a Circular on local travel so that Ministries and Departments can be guided accordingly, and excessive spending avoided, More prudence must be exercised.*

CONCLUSION

During the Second Session of the Eleventh Parliament, the PAAC conducted a follow-up examination into the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs with regard to the First Report of the PAAC on an Examination into the Current Expenditure of Ministries and Departments under three (s) Sub-Heads: Current Transfers and Subsidies, Development Programme — Consolidated Fund and Infrastructure Development Fund, in addition to a look at the Ministry's current expenditure for fiscal year 2017 with specific reference to official travel to Tobago. During the course of the examination which consisted of written submissions and a Public Hearing, the Committee followed up on a number of issues emanating from the First Report such as short-term employment, maintenance plans, refurbishment and upgrade of multi-purpose stadia and site visits. The Committee also delved into issues relating to official travel to Tobago and accountability and transparency.

The Committee is of the view that the adoption of its proposed recommendations will lead to greater accountability, transparency and value for money in the use of public funds. Moreover, the Committee intends to monitor the progress made in the implementation of the recommendations proposed in this Report.

This Committee respectfully submits this Report for the consideration of the Parliament.

Sgd.
Mrs. Bridgid Mary Annisette-George
Chairman

Sgd.
Dr. Lackram Bodoe
Vice-Chairman

Sgd.
Mrs. Ayanna Webster-Roy
Member

Sgd.
Ms. Nicole Olivierre
Member

Sgd.
Mr. Ronald Huggins
Member

Sgd.
Mr. Wade Mark
Member

Sgd.
Mr. Daniel Dookie
Member

Sgd.
Ms. Jennifer Raffoul
Member

Sgd.
Mr. Clarence Rambharat
Member

Sgd.
Brig. Gen. (Ret.) Ancil Antoine
Member

APPENDIX I

Questions to Entities

Questions submitted to Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs

Recommendation

The Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs regularizes the persons employed on short-term contract using existing vacancies in the contract employment establishment at the Ministry.

Questions:

1. The Ministry's Ministerial Response stated that "Persons currently on short-term would be afforded the opportunity, via a fair and transparent process, to fill any contract positions".
 - I. How many short-term employees have been hired on contract to date? Provide the necessary documentation.
2. The Ministerial response stated that "the Government Human Resource Services Company (GHRM) has been engaged to fill thirty-seven (37) positions" and that "It is expected that this exercise will be completed and persons retained by end of March 2017".
 - I. Was the exercise completed?
 - II. Were all thirty-seven (37) positions filled?
 - III. How many short-term employees were re-hired on contract following this exercise?
3. According to your Ministerial Response, "A review and rationalization of the Ministry's short term employment is underway as well as the need for any additional positions on the Ministry's Establishment. The Ministry expects to be able to approach the Public Management Consulting Division, Ministry of Public Administration and Communication and the Chief Personnel Officer for assistance in conducting an organizational structure review for the Physical Education and Sport Division by early March 2017".
 - I. What is the status of the review and rationalization exercise?
 - II. What were the findings and recommendation arising from the exercise?
 - III. Did the Ministry approach the Public Management Consulting Division and the Chief Personnel Officer for assistance in conducting an organizational structure review for the Physical Education and Sport Division? If no, why not? If yes, what is the status of the organizational structure review?

Recommendation

Develop a comprehensive maintenance plan for each large sporting facility under its purview which must be custom designed to suit the needs of each facility.

Questions:

1. The Ministerial Response stated that "It is however expected that the Sport Facilities Managers will be hired by the end of March 2017 and the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs in conjunction with the SPORTT is currently in the process of developing a comprehensive maintenance plan that would be custom designed to suit the needs of each facility".

- I. Were the Sport Facilities Managers hired? If yes, when were they hired? If no, why weren't they hired?
- II. Provide a status update on the comprehensive maintenance plan.
- III. Provide evidence that the comprehensive maintenance plan was custom designed to suit the needs of each facility.

Recommendation

Conducts regular site visits as part of maintenance plan for all stadia and large sporting facilities.

Questions:

1. Provide a list of all facilities under the purview of the Ministry and the accompanying number of site visits for each facility for Financial Year 2016-2017 thus far.
2. Provide a copy of the Site Visit Report for each facility visited for Financial Year 2016-2017 thus far.
- 3.

Issues Arising from travel to Tobago House of Assembly (THA) Sports Awards, Question:

1. **Provide** a Report on the attendance of officials of the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs and the **SportTT to the Tobago House of Assembly (THA) Sports Awards** inclusive of:

- a. The purpose of the trip;
- b. The posts/designation of persons authorized to attend;
- c. The number of people authorized to attend;
- d. The names of persons who attended;
- e. The budget for the trip; and
- f. The expenses incurred on the trip.

APPENDIX II

The Inquiry Process

The Inquiry Process

The Inquiry Process outlines steps to be taken by the Committee when conducting an inquiry into an entity or issue. The following steps outlines the Inquiry process followed by the PAAC:

- xii. Identification of entity to be examined;
- xiii. Preparation of Inquiry Proposal for the selected entity. The Inquiry Proposal outlines:
 - Description
 - Background;
 - Overview of Expenditure
 - Rationale/Objective of Inquiry; and
 - Proposed Questions.
- xiv. Consideration and approval of Inquiry Proposals by the Committee and when approved, questions are forwarded to the entity for written responses;
- xv. Issue of requests for written comment from the public are made via Parliament's website, social media accounts, newspaper and advertisements;
- xvi. Preparation of an Issues Paper by the Secretariat for the Committee's consideration, based on written responses received from the entities. The Issues Paper identifies and summarises any matters of concern in the responses provided by the entity or received from stakeholders and the general public;
- xvii. Review of the responses provided and the Issues Paper by the Committee;
- xviii. Conduct of a site visit to obtain a first-hand perspective of the implementation of a project (optional);
- xix. Determination of the need for a Public Hearing based on the analysis of written submissions and the site visit (if required). If there is need for a public hearing, the relevant witnesses will be invited to attend and provide evidence. There is usually no need to examine the entity in public if
- xx. the Committee believes the issues have little public interest; or
- xxi. the Committee believes that the written responses provided are sufficient and no further explanation is necessary.
- xxii. Issue of written request to the entity for further details should the Committee

require any additional information after the public hearing.

- xxiii. Report Committee's findings and recommendations to Parliament upon conclusion of the inquiry.

APPENDIX III

Minutes of Meetings

**THE PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION AND APPROPRIATIONS COMMITTEE -
SECOND SESSION, ELEVENTH PARLIAMENT**

**MINUTES OF THE TWENTY-FOURTH MEETING HELD ON MONDAY JUNE 05, 2017 AT
1:36 P.M.**

**IN THE ARNOLD THOMASOS EAST MEETING ROOM, LEVEL 6, AND THE J. HAMILTON
MAURICE ROOM, MEZZANINE FLOOR, TOWER D, OFFICE OF THE PARLIAMENT,
INTERNATIONAL WATERFRONT CENTRE,
1A WRIGHTSON ROAD, PORT OF SPAIN.**

Present were:

Mrs. Bridgid Mary Annisette-George	Chairman
Dr. Lackram Bodoë	Vice-Chairman
Mr. Maxie Cuffie	Member
Mr. Daniel Dookie	Member
Mr. Wade Mark	Member
Ms. Candice Skerrette	Secretary
Ms. Sheranne Samuel	Assistant Secretary
Mr. Brian Lucio	Parliamentary Intern

Absent were:

Ms. Nicole Olivierre	Member (Excused)
Dr. Dhanayshar Mahabir	Member (Excused)
Mrs. Ayanna Webster-Roy	Member (Excused)
Mrs. Allyson Baksh	Member (Excused)
Mr. Clarence Rambharat	Member

EXAMINATION OF THE MINISTRY OF SPORT AND YOUTH AFFAIRS FOR FISCAL YEAR 2017

- 61 The Chairman called the public meeting to order at 2:34 p.m., in the J. Hamilton Maurice Room, Mezzanine Floor.
- 62 The following officials joined the meeting:

MINISTRY OF SPORT AND YOUTH AFFAIRS

Ms. Natasha Barrow	Permanent Secretary (Ag.)
Ms. Denise Arneaud	Deputy Permanent Secretary
Mr. Ian Ramdahn	Deputy Permanent Secretary

Mr. Jairaj Balliram
Mr. Anthony Blake
Ms. Beatrice Ramlal
Ms. Dianne Rampadarath
Mr. Patrice Charles

Mr. Earland Kent
Ms. Sherry Ann Smith- Simmons

Auditor III
Head of Facilities Management
Administrative Officer V
Senior Planning Officer
Director Physical Education &
Sport
Director, Youth Affairs
Director, Human Resource Services

6.3 The Chairman welcomed officials, members of the media and the public.

6.4 The Chairman outlined the mandate of the Committee and the purpose of the hearing. Introductions were then exchanged.

6.5 The following issues arose from the examination of the Ministry of Sport And Youth Affairs:

Follow-up to First Report of the Committee

Recommendation: Regularize Short term employment

- i. The progress made in reducing the Ministry's reliance on short-term employment;
- ii. The recruitment process used by the Ministry to hire contract employees;
- iii. The difference between short term employment and short term contract;
- iv. The reasons for persons being employed by Government Human Resource Services Company Limited (GHRSC) prior to completion of the Ministry's rationalization of short term employment;
- v. The MSYA non-compliance with the Minister of Finance's directive to end short-term employment;
- vi. The status of the review and rationalization exercise;
- vii. The industrial relation practices followed with respect to the short term employees sent home as a result of the review and rationalization exercise;
- viii. Litigation faced by the MSYA as a result of persons being unemployed due to the review and rationalization exercise;
- ix. The impact of moving during the period September 2016 to February 2017 on the rationalization of short term employment;
- x. The consideration of employing persons under Section 13(5) of the Public Service Regulations;
- xi. The reasons for differences amongst assumption dates for the 9 short term employees that were hired on contract;
- xii. The number of persons employed within the Physical Education and Sport Division; and
- xiii. The human resource capacity of SportTT.

Recommendation: Maintenance Plan for each facility

- i. The employment of OJTs;
- ii. The absence of a National Sport Policy and strategic plan;

- iii. The absence of a maintenance plan for small sport facilities;
- iv. Maintenance plans were done as part of the scope of works for new sport facilities;
- v. The lack of financial resources for maintenance of stadiums;
- vi. Maintenance of stadiums are done on a reactive rather than proactive basis; and
- vii. The rationale for differences in salary and transport amongst sport facility managers. - *Recommendation: Site Visits*

- i. The reasons for site visits not being conducted at the Bastion Youth Centre, the Malick Youth Centre and the Laventille Youth Centre;
- ii. The reason for the absence of official reports of site visits at the Ministry's facilities;
- iii. The absence of a policy that site visits are required;
- iv. The reasons for the disparity in the amount of site visits for certain facilities compared to other facilities;
- v. The tracking mechanisms for operational and maintenance issues that are raised by managers of each facility in the absence of official reports; and
- vi. The processes in place to confirm site visits actually took place in the absence of an official report.

Expenditure related to the Tobago Sport Awards

- i. The impact of three (3) additional persons on trip's expenditure;
- ii. The rationale for the addition of two (2) administrative professionals to the trip;
- iii. The process to approve travel expenditure within Trinidad and Tobago and the absence of a travel expenditure ceiling;
- iv. The reasons for the Public Relations Officer II attending the trip rather than a senior person in the Communication Unit;
- v. The state of the Dwight Yorke Stadium based on site visit;
- vi. The rationale for meeting on the 5th Caribbean Youth Leader Summit;
- vii. The reasons for choice of accommodation at Magdalena Grand versus other hotel accommodations;
- viii. The absence of a whistleblower policy within the Ministry;
- ix. The conditional estimate of \$44 million prepared by a private company for works required at Dwight Yorke Stadium;
- x. The rationale for renting vehicles verses utilizing vehicles from the Tobago House of Assembly or the Central Administrative Services, Tobago;
- xi. The follow up actions to be taken related to Dwight Yorke Stadium subsequent to the site visit; and
- xii. The short term gains to justify the total trip expenditure with respect to the:
 - a. 5th Caribbean Regional Youth Leaders' Summit
 - b. Review and Development of the National Youth Policy;
 - c. National Sport Policy/ Tobago Sport Policy;
 - d. Caricom Youth Ambassador Programme;
 - e. National Youth Organization Registration; and
 - f. Overall State of Disrepair of the Dwight Yorke Stadium.

6.6 The Chairman thanked officials for attending and they were excused.

[Please see the verbatim notes for the detailed oral submission of the witnesses] SUSPENSION

7.1 At 4:48 p.m., the Chairman suspended the *public* meeting to resume *in camera* for a post-hearing discussion with Members only.

RESUMPTION

8.1 At 4:55 p.m. the Chairman resumed the meeting *in camera*.

POST-HEARING DISCUSSION

9.1 The Chairman sought Members' views on the public hearing. The Committee expressed concern with the high number of short-term employees at the Ministry, the delegation size to Tobago and the lack of an official Site Visit Report policy at the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs.

9.2 The Committee agreed that additional questions would be sent to the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs. [Please see Appendix 1]

ADJOURNMENT

10.1 There being no other business, the Chairman adjourned the meeting to **Wednesday June 14, 2017 at 1:30 p.m.** when the Committee would examine the Ministry of Education.

10.2 The adjournment was taken at 5:00 p.m.

We certify that these Minutes are true and correct.

CHAIRMAN

SECRETARY

June 05, 2017

APPENDIX 1

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION REQUESTED FROM
THE MINISTRY OF SPORT AND YOUTH AFFAIRS

Expenditure related to the Tobago Sport Awards

- I. Provide a detailed breakdown of the cost incurred by the Sport Company of Trinidad and Tobago's (SporTT) delegation to Tobago.
- II. Provide a detailed breakdown of the \$88,310.43, which was expended to facilitate the Ministry's delegation to Tobago.
- III. Given the fact that the Ministry exists to provide a service to the public, does the Permanent Secretary give any consideration to public satisfaction when expenditure is incurred?
- IV. Is the Accounting Officer concerned with the issue of confidentiality at the Ministry?
- V. Has the Accounting Officer received any reports on expenditure? If yes, how was the situation dealt with?
- VI. Given the history of expenditure scandals at the Ministry, what is the Accounting Officer doing to improve accountability and transparency at all levels?

Conditional Assessment Report by Pheonix Project Management for Dwight Yorke Stadium

- VII. Was this contract for the Dwight Yorke Stadium tendered? Provide the relevant documentation.
- VIII. What was the bid submitted by Pheonix Project Management's for the tender for this contract?
- IX. Were there other bids? If yes, provide the necessary documentation. If no, why were Pheonix Project Management the only bidders?
- X. What is the total contract cost for the Conditional Assessment Report of the Dwight Yorke Stadium prepared by Pheonix Project Management?
- XI. Approximately, how much would the contract cost, if the SporTT had approached the Urban Development Corporation of Trinidad & Tobago (UDeCOTT)?
- XII. Provide details on the tender process used from the selection of Pheonix Project Management to the finalization of the tender, inclusive of advertisement, tender procedures and award criteria.

Appendix IV

Verbatim

VERBATIM NOTES OF THE FOURTEENTH PUBLIC MEETING OF THE PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION AND APPROPRIATIONS COMMITTEE, HELD IN THE J. HAMILTON MAURICE ROOM, MEZZANINE FLOOR, (IN PUBLIC), OFFICE OF THE PARLIAMENT, TOWER D, THE PORT OF SPAIN INTERNATIONAL WATERFRONT CENTRE, #1A WRIGHTSON ROAD, PORT OF SPAIN, ON MONDAY, JUNE 05, 2017, AT 2.34 P.M.

PRESENT

Mrs. Bridgid Annisette-George	Chairman
Dr. Lackram Bodoë	Vice-Chairman
Mr. Maxie Cuffie	Member
Mr. Daniel Dookie	Member
Mr. Wade Mark	Member
Miss Sheranne Samuel	Assistant Secretary
Miss Candice Skerrette	Procedural Clerk

ABSENT

Dr. Dhanayshar Mahabir	Member
Mrs. Ayanna Webster-Roy	Member
Miss Allyson Baksh	Member
Mr. Clarence Rambharat	Member
Miss Nicole Olivierre	Member

MINISTRY OF SPORT AND YOUTH AFFAIRS

Ms. Natasha Barrow	Permanent Secretary (Ag.)
Ms. Denise Arneaud	Deputy Permanent Secretary
Mr. Ian Ramdahin	Deputy Permanent Secretary
Mr. Jairaj Balliram	Auditor II
Ms. Beatrice Ramlal	Administrative Officer V
Ms. Dianne Rampadarath	Senior Planning Officer
Mr. Patrice Charles	Director Physical Education & Sport

Mr. Earland Kent

Director, Youth Affairs

Ms. Sherry Ann Smith-Simmons

Director, Human **Resource** Services

SPORTS COMPANY OF TRINIDAD AND TOBAGO

Mr. Anthony Blake

Head of Facilities Unit, Sport
Company of T&T

Madam Chairman: Good afternoon, and I want to welcome the officials of the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs, and the Sports Company of Trinidad and Tobago, the members of the media and the members of the public to this fourteenth public meeting of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee. The Committee on Public Administration and Appropriations has a mandate to consider and report to the House on:

- (a) The budgetary expenditure of Government agencies to ensure that expenditure is embarked upon in accordance with parliamentary approval;
- (b) the budgetary expenditure of Government agencies as it occurs, and keeps Parliament informed of how the budget allocation is being implemented; and
- (c) the administration of Government agencies to determine hindrances to their efficiency and to make recommendations to the Government for improvement of public administration.

The purpose of this fourteenth public meeting of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee of the Eleventh Parliament is to follow up with the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs with regard to the first report of the Committee as well as seek further information on the Ministry's current expenditure with specific reference to official travel to attend the Tobago House of Assembly sports award.

The first report of the PAAC entailed an examination of the current expenditure of Ministries and Departments under three Sub-Heads: Current Transfers and Subsidies Development Programme, Consolidated Fund, and Infrastructure Fund.

This meeting is being held in public and will be broadcast live on the Parliament's Channel, Channel 11, radio 105.5 F.M., and the Parliament's YouTube Channel *ParlView*. The Committee is desirous of hearing from the accounting officer and other key officials of the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs to determine whether the Ministry has made progress with regard to the implementation of recommendations arising from the Committee's first report. The Committee is

also seeking to determine any challenges faced in the implementations of the recommendations and to determine possible solutions to these challenges.

The Committee would also look into certain aspects of the Ministry's current expenditure. The role of the Committee is to assist the Ministry to achieve efficient delivery of services while ensuring that expenditure is embarked upon in accordance parliamentary approval.

I will now invite the representatives of the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs and the Sports Company of Trinidad and Tobago to introduce themselves. Madam Permanent Secretary.

[Introductions made]

Madam Chairman: Thank you very much, and **I** would now invite the members of the Committee to introduce themselves.

[Introductions made]

Madam Chairman: **I** will now invite the Permanent Secretary to make a brief opening statement.

Ms. Barrow: Good afternoon again. At the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs for this fiscal 2016/2017, we have continued our efforts at progress through trying to restructure our operations and the manner in which our business is conducted relative to the development of sport in Trinidad and Tobago. Having taken up the mantle of Permanent Secretary in this Ministry in January this year, I have found the task of reviewing the operations and ensuring that the processes and procedures undertaken are being done in accordance with public sector mandates, and it has been challenging to say the least.

However, the progress that has been achieved are proof that perseverance and dedication are key to achieving our goals. It is imperative to know that we are currently undertaking a restructuring process at the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs, and that it is ongoing, and we are at a critical juncture towards organizational change. We plan to pursue elimination, duplication and redundancies, and it is already on the way, and we will be looking at establishing a sport commission in Trinidad and Tobago. This will impact on the overall organizational structure of the Ministry as well as the existing Sports Company, and we hope to have this established before the end of this fiscal year.

The Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs has been operating without a national sport policy since 2012, and that being the year that the existing sport policy had expired and the draft document is being developed right now, and it has been through a series of national consultations. This policy is also expected to be finalized before the end of this fiscal. Now in an

ideal world, the time would

cease and the clock would stop, allowing the Ministry to implement necessary projects which would result in the efficient and productive operations of the Ministry. However, we are not so lucky, and it is that the business of sport and youth does not end. It is in the midst of this implementation of our plans to restructure the organization that the day-to-day operations have been ongoing, and to this end we have different budgetary programmes, projects and initiatives which have been ongoing with the Ministry, trying to do its part towards the successful implementation of Vision 2030.

The Ministry has continued to deliver on its mandate for sport and youth development, and has impacted on a number of initiatives which seek to address the outlined thematic objectives as contained in the Vision 2030. In the area of sport:

- support is given to sporting organizations and athletes through the grand funding policy and elite athlete policy.
- Infrastructure works have continued on recreational and regional grounds around Trinidad and Tobago through the sporTT and are at various stages of completion.
- Upgrading of swimming pools has been ongoing, and a number of patrons are enjoying greater access to our swimming pools, especially with the implementation of the weekend swim, and the same progress is reflected in our indoor arenas with a number of improvement works which have been executed.

Relative in the area of youth development, steps have been taken for the evaluation and development of a youth policy. And again, this process will align the operations of the youth division to the overall landscape for youth in Trinidad and Tobago; implementing a youth-centric focused towards youth development. Refurbishment works have been ongoing. Again, there is a lot of infrastructure that is ongoing within the Ministry, especially at the two youth apprenticeship centres. A number of key initiatives that satisfies both mandates of youth and sport are currently being undertaken by the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs. Two proposals are currently being reviewed and refined for the implementation such as a structured primary and secondary school sports programme. This in turn will become a field programme for the second proposal which constitutes the development of a sport institute in Trinidad and Tobago. Through the conceptual stages, the proposed institute will comprise five or six sporting academies, starting with the Brian Lara Cricket Academy. The academies which are tentatively the disciplines of football, netball, track and field, volley ball, cricket and aquatics, will collectively form the sport institute.

As I said, these are all in the conceptual stages currently, and in an effort to ensure that the ongoing operations a number—not continue—key vacancies have been filled, and the use of short-term employment is being steadily reduced. In the area of commerce and revenue generation, the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs in collaboration with the Ministry of Tourism have embarked on plans to pursue a sport tourism mandate. Focal points for operationalization have been centred on sport services, sport events and sport infrastructure tourism. The sport tourism policy, as developed by the TDC with consultation with the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs, is expected to be finalized in the upcoming months. The rate structure is currently under review, and process for the rental of sport facilities is also in the final stage of completion, of which the naming rights policy which is currently being developed will also be part thereof.

In closing, the Ministry has gone through a dramatic ordeal, and the management as well as the employees have been working to facilitate the day-to-day operations with limited resources. But more so towards restructuring as well as the realignment of the Ministry to the new mandate as stated in Government's policy.

Madam Chairman: Thank you very much, Madam PS. I noted in your opening statement you spoke about short-term employment being steadily reduced, and I would like to open the discussion on that, particularly as it relates to your follow-up submission with respect to a table which shows that in October this would be your short-term employees were 61?

Ms. Barrow: "1-Imm hmm."

Madam Chairman: Yes? So that when you said, persons currently on short-term would be afforded the opportunity via a fair and transparent process to fill any contract positions, you are talking short-term here, you mean short-term contract?

Ms. Barrow: "Hmm hmm."

Madam Chairman: "Hmm hmm", yes. So, in October you would have had 61 persons employed? **Ms. Barrow:** Yes.

Madam Chairman: And it means as of June the Pt you now have 30?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Madam Chairman: So, employed on short-term contract?

Ms. Barrow: No, no, they are now employed on contract.

Madam Chairman: They are now employed on contract?

Ms. Barrow: Yes, three-year contracts.

Madam Chairman: Okay, so what would have happened to the other 31 people?

Ms. Barrow: No, they are still there with the Ministry, however we are still in the process of—we are still going through a recruitment process. What we have done so far is actually just recruited. So, a number of positions which we have listed on the next page, what we basically did is we advertised the positions of Facility Manager, Assistant Facility Manager, the Business Operations Assistants, and we have now finalized those positions and filled them.

Madam Chairman: All right. So, of the 30 positions you filled nine of them were before on short-term contract?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Madam Chairman: So, if my maths is right, 21 other people would have filled the positions?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Madam Chairman: So, how does that fit in with steadily reducing short-term contracts, particularly when you say the other people are still there?

Ms. Barrow: The remainder are still there. The remainder from the 30. All right, we would have had 61 employed on short-term.

Madam Chairman: Yes.

Ms. Barrow: So we now have only 30 persons employed on short-term. The other persons are now—we have regularized.

Madam Chairman: You have regularized how many?

Ms. Barrow: We no longer have 34 positions. We eliminated 34 positions on short-term.

Madam Chairman: You eliminated 34 positions on short-term?

Ms. Barrow: Thirty one, sorry.

Madam Chairman: You eliminated 31?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Madam Chairman: So, those people are no longer there?

Ms. Barrow: Because we no longer have those—those positions were never really created, so what we did we advertised the actual existing contract positions and gave them the opportunity to participate in the recruitment process.

Madam Chairman: Right, and of those 30 only nine were of the original 61?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Madam Chairman: Yes?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Madam Chairman: All right. Thank you, because we needed some explanation with respect to this. I will open the panel for other questions.

Mr. Mark: Madam—

Madam Chairman: Member Mark, sorry, I had seen member Bodoë first, I will take you after. Sorry about that.

Dr. Bodoë: Thank you, Madam Chair. Madam PS, I just want clarification, you said you had 30 I just want to be sure that I understand what you are saying. So, you have 30 people on contract? **Ms. Barrow:** On short-term contracts.

Dr. Bodoë: On short-term contracts. They were 31 from the original 61 remaining. You said that those 31 positions are no longer in existence?

Ms. Barrow: Okay, the short-term employment positions—persons who were employed on short-term, there were no actual positions.

Dr. Bodoë: My question is, are those people still employed by the Ministry or not?

Ms. Barrow: No, they are no longer employed. Nine of the persons, they were successful in obtaining contract employment on a long-term basis.

Dr. Bodoë: So, the 31 of the 61 no longer have jobs in the Ministry?

Ms. Barrow: No.

Dr. Bodoë: Okay, I just wanted to clarify that.

Madam Chairman: Well, it would not be 31 of the 61. It would be 61 minus nine?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Madam Chairman: It would be 61 minus nine—that is how you understand it.

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Dr. Bodoë: Is that correct?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Dr. Bodoë: I am sorry. Because you are saying that 37 positions were filled—if I may refer you, madam Permanent Secretary to page 2 of that submission, 37 positions were filled, seven persons are yet to assume duty, could you clarify that?

Ms. Barrow: They were successful in the interviews, however, you know they would have had to—they were otherwise employed, they would have had to give their own notice.

Dr. Bodoë: But those 37 would not necessarily have been from those 61?

Ms. Barrow: No, no.

Mr. Mark: Madam Chair, I need some clarification. We are being told that there were 30 persons on short-term contract—

Ms. Barrow: Sixty-one.

Mr. Mark: Sixty-one. But you said out of 61 there were nine persons out of 30.

Ms. Barrow: Nine out of 61.

Mr. Mark: Nine out of 61?

Ms. Barrow: Nine of the persons who were employed on short-term—

Mr. Mark: They were retained?

Ms. Barrow: Were retained.

Mr. Mark: Right. How many people initially were employed on short-term?

Ms. Barrow: Sixty-one.

Mr. Mark: Sixty-one. And out of the 61, only nine were retained.

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Mr. Mark: So, where the rest have gone?

Ms. Barrow: They are no longer employed with the Ministry as they participated in a recruitment exercise. They went through interviews and through GHRS.

Mr. Mark: But, that company has died?

Ms. Barrow: This is before that?

Mr. Mark: Is it still alive?

Mr. Cuffie: At that time.

Mr. Mark: Oh, at that time it was alive. They have since passed on? *[Laughter]* No, I am trying to get clarification on the matter, Madam Chair. What prompted the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs to embark on a new recruitment exercise that resulted in only nine of the original 61 persons being retained? And, what was the process of recruitment that you embarked upon to ensure that there was proper transparency in this exercise? In other words, Madam Chair, I am asking, okay, you would have had a panel to interview people, not so?

Ms. Barrow: No, we utilized the services of GHRS to do the recruitment process for the Ministry. **Mr. Mark:** They are the ones who did what, you are now proposing or suggesting?

Ms. Barrow: "Hmm

Madam Chairman: Maybe, Madam Permanent Secretary, if we ask a little more questions we

will be clear, and I think what is creating some of our confusion is maybe the information—what we have been told here, is 30 persons in the department/unit listed below are retained on short-term contract as of June 01, 2017. So that, I think it is the wording that is creating some confusion with us. Because, it would appear from what you said, you now have 30 people who are on contract.

Ms. Barrow: Short-term.

Madam Chairman: On short-term. So, what were the positions that have been—well, I do not want to use the word "positions" because you just said those were not positions. The 61 people were on what?

Ms. Barrow: The total 61 were on short-term employment.

Madam Chairman: Short-term employment. And therefore to help the Committee, could you tell us what is the difference between short-term employment and short-term contract?

Ms. Barrow: Okay. So, short-term employment is when the Permanent Secretary gives approval to engage a person on short-term employment. Contract employment in the public service is normally a three-year contract. It is between one to three years, and it would have had Cabinet approval, where they would have created positions and it is part of the organizational structure.

Madam Chairman: And that contract employment is called short-term even though it is one to three years?

Ms. Barrow: It is not short-term. That is not short-term. That is contract employment. That is normal long-term contract employment. They used to work long term but no more than three years. **Madam Chairman:** Right, so we come back again. You had 61 in October?

Ms. Barrow: Right.

Madam Chairman: You now have 30 in June?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Madam Chairman: These would not have been the people who would have filled positions? **Ms. Barrow:** Nine of them did fill some of the positions.

Madam Chairman: Right.

Ms. Barrow: Because they went through the process. Everybody had an opportunity to go through the process, nine of them were successful and would have been given three-year contracts. **Madam Chairman:** And what happened to the 52?

Ms. Barrow: Fifty-two?

Madam Chairman: Of the 61?

Ms. Barrow: "Or ho", right. So, we have not finished filling all of our contract positions. So we only had 37 vacancies that we filled so far.

Madam Chairman: And you still have not answered my question, what has happened to the 52?

Ms. Barrow: Of the 52? *[Interruption]* Right, so of the 52, 21 are no longer with the Ministry and 30 are still with the Ministry employed on short-term.

Madam Chairman: Those 30 people, are those who are employed for six months and under?

Ms. Barrow: Yes, that is what is supposed to happen.

Madam Chairman: Right. We know that does not happen in fact, that people serve the six months and it is renewed, and renewed, and renewed, okay?

Ms. Barrow: All right.

Madam Chairman: And that is what generated the recommendation that you regularize persons employ on these six months and fill existing vacancies on the contract employment. All right?

Ms. Barrow: "Hcrim Imun."

Madam Chairman: What you are saying is you went through an exercise, and of the 61 people you had on these six-month employment terms, of that, nine you converted into contracts?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Madam Chairman: Agreed?

Ms. Barrow: "I-1mm hmm."

Madam Chairman: Between one to three years, or three-year contracts?

Ms. Barrow; Yes.

Madam Chairman: And those would be the nine people who are really Business Operations Assistant, Assistant Facility Manager, Facility Manager, et cetera?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Madam Chairman: Okay. All right. So that you would have been left with 52, you say now of the 52, 21 are no longer with you.

Ms. Barrow: "Hmm hmm."

Madam Chairman: Okay, 30 continue on the short-term employment, which is the six months?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Madam Chairman: Now, you just told us something about 34 positions were retired? What is that?

Ms. Barrow: No, not retired.

Madam Chairman: No? So, the way how it is stated is exactly as it is?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Madam Chairman: So, you still have 30 people who are on current six-month employment?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Madam Chairman: All right. Member Cuffie.

Mr. Cuffie: Afternoon, PS, are you aware of a directive from the Ministry of Finance to bring an **end** to short-term employment?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Mr. Cuffie: And how do you account for the fact that you still have 30 persons on short-term employment?

Ms. Barrow: We are trying to ensure that we do not end up with industrial relations—or at least we try to employ proper industrial relations practices by reducing it, by making sure that we offer persons the opportunity for contract employment or other opportunities.

Mr. Cuffie: I am not sure that there is an industrial relations issue because persons on short-term employment, they are really on offer for services, and when you try to fill these positions, I assume that anyone who wishes to apply should have an opportunity to become engaged. So, are you saying that the procurement process or the recruitment process is aimed at giving these 30 persons an opportunity to become fully engaged in the Ministry?

Ms. Barrow: As far as I am aware, a lot of these persons were engaged for a longer period than just six months, and some of them even went back as far as two to three years. I do know that there are a number of different court matters before the Industrial Court with regard to whether or not these persons are currently employed on long-term employment or whether or not they are entitled to different benefits.

3.00 p.m.

On short-term employment you are not entitled to certain things like, for example, any kind of leave or any kind of—and we have had cases where persons have taken or written, trying to take us to court with regard to basically just terminating their employment without any due process. **Mr. Cuffie:** Okay, so you have gotten legal advice on this—

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Mr. Cuffie:—in terms of the way forward?

Ms. Barrow: Well, what we have been doing is that we have been systematically trying to recruit persons through a proper process of contract employment.

Madam Chairman: Madam PS just, I just have two other questions so that we will be totally clear. We have one person missing from the 61. What has happened to that? Twenty-one were sent home, 30 remain on short-term employment, nine were converted into contracts. So we have one person missing.

Ms. Barrow: I will have to confirm the figures, but I think it is just our maths.

Madam Chairman: All right, okay. Let me ask something. In terms of the 30 who have remained and the explanation that you just gave to member Cuffie, in your response it was stated and I am reading what I have seen here:

It is to be noted that a number of persons previously retained on short-term were not subjected to participate in any recruitment process and in some instances they—1 expect it will be—in some instances they did not possess the minimum qualification and experience for the job function they are currently performing.

What has happened to these people who would have fitted into this statement?

Ms. Barrow: Let me ask my director of **HR**.

Ms. Smith-Simmons: These persons would have been allowed—being part of the organization already, would have been allowed to go through the process with the other qualified persons in order to justify their "retainance". The fact that they did not obtain a position on the order merit list meant that they were not successful and as such were not offered contract employment.

Madam Chairman: So that they are no longer with you all or are they still there on short-term?

Ms. Smith-Simmons: They are no longer with us as of 31 May, 2017.

Madam Chairman: As of 31 May, 2017?

Ms. Smith-Simmons: Yes.

Madam Chairman: So that, of the 30 that are left, are people whom you feel would be able to fit into the organization?

Ms. Smith-Simmons: Of the 30 persons, those persons are persons who—we have approached Service Commissions Department for vacancies within the establishment and they have not been able to give us those persons. So we have secured persons on a short-term basis in order to maintain, for instance, the aquatic officers in the pools in order to provide the ready service needed by the Ministry.



Madam Chairman: What officers you said that was?

Ms. Smith-Simmons: Aquatic officers.

Madam Chairman: Oh sure, sorry.

Mr. Mark: Through you, Madam Chair. You did indicate, Madam Permanent Secretary, that the Ministry was undertaking a review and rationalization of its short-term employment. I am further to understand that that exercise is still to be completed? Am I right?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Mr. Mark: Well why, if that exercise is to be completed, why did we employ the human resource company to exercise this, to engage this company to conduct interviews involving all those persons who were on short-term contracts? And in that interviewing process some were eliminated, because as you said, they did not fit qualification, experience and they seemed to be square pegs in round holes. And at the same time, the review and rationalization exercise for short-term employment at the Ministry is not yet completed, because I would have thought that you would have had the review first and out of that report they would have indicated, well look, we only need X number of persons and you have 61, so all you need is 31. Therefore you do not have the resources to conduct the interviews so you engage a consultant firm, the company, Government Human Resource Services Company Limited. I am trying to understand whether the action taken was a bit premature having regard to what you have stated in your document. What was this review and rationalization of short-term employment about? I am not too clear. Could you explain that to us?

Ms. Barrow: Okay. The Ministry has the peculiar division which is the Physical Education and Sport Division which has some positions and the type of positions that are in that division are somewhat outdated and it has been difficult to recruit persons or to determine what type of positions we actually need in that division. The short-term rationalization I believe, when we say we have not finished it, is more along the lines of that particular division because a lot of the short-term is actually in the swimming pools and the indoor arenas. So we are really trying—we really do not want to keep back the entire process of making sure that we have adequate resources at these different facilities because we were very clear that we understood that we needed to have Facility Managers and Assistant Facility Managers. Business Operations Assistants are more or less across the public service. So what we have not finished really is the peculiar positions that may be under the Ministry that we currently have on that—that when we are talking about actually

rationalizing how we want to go about it and we really have not approach PMCD as yet with regard to acquiring the assistance to help us with that undertaking.

Mr. Mark: Madam Chair, would you want to share with us what is the establishment or the number of personnel employed in the Physical Education and Sport Division, the overall number of personnel employed?

Ms. Smith-Simmons: There are approximately 111 offices of which 46 positions are substantively filled and there are 55 vacancies.

Mr. Mark: And out of that 100, how many of them are on short-term employment within that division?

Ms. Smith-Simmons: The short-term personnel is not on the permanent establishment. The short-term personnel seek to fill the void that the vacancies have left.

Mr. Mark: Do you have any short-term employment or personnel in this division, outside of the numbers that you have just given us, the 100 and above?

Ms. Smith-Simmons: The 111 is established positions. The short-term would be 26 persons.

Mr. Mark: Twenty-six. Can you, through the Chairman—so in that division we have 26 short-term employees. Is that right? Am I correct?

Ms. Smith-Simmons: Just making a quick adjustment.

Mr. Mark: Okay.

Ms. Barrow: Let me just answer, if you look back on the first page of our report we did have under the director of physical education and sport, 19 positions currently on short-term. That is under the sport division.

Mr. Mark: Ninety or 19?

Ms. Barrow: Nineteen, 19.

Mr. Mark: Okay. Could you advise this Committee how soon you would be embarking on this review and rationalization exercise?

Ms. Smith-Simmons: We have in fact had consultation with PMCD today. We had initially engaged their services last year but because of our relocation efforts from September to February of this year we were not able to have any meeting. So we have scheduled a meeting with PMCD for later this month, a date has not been assigned.

Mr. Mark: Could I further ask, Madam Chair, do you have representation going back to the Government Human Resource Services Company Limited that has now expired, but whilst they

were living, could you tell me, would you have had representation on the panel that were responsible for interviewing, recruiting and then making a final determination as to who should stay and who should go. Would the Ministry of Sport have representation on that panel?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Mr. Mark: Could you explain to *us*—*[Interruption]*

Ms. Barrow: They participated as a panel member in all the interviews.

Mr. Mark: So how many people comprised the panel?

Ms. Barrow: Three persons.

Mr. Mark: Three persons.

Ms. Barrow: One person from the Ministry.

Mr. Mark: Okay. And the actual interviews were taking place at the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs or would it be at the offices?

Ms. Barrow: At GI-IRS.

Mr. Mark: Okay.

Dr. Bodoë: Thank you, Madam Chair. Madam PS, if I could refer again to the follow-up report and draw your attention to page 3, and that recommendation is:

To develop a comprehensive maintenance plan for each large sporting facility under its purview which must be custom-designed to suit the needs of each facility.

And if we can just turn the page, the first paragraph reads:

With regard to Sports Company of Trinidad and Tobago has advised that a revised organizational structure...

—and so on. But I am asking here in the interim, you are stating that sports has recruited, through the OJT programme, suitable qualified individuals in the area of clerical officers, engineers and technicians. My question, Madam PS: Is that how many of these positions have been filled? How were they filled and for how long these positions would have been filled?

Mr. Blake: Good afternoon to the Committee. Anthony Blake, Sports Company. As so far as Sports Company is concerned for the member's question, we would have recruited, as stated here, suitable qualified officials or individuals from the OJT programme based on the fact that the organizational structure is not yet approved for the new national centres. We have had some of the OJTs with us for, in excess of 18 months, training as clerical officers, engineering staff and so on. Our maintenance contractor, the design/build contractor has provided us with a training plan for the

new national facilities in terms of maintenance and operations and the existing staff at sports company engineering team along with our OJT professionals have been training alongside the engineering team.

Dr. Bodoë: And that is, through you, Madam Chair, fine. I am just wondering in terms of numbers. **Mr. Blake:** Sure. We at this point in time in terms of administrative staff, we have approximately 20 individuals training from the OJT programme. We also have in terms of the engineering team, we have six engineering technicians from the OJT Programme. We have also recruited recently for engineering professionals and technicians, we have approximately 400 people shortlisted so far that have responded and we are going through the due diligence exercise to get these people properly vetted and so on?

Dr. Bodoë: And these would be for how many engineering positions?

Mr. Blake: The engineering positions are approximately 20 positions.

Dr. Bodoë: So 400 applications for 20 positions.

Mr. Blake: Yes, Sir.

Dr. Bodoë: I am just trying to put it in perspective.

Mr. Blake: Sure.

Dr. Bodoë: Thank you.

Mr. Dookie: Thank you, Madam Chair. For my own clarification and to help me with a little confusion in my mind, to the acting Permanent Secretary, did you say a while ago that a number of short-term employees have been employed in the Ministry for a number of years?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Mr. Dookie: And generally what would account for that? Short-term means, by definition. Could you help me with that?

Ms. Barrow: A number of positions, as far as I am aware, a number of positions would have expired and in order to ensure that the Ministry's work continued, persons would have been reengaged on a short-term basis while the Ministry continued to seek to have the positions retained. I am going to ask my director, HR, if she could provide any further clarification and any other reasons.

Ms. Smith-Simmons: As I said before Service Commissions—for instance, we have approached Service Commissions for personnel for peculiar positions and they were not able to give us those persons. So we had to recruit persons in order to meet the needs of the Ministry in those areas.

Mr. Dookie: I am trying to get—an employee who has been employed under as you term it, short-term employment which from your definition is different from short-term contract. So he or she is employed for less than six months initially?

Ms. Smith-Simmons: Six months maximum is what it is supposed to be.

Mr. Dookie: Six months or less. But you are saying that in a number of cases that particular employee would have been employed for a number of years.

Ms. Smith-Simmons: Would have been, yes.

Mr. Dookie: And the explanation you would have given, you are telling me that is what would have accounted for—

Ms. Smith-Simmons: Would have accounted, would have been—contract positions would have expired and the services were needed and they had not yet approach Cabinet for renewals or in some cases the six-year plan which the previous administration had required were not approved. So persons were retained under those conditions.

Mr. Dookie: Is there a specific policy in the Ministry regarding short-term employment. **Ms. Smith-Simmons:** No, there is not any.

Mr. Cuffie: Thank you, Madam Chair. PS, have you considered, in terms of the peculiar positions, approaching the Director of Personnel Administration to recruit persons under section 13(5) of the Public Service Regulations?

Ms. Smith-Simmons: Yes, we have. For most of our peculiar positions, we had requested them to advertise and do the necessary recruitment process. They have started with some. For instance, they advertised the Physical Education Sport Officer 1 sometime earlier this year, but the other offices they have not yet addressed.

Mr. Cuffie: I understand that. What I was seeking to find out is whether you would have sought the approval of the commission so that the Ministry itself could recruit four peculiar positions under that regulation.

Ms. Barrow: No, we have not.

Ms. Smith-Simmons: No, we have not.

Mr. Cuffie: Okay.

Dr. Bodo: Thank you, Madam Chair. Madam PS, if I could draw your attention to page 5 of
your

submission with regard to the site visits and I have two questions there. One is with regard to

the
youth centres and I note that there are three centres there listed where no visits were
conducted,

Basilon Youth Centre, the Malick Youth Centre and the Laventille Youth Centre. Can you perhaps explain to the Committee why this is so?

Ms. Barrow: This was at the time of when—we are currently now undertaking to do site visits at the different areas. So it is just that we have not reach to these as yet.

Dr. Bodoë: So I take it that will be done during the course of the financial year?

Ms. Barrow: Yeah, within this financial.

Dr. Bodoë: Thank you. Madam PS, the other thing I am concerned about here would be just following those listings, there is a statement saying that there are no official reports on the site visits conducted at the Ministry's facilities. Can you tell this Committee if that in fact is so?

Ms. Barrow: That is the case. What has been happening is that it is not an official site report that I can produce for you. What has been happening is that they have been undertaking the different issues raised and when they do the site visits and they actually—because a lot of the things are ongoing, we have been trying to effect different repairs, different upgrades as we go along. So I did have this conversation with our project unit and I have instructed them that we have to have site reports for every site visit.

Dr. Bodoë: I am a little bit concerned about that, Madam PS. I mean, how can you be expending funds? Because I am sure certain expenditure will be involved here in terms of dealing with the operation and maintenance issues and so on. So are you saying that there is no policy at all for you to receive a report of a site visit?

Ms. Barrow: No, there is not. But what they had been doing is that they would refer to the site visit in the recommendation or in the proposal for the different upgrades or the different maintenance that needed to happen at the different facilities.

Dr. Bodoë: But then whose responsibility it would be to correct that situation going forward? And how soon can I expect that to be corrected?

Ms. Barrow: As I said, I did instruct our project unit with regard to all of the different site visits, that they would be expected to produce a site visit report for each of them.

Dr. Bodoë: So this Committee can take it that that will be the process going forward.

Ms. Barrow: Yes, it will.

Dr. Bodoë: Thank you.

Madam Chairman: Might I ask going forward from when? When was the last site visit report with any one of these centres?

Ms. Barrow: So the site visit report, we do have one for the Dwight Yorke Stadium which we did do.

Madam Chairman: So that will be the first one based on your instructions. So **that**, with what confidence can the statement be made that operational and maintenance issues which have been raised by managers of each facilities are dealt with? If there is no report to say what was found, what corrective action is going to be taken, then how can one say this with any sort of confidence.

Ms. **Barrow:** And I agree. It needed to happen so that the reports, that we can follow the reports and we can track the progress because otherwise we would just be outing fires all the time.

Madam Chairman: Okay, is there a schedule for these visits?

Ms. **Barrow:** Not as yet. We were supposed to come up with a schedule.

Madam **Chairman:** So when you mean not as yet? So you mean for—we are all into nearly the end of the fiscal 2017 and some, I see here, Eastern Regional Indoor Sports Arena, 10 visits; La Horquetta swimming pool, 10 visits; Cocoyea swimming pool, 20; South-West Regional Indoor Sport Arena, 10. Then you have like, Sangre Grande swimming pool, 2. So for all of these, these are on schedule?

Ms. Barrow: Yes, they would have been based on needs that might have been arising at the different facilities. As I said it was being done very ad hoc which we are trying to change now.

Madam Chairman: I just want to ask one question of Ms. Smith-Simmons. Just going back and then therefore I will invite other members. This is in respect to the Physical Education and Sport Division that has a little confusion in my mind that I need cleared up. We were told that the organizational structure review which was supposed to be March 2017 has not been completed.

Ms. Smith-Simmons: No, it has not.

Madam Chairman: Okay. We were also told that you all had not consulted PMCD and CPO on any assistance because until you finish your own process of rationalization you would not go to them.

Ms. Smith-Simmons: Yes, correct.

Madam Chairman: Yes? But I thought and I might have been mistaken a short while ago you had said that a meeting with PMCD was scheduled.

Ms. Smith-Simmons: Last year when Ms. Mendez was here she had written to PMCD informing them of the need for the Ministry to review its organizational chart. They had in fact responded requesting some information which we have provided. However, the last communication was

about November of last year and at that time we were in the process of moving so nothing happened between November of last year and this year. But what we have done is, we have engaged the heads of divisions to determine what the needs of the individual units and divisions are. For instance, we have also looked at the Physical Educational and Sport Officer, JD, as well as the org chart and a revised org chart for Physical Educational Sport Division. What we have not done was had a consultation with PMCD on the matter and CPO.

Madam Chairman: This consultation was based on the fact that you were not moving and not because you had not finished your own internal determination?

Ms. Smith-Simmons: Right.

Madam Chairman: So this answer then is not a correct answer then? I just want to get it straight in my head.

Ms. Smith-Simmons: It is just that it was not completed. It was asked if it was completed. We were in the process, but we have not completed it.

Madam Chairman: That is your review?

Ms. Smith-Simmons: The review.

Madam Chairman: The consultation with PMCD and CPO, from what you are telling me, could have been done even though your review was not completed?

Ms. Smith-Simmons: It could not have been done because we were moving from September to February, it was the only time in which we would have had access to files and documentation.

Madam Chairman: All right. So that therefore my understanding is, what prevented that from taking place was the moving—

Ms. Smith-Simmons: Exactly.

Madam Chairman: And the whole dislocation—

Ms. Smith-Simmons: Correct.

Madam Chairman: And not that the process had to go in a particular sequence.

Ms. Smith-Simmons: No.

Madam Chairman: Okay, good. All right. So we will now have member Cuffie.

Mr. Cuffie: Madam PS, I just want to go back to the site visits to the facilities. When I look at the table I get a different impression because I know where the Ministry of Sport is and was and the Basilon Youth Centre, the Malick Youth Centre and the Laventille Youth Centre, I would think are the facilities closest to the Ministry but yet they received no visits. And the St. James Youth

Centre got 20 visits and the Cocoyea swimming pool got 20 visits. Now, would somebody be able to say, what was the nature of the problems that would have led to these getting so many visits and no visits to Basilon, Malick or Laventille which all fall in the same area, an area that is close to the Ministry's office?

Ms. Barrow: What I can say is that I can provide you with the actual documentation with regard to the actual physical infrastructure that—but I do know that at these particular facilities that infrastructure projects were being undertaken and carried out which necessitated repeat visits, not necessarily that they were being targeted in particular. I do not have the actual infrastructure that might have been carried out at the facilities.

Mr. Cuffie: So am I to assume that there were no problems, no issues in Malick, Laventille or Basilon Street?

Ms. Barrow: I would not assume that. I would say that it is just that it did not necessitate maybe a site visit.

Mr. Dookie: Picking up from where member Cuffie left off in terms of site visits. Is it that site visit only occur if there is infrastructural work taking place, because I kind of glean that from your answer. The infrastructure work.

Ms. Barrow: Only if there is either maintenance—

Mr. Dookie: Infrastructure work.

Ms. Barrow: Maintenance and infrastructure work.

Mr. Dookie: That site visits are made.

Ms. Barrow: At present, that is what is happening.

Mr. Dookie: So therefore, if there is no works like that ongoing, then there will be no visits to the—

Ms. Barrow: Right, so that is what is happening. What I am saying is that right now, what the Ministry is embarking, we are trying to do site visits at all these different facilities, it is just that we have not reached to the three that have not had site visits as yet.

Madam Chairman: Member Bodoë. I will take you after, member Mark.

Dr. Bodoë: Thank you, Madam Chair. Madam PS, there is something that is troubling me about these site visits and I want to go back to a very fundamental issues. What process is there for you to assure yourself as the accounting officer in the Ministry that these site visits in fact take place? Because that is the question that comes to my mind in view of the perceived—I do not want to use

the word "irregularities". If you can tell us what process is in place to give yourself assurance that these are actually taking place and of course by extension the taxpayer?

3.30 p.m.

Ms. Barrow: I completely agree with you, which is why, as I said, we only recently instituted the fact that all the different site visits we need to have site visit reports, and they are being linked to the different issues and the maintenance issues that we do have at the different— We do collaborate with the different facility managers with regard to the problems and the different maintenance issues that might be at the different facilities, but other than that right now, no, there was no reconciliation with that.

Dr. Bodoë: But the point I am making, Madam PS, is a fundamental point. What assurance do you have the visits actually take place? Is there somebody who reports back to someone under you? I am not talking about the lack of a report. That is a completely different matter. I am speaking to the actual performance of a site visit, how do you have the assurances that somebody actually went on site? Is that documented in some way? That is what I am asking.

Ms. Barrow: It would be with the facility managers and they would normally report to their individual directors, which is the Director of Physical Education and Sport, and the Director of Youth.

Dr. Bodoë: All right. So there is assurance that these visits have actually taken place?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Dr. Bodoë: Thank you.

Mr. Mark: Thank you, Madam Chair. I want to go back to the short-term employment and to ask the PS, maybe the Human Resource Manager, in light of the fact that many of the workers who have been sent home were on short-term contracts, short-term employment I should say, may have worked for the Ministry, or at the Ministry, for a considerable period of time because remember, as the Chairman said earlier, these things tend to roll over, six months, another six months. So you may have somebody on short-term contract, or short-term employment to capture the concept properly, and they may go to, as I said over five years, would you say that there is an absence of proper industrial relations practice on your part, or on the Ministry's part, to have had these people working for so long and then through a recruitment process they are disposed of? When these people were sent home, were they given any kind of benefits, or their services just came to an end? Could you explain to us?

Ms. Barrow: Persons were given one month's notice with regard to the fact that the contracts would have been coming to an end, but prior to that it would have been, while they were participating in the recruitment process they would have known that we would not be retaining persons after we had filled the contract positions. So they would have known in advance that if they were not successful in the recruitment process that they would no longer be retained.

Mr. Mark: But were they offered any— Did you meet with the CPO on these matters to determine whether these workers who have been there for five years and above on short-term employment ought to be given some kind of compassionate gratuity as they depart the services, or the employment of the Ministry?

Ms. Barrow: I did not seek the advice of the CPO Department in this particular instance in this Ministry, but I am aware that the CPO Department is working on a short-term employment policy with regard to that area.

Mr. Mark: Madam Chair, I just would like to ask the Permanent Secretary, do you have a strategic plan?

Ms. Barrow: Not at the moment. We are looking at creating a strategic plan, but it hinges on both the youth policy, as well the sport policy, as well as the administrative reform that I spoke about before, because even though we may look— What we have done at our heads meetings we try to look at a kind of one-year action plan at least in the interim, but we did not want to sit down and do an entire strategic plan without having the youth policy and the sport policy clearly defined. **Mr. Mark:** Well that explains some of the challenges that you are faced with because you seem to be taking decisions, as the youths would say, on the fly, and you have a situation where you do not have a sports policy, you do not have a strategic plan. You indicated here that you are going to develop a comprehensive maintenance plan, but there is no—I should ask rather, have you developed a comprehensive maintenance plan thus far?

Ms. Barrow: Not for the smaller facilities. We have been liaising with SporTT with regard to the development of an actual maintenance plan for the larger facilities including the stadiums, because as you know the Dwight Yorke Stadium is also under the Ministry. So what we have planned to do is link that because we did note that there was a recommendation with regard to it being specific to the different facilities as the recommendation by the Committee. So we do want to do that. So we have been working with the SporTT to try to develop a maintenance plan that is specific to the different individual facilities themselves.

Mr. Mark: So we are now liaising with the Sports Company with a view to developing a comprehensive maintenance plan for the larger sporting facilities? So prior to you, when I say you, as PS, liaising with the Sports Company, we do not have a maintenance plan. That explains the state of the Dwight Yorke Stadium today, and it means to say that the taxpayers are not really getting value for their money because they have invested a lot of money in all these facilities.

What assurances do we have that the aquatic centre, the tennis court, the cycling centre, would not meet the same fate as the Dwight Yorke Stadium after the taxpayers have spent hundreds of millions of dollars? I am not being given the assurance by you, or your team, that anything is being done with any degree of emergency to develop quickly a comprehensive maintenance plan for all of our large facilities. What you have just told us is that you are liaising, when would we able to get from the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs, and the Sports Company, a comprehensive maintenance plan?

Madam Chairman: So, Member Mark, do I take it that there are two questions? One, the assurance that the National Aquatic Centre and the tennis centre and so do not suffer the fate like the Dwight Yorke Stadium? So that the Permanent Secretary will answer what is the difference with those. And then also the second question would be that we would like to know when the Ministry would have a comprehensive maintenance plan.

Mr. Mark: Thank you.

Ms. Barrow: Okay. I am going to let Mr. Blake from SporTT answer that, but I do know that there are maintenance plans that have been developed for the larger facilities. What I had said is that our smaller facilities within the Ministry, we are now liaising with SporTT to develop maintenance plans for these smaller facilities like the swimming pools, and the indoor arenas, but I will let Mr. Blake—

Madam Chairman: And when Mr. Blake answers, maybe he could distinguish for us what are these mega facilities, vis-à-vis what are the nationals, vis-à-vis what are the smaller facilities.

Mr. Blake: Thank you, Chair. So with regard to the facilities under the Sports Company of Trinidad and Tobago, I want to give the Committee the assurance that we do have fully ventilated maintenance plans for them, and as the chairperson would have asked, the Nationals are the Aquatic Centre, Cycling Centre, the Racquet Centre, Sangre Grande indoor. What would have been done is during the design-build contract part of the scope for the contractor was to develop maintenance plans for these facilities. So the design-build contractor has been contracted

during

the defects liability period to provide maintenance services on these facilities. A copy of the maintenance plans have been supplied to the Committee here. So I want to give you the assurance again that the Nationals under the Sports Company have the maintenance plans in place and we are well on the way in terms of the maintenance cycles at these facilities.

With regard to the larger facilities, which are the National Stadium in Port of Spain, the Dwight Yorke Stadium, the Larry Gomes Stadium, Manny Ramjohn Stadium and Ato Boldon Stadium, these facilities were handed over to Sports Company approximately seven to eight years ago from the Ministry of Sport. I want to say what we would have done in the initial phase is a preliminary conditional assessment because any good maintenance plan, at the backbone of that is a conditional assessment. It would give you the scope of works and the budget to be able to move forward to upgrade these facilities and put them in a maintainable state.

We have also supplied, for this Committee, through the Permanent Secretary in the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs, a copy of the conditional assessments for the existing national stadia at this point in time and, as I said, that conditional assessment also contains budgetary estimates to bring these facilities up to a maintainable state. The maintenance plan now for the national stadia, Larry Gomes and the others, can only be put in place properly when we have the upgrade done to the facility. Part of the challenge that the Sports Company has had is the allocation of funding towards maintenance.

You see we must first upgrade the facilities to a maintainable state and then put the maintenance plan in place. A lot of the assets, for instance, in the Hasely Crawford Stadium have passed their serviceable life. So it is not an issue of a maintenance plan for a generator that is 20 years passed its serviceable life, it is actually capital replacement of assets and then putting your maintenance plan in place. Thank you.

Mr. Cuffie: Thank you, Madam Chair. Mr. Blake, you mentioned earlier that those facilities were handed over seven years ago. When I look at the report on the Dwight Yorke Stadium, it suggests that the issues would have been occurring for some time before 2017 or 2016 when the financial issues became tighter. So in those seven years what was being done to ensure that the Dwight Yorke Stadium did not fall into the kind of disrepair that the OSH report suggests because if you are spending time doing an assessment, the assessment could not have taken seven years. There must have been work taking place in terms of the maintenance of Dwight Yorke Stadium over those years that would have prevented the kind of report that we are seeing here for the facility.

Mr. Blake: So I want to agree with you, Sir. Just to say that the Dwight Yorke Stadium itself is not under the Sports Company, but I would attempt to answer the question. In my experience there has been a lack of—how should I say—impetus in terms of maintenance admittedly from the Ministries and the Sports Company's standpoint. Resources determine where your focus is, and if you look at the allocation in terms of the resources for maintenance that has not been there.

Even in the time before the 2017, 2016 and so on, a large part of the maintenance has been reactive per se and I would say that admittedly because of the funding that was allocated to it at the point in time. The Ministry personnel may be able to elucidate. They may have a lot more institutional memory for the exact facility itself, but admittedly maintenance in those larger facilities for some time has been very reactive and that needs to be changed.

Mr. Dookie: Thank you, Madam Chair. Mr. Blake you indicated that there are maintenance plans in place for the larger facilities based on the contractual agreement with the relevant contractors. So the plans are in place. Are we equipped, or are you equipped, or your organization, to ensure that these plans can be successfully operationalized because the plans are there? To make sure that the plans are implemented, do you have, for example, the technical capability and/or other resources to ensure that what is on paper can be operationalized?

Mr. Blake: So at this point in time the maintenance plans are being operationalized, but I would have to say it is basically being operationalized through the good graces of the design-build contractor. We still struggle at this point in time in terms of resources for maintenance, and you are so correct in terms of the technical expertise and so on. I would have mentioned earlier that we have looked at the OJT Programme as a stop gap measure to recruit qualified professionals and so on, but we really need the resources. Money is not the cure for everything, but it does help. If we get the resources we will be able to recruit the qualified people and so on. So we do need help admittedly.

Dr. Bodoë: Thank you, Madam Chair. Madam PS, in your opening remarks you mentioned the Sport Commission of Trinidad and Tobago and a sport institute, and you did mention what would comprise the sport institute. Can you perhaps tell the Committee just an idea of what would be the difference between the commission and the sport institute in terms of how they will function?

Ms. Barrow: The sport institute would be part of the Sport Commission. So it would fall under the Sport Commission. What we are trying to do is actually move it forward because we are still in the process right now of going to look at what the actual structure would be like. For the Sport

Commission, I know right now the tender did go out with regard to the engagement of a consultant—a consultancy firm—to help establish the Sport Commission, and the sport institute would actually fall under the commission.

Dr. Bodoë: What would be the purpose of the Sport Commission, the overall visions sort of?

Ms. Barrow: It would take over responsibility for sports in its entirety. So the Ministry would now be more in a position to look at policy rather than things like the actual infrastructure, the management and the administration of sport.

Dr. Bodoë: So you are saying it would be more of an implementation organization? Is that what you are saying?

Ms. Barrow: It would take that too, but it would also be an overarching body.

Dr. Bodoë: I just wanted to clarify again. During your opening submission, Madam PS, I am not sure whether you said traumatic or dramatic ordeal, would you clear to clarify whether I got that correct and what you were referring to?

Ms. Barrow: I think it was dramatic. Traumatic. Traumatic.

Dr. Bodoë: You did not expand. Perhaps you would care to expand?

Ms. Barrow: Well I know that this Ministry— Since I have been there, I know that you all would be aware of—well, we have the LifeSport issues that would have been coming forward with this Ministry, and having to deal with the backlash of that and persons coming forward, there has been a lot of need for healing within this Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs. So I think that is what I meant.

Madam Chairman: I just want to ask a few more questions, then I will turn over to member Mark. Madam PS, as far as the sport facility managers I see in the submission that a number of persons have been hired for different facilities and I see a discrepancy in salary and transportation, what would account for this? This is page 3 of the submission. There is a table. So, for instance, Sport Facility Manager, Dwight Yorke Stadium would be getting a salary of \$10,800 and transportation \$1,300; Sport Facility Manager, Chaguanas would be getting \$8,800 salary, \$880 transportation; and within the various other positions, which would appear to be the same Sport Facility Manager, there are other variances, could you explain what accounts for that?

Ms. Arneaud: Okay. The CPO has designed a contract table where we look at the person's experience, three years and over, three years under, six years and over, and they have designed the salaries. So that is what we use.

Madam Chairman: All right. So let me ask something. If you were St. Paul Street Sport Facility Manager, I would assume that your experience would fall within the band of the one here as the Sport Facility Manager, Dwight Yorke Stadium because the salaries are the same.

Ms. Arneaud: No, the person at St. Paul Street has been employed for more than six years and that is why she received that salary. It has nothing to do with where they are.

Madam Chairman: I understand that. So I am saying within the same band of experience because the Sport Facility Manager Dwight Yorke Stadium gets almost a similar salary. Because what I understood you to say is that there is a table, would say a range, of experience and you fall within that and you get a certain salary.

Ms. Arneaud: Yes.

Madam Chairman: Yes? So if I understand what you are saying, the one for St. Paul Street should fall within the same sort of range as the one for Dwight Yorke Stadium.

Ms. Arneaud: Yes, it should. I am thinking that—

Madam Chairman: Okay. But why is it not there then a transportation—I guess must be an allowance because the table does not say, why is there one for Dwight Yorke and none for St. Paul Street based on what you have given me as the sort of categorization for compensation?

Ms. Arneaud: Yes, that would have to be checked. I am not sure why the Dwight Yorke person has the travelling allowance—

Madam Chairman: Dwight Yorke has it?

Ms. Arneaud: Yes.

Madam Chairman: St. Paul Street does not have it?

Ms. Arneaud: No.

Madam Chairman: South West, I guess regional, does not have it either?

Ms. Arneaud: Okay. What has happened as well is that the terms and conditions of employment have not been established by the CPO. The persons were previously employed as Assistant Facility Managers and then CPO changed the position to Business Operations Assistant II. So the three persons that came from the sport facilities, whose terms have not yet been actually given by the CPO, their travelling allowances were withheld.

Madam Chairman: And within those three that you have identified, do I take it then that the eastern regional falls into a different band of experience?

Ms. Arneaud: Yes, she has a different experience.

Madam Chairman: All right. And might I just ask one more question? I am going back now a little further, Madam PS, as far as what we have been told of the 37 positions filled, seven are yet to assume duty, could you account for why?

Ms. Barrow: They would have had to give notice at their other places of employment and that is when they said that they would be able assume duty.

Madam Chairman: All right So the date of assumption of duty will vary amongst them?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Madam Chairman: And could you say when the last of the seven would assume duty?

Ms. Barrow: July.

Madam Chairman: July of?

Ms. Barrow: This year.

Madam Chairman: So that the other six between now and the end of this month should assume duty? Yes?

Ms. Barrow: Yes. Well, between now and July.

Madam Chairman: Now and the end of this month the other six should assume?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Madam Chairman: And one other thing. Your table on page 2, these are the nine people who are already on short-term employment, who have been converted to contract, in the case of one person, a Business Operations Assistant I see that their date of assumption is July 03, 2017, is that correct? **Ms. Arneaud:** Yes.

Madam Chairman: And may I ask why?

Ms. Arneaud: She is on maternity leave.

Madam Chairman: She is on maternity leave?

Ms. Arneaud: Yes.

Madam Chairman: And therefore what happens in—

Ms. Arneaud: When her leave expires, she will assume.

Madam Chairman: And what is happening to the—I do not want to say the position—but the function in the meantime? The execution of the duty because this was, if I understand it, short-term, six months, so what is happening with this function in the meantime?

Ms. Arneaud: Well, other persons in the Ministry are performing the duties, assisting the Youth Division with the function of her duties.

Madam Chairman: So would this be, people who are already employed are sharing the responsibility—

Ms. Arneaud: Yes.

Madam Chairman:—and not that somebody has been hired on a short-term employment?

Ms. Arneaud: No, no one has been hired. These persons are public servants who are also there.

Madam Chairman: Okay. All right. Member Bodoë, and then I will take member Mark.

Dr. Bodoë: Thank you, Madam Chair. In terms of all of the restructuring and some of the employees no longer having positions and so on, can you indicate whether any employees at the Ministry have had to be compensated for wrongful dismissal or termination?

Ms. Barrow: Not that I am aware of.

Mr. Mark: Thank you, Madam Chair. Permanent Secretary, I would like to, through the Chair, raise the issue of travel, and that has to do with issues surrounding the Tobago House of Assembly Sports Awards. Now, based on your submission to this Committee, you did outline the business that would have been attended to on this particular occasion, and you went on further to identify the invitation that would have been issued to, initially, some nine officers. You did indicate that. You went on further to identify the actual names of those officers and those persons who actually attended, which moved from nine officers to 12 officers.

We also understand from your submission that the overall budget amounted to some 591,910.43 and you gave a breakdown of how that was arrived at. What we would like to, without detaining you and outlining the names—I think this is now public knowledge of the nine persons, and now the 12 persons—would you want to share with this Committee, how did the additional three persons affect the expenditure for this particular trip, that is one; and were the two administrative professionals necessary for the trip to Tobago? You would like to explain to this Committee, or share with us your views, or your submission?

Ms. Barrow: Well, I would like to say that with regard to the administrative support, as I had mentioned we did have a number of other meetings to attend with the Sport Division and with the THA that spanned—because as you know a lot of our work would be entailed on a work day, normal weekday, and I mean at the end of the day I guess we could have possibly done without. I am not saying no. At the time, we felt that there was sufficient need at the time, especially with regard to the types of meetings that we were having and especially with the type of work that we wanted to undertake with the THA, that we felt that you know it was necessary to make sure that

we had proper records of the meetings.

However, I would be guided by the Committee with regard to the necessity for carrying the administrative support.

4.00 p.m.

Mr. Mark: No, we would want to get your guidance on this matter because here it is, Trinidad and Tobago, as you are well aware, Permanent Secretary and as the accounting officer, is going through extremely difficult financial times and every penny counts. So I would like you to explain to this Committee why an invitation that was issued to nine persons initially extended itself to 12. As I said, three additional persons and I would like you to really indicate to this Committee how these three persons were added. You were giving us some story there—

Ms. Barrow: No, no, no, I—

Mr. Mark: No, no, not story, let me withdraw that word. Explanation that maybe they needed some support, that is the team, secretarial support and the amount of meetings and that sort of thing. But you would know that these are very difficult times and we have to cut back expenditure as much as possible, and if we are being invited and nine persons have been invited, we would like to have from you, as the accounting officer, because at the end of the day, you are the accounting officer and you would have had to give authorization for these additional persons. What this Committee would like to find out from you is what was the rationale and justification for this additional expenditure which taxpayers are being called upon to foot? So could you guide us on this matter? Rather than seek our guidance, we would look to have your guidance on this.

Ms. Barrow: Okay. I did not see it as additional expenditure because of the fact that we had been scheduled to previously go to Tobago with SporTT, especially with regard to the Dwight Yorke Stadium, as well as the other meetings that we—what we basically did was combined. When we got the invitation for the sports awards, we combined the trip.

Now, the persons who were originally scheduled to go to Tobago were already—were mostly the persons who had been invited to the sports awards. The additional persons to the sports award did not actually cost the Ministry any additional funds because they would have been going with us to the other trip anyway. The reason why we did not go before was because we knew that we had the opening of the Brian Lara Cricket Academy and we had had to postpone and reschedule the trip because we did not want to over extend our resources

and ensuring that the event took place.

So, at the time, when we were looking at it and we said that, well, we would basically do everything in one because most of the persons were already included. The three additional persons, there was not a cost to the Ministry with regard to them going to the sports awards itself. Because we basically just asked the THA if they could have facilitated their attendance as they would have already been there in Tobago.

Mr. Mark: So are you telling this Committee that they paid their way?

Ms. Barrow: No.

Mr. Mark: Or are saying that the THA underwrote the cost for the three additional persons? Who actually paid in the final analysis for those—

Ms. Barrow: No, what I am saying—

Mr. Mark: No, I am asking who paid. Was it the taxpayers of Trinidad and Tobago that paid for it? Was it the THA as a separate unit although it is taxpayers' money? Who actually paid at the end of the day for this?

Ms. Barrow: The Ministry paid. The Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs. Yes.

Mr. Mark: Yeah, the Ministry paid but it is the taxpayers.

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Mr. Mark: Paid at end of the day.

Ms. Barrow: My point was that they were intended to go in any event because we had a previous trip scheduled and because we decided to combine the trip, it was not that they were now being added because we were going to the THA awards. What I am saying is that they were already included in our previous trip and because they were going to the trip, we just asked the THA if they could have included them to attend the function.

Mr. Mark: How does the Ministry select and approve travel expenditure? Could you share with the Committee how you go about this?

Ms. Barrow: Well, normally it would be dependent on whether and if it is that we would normally have an invitation, it would normally be put up by the relevant division and sent up for approval by the Permanent Secretary.

Mr. Mark: Is there a ceiling on the total cost of a trip within Trinidad and Tobago? Do you have a ceiling that you established or is it just like business as usual even though we are in serious economic times?

Ms. Barrow: There is no ceiling.

Mr. Mark: There is a ceiling?

Ms. Barrow: No.

Mr. Mark: There is no ceiling?

Ms. Barrow: No.

Mr. Mark: Thank you, Madam.

Dr. Bodoë: Thank you, Madam Chair. Madam PS, three questions and I will ask them separately. In terms of the addition of the three persons to the—those who were previously invited, who would have authorized that addition? Would it have been yourself or someone else?

Ms. Barrow: With regard to the different persons, they would have been for different reasons.

Dr. Bodoë: The additional three people.

Ms. Barrow: Right, they would have been for different reasons. My assistant came with—well, I would have authorized her—I would have required her presence, the Minister would have required his assistant and the person from communications would have been—anytime we have any event, a person from communications usually covers the event.

Dr. Bodoë: And my question to follow up on that, in terms of choosing the person from communications, I see that person is a Public Relations Officer **II**. In terms of the rationale, I am presuming that there would have been more senior people in communications. So in terms of the rationale for not choosing a more senior person or perhaps even the head of communications, can you give us an explanation as to why that decision was made?

Ms. Barrow: I have three positions within my communications unit that are public servants. We have a PRO I, a PRO II and a PRO III. The PRO I had previously been scheduled to go to Tobago with the Minister on a previous occasion and even though we had made all the necessary arrangements, the person was unable to attend because of personal commitments and the personal commitment still exists. The **PRO III** has previously been not well and has some mobility issues. **Dr. Bodoë:** So one is most senior person?

Ms. Barrow: The **III**.

Dr. Bodoë: The **III**, okay. The other question, in terms of the expenditure and the figure quoted, I know that from the report here that three members of the Sports Company were part of the delegation. Can you tell us whether there is a separate cost that would have been incurred for the three members of the Sports Company?

Ms. Barrow: Yeah, no, the Sports Company did not come with the Ministry, they attended on

their own.

Dr. Bodoë: Can you perhaps give us an idea of the cost that would have been incurred by the Sports Company?

Ms. Barrow: I will ask SporTT.

Mr. Blake: We do not have that cost here now but we can provide it in writing.

Dr. Bodoë: So is that something you can provide to us in writing?

Mr. Blake: Yes, we can.

Dr. Bodoë: Thank you.

Madam Chairman: Member Cuffie.

Mr. Cuffie: Thank you, Madam Chair Madam PS, I note in the report of the Director of Youth Affairs, there is a plan, 5th Caribbean Regional Youth Summit carded for September 28, 2017. Could you give some idea of what is intended there? Because I see the cost of \$343,400. Is it that you are going to host this summit from the Ministry's resources? Are you going to seek Cabinet approval? And it says—it is a regional youth summit so I assume that people are going to be invited to Trinidad and Tobago. I want to get some idea of this event.

Ms. Barrow: Okay, I am going to let the Director of Youth give you some more information but I can say that it is a collaboration between the Ministry of Sport and THA with regard to providing the Caribbean Regional Youth Council additional—well, funds with regard to certain things like accommodation and transportation, and that was one of the key discussions that we had with the THA with regard to what our cost would be.

Mr. Kent: Good afternoon again. The Fifth Caribbean Youth Leaders Summit is a summit that is organized for the meeting of minds of the young people across the Caribbean, representatives of various national youth organizations and regional youth structures, and it was decided at the last Summit which was held in Belize that they would—they proposed to host the fifth summit in Tobago. All right. It is intended to coincide with the—well, culminate with the Tobago House of Assembly Annual Youth Awards on the 30th of September which is also Commonwealth Youth Day.

Mr. Cuffie: Through you, Madam Chair, what I am trying to get is, this is a regional event, has Cabinet been approached for the hosting of the event and to provide funding for the event?

Mr. Kent: It is intended that the Minister will approach Cabinet once a final decision is made between the Tobago House of Assembly and the Ministry in terms of the resources that we will

expend towards the hosting of the conference.

Mr. Cuffie: And the reason **I** am asking the question, you said that when the meeting was held in Belize, the decision was made that the next one will be in Tobago, so that is a regional commitment that has been made. So **I** am trying to get an idea of how a commitment could be made to host a meeting in Tobago without a Cabinet approval or sanction.

Mr. Kent: No, the decision was not made or facilitated by the Ministry. We did not participate in that Summit. It is the young people of the region elected to host the next—the fifth summit in Tobago.

Mr. Cuffie: So it is not a commitment then, it is a desire, "ah wish"?

Mr. Kent: Yes, it is a wish by the young people.

Madam Chairman: Just one minute. Member Dookie.

Mr. Dookie: Not on this.

Madam Chairman: All right. Member Mark, it is on this?

Mr. Mark: Yes. It is just a follow-up, Madam Chair, on an earlier intervention **I** made. **I** just wanted to ask the Permanent Secretary, we have been informed, through newspaper reports and **I** do not like to go on newspaper reports because we need to confirm these things, that one out of the 13 persons—is it 12—twelve persons and coming out of your Ministry has since been transferred to the Office of the Prime Minister. As **I** said, **I** saw this in the newspaper and **I** do not like to go with newspaper reports. Could you confirm, deny, rubbish, that particular allegation that has been peddled in the newspapers one way or the other?

Ms. Barrow: As far as **I** am aware, no one has been transferred from the Ministry.

Mr. Mark: No one has been transferred?

Ms. Barrow: No.

Mr. Mark: All right. Thank you very much.

Madam Chairman: Member Dookie.

Mr. Dookie: Thank you, Madam Chair. The Acting Permanent Secretary referred to a period of trauma in the Ministry and putting it into context the Permanent Secretary referred to LifeSport, and in her opening remarks, the Permanent Secretary indicated that the Ministry is embarking upon change. So my question is this: what are the major change initiatives taking place in the Ministry at this time? And **I** am putting that in the context of the period of trauma that you referred to.

Ms. Barrow: I think the main change that is being undertaken by the Ministry is basically trying

to get all the persons within the Ministry to do things in a particular way, such as trying to use proper procurement procedures, proper documentation; doing things that are efficient and effective rather than—as I said, that is something that you have to change with regard to the persons that are there. It is not something that you can just instruct persons and they will just go ahead and they will just automatically starting doing things in a particular way. It has been a long process. We have had a number of different meetings and basically it is a process of change that we have to go through. So I do not know if that answers your question.

Mr. Dookie: I could—if you allow me, Madam Chair—interpret what you said to some extent in the context of the culture which exists in your organization and you are saying that you are embarking on some initiatives to bring about some cultural adjustments. And you did mention a while ago about having meetings and of course, sharing information. So the question I want to ask is this now: Has that been working or have the meetings, in fact, been working? Are you seeing adjustments to behaviour?

Ms. Barrow: I have been seeing adjustments to how things are submitted. I do not know that we are having as much success with regard to behaviours and it is something that we have to look at and we may need to get additional help.

Mr. Dookie: Additional help means what? Are you talking about external support?

Ms. Barrow: External professional support because some of—and I would not go into it here. I mean, a lot of the reactions that you find happen at the Ministry is not necessarily the norm—normal reactions that you would get in another Ministry. You find that persons are quick to jump to the defensive, they are quick to react in certain ways. So I do think that it is—even though I have seen improvements in the way the work is being done, I do think that a lot of deeper intervention is necessary.

Mr. Dookie: So you are convinced that external support is needed?

Ms. Barrow: I think so, yes.

Madam Chairman: Madam Permanent Secretary, from the questions asked earlier, I formed the impression—and I might be wrong—that you would not have had any concern about the size or the nature of the delegation on the Tobago trip.

Ms. Barrow: I do not know that I do not have a concern about the size, I do think that it was the cost of doing business. The rates are high basically with regard to even the hotel accommodation. I do think that the persons who were required for the other meetings that they were necessary

mainly because, I think, the site visit especially to the Dwight Yorke Stadium was extremely enlightening. The conditions there, I think it is appalling with regard to not being able to actually use that facility and we do have a lot of events that are coming up at that particular facility, and I do think it was necessary for us to actually see what was really happening at that facility, rather than a lot of different—because you know, we get a lot of reports in front of us and I think sometimes it does not make that kind of—you do not get that sense of urgency that, you know, sometimes you would get if you actually go and see a location.

Madam Chairman: But pictures or videos would not have done it?

Ms. Barrow: I have seen the pictures and the videos but I do not think that anything prepares you to go and look at a facility where the entire bottom floor of the stadium is filled with equipment that is completely useless. I mean, it is mind-boggling to me.

Madam Chairman: All right. So you would say then that the cost of the trip was value for money for the taxpayer?

Ms. Barrow: I do think so, yes.

Madam Chairman: You do think so. Now with respect to the additional people, you said that some people were intended to go in any event. Would their stay have been as long as the stay which occurred?

Ms. Barrow: Their stay would have been approximately two days and they would have also had to attend the THA awards which would have been another night.

Madam Chairman: All right. And you said you found the rates were high. Were there other options for accommodation?

Ms. Barrow: No other options were looked at. We did use the Magdalena Grand.

Madam Chairman: All right. But are there other options that one could consider?

Ms. Barrow: Yes, there are.

Madam Chairman: Okay and let me ask one last question. Do you have a mechanism to test the reasonableness of expenditure? Or do you employ a mechanism for test of reasonableness of expenditure?

Ms. Barrow: I would say that there is no measure. We do not have anything employed. **Madam Chairman:** No, not "we", you.

Ms. Barrow: Well, I would use my judgment,

Madam Chairman: Because as a Permanent Secretary, you have a particular responsibility to

safeguard the state resources. So do you have a test for expenditure? The reasonableness of expenditure. What would guide you in the discharge of that function to say whether an expenditure is justified or not, whether it is reasonable or not?

Ms. Barrow: Well, I would look at the benefits.

Madam Chairman: You would look at the benefits?

Ms. Barrow: Yeah.

Madam Chairman: So in this particular instance, you would say that the expenditure was reasonable?

Ms. Barrow: I think we could have been a little bit more prudent especially with probably the timing of when persons were coming in and going out of Tobago. We were constrained a little bit by the availability of flights. Two of our flights were actually cancelled on the Friday. But I do think that we could have scheduled it a little bit better.

Madam Chairman: Okay. Let me ask you something. The technical competence would have come from the Ministry or the Sports Company?

Ms. Barrow: Well both because the manager would have been there, the Director of Physical Education and Sport. Because it falls under the Ministry, we actually look after the maintenance and the repairs to the actual facility in Dwight Yorke. However, we do rely on SporTT and we have been relying on SporTT with regard to technical expertise, especially as it pertains to the roof at the Dwight Yorke Stadium. So yes, we do rely on them for technical expertise.

Madam Chairman: And therefore, if you relied on them for technical expertise in terms of the prudence, would the members of SporTT not have been sufficient for the purpose of the technical aspect of the visit?

Ms. Barrow: Well, the Director of Sport Division is also relatively new to the Ministry and I do think because the Dwight Yorke Stadium falls under the Ministry as well as the maintenance, it is necessary for that division to have a very hands-on approach to the Dwight Yorke Stadium.

Madam Chairman: Okay, let me ask you something. I mean, it is in the public domain, you would have seen a public outcry. Have you learnt any lessons from this experience?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Madam Chairman: Would you like to share with us what are the lessons you have learnt?

Ms. Barrow: Well, I do think that we need to be better able to schedule how we are going about reviewing the facilities that we do have. I do think it is necessary for us to have a proper

maintenance and repair plan for all our facilities so that we do not have to necessarily be going on site visits and to that extent. And also I do think it is necessary to make sure that we are really getting value for our expenditure and while I do think that it was necessary, I think that we could have been a little bit more prudent with regard to the number of persons and the time frame.

Madam Chairman: And what about the level of the accommodation?

Ms. Barrow: The level of accommodation, as I said, we did use Magdalena Grand and I do think that we should be able to use other hotel accommodation.

Madam Chairman: But nothing prevents you from using other accommodation?

Ms. Barrow: Nothing prevents us, no.

Madam Chairman: Okay. My last question to you: Do you have whistle-blower policy in your Ministry?

Ms. Barrow: Not that I am aware of.

Madam Chairman: All right. Are you considering one?

Ms. Barrow: I do not know that that would be an individual Ministry initiative or a public service initiative.

Madam Chairman: My question is: Are you considering one in your Ministry?

Ms. Barrow: Not at this present time.

Madam Chairman: Okay, thank you. Member Cuffie, member Mark, in that order.

Mr. Cuffie: Through you, Madam Chair, Madam PS, I see from the Sports Company investigation a suggested budget of \$54.2 million for the repair of the Dwight Yorke Stadium. Now, I see this was suggested by one person. I am trying to determine how this was arrived at, whether there was a tender? What was the process to arrive at one single estimate by a company for the repair of the stadium?

Ms. Barrow: I am going to let SporTT take that one.

Mr. Blake: Thanks PS. So what you are seeing in front of you, hon. Member, is not any contract awarded or so on. As I was explaining earlier, what we would have done is a conditional estimate. What we had is a consultancy company go in and look at every item of the engineering scope of works: civil, mechanical, electrical and so on. Their remit is to come up with an estimate of what the overall budget is. This budget will be used to go to Cabinet for approval of the overall scope of works. Then we go out for procurement for the individual packages of work. So all that you are seeing before you is what the total scope would consist of and we can provide the document which

justifies every item of the scope individualized.

Mr. Cuffie: Through you, Madam Chair, I was under the impression that that kind of scope you will get from a state enterprise, a special purpose company like UDeCOTT, Nipdec, MTS, but this scope comes from a private company that is going to inform the Sports Company's approach to the project. So was there any attempt made to get a Ministry or a special purpose company to look at the project to inform—there is a good example. You used the UDeCOTT for the Brian Lara Stadium, why would you go to a private company for the Dwight Yorke Stadium?

Mr. Blake: Well, in terms of how conditional estimates are done, what we would have done is go out for open tender for consultancy services, similar to Brian Lara Stadium. Even though UDeCOTT would have been undertaking work at the Brian Lara Stadium, they still have a consultancy company engaged at Brian Lara doing due diligence for them so it is not abnormal in the construction industry to have a consultancy partner for the project. They would bring a certain level of expertise also that the Ministry and Sports Company may not have based on the amount of projects under our portfolio at the point in time.

Our internal quantity surveyors would then go through their estimates to ensure that it is in line with industry standards so there is no inflation in price and costing. Further to that, when we go out for tender, the market will dictate what the price of the project—the true price of the project is. So what this is here is a preliminary estimate of what it should cost.

Mr. Cuffie: Okay. Can I ask in writing for a copy of the advertisement—

Mr. Blake: Sure.

Mr. Cuffie:—the tender procedures and a copy of the award determination that would have led to this company being awarded the consultancy services for the Dwight Yorke Stadium?

Mr. Blake: Sure, that can be provided in writing.

Madam Chairman: Member Mark.

Mr. Mark: Thank you, Madam Chair. I wanted to return to the matter of whistle-blowing raised by the Chair. Permanent Secretary. How long have you been acting as Permanent Secretary?

Ms. Barrow: In the Ministry of Sport? Since January.

Mr. Mark: January. Are you familiar with the Government's policy as it relates to whistle-blowing in Trinidad and Tobago?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Mr. Mark: And if you are, the question that the Chairman raised is that if you are aware and you

do not now have a whistle-blowing policy, having regard to the policy of the Government as it relates to whistle-blowing, would you not want to consider taking measures as a matter of urgency to have established a whistle-blowing policy within the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs reflecting the Government's thrust in this particular area?

4.30p.m.

Ms. Barrow: I do not know that I agree that each individual Ministry needs to have a separate policy. I do think we have processes and procedures, which I am very happy and willing to do, but I do think that we need to have one public service policy with regard to that.

Mr. Mark: And as far as you aware, there is none existing in the public service at this time?

Ms. Barrow: Not that I am aware of.

Mr. Mark: Thank you. Now, coming back to the Dwight Yorke Stadium, are discussions on the way re: having the Dwight Yorke Stadium handed over to the THA seeing that the THA, under the THA Act, is responsible for sport and other activities within Tobago, and seeing that the Dwight Yorke Stadium is in Tobago, are there any discussions underway to address this issue of having the THA? Because if the THA has responsibility for the maintenance, I would imagine they would have been done a better job than the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs.

Ms. Barrow: I do not know that I would agree with that, but I have had discussions with the administrator in Tobago and that is the end goal that we want to have. Right? But we did both agree that the stadium itself needed to be in a state of—at a particular level before we just hand over the stadium. So we are working together with regard to working out how we can repair and look at the maintenance of the Dwight Yorke Stadium together.

Mr. Mark: So it is your intention, maybe policy objective, of course with the approval of the Government, to eventually enter into a memorandum of understanding with the THA to have them maintain, ultimately, the Dwight Yorke Stadium?

Ms. Barrow: That would be my suggestion. And like I said, it would have to go to Cabinet.

Mr. Mark: Okay, thank you, Madam.

Dr. Bodo: Thank you, Madam Chair. Madam PS, I just want to come back to the point made by the Chairman here and to look at the figures again and it is a bit mind-boggling because when I you look at the cost of the \$88,310 divide by 12, it comes up with \$7,359. And just to use your term of the cost of business and the value for money, and you gave certain assurances but can you give this Committee, and by extension the tax-paying public the assurance that going forward,

there would be some policy within the Ministry, in terms of exploring the options for accommodation, as opposed to just choosing a hotel? Is that something that is in place, or it is not in place in the Ministry?

Ms. Barrow: It is not in place in the Ministry, but I completely agree.

Dr. Bodoë: So can you give the Committee the *assurance*—[*Interruption*]

Ms. Barrow: Yes, I would commit to that.

Dr. Bodoë:—that would be the policy going forward?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Dr. Bodoë: Thank you.

Mr. Cuffie: Madam PS, I just wanted to ask why was consideration not given to use of vehicles from the THA or CAST for the weekend rather than taxi rentals?

Ms. Barrow: I agree that it is something that we should have explored and we would do so in the future.

Madam Chairman: Madam PS, I just wanted to get some clarification in that you said that you felt it was the cost of business and nothing—this might be my summarization—nothing beats going and seeing for yourself. Okay? You went and you saw for yourself at a cost of \$92,000, plus whatever SporTT cost will be, which I expect is something that would be presented to the Committee in writing. What next? Having gone and seen and that was the benefit.

Ms. Barrow: "Um-hmm."

Madam Chairman: What next?

Ms. Barrow: Right, so we are now in a position where we are looking at what our short-term and our long-term action plans are with regard to the work that needs to be completed at the Dwight Yorke Stadium. We have established that the roofing is definitely something that we may not be in a position to effect repairs on in the short-term. However, there are—as I said, sometimes it is necessary to actually go and see because what they have actually done is that there is actually roofing on the different offices under the roof that is in a state of disrepair also, that can be repaired but it needs to have a certain type of material. Because right now the stadium is really flooding out whenever it rains. As well as, we are right now in the process of negotiating with THA with regard to lighting of the stadium because right now it has no lighting either.

So, like I said, basically what we have come with now is a short-term action plan and we do have a long-term one also but in the immediate short-term we are looking at the roofing that is at the

administrative offices, so that we can at least try to prevent some of the flooding that is happening in the stadium. So that we can have some use of it.

Madam Chairman: Okay, so would I be wrong in saying that the only two benefits of this big contingent going was for 12 people to see for themselves, all right, and for you all to determine that your short-term plan would be to fix, I would say the under roof

Ms. Barrow: Well, it is not only the Dwight Yorke Stadium. We also met with THA with regard to the youth areas, especially with regard to the conference, the different projects and the programmes that are going on right now under the youth division, which includes the youth registration drive, as well as looking at the review of the national youth policy to collaborate with Tobago because we do not want to—right now we have the national sport policy also that we also discussed, that is being undertaken.

Tobago, right now is also doing a national sport policy and we did not want the same thing to happen with regard to us having two separate policies. Rather, we would want to have one youth policy and that was something that was agreed to at that meeting also.

Madam Chairman: Okay. All right. So as far as the state of the Dwight Yorke Stadium, that was one of things you all went for. The only immediate gain we could see is whatever sort of temporary work would be done to the roof?

Ms. Barrow: Well, not only that, there is the temporary repairs to the roof. We also have to look at the grout in the—I do not know if you would know where they would have joined the different stadium. You know when you are dealing with a stadium, they have the different step downs. So, what they normally do is they normally would join them. Apparently the grout that would have been used there would have been the incorrect grout that should not be used in these climates. So we would also be looking at replacing that also, because right now that is also assisting with the severe flooding also.

Madam Chairman: So what I am saying is neither of those two—and those are all the short-term gains, or there are more, as far as the Dwight Yorke Stadium?

Ms. Barrow: We also wanted to look at the bolts that are eroded in the roof that we cannot really go and do the overall repairs to that bigger project of the roof but we have corroded bolts that we can also replace.

Madam Chairman: So, I am trying to identify the short-term gains, which the visit would justify.

Ms. Barrow: "Um-hrnm."

Madam Chairman: So when would the bolts be changed? In this fiscal year?

Mr. Blake: Thanks again, PS. So just to expand a little. What Sports Company would have done there is to really show to the Ministry what are the critical works needed at this point in time. I think what is missing here also is the fact that there are areas of Dwight Yorke Stadium under prohibition notice from OSHA at this point in time. So there are some works that need to happen immediately so that that prohibition notice can be lifted.

There are also issues of structural decay to the facility, which are things like the rusted and pitted bolts, and so on. There are a number of issues on leaking, and so on. So part of the takeaway, I think, from Sports Company side and the Ministry for the visit is really what are the things that can be done, as PS said, in the short, medium and long term. We at Sports Company now will prepare for them a scope of works and an estimate just for the specific items and not the overall upgrade of the facility, which would lift the prohibition notice and allow a lot of the national level events to be held in Tobago. For instance there is a request by 'TT'FA to host National Games in Tobago. Also there is a lot of requests for track and field also in Tobago that cannot be facilitated at this time.

Madam Chairman: All I want you all to tell the public, okay, there might be plenty things that in a report could be covered. I want to know what are the takeaways. What I have heard from you all is that the value for money is that we went and we saw. Okay? This is not going to see one of the wonders of world. What are the immediate consequences/results that the people of Trinidad and Tobago could say: Yes it cost a lot of money, but this was fixed in two weeks, this was fixed in a month? What? And I am going to ask for each one. Was the Dwight Yorke. Has the National Youth Policy been advanced by the meeting? I do not know. Yes or no?

Ms. Barrow: Yes, it was.

Madam Chairman: Okay, so it is near to completion?

Ms. Barrow: We have approached Cabinet with regard to getting the funds allocated for the—
[*Interruption*]

Madam Chairman: So that is between May 18th and now? I want to know if that can be looked as an advance from the visit. **Ms. Barrow:** No, we had *already*—[*Interruption*]

Madam Chairman: That was before May 18th?

Ms. Barrow: Yeah.

Madam Chairman: All right, the Caricom Youth Ambassador Programme, was that advanced by the meeting?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Madam Chairman: Yes? So when are we likely to see a completion or implementation? Tell us what the advance is.

Ms. Barrow: We want to approach Cabinet by either next week, well actually by next week, with regard to that conference.

Madam Chairman: All right, the National Youth Organization Registration, how was that advanced?

Mr. Kent: Well, since the visit to Tobago, we were able to finalize the proposal which would have taken on board some of the ideas in terms of the design of the database, interactive and the Division of Sports and Youth Affairs will also have administrative access to the database, as well as they are asking for youth organizations nationally. Similar youth organizations, for example, all environmental organizations would be able to pull information so that they can network among themselves, and we have also passed that information to IT who is due to do an initial presentation for us, in terms of the database, on Thursday.

Madam Chairman: Okay, so without the visit, that could not have been achieved?

Mr. Kent: Well, the idea came up at the meeting in Tobago, from the Tobago Youth Council.

Madam Chairman: Okay, and what I am saying is, without the visit that could not have been achieved? The ideas could not have been sourced without the visit? That is what I am trying to find out.

Ms. Barrow: I do think it was important for us to actually meet with the youth council and meet with these young individuals, right and get their ideas. Right.

Madam Chairman: And what about the National Tobago Sport Policy? How was that advanced by the visit?

Ms. Barrow: Right. So that was something that was already ongoing. However, we did have discussions with regard to the way in which it was going to move forward. Right? So the actual sport policy for Tobago, our Ministry, our senior legal officer actually, he submitted to me the finalized draft policy for Tobago, which would have been finalized after that, after we had already gone to Tobago. So he actually submitted that to me yesterday.

So hopefully Tobago's—now we are trying to still align it to ours but we are still in the draft stage. So even though Tobago's own is a little bit more advanced than ours, we are still trying to align it to our draft which we have revised and we are hoping that—so that Tobago's own would still reflect some of what we are trying to do here in Trinidad.

Madam Chairman: Okay, so that would not be delivered in the short-term?

Ms. Barrow: Yes. That is being completed this fiscal.

Madam Chairman: This fiscal?

Ms. Barrow: "Um-hmm."

Madam Chairman: All right. So that, according to you, by the end of this fiscal you should have the National and Tobago Sport Policy.

Ms. Barrow: "Um-hmm."

Madam Chairman: You should have with the youth registration, the National Youth Organization registration be complete?

Ms. Barrow: "Um-hmm", yes.

Madam Chairman: You should have some final word on the Caricom Youth Ambassadors Programme?

Ms. Barrow: Yes.

Madam Chairman: And all of these are coming out of the visit?

Ms. Barrow: "Um-hmm "

Madam Chairman: All right? Okay. So what I would like to put you on notice is that come September, this Committee would invite you all back to see where you have reached on these short-term deliverables, including the short-term deliverables on the disrepair in the Dwight Yorke Stadium. Member Mark.

Mr. Mark: Thank you, Madam Chair. Madam Chair, I would like to ask the Permanent Secretary to supply you, on behalf of the Committee, with a detailed breakdown of the \$88,310.43 that would have been expended on car rental expenses and accommodation expenses. We would like to know how, if you rented cars, how many cars you rented, if you rented maxi-taxis, how many maxis you rented, did you hire drivers, did the people drive themselves, and in terms of meals, and so on. Give us a detailed breakdown of this expenditure of \$88,310.43.

Madam Chairman: I would like to include that for the Sports Company of Trinidad and Tobago. Okay? Members, any more? Any further questions? Okay, so I would like to invite the PS, if

she

wishes, to make a closing statement before we suspend this meeting.

Ms. Barrow: I would just like to say that I always welcome the opportunity to come before any of these Committees with regard to either joint select or for public accounts, because I do think that it is necessary for us to work together to move forward and ensure that we are really achieving what we set out to do at the beginning of each fiscal and that we do have a long-term policy and plan in place as we move forward. So, I thank you.

Madam Chairman: Okay, and I want to thank you PS and the members of your Ministry, the representatives or SporTT for coming and assisting us here today. I want to thank the members of the media and the members of the listening and viewing public who have stayed with us during this afternoon's proceedings. I, therefore, now suspend this meeting and wish you all a safe journey home. Thank you.

Ms. Barrow: Thank you.

4.48 p.m.:

Meeting suspended.